



Audit of Service to the Public in Both Official Languages in seven Airports Having a Significant Demand

Follow up to Audit of Halifax International Airport

February, 2005

Audit of Service to the Public in Both Official Languages

Halifax International Airport

1. Introduction

This audit is part of the audit activities conducted by the Official Languages Branch (OLB) of the Public Service Human Resources Management Agency of Canada (PSHRMAC)¹ to ensure that the *Official Languages Act* (OLA), the *Official Languages (Communications with and Services to the Public) Regulations (Regulations)* and Treasury Board (TB) official languages policies are being enforced. The same seven airports previously audited in the year 2000 will be subject of this new audit, as follows:

- Vancouver International Airport
- Calgary International Airport
- Winnipeg International Airport
- Toronto Pearson International Airport
- Montreal-Dorval International Airport (Montreal)
- Greater Moncton International Airport
- Halifax International Airport

The goal of this new audit is to determine whether the airport authorities responsible for the administration of the above-mentioned airports and the federal institutions providing services to the public there-in can communicate with and provide services to the public in the official language of its choice, in accordance with the OLA and the *Regulations*.

2. Background

Since 1992, Transport Canada has been leasing to local airport authorities the international airports it owned and operated in locations such as those identified in the Introduction. Local airport authorities (non-profit corporations) are responsible for the management, operation and maintenance of the airports they lease, and for capital projects relating to such components as the runways, air terminal buildings, industrial areas, parking lots, ground transportation, emergency response services, personnel management and the financial and administrative functions.

The federal *Airport Transfer (Miscellaneous Matters) Act* (ATA) states that “Where the Minister has leased an airport to a designated airport authority, on and after the transfer date Parts IV, V, VI, VIII, IX and X of the *Official Languages Act* apply, with such modifications as the circumstances require, to the authority in relation to the airport as if (a) the authority were a federal institution; and (b) the airport were an office or facility of that institution, other than its head or central office.”

¹ The *Official Languages Branch*, which used to be part of the *Treasury Board Secretariat*, was transferred to the new *Public Service Human Resources Management Agency of Canada* on December 12, 2003.

In the year 2000, the OLB conducted an audit to ensure that the OLA and TB official languages policies are being enforced for the airports of Vancouver, Calgary, Winnipeg, Toronto, Montreal (Dorval), Moncton and Halifax (here-after referred to as the “prior audit”).

3. Audit objectives

The objectives of the present audit were established under Part IV of the OLA which deals with the obligations of federal institutions, and third parties acting on their behalf, concerning service to the public. The audit objective is to determine the extent to which the airports in question (services provided in the airports by airlines, concessionaires, and health and safety services under the administration of the airport authorities), federal institutions² subject to the OLA and located at the airports audited (Canada Customs and Revenue Agency (CCRA), Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC) and Canadian Food Inspection Agency (CFIA)) and Air Canada are fulfilling their service to the public obligations under the OLA, the Regulations and other federal government policy.

4. Scope

The audit was conducted on the airport authorities (and services under their administration), federal institutions and Air Canada operating in the Vancouver, Calgary, Winnipeg, Toronto, Montreal, Moncton and Halifax airports. Audits were made up of the following four main components:

- telephone number testing during and outside business hours to determine if active offer and delivery of services were in both official languages,
- Internet Web site testing to assess the availability and linguistic quality of these sites,
- in-person interviews and
- tours of airport terminals and airport lands.

A separate report was prepared for each airport, as was done in the prior audit.

It should be noted that the audit did not cover the verbal announcements directly related to flights (for example, boarding announcements at departure gates) since they are related to the obligations of the route and, therefore, not directly related to operations of the airport.

5. Approach

The following steps were completed during the audit:

- Establish the audit parameters (such as audit objectives, scope and approach).
- Discuss the objectives and scope of the audit with the representative of the Commissioner of Official Languages in Montreal (for example, identify complaints received from the public during the past two years) prior to performing the audit.

² Please note that some sectors of these institutions were transferred to the new Canada Border Services Agency on December 12, 2003. However, the details of these transfers were still unclear at the time the report was being prepared. Consequently, it was deemed more practical to use the organizational structure in place at the time the audit took place.

- Conduct verifications of the public telephone numbers for the entities audited (ie. airport authorities, airport hotels, Air Canada, CCRA, CIC, CFIA) during and outside of regular business hours. Determine the extent to which the public can communicate with service providers in these airports in both official languages.
- Conduct verifications of the Internet Web sites for the entities audited. Determine to what extent these Internet Web sites provide the same information in both official languages.
- Develop audit questionnaires and audit check-lists for the on-site visits for each of the entities audited within each airport. Ensure that all deficiencies identified in the prior audits are denoted in the questionnaires and check-lists for follow-up.
- Conduct on-site interviews of representatives of each of the entities being audited using the audit questionnaires. Verify the representatives knowledge of the requirements regarding services to the public in both official languages as part of these interviews.
- Conduct extensive tours of all areas of the airports to which the travelling public has access using the audit check-lists. Areas toured include all pre- and post-secure areas of the terminals buildings, structures connected to airport terminals such as hotels, and the surrounding properties within airport boundaries.
- Determine the existence and adequacy of bilingual capacity to provide continuous service in both official languages. For example, speak with a random selection of airport employees (covering each of the entities audited) to determine the availability of services and active offer in both official languages. Ensure that bilingual services are comparable.
- Review all signage posted within airport land boundaries interior to and exterior to the air terminal(s). Assess the existence and/or adequacy of symbols or signs announcing that services can be obtained in both official languages as part of this review of signage.
- Take photos of selected services and signage interior and exterior to airport terminals in order to better assist the entities audited. Prepare numbered schedules containing the details of each photo with suggested improvements, as applicable. Some photos were taken of things that were perfect examples of improvements since the last audit.
- Review all documentation made available to the public by the entities being audited.
- Review a sample of contracts between airport authorities audited and third parties, as applicable, to ensure that adequate language clauses are contained within these contracts.
- Determine the existence and adequacy of controls mechanisms to ensure that services are always provided in both official languages, as well as mechanisms to assess client satisfaction.
- Review the services related to public security, health and safety for each of the airports audited, such as public address announcements.
- Determine the extent to which the recommendations made in the prior reports have been addressed by the entities audited, and make new recommendations as necessary.
- Analyze all of the data collected, and prepare reports for each of the airports audited.

Discuss draft findings with each entity interviewed.

6. Findings

6.1 Airport Authority

6.1.1 Profile of organization

The Halifax International Airport Authority (HIAA) has been responsible for operating and managing the airport since February 2000. HIAA employees provide almost no direct service to the public, except for telephone information service for travellers. Passenger traffic for the Halifax International Airport in 2002 was 2.8 million passengers.

The Airport Authority has a work force of about 100 employees. None of their positions are identified bilingual. However, the auditors were informed that some employees could communicate in French. There is no language testing in place that would allow the Airport Authority to identify bilingual employees. According to the HIAA representative, there is no language training provided to employees at the airport authority's expense.

Most services to the public are provided (subject to section 25 of the OLA) by third parties with whom service contracts have been signed with the HIAA. Examples of such third parties include the Canadian Corps of Commissionaires, Nova Scotia Tourism, concessionaires and retailers.

6.1.2 Language obligations

Active offer on the telephone outside business hours: The Airport Authority was reached at (902) 873-1223 (Information Booth) outside business hours and an active offer was provided as well as information in French, directly by the person who answered the call.

Active offer on the telephone during business hours: During business hours, the auditors reached (902) 873-4422 and (902) 873-1223 and in both cases, the receptionist made an active offer but could not provide the information in French. However, she was able to quickly get a bilingual person to come to the phone.

Knowledge of requirements: As reported in the prior audit, the Airport Authority is open to the question of official languages, and well aware of its responsibilities for bilingual notices both inside and outside the airport; it ensures that all notices directing travellers are in both official languages. HIAA uses professional translators for translation of the required written material (i.e. signs, letters, maps, comment cards, etc.).

It is also well aware that third parties providing services under contract must also have notices and provide services in both official languages. Moreover, since hiring is difficult because the airport is located 40 minutes from Truro and Halifax, it provides basic translation services for its tenants.

Contract clauses related to language obligation: HIAA has thorough language clauses covering service and documentation that could be used as an example by many organisations.

The auditors were informed that the clauses were developed in consultation with representatives from the Commissioner of Official Languages. However, the authorities did not include any bilingualism clause in

the service contract with the Canadian Corps of Commissionaires, which handles security inside the airport and is responsible for communicating with travellers claiming lost articles. The same applies to the service contract with the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, which is responsible for responding to emergency calls from the security check service.

Monitoring Mechanisms:

Tenants and agencies under contract are reminded of their language obligations by HIAA. A memo was sent in March 2002 to all tenants. The objective was to emphasize the importance of active offer and to suggest ways of complying with the OLA and Regulations. Another memo was sent, just before the auditors' visit to Halifax, February 28, 2003. Furthermore, the Airport Authority regularly visits the tenants to remind them of their linguistic obligations.

The duties related to implementing the airport's language obligations are still assigned to the Terminal Service Officer, whose main task is to ensure that inside and outside notices and signage, including those posted by the concessionaires in the air terminal, are in both official languages. The officer is also responsible to coordinate the reply to official languages related complaints.

Bilingual comment cards are available to members of the travelling public. They do not, however, invite the public to comment on any aspect of the delivery of services in both official languages.

Information Booth:

Halifax International Airport Authority has a contract with the Nova Scotia Department of Tourism and Culture to operate an information centre from 09h00 to 21h00. HIAA relies heavily on this organisation to provide bilingual services to the public and to many tenants who are not equipped to fulfill their language obligations.

The official languages symbol is clearly displayed and the documentation is bilingual. A verbal active offer of service is not consistently made, although all attendants questioned were fully bilingual. It should be noted that the employees of this booth, as part of their responsibilities, help out the other third parties operating under contracts when they cannot provide the service in French. Finally, it should also be noted that HIAA publications were, for the most part, bilingual.

Internet Web site: It should be noted that the quality of the French version of the Halifax International Airport Internet site has improved tremendously. Until recently, only a greeting message and the weather conditions (from Meteomedia.com) were available in French on the site. Most information in English now is available for consultation in the French language. Examples of what still remains to be translated are the "Progress report on the Airport Improvement Program" and "Making the News", both on the Home Page and the site map.

Volunteer Host Program: In October 2000 the Airport Authority set up a volunteer service. The volunteers meet and greet visitors, offer direction and information about services available at Halifax International Airport and provide assistance to people with special needs. There are over a hundred volunteers clearly identified by a distinctive costume. The volunteers are not required to be bilingual, although some have a rudimentary command of French. The Airport Authority has given them cards so that they can at least say "un moment s'il-vous-plaît", to ask the public to wait until they call a bilingual officer of the Information Booth.

6.1.3 Exterior notices and signage

The notices announcing the Halifax International Airport are bilingual. The signs for the parking lots, to one exception (photo # IMG_0340 in Appendix A), are bilingual and consist of pictograms, as are the directions for drivers wanting to enter or leave the parking lots.

There is also bilingual information on the signage relating to fares for taxis and buses to downtown Halifax.

6.1.4 Interior notices and signage

Temporary signage: Halifax International Airport Authority (HIAA) is going through a major improvement program. The expansion phase of the centre core retail area is being implemented as well as other renovations in other areas. The construction and renovations activities created a need for temporary signage. The auditors noted a wide variety of signs and notices from different sources (HIAA, contractor, others). In most cases, the signs were bilingual. However, the translation was of varying quality. In the hope of providing assistance to the Airport Authority in this matter, please consult Appendix A for a list of signs noted during the audit that could be modified to improve the linguistic quality of those signs in both official languages.

Permanent signage: As for permanent signage throughout the airport, most of it is well done and respect the requirements of the Official Languages Act and Regulations. However, a few signs contained errors in French which might have been inadvertently made at the translation or production stages. There are also a few signs which still require translation. Please see Appendix A for further details.

6.1.5 Self-service machines

The information on using the public telephones (MTT) is bilingual, as is the device indicating how to obtain a prepaid telephone card. Furthermore, the Royal Bank automated teller machine is completely bilingual.

6.1.6 Contract services

Food outlets: The auditors visited three fast food outlets managed by HMS Host (Maritime Ale House, Deli Brisket and Burger King). The day of their visit there was no active offer made in French, no pictogram or similar notices indicating the availability of bilingual services and the attendants could not provide the service in French nor find a colleague who could. They did not seem to be aware of the administrative arrangement with the Information Booth. Deli Brisket had a menu posted in both languages. Cash register receipts were in English only except for three words at the end of the Maritime Ale receipt. The same situation occurred at Tim Horton. Here is a summary of the results:

Restaurant name	Location	Active offer	Bilingual staff on-duty	Admin. arrangements	Bilingual signs	Bilingual menu
Maritime Ale House	Pre-secure	No	No	No	No	No
Deli Brisket	Pre-secure	No	No	No	No	Yes
Burger King.	Pre-secure	No	No	No	No	No
Tim Horton's	Pre-secure	No	No	No	Yes	Yes

Duty-free shop: The duty-free shop was closed at the time of the visit. However, the auditors noted some signs that were bilingual, including a sign indicating that a renovation was going on. Some other shops were open, and for the most part, all signage and receipts are in English only. Most shops know that there is an administrative arrangement with the information centre should they have a customer who wishes to be served in French.

Car rental agencies: There are six car rental agencies operating at Halifax International Airport: Thrifty, Hertz, Avis, Budget, Alamo-National and Enterprise. None greeted the auditors in both official languages. At the time of their visit, only one (Enterprise) was able to provide the service in French without help from employees of the Nova Scotia Department of Tourism and Culture at the Information Booth. Contracts were available in both official languages but the new employee at Thrifty simply could not find them. Here is a summary of the results:

Car Rental Company	Active offer	Bilingual staff on-duty	Admin. arrangements	Bilingual car rental agreement	Bilingual signs	Bilingual documentation
Avis	No	No	Yes	Yes	-	Yes
Budget	No	No	Yes	Yes	-	Yes
Hertz	No	No	Yes	Yes	-	Yes
Thrifty	No	No	Yes	No	-	No
<i>Alamo-National</i>	No	No	Yes	Yes	-	Yes
Enterprise	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	-	Yes

Airlines: Counters operated by airlines (Canjet, Westjet, Continental, Skyservice, Air Transat, Provincial) displayed the official languages symbol and notices in both official languages. The day of the auditors' visit, there was no bilingual verbal greeting at any of the counter nor delivery of services in French. However, when questioned, the attendants knew about the administrative arrangements.

The information related to Air Canada will be dealt with in a separate section.

6.1.7 Health and security

Security at the Halifax International Airport is provided by the Canadian Corps of Commissionaires (CCC). The Corps members, under the authority of an Airport Authority manager, are mainly responsible for ensuring compliance with the laws governing aeronautics and responding to any emergency that arises at the airport. All have first-aid training and are part of the evacuation plan.

The officers (approximately 50) have direct contacts with the public; they share work shifts and they can be seen in uniform throughout the airport. Those wearing blue hats have policing functions while those with white hats have security duties. The CCC is also responsible for lost articles.

When the auditors visited the lost and found office, the notices were partly bilingual but the service was in English only. As mentioned earlier in this report (Section 6.1.2), the service contract with the CCC does not include a language clause. It was not possible to obtain the number of bilingual officers since the CCC do not test its employee. Bilingualism is not a condition of employment and, therefore, an employee's language capability is not taken into account when work shifts are assigned. If they received a request from a French speaking person, CCC would communicate with an agent from the Information Booth. As mentioned in the prior report, there is one work shift during which no administrative arrangements are possible since the Information Booth is only open from 09:00 hours to 21:00 hours.

The Royal Canadian Mounted Police has signed a service contract with the Airport Authority. The role of the police officers is to be present at the pre-boarding area and to respond to any emergency calls from the security check officers. As for the inclusion of a language clause in the contract, the situation is similar to the service contract with the CCC; no such clause exists.

There is no medical clinic at the Halifax International Airport.

6.1.8 Hotel

There is no hotel in the Halifax International Airport.

6.1.9 Conclusions

The HIAA is well aware of its language obligations. It uses professional translators for translation of the required written material such as signs (temporary and permanent), letters, maps and comment cards. However, the HIAA is not presently equipped to perform a quality control function.

The HIAA faces some challenges in order to ensure that tenants are respecting language clauses. Many efforts were made to inform them of their language obligations, in writing and in the course of regular visits, but the results are still not satisfactory.

Finally, HIAA has no mechanisms to assess the clientele's satisfaction with the linguistic quality of the services it provides.

The HIAA relies heavily on the Nova Scotia Department of Tourism and Culture employees assigned to the Information Booth to fulfill an important part of its language obligations.

6.1.10 Responses to Prior Recommendations

Recommendations from the prior report are in bold face type, and are followed by current findings related to each recommendation:

1. **Set up a mechanism to monitor interior and exterior postings at the air terminal and the postings on the self-service equipment.**

Response: Based on the information provided by the HIAA representative, it is possible to conclude that no mechanism or quality control function has been set-up since the prior audit to monitor interior and exterior postings at the air terminal and the postings on the self-service equipment.

2. **Set up a precise schedule for creating an Internet site in both official languages, and ensure that additions to this site are made simultaneously in both official languages.**

Response: The Internet Web site is now bilingual for the most part of it.

3. **Review the service contracts with those responsible for health, security and safety in order to make the language clauses covering postings and delivery of service in both official languages more explicit.**

Response: The representative stated that the current contracts still contain no references to official languages but added that the Airport Authority is ready to examine the feasibility of adding such clauses to the CCC and the RCMP contracts.

6.1.11 New Recommendations

1. **Recommendations 1 and 3 contained in the report resulting from the prior audit need to be repeated.**
2. **Ensure that the modifications to the sections dealing with Health, Safety and Security and Services to the travelling public on the Internet Web Site are made simultaneously in both official languages.**
3. **Create and maintain a quality control function to ensure that all services provided by the HIAA to the travelling public either directly or by contract (as referred to in Section 12 of the Regulations) are provided in both official languages.**
4. **The HIAA should prepare an action plan (including a time line) of implementation of the above recommendations, and forward a copy to the Official Languages Branch.**

6.2 Air Canada

6.2.1 Active Offer

1. **Active offer on the telephone outside business hours**

The auditors tried three toll free telephone numbers for Air Canada. When they called the number for reservations, 888-247-2262, they were first connected with a fully bilingual automated answering system, at the end of which they received an active offer in French.

The toll free numbers 888-422-7533 (Arrivals & Departures) and 888-689-2247 (Baggage) also had bilingual automated answering systems, but they were put on hold for a long period of time and were not able to speak to an agent.

2. **Active offer on the telephone during business hours**

The same results apply during business hours as outside business hours.

3. **Active offer in person**

Check-in counters that provide services in French are equipped with overhead signs indicating that bilingual services are available. At two different occasions and at different times, the auditors visited an Air Canada service counter identified as being able to provide services in French. The customer agents behind the counter at the time of the visits were not bilingual and no active offer was ever made. On both occasions, the agents continued in English without referring the auditors to a bilingual agent.

4. Visibility of a symbol or sign announcing that services can be obtained in both official languages

Check-in counters are equipped with overhead signs indicating that bilingual services are available. However, the auditors did not see any pictograms announcing the availability of services in both official languages nor did they see agents wearing a pin indicating they were bilingual.

5. Postings in both official languages at all times

The vast majority of signage was posted in both official languages. However, there were several exceptions. For instance, some signs that are in English on one side and French on the other are often placed in such a way as to show only the English version. A case in point would be the luggage measurement racks where English is on one side and French on the other, with no indication that, when only the English is visible, French is available on the other side. The auditors also noted two further exceptions: a ticket purchase sign, as well as a “flight direct to USA” sign were in English only. Please refer to Appendix B for further details.

6. Availability of publications in both official languages

The documentation that is available to the travelling public is provided in both official languages. Most information is now posted on the Internet and is available in French and English.

7. Use of both official languages on the Internet site

The situation has remained the same since the prior audit report. Air Canada's Internet Web site (www.aircanada.ca) is highly detailed and fully bilingual. However, it is somewhat difficult to move from one language to the other, because the generic headings given at the top of the page do not include a "Français" option for moving from one language to the other within the same heading without returning to the Home page. There is no separate Internet Web site for the Air Canada offices at the Halifax International Airport.

6.2.2 Service

1. Nature of the services provided by Air Canada at the airport visited

The services provided to the travelling public at the Halifax International Airport include ticket offices, check-in counters, access to the boarding and disembarking areas, baggage check and pick-up and executive class lounge. Air Canada also provides these same check-in services to other air carriers, under an agreement with these companies.

When the auditors visited the Maple Leaf Lounge, the attendant who could not personally provide the service in French promptly contacted a bilingual agent who arrived a few minutes later. The administrative arrangement was in place and the attendant knew how to use it. The documentation and signage were bilingual.

2. Existence of bilingual capacity required to provide continuous service in both official languages

Air Canada has 109 employees serving the public in the HIA. According to the list provided during the audit, 26 employees are bilingual (24%), either tested or confirmed. The auditors were told that since former Canadian Airlines employees were not tested, it is possible that the total number of bilingual employees is greater than the 26 shown on the list. The representatives added that testing is done on a voluntary basis. They maintain that they do their utmost to ensure that there are bilingual employees on all work shifts.

3. Presence of work tools required for provision of service in both official languages

Air Canada Halifax is able to follow up on correspondence it receives in French. Boarding cards, flight timetables and business cards are bilingual. The electronic system used by employees is available in both French and English languages and the end product is also available to the client in both official languages.

4. Comparability of the service in both official languages, and availability of administrative arrangements as necessary

It cannot be said that the services provided are comparable or equal in quality in both official languages. Even though Air Canada attempts to establish bilingual work shifts, seniority, as included in the collective agreements, is still the primary factor taken into account when establishing the schedules. As a result, at certain times there are no bilingual personnel on duty. When situations arise where no bilingual employees are available to provide services in French, they telephone to obtain the services from the officers in Moncton, or Montreal.

6.2.3 Managers' Responsibilities

1. Knowledge of requirements regarding service to the public in both official languages

The representatives were well aware of the requirements regarding service to the public in both official languages.

2. Existence of controls to ensure service is always provided in both official languages

As a control mechanism to check whether the service is always provided in both official languages, the representative said Air Canada's Customer Service Manager (SCM) conducts daily audits of Customer Sales and Service. These audits include ensuring that bilingual agents are behind bilingual designated check-in counters, bilingual public address announcements are made and all signage is bilingual. The results are reviewed at daily operational meetings the following morning. Any official language deficiencies are brought to the representative's attention. The representative also stated that management would also note deficiencies in areas such as official languages while walking through the terminal.

3. Existence of mechanisms to assess client satisfaction

The representatives were not aware of any Air Canada formal mechanisms to assess client satisfaction that are currently in place. They added that people could contact Air Canada Customer Solutions by mail or fax or the Air Canada Ombudsman with complaints including official languages.

4. Meetings with the representatives of the official language minority community

This section is not applicable to Air Canada.

5. Use of the media

Contact with the media is primarily conducted and coordinated by Air Canada's head office in Montreal.

6. Complaints related to official languages

The representative stated that two complaints were already received when the audit took place, one related to the lack of active offer at an Air Canada counter, the other one about English only signage at the pre-board screening.

6.2.4 Conclusions

Active Offer: Automated telephone systems during and outside of business hours are fully bilingual, and the telephone attendant reached provides active offer. Air Canada's Internet Web site is highly detailed and fully bilingual. At the time of the audit, the auditors did not get any form of verbal active offer at two different check-in counters even though the sign indicating that French services were available was there. Although the auditors were told that administrative arrangements are in place, attendants did not try to implement them.

Service: Air Canada attempts to establish bilingual work shifts, but seniority, as included in the collective agreements, is still the primary factor taken into account when establishing the schedules. As a result, at certain times there are no bilingual personnel on duty. As mentioned earlier, both times when the auditors tried to obtain services in French, attendants did not attempt to provide such services or refer to any administrative arrangement.

Managers' Responsibilities: Air Canada managers are well aware of their official languages obligations and have been made numerous efforts to implement them.

6.2.5 Responses to Prior Recommendations

Recommendations from the prior audit report are in bold face type, and are followed by current findings related to each recommendation:

- 1. Make certain, when establishing the work shifts that there are always bilingual personnel assigned to the wickets identified as providing services in both official languages.**

Response: Some check-in counters are identified as providing bilingual services. As noted earlier in the report, there were no bilingual agents available at the identified counters visited. A possible cause for this situation is the fact that, in order to respect the labour contracts, seniority is still the primary factor taken into account when establishing the schedules.

- 2. Set up a mechanism to measure the level of satisfaction of clients in the air terminals with the delivery of services in both official languages.**

Response: The representatives were not aware of any Air Canada formal mechanisms to assess client satisfaction.

6.2.6 New Recommendations

1. **Both recommendations contained in the report resulting from the prior audit need to be repeated.**
2. **Ensure that two-sided signage (French on one side and English on the other) is no longer used or that mechanisms are in place to ensure that the public is aware of the fact that the information is available in both official languages.**
3. **Ensure that all employees are informed and reminded regularly of their linguistic obligations (such as active offer) and of the administrative arrangements available.**
4. **Air Canada at HIA should prepare an action plan (including a time line) of implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations and forward a copy to the Official Languages Branch.**

6.3 Canada Customs and Revenue Agency (CCRA)

6.3.1 Active Offer

1. Active offer on the telephone outside business hours

When the auditors called at (902) 873-1330, they received active offer of service, and the person who answered the call was able to provide directly the information in French.

2. Active offer on the telephone during business hours

Even though they received an active offer, the person who answered the call at (902) 873-1330 for CCRA during business hours could not offer services in French, but she was able to get a bilingual person to come to the phone quickly.

3. Active offer in person

Non-travellers have access to the Agency's office through an entrance in one wing of the airport. The greeting at the reception counter is bilingual and there is a bilingual sign on the counter. Officers, whether bilingual or not, have been instructed to give travellers a bilingual greeting. The auditors were unable to verify whether this active offer is actually spontaneously provided to the travelling public, because there were no international flights at the time of the audit.

4. Visibility of the official languages symbol at all times

Pictograms indicating the availability of bilingual services are present on the wickets where the service is available in both official languages.

5. Postings in both official languages at all times

The signage was posted in both official languages. Electronic signs above primary inspection booths welcome travellers to Canada in both official languages, and identify booths that can provide services in

both official languages. The auditors noted only one sign that contained errors in French, as detailed in Appendix C.

6. Availability of publications in both official languages

Documentation placed at the reception counter was available in both official languages.

7. Use of both official languages on the Internet site

As previously noted, the Agency's Internet Web site (<http://www.cca-adrc.gc.ca/>) is fully bilingual and very user-friendly. It describes the full range of services provided by the Agency.

6.3.2 Service

1. Nature of the services provided by the office visited

As described in the prior audit report, the office visited provides mainly customs services and programs to travellers and business people arriving in or returning to Canada. The officers receive each visitor at primary inspection, ask some questions about the declarations submitted by the traveller, and if necessary redirect the traveller to secondary inspection, where the investigation continues and the duty is collected as applicable.

2. Existence of bilingual capacity required to provide continuous service in both official languages

There is a total of 30 employees, all of whom have regular contact with the public. 10 of them (33.3%) speak both English and French and are in bilingual designated positions. The above-mentioned services are provided automatically in both languages at the one wicket identified as bilingual out of a total of ten. If the client is sent to secondary inspection, the supervisor is informed so that a bilingual employee can be assigned.

Shift schedules are developed to ensure that bilingual officers are staffed at all times. If there is a need for bilingual personnel at secondary inspection or at the cashier booth when none are on duty in those areas, they use a bilingual employee from primary inspection.

3. Presence of work tools required for provision of service in both official languages

As noted in the prior audit, all correspondence is automatically forwarded to the Halifax office, so there is no need to have bilingual keyboards at the airport office. The fax cover sheets and business cards are bilingual. The national computerized system used by employees has bilingual provisions and can deliver documents in both official languages.

4. Comparability of the service to the public in both official languages, and availability of administrative arrangements as necessary

The auditors came to the same conclusion as in the prior audit. Services provided to the public in both official languages are essentially comparable and equal in quality, because the same staff members who are fully bilingual provide them. No administrative arrangements have been made, because management considers that there are enough bilingual employees to provide the service in both official languages. Also, a number of employees have language exemptions.

6.3.3 Managers' Responsibilities

1. Knowledge of requirements regarding service to the public in both official languages

The manager and the supervisory staff are well aware of their official languages responsibilities.

2. Existence of controls to ensure service is always provided in both official languages

There are still no formal controls to ensure that the service is always provided in both official languages. However, all employees are reminded of the obligation to make an active offer on the telephone and in person. Managers and supervisors regularly perform informal checks to ensure that staff is following official languages procedures.

3. Existence of mechanisms to assess client satisfaction

The representative is not aware of the existence of mechanisms to assess client satisfaction. However, the airport has comment cards and forwards any comments pertaining to CCRA for resolution.

4. Meetings with the representatives of the official language minority community

The representative is not aware of any formal mechanism for contact with the official language minority associations.

5. Use of the media

The regional office handles any communications with the media.

6. Complaints related to official languages

No Official Languages complaint has been filed against this office since the prior audit.

6.3.4 Conclusions

Active Offer: The auditors were able to obtain telephone services in French quickly and efficiently during and after regular business hours. The CCRA Internet Web site is fully bilingual and user-friendly. The public can easily identify CCRA counters providing bilingual services through written and visual active offers. The CCRA related signage was posted in both official languages.

Service: Services provided to the public in both official languages are essentially comparable and equal in quality.

Managers' Responsibilities: The manager and supervisory staff are well aware of their official languages responsibilities. There are still no mechanisms to assess client satisfaction. However, the Airport Authority has comment cards and forwards any comments pertaining to CCRA for resolution.

6.3.5 Responses to Prior Recommendations

No recommendations were necessary.

6.3.6 New Recommendations

CCRA is fulfilling very well its language obligations and new recommendations are not necessary.

6.4 Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC)

6.4.1 Active Offer

1. Active offer on the telephone outside business hours

As indicated in the last report, the Citizenship and Immigration Canada office at the Halifax International Airport does not provide any telephone service; there is no number in the Halifax telephone directory referring directly to the office at the air terminal. The public can call the CIC toll-free number, 1-888-242-2100, through which services are available in both official languages.

2. Active offer on the telephone during business hours

The same results apply for both during and outside business hours.

3. Active offer in person

Since there were no international flights at the time of the audit, the auditors were unable to verify whether an active offer is spontaneously provided. They were told, however, that active offer is not made at all times. CIC offers services in the language used by the client to fill out the E311 card [Customs referral form (Airport)].

4. Visibility of the official languages symbol at all times

The auditors noted that the official languages symbol was visible to the public at the time of their visit.

5. Postings in both official languages at all times

All CIC signage was posted in both official languages.

6. Availability of publications in both official languages

All CIC documentation was available to the public in both official languages.

7. Use of both official languages on the Internet site

The positive comments found in the prior audit are still applicable. The Citizenship and Immigration Canada Internet Web site (<http://www.cic.gc.ca/>) is fully bilingual and very user-friendly. One can switch from one official language to the other without going back to the home page. It describes the full range of services provided by CIC. There is no specific reference to the office at the Halifax International Airport.

6.4.2 Service

1. Nature of the services provided by the office visited

The office provides services to travellers requesting information on citizenship, and answers questions about permanent residents and refugee status. Most clients coming to this office have been referred by the Canada Customs and Revenue Agency (CCRA) as described in the prior audit report.

2. Existence of bilingual capacity required to provide continuous service in both official languages

This office has nine positions providing services to the public, including four (44%) bilingual positions at BBB/BBB level. The office has presently one vacant bilingual position which is currently being staffed. Employees work shifts, and the schedule shows that at any moment there are at least two bilingual officers on duty. In the summer, when there are more flights, students are hired; they are often bilingual, although the positions are not designated as bilingual. If there is a request for service in French and there are no bilingual personnel available, CIC would first check with CCRA, who has bilingual officers on duty at all times. Other administrative options are also available: other entry points like St Stephen and Lacolle (24 hours a day operation) or CIC office downtown.

3. Presence of work tools required for provision of service in both official languages

The Field Operations Support System (FOSS) is the major tool used by CIC employees in Halifax. The system allows the employee to login in the language of his or her choice and produce a report in the language of the traveller's choice.

All the Acts, Regulations, Policies and directives Manual are available to the employees in both official languages via Intranet. The office also has bilingual fax cover sheets and bilingual business cards.

4. Comparability of the service to the public in both official languages, and availability of administrative arrangements as necessary.

CIC services provided to the public in both official languages are essentially comparable and equal in quality, because its own employees provide them in both official languages most of the time. The employees have a good knowledge of their duties and long experience in serving the travelling public. When CIC officers are not available, it has very good administrative arrangements in place to ensure that services are provided in French quickly and efficiently.

6.4.3 Managers' Responsibilities

1. Knowledge of requirements regarding service to the public in both official languages

The manager was well aware of CIC's language obligations at the airport. She said support and advice are available from the CIC Official Languages Coordinator located in St-John Newfoundland.

2. Existence of controls to ensure service is always provided in both official languages

There are still no formal controls to ensure service is always provided in both official languages. The representative stated that the lack of complaints is another means by which she is assured that the office is meeting its official languages obligations.

3. Existence of mechanisms to assess client satisfaction

There is still no formal mechanism to assess client satisfaction.

4. Meetings with the representatives of the official language minority community

There have been no formal contacts with the official language minority community.

5. Use of the media

As found in the last report, the airport office does not use the media; if the need should arise, it would be handled by the regional office, not the air terminal staff.

6. Complaints related to official languages

The representative was not aware of any complaints being filed against their office since the prior audit.

6.4.4 Conclusions

Active Offer: CIC staff provided active offer when the auditors visited, and postings and documentation were bilingual. The CIC Internet Web site is fully bilingual and user-friendly.

Service: CIC has bilingual staff present during all work shifts and has also put in place adequate administrative arrangement. It is actively working towards staffing one more bilingual position. CIC services are comparable in both official languages.

Managers' Responsibilities: The manager was well aware of CIC's language obligations at the HIA. It should be noted that no control mechanisms are in place to evaluate the linguistic quality of the services provided. Furthermore, no mechanisms are in place to assess client satisfaction with regards to the linguistic availability and quality of the services provided.

6.4.5 Responses to Prior Recommendations

The recommendation from the prior report is in bold face type, and is followed by current findings related to the recommendation:

- 1. Review the language designation of the term positions used during the summer so that it will be able to provide services in both official languages during all work shifts.**

Response: This action does not need to be carried forward since CIC now has four bilingual employees and is in the process of staffing a fifth one. They will, nevertheless, attempt to hire bilingual students.

6.4.6 New Recommendations

CIC is fulfilling very well its language obligation so, no new recommendations are required.

6.5 Canadian Food Inspection Agency (CFIA)

6.5.1 Active Offer

1. Active offer on the telephone outside business hours

At (902) 426-3874 outside business hours, there is a bilingual automated Call Answer system, which invites, in both languages, to leave a detailed message.

2. Active offer on the telephone during business hours

The person who answered the call at (902) 426-3874 for CFIA did make an active offer in French and was fluent in that both official languages. She then transferred the call to the appropriate animal inspection department where no one could provide direct services in French, but they were able to provide the cell phone number of a bilingual veterinarian from that department.

3. Active offer in person

There was no international flight arrival during the audit period. It was, therefore, impossible for the auditors to verify if an active offer is spontaneously provided.

4. Visibility of the official languages symbol at all times

There was an official language symbol on the front desk.

5. Postings in both official languages at all times

All CFIA signage was posted in both official languages. As detailed in Appendix D, one of those signs contained errors in French.

6. Availability of publications in both official languages

All brochures kept inside the CFIA office available for distribution to the public were bilingual.

7. Use of both official languages on the Internet site

The Canadian Food Inspection Agency Internet Web site (<http://www.cfia-acia.agr.ca/>) is fully bilingual and very user-friendly. It describes the full range of services provided and one can go from one language to the other at all times. There is no specific Internet Web site for the office at the Halifax International Airport.

6.5.2 Service

1. Nature of the services provided in both official languages

The clientele consists mainly of passengers on transatlantic flights and various charter flights from Europe, Florida and the Caribbean. The remaining clientele consists of importers. Passengers are referred to CFIA by Customs officers and the traveller's language is identified on the Customs form. If the commodities are illegal, the officer confiscates them and issues a receipt. The receipt is a standard CFIA form and is bilingual.

2. Existence of bilingual capacity required to provide continuous service in both official languages

There is one inspector in the office at the airport and a detector dog handler who works on shift. There are also four replacements in the downtown Halifax office who come upon request. The dog handler occupies a bilingual position and is bilingual. The representative said CFIA will create a third permanent position at the airport. The position will be bilingual, staffed on an imperative basis and used on a second work shift.

If there is a request for services in French, the dog handler will give the service if he is readily available. If he is not available, CFIA would communicate with a bilingual CCRA officer for assistance. On rare occasions, when no CCRA officers are available, the CFIA officer calls the Regional Office in Halifax during office hours.

3. Presence of work tools required for provision of service in both official languages

The receipts issued when commodities are confiscated are bilingual and all other standard forms issued by CFIA are bilingual. If the need arises to correspond with a client in French, such correspondence is automatically sent to the Halifax office for translation. The business cards are bilingual.

4. Comparability of the service in both official languages, and availability of administrative arrangements as necessary

The services provided to the public in both official languages are now closer to being comparable and equal in quality than in the prior audit. A bilingual employee was appointed at the end of January 2002. There is also a formal MOU with CCRA for the provision of bilingual services on an as-needed basis.

6.5.3 Managers' Responsibilities

1. Knowledge of requirements regarding service to the public in both official languages

The representatives were aware of the Official Languages Act (OLA) and its requirements.

2. Existence of controls to ensure service is always provided in both official languages

There are no formal control mechanisms. Management sent a memo to all staff reminding them of their obligations with respect to Service to the Public.

3. Existence of mechanisms to assess client satisfaction

There are no formal mechanisms in place to assess client satisfaction.

4. Meetings with the representatives of the official language minority community

There are no mechanisms for contact with any official language minority associations.

5. Use of the media

Any contact with the media is done by CFIA Halifax office.

6. Complaints related to official languages

The representatives were not aware of any official languages complaints being filed against their office since the prior audit.

6.5.4 Conclusions

Active Offer: Services in both official languages are available, directly or through administrative arrangements, at the telephone number that is given out to passengers from whom goods, such as foods or animals, are seized. The receipt, on which this telephone number is written, is bilingual. Documentation is available in both official languages, and the CFIA Internet Web site is fully bilingual and user-friendly.

Service: CFIA is now able to provide bilingual services with its own resources on one of its work shifts with the addition of a bilingual officer to its personnel. Its administrative arrangements with CCRA are adequate since CCRA has bilingual officers at all times. The services provided to the public in both official languages are now closer to be comparable.

Managers' Responsibilities: The CFIA Representative was fully aware of the Official Languages Act (OLA) and its requirements.

There are no control mechanisms in place to ensure that active offer is spontaneously provided and bilingual services delivered. Furthermore, there are no mechanisms to assess the degree of client satisfaction concerning the linguistic aspect of the delivery of services.

6.5.5 Responses to Prior Recommendations

Recommendations from the prior report are in bold face type, and are followed by current findings related to each recommendation:

1. Inform all staff assigned to the airport of the scope of the Official Languages Act as to the language obligations related to active offer and services to the public.

Response: Management sent a memo to all employees reminding them of their obligations with respect to service to the public.

2. Take measures so that the receipts issued to travellers bear a telephone number at which an active offer and services in both official languages are provided.

Response: There is now an active offer made at this telephone number, during and outside business hours. During business hours, if the person who answers the call is not bilingual, the call is then referred to a CFIA bilingual officer or, to a CCRA bilingual officer. After business hours, a bilingual call answer system is now used.

3. Acquire sufficient bilingual capacity to be able to provide services in both official languages at all times.

Response: A bilingual employee was appointed at the end of January 2002 and his substantive position is at the airport. CFIA will possibly create a third permanent position at the airport. The position would be bilingual and used on a second work shift.

6.5.5 New Recommendations

1. **Control mechanisms are developed and implemented to ensure active offer is made and measure the level of client satisfaction pertaining to the linguistic quality of the services delivered in both official languages.**
2. **CFIA prepares an action plan (including a time line) of implementation of the above recommendation and forwards it to the Official Languages Branch.**

APPENDIX A

HALIFAX INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT AUTHORITY
INTERIOR AND EXTERIOR SIGNAGE

Please note that this is not an exhaustive list. It has been accumulated to assist the Halifax International Airport Authority (HIAA) with improving its signage. Please also note that photos were taken for the following items, and have been provided separately. The photos in this appendix are shown in the order taken.

Photo #	Sign Location	Sign Description	Comments
IMG_0303	Self standing sign at temporary departures area	The following errors were noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seating De Vestibule • Billets 	Suggested corrections: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Salle d'attente • Billetterie
IMG_0304	Temporary sign at construction site on main level	"Attention construction: Casques protecteurs et bottes protectrices doivent etre porter sur le lieu" poorly translated.	Casque protecteur et bottes de sécurité obligatoires sur ce site
IMG_0305	Temporary departures area	"Lobby Seating - <u>Seating de Vestibule</u> "	Salle d'attente
IMG_0306	Overhead sign on main level	The following errors were noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • "Gares de depart 1-50 • <u>Billetterie</u> des lignes aériennes • <u>Magazinage</u> • <u>Échange</u>" 	Suggested corrections: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Portes d'embarquement • Billetterie • Boutiques • Bureau de change
IMG_0307	Main level, close to food fair area	Food and beverage self service vending machines instructions in English only	Should be bilingual
IMG_0310	Provincial Airlines carry-on luggage information	"PAL – As a customer with Provincial Airlines you are permitted one piece..."	Should be bilingual
IMG_0311	Stand alone IATA sign	"IATA – Can I take it? Fireworks – No ..." in English only	Should be bilingual
IMG_0312	Sign on main floor regarding firearms	"Transportation of Firearms and Inspection of Checked Baggage" in English only	Should be bilingual
IMG_0314	8½ x 11 laminated notice posted on door near St-Pierre et Miquelon counter (also see IMG_0315)	"SORTIE D'URGENCE, N'OUVRIEZ PAS, S.V.P." poor translation from the English version	SORTIE D'URGENCE <u>UNIQUEMENT</u> , SVP NE PAS OUVRIR

APPENDIX A (continued)

Photo #	Sign Location	Sign Description	Comments
IMG_0315	Close-up of IMG_0314	See IMG_0314	See IMG_0314
IMG_0316	Temporary construction sign near the Foreign Exchange on main level	“ADMINISTRATION ENTRANCE D’ÉQUIPAGE” poorly translated from English to French	Entrée de l’administration et des équipages
IMG_0330	Signs posted on emergency exit doors (Maple Leaf Lounge, departure area, etc)	“Zone <u>reglementée</u> personnes autorisées seulement” (also see IMG_0354)	d’accès limité
IMG_0331	Signs posted on emergency exits (various locations)	“Zone <u>Reglementée</u> - Personnes <u>Autorisées</u> <u>Seulement</u> ”	d’accès limité, autorisées seulement
IMG_0332	8½ x 11 sheet posted near Baggage Check, main level	“The Baggage Check is now located next to the Center Entrance...” in English only	Should be bilingual
IMG_0333	8½ x 11 posting near tunnel entrance to outdoor parking (also see IMG_0334)	“Security Office, Pass Control AVOP, Escorts, Lost and Found...” in English only	Should be bilingual
IMG_0334	Close-up of IMG_0333	See IMG_0333	See IMG_0333
IMG_0336	Sign on RCMP Office door	“Gendarmerie <u>royale</u> du Canada, <u>Service de la Sécurité</u> Protective, Officier <u>en Charge</u> , Officier <u>en Charge</u> des <u>Opérations</u> ”	Suggested corrections: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Royale • Service de la Sûreté • Responsable • opérations
IMG_0337	Sign on wall near Airport Security Office	“Entrepôt des valises... manteaux” poorly translated; Opening hours are in English only	Suggest: Consigne des bagages et vestiaire; Should be bilingual
IMG_0340	Red sign in the exterior parking area	“Wrong Way” in English only	Should be bilingual or use pictogram
IMG_0341	At airport model in front of the tunnel to parking	“...à l’aéroport international de Halifax sont <u>accessibles</u> aux handicaps.”	l’Aéroport International, accessibles
IMG_0342	At airport model in front of the tunnel to parking	“Lower Lobbies - <u>Hall d’entrée</u> ”	Hall inférieur
IMG_0343	Sliding door to tunnel to parking	“Porte automatique - <u>tenez-vous à distance</u> ”	Tenir dégagée

APPENDIX A (continued)

Photo #	Sign Location	Sign Description	Comments
IMG_0344	At airport model in front of the tunnel to parking	See IMG_0345 and IMG_0346 for close-ups and details	See IMG_0345 and IMG_0346
IMG_0345	At airport model in front of the tunnel to parking (also see IMG_0344)	“Airport Security - <u>Sécurité de l’aéroport</u> ... Limousine, Bus & Tax Transportation - <u>Limousine, autocar et taxis</u> ”	Sûreté aéroportuaire; Limousines, autocars
IMG_0346	At airport model in front of the tunnel to parking (also see IMG_0344)	“Info Courtesy Phone - <u>Téléphone d’information gratuit</u> ; Hotel Phone – <u>Téléphone d’hôtel</u> ”	de courtoisie; Téléphones d’hôtels
IMG_0347	At airport model in front of the tunnel to parking	“Tél. <u>guèrite</u> de stationnement...”	guèrite
IMG_0348	Large lighted sign at departures area	“Excitement is Building, Arrivals Area and Retail Expansion – Completion Fall 2002”	Preferably bilingual
IMG_0349	Sign at departures area	“L’enthousiasme va gandissant ... Programme d’amélioration de...”	Preferably bilingual
IMG_0350	Sign at departures area	“Excitement is building ... Airport improvement program”	Preferably bilingual
IMG_0351	Duty Free Shop – Departure Area	“On s’excuse pour n’importe quels incovénients à nos clients car on a des travaux de réaménagements en progrès” poorly translated from English. Suggested corrections follow:	Veillez excuser les inconvénients occasionnés par les travaux de réaménagement en cours
IMG_0352	Duty Free Shop in departures area	“Renovating to serve you better - <u>Rénovation pour vous servir mieux</u> ”	Nous rénovons pour mieux vous servir
IMG_0353	Signs on restricted area doors in the terminal	See IMG_0330 for further details.	See IMG_0330 for further details.
IMG_0354	Signs on restricted area doors in departures area	“Zone <u>reglementée</u> personnes <u>autorisées</u> seulement”	d’accès limité, autorisées

APPENDIX B

AIR CANADA - SIGNAGE HALIFAX INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT

Please note that this is not an exhaustive list. It has been accumulated to assist Air Canada at the Halifax International Airport with improving its signage. The photos in this appendix have been provided separately, and are described below in the order taken.

Photo #	Sign Location	Sign Description	Comments
IMG_0308	Air Canada check-in area, at start of line-up	“Air Canada Ticket Purchase” in English only	Should be bilingual
IMG_0309	Air Canada check-in area near Express machines	“Air Canada Jazz flights direct to USA” in English only	Should be bilingual

APPENDIX C

CANADA CUSTOMS AND REVENUE AGENCY - SIGNAGE
HALIFAX INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT

Please note that this is not an exhaustive list. It has been accumulated to assist the Canada Customs and Revenue Agency (CCRA) at the Halifax International Airport with improving its signage. A photos was taken for the following item. (Actual photos provided separately).

Photo #	Sign Location	Sign Description	Comments
IMG_0328	Stand alone sign in passenger arrivals area (post-secure)	“Veuillez avoir votre preuve de citoyenneté, passeport ou certificat de naissance <u>a’nsi</u> que votre carte de déclaration <u>à la main</u> ”	Suggested corrections: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ainsi• en main

APPENDIX D

CANADIAN FOOD INSPECTION AGENCY - SIGNAGE
HALIFAX INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT

Please note that this is not an exhaustive list. It has been accumulated to assist Canadian Food Inspection Agency (CFIA) at the Halifax International Airport with improving its signage. A photos was taken for the following item. (Actual photos provided separately).

Photo #	Sign Location	Sign Description	Comments
IMG_0327	CFIA stand alone sign in passenger arrivals area (post-secure)	The following errors were noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “<u>aux voyageurs</u> qui entrent...” • “<u>Veillez rapporter</u> tous les • produits ou <u>sous, produites</u> • <u>en bois</u> a L’Agence canadienne...” • “Nous vous remercions <u>d’avance</u>...” 	Suggested corrections: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • à tous les voyageurs • Vous devez déclarer • sous-produits • de bois • à l’avance