Gender and International Trade An Annotated Bibliography

Prepared for Status of Women Canada

by

Chantal Blouin
The North-South Institute

June 8, 2002

PREFACE

In the global economy of the 21st century, the importance of trade liberalization to Canada has never been clearer. Exports now account for 45.6 percent of our gross domestic product. Everyday, Canada does over \$2.5 billion worth of business in two-way trade with the rest of the world.

Increasing the amount of goods and services we trade, and reaping the commercial and financial rewards, is certainly a desirable goal of trade liberalization. An equally important objective, however, is to contribute to a better quality of life for Canadians and our neighbours around the world.

This annotated bibliography was commissioned by Status of Women Canada in order to begin identifying some of the key sources of information on the differential implications and impact of international trade agreements on women and men. It is hoped that this document would make a contribution to the building of knowledge on the potential outcomes of international trade agreements for all Canadians.

For more information regarding the work of Status of Women Canada on international trade, please contact the Policy and External Relations Directorate.

Status of Women Canada Policy and External Relations Directorate MacDonald Building 123 Slater Street, 11th Floor Ottawa, Ontario K1P 1H9

http:/www.swc-cfc.gc.ca

Tel: (613) 995-4067 Fax (613) 947-0530

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. GENDER AND TRADE: GENERAL	. 4
Canadian Literature	. 4
International Literature	. 9
II. TRADE AND LABOUR STANDARDS	15
Canadian Literature	15
International Literature	16
III. TRADE AND MIGRATION	18
Canadian Literature	18
International Literature	19
IV. INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND ABORIGINAL WOMEN	21
Canadian Literature	21
V. TRADE AND HEALTH CARE	23
Canadian Literature	23
International Literature	26
VI. TRADE AND HUMAN RIGHTS	29
Canadian Literature	29
International Literature	30
VII. TRADE AND WOMEN ENTREPRENEURS	31
Canadian Literature	31
International Literature	32

GENDER AND TRADE: GENERAL

Canadian Literature

1. The North American Free Trade Agreement: Implications for Women, Toronto, Ontario Women's Directorate, 1993.

This brief report concludes that the NAFTA would result in greater economic inequality for women in Ontario by evaluating its impact on their employment, on social services and labour standards. It does not offer much in terms of empirical material given its brevity, but states the NDP Ontario government's opposition to the NAFTA, as it believed it would lead to job and investment losses, downward pressures on social, labour and environmental standards and reduce the government's capacity to respond with positive policies.

2. Blacklock, Cathy, <u>Women and Trade in Canada: An Overview of Key Issues</u>, Ottawa, Status of Women Canada, 2000.

The paper is an overview of the many ways that Canadian women's lives are touched by trade liberalization. They include impact on labour markets, impact on the Canadian State's capacity to offer gender equality programs, impact on private sector involvement in health care and education. The report concludes with a recommendation that SWC be involved in government policymaking on trade. The paper is a good introduction to the question of gender and trade in Canada. In addition to reviewing the literature, the author provides some data from Statistics Canada on employment restructuring in Canada. This section would benefit from a more in-depth analysis and additional evidence.

3. Conseil du statut de la femme, <u>Les Québécoises</u>, <u>la mondialisation et la Zone de libre-échange des Amériques: Une première réflexion</u>, Québec, April 2001.

This study is divided in three parts. It first briefly reviews the positions of the governments' involved in the FTAA negotiations and of women who participated in the People Summit Quebec city. The second chapter provides an overview of the trends that characterise globalisation and their impacts on women around the world. The third part examines the Canada-US free trade agreement, the NAFTA and the negotiations of the FTAA and highlights three main concerns vis-à-vis the FTAA:

- Lack of transparency and democracy in the hemispheric integration process,
- Loss of State sovereignty given the content of trade agreements; and
- Dominance of economic issues over social issues as an engine of hemispheric integration.

Finally, the Council proposes a number of recommendations to the Quebec government regarding the FTAA and the NAFTA, such as to establish the precedence of human rights agreements over trade agreements and to analyse the effects of the investment protection of NAFTA (Chapter 11). The study provides a good overview of the main arguments made in critical literature on trade agreements, but did not conduct original research on the impact of trade agreements on women in Canada or abroad.

4. Cohen, Marjorie Griffin, "New International Trade Agreements: Their Reactionary role in Creating Markets and Retarding Social Welfare", in Bakker, Isabella (ed), <u>Rethinking Restructuring: Gender and Change in Canada</u>, Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1996.

This clear and straightforward paper argues that the global marketisation process induced by international trade agreements is not in the interests of democracy and equality. Women rights and the rights of disadvantaged minorities are especially endangered by these trade agreements because they contain features that go far beyond the regulation of trade, and codify social, economic and political behaviours in ways that strongly restrict the manoeuvrability of national governments to reduce inequality found in the market economy. The role of the Canadian State in creating market-correcting activities which are strongly linked to the success of equality seeking groups, such as women rights groups, is challenged by the free-trade agreement with the US and NAFTA. The author briefly discusses the impact of these agreements on intellectual property and social programs. A more thorough examination of how trade agreements limit the political space of equality-seeking activities would have made the paper even more interesting.

5. Gabriel, Christina and Laura Macdonald, "NAFTA and Economic Restructuring: Some Gender and Race Implications", in Isabella Bakker (ed), <u>Rethinking Restructuring:</u> <u>Gender and Change in Canada</u>, Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1996.

This paper is a useful review of the literature available on the impact of NAFTA on women in Canada with a particular focus on immigrant women and women of colour and on women in Mexico, especially women working in the maquiladoras. One of the most interesting pieces of information in the paper relates to the costs of displacement for working women in Canada, from a study for the Ontario Ministry of Labour. Women take a greater pay cut compared with men when displaced. After controlling for all other factors that explain post displacement earning differential (income level, education, occupation), the fact of being a woman costs the displaced worker \$2 283. The paper also reviews the positive and negative impact of the growth of maquiladoras for the economic status of Mexican women. Finally, it provides a description of the mobilization of women in Canada and Mexico to face the challenge posed by trade liberalization.

6. Gibb, Heather, <u>Gender Front and Centre: An APEC Primer</u>, Ottawa, The North-South Institute, 1997.

This brief book describes the institutional features and mandates of APEC. This primer is meant to be used by women groups who wish to engage with this organization. It also provides examples of experiences in advancing gender concerns in APEC. This is a good succinct introduction to APEC. Several of the key contacts in annex are probably out of date now.

7. Hassanali, Soraya, International <u>Trade: Putting Gender into the Process, Initiatives and Lessons Learned</u>, Status of Women Canada, 2000.

This discussion paper examines how trade policymaking mechanisms can be made more conducive to putting gender issues on the trade policy agenda. It reviews: 1) the different consultation mechanisms for trade policymaking in Canada; 2) traces historically, the efforts by women's organizations both in Canada and internationally to influence trade policy negotiations, and 3) explores the gender mainstreaming approach of APEC. The paper details 'lessons learned' and offers a number of recommendations on how to include gender analysis in future trade policymaking in Canada. A longer discussion on the role of parliamentarians in augmenting public participation in trade policymaking would have been very interesting.

8. Angela Keller-Herzog, <u>Discussion Paper: Globalization and Gender Development Perspectives and Interventions</u>, Prepared for Women in Development and Gender Equity Division, Policy Branch, CIDA, December 1996. http://www.ifias.ca/gsd/trade/gagdindex.html

This discussion paper argues that CIDA interventions should include an understanding of how, in a particular locality, the dynamics of globalization, gender and poverty are interacting. Such an understanding can contribute to broaden the opportunities of poor women and men offered by globalization. The paper mostly highlights key issues and some key trends but does not analyze them in depth. For instance, it points at the fact that between 1970-1990, the labour participation of women has increased significantly worldwide, and not only in traditional manufacturing sectors (apparel, light manufactures). Employment generation has especially benefited young women with some secondary education. The problems facing women in employment include lower wages than men for equal work, lack of promotion opportunities and denial of access to many areas, poor working conditions, barriers for married women and women with children, intra-factory gender segregation, lack of workers rights, and lack of maternity leave

9. Lévesque, Andrée, <u>La division sexuelle et la division internationale du travail dans la</u> mondialisation, Université McGill, Montréal, 2000.

This article describes the type of salaried employment working-class women hold in the North and in the South. It argues that in Western Europe and North America, the growth of the number of women in the workforce did not change significantly the gendered division of labour. The majority of women still work in positions with less social status and remuneration and in sectors such as health, social services, education, retail stores, clerical work. In developing countries in South East Asia and Mexico, the paper focuses on the abuses faced by working women in factories and export processing zones (EPZ). This broad-ranging essay provides some interesting pieces of information on the division of labour in a globalized world, but sometimes lacks focus in the argumentation.

10. Macdonald, Laura. <u>Gender and Canadian Trade Policy: Women's Strategies for Access and Transformation</u>, unpublished, 2001.

This clearly written analytical piece distinguishes between two types of feminist analysis and of activists' strategies toward globalization. The liberal feminists response to the challenges raised by international trade by concentrating on the improvement of women's access to markets, employment, credit, land and training, so that they can take advantage of the opportunities created by trade liberalization. This strategy focuses on access, and increasing women's capacity to influence trade decision-making. In contrast, a strategy focused on transformation is adopted by what the author calls "socialist feminists". This perspective considers the benefits of globalization to women associated with new employment opportunities as very limited and as not necessarily improving women's welfare, since entry into the workforce is often a survival strategy adopted by women to respond to growing poverty. According to this perspective, attempts to influence trade negotiations or trade policymaking to include gender concerns is viewed as futile.

The paper also highlights the main areas where trade has an impact on women: employment, food and agriculture, migration, consumption, unpaid labour, public services. In its last part, the article describes several activities of women's groups on trade issues and agreements such as APEC.

11. Marsden, Lorna, <u>Timing and Presence: Getting women's issues on the trade agenda</u>, paper prepared for the Gender, Science and Development Programme, Bangkok, Thailand, July 18-19, 1992. http://www.ifias.ca/gsd/trade/index.html

This paper offers an analysis of the political dynamics of trade policy and provides precise recommendations for those concerned with the broad social sector and who wish to influence international trade negotiations. The concrete and useful conclusions are drawn from interviews with leading Canadian negotiators of the FTA and from an analysis of the literature. They are:

- In bilateral or multilateral trade agreements timing is crucial. Anyone wishing to be involved in negotiations should be in at the start, participating by becoming a member of an advisory or consultative group. Timing determines to a very large extent the context and procedure of the deal that follows.
- Presence is also crucial. Those interested in the social sector must be prepared to be members of consultancy groups, serving with people whose interests are completely different from their own. It is, therefore, very important that the social sector put forward credible spokespeople who can argue their case in the face of hostility. The social sector and women's community groups should also remain strongly supportive of their representatives on these committees, as well as clear in their own demands to governments.
- The substance of the case put forward by the social sector must be highly interactive with people whose background is exclusively in narrow fields of economics, commerce and trade negotiation. Typically, such people fail to see the links between the economic changes brought about by a free trade agreement with social life and the lives of women.
- 12. Morris, Marika, <u>Women, Poverty and Canadian Public Policy in an era of Globalization</u>, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, Presentation made on May 29, 2000.

This essay focuses mostly on the structural reasons for the over-representation of women among the poor in Canada and the contribution of government policies to this state of affairs, which is the stronger part of her argumentation. The author argues that globalization exerts a pressure on the Canadian government to weaken its social policies and decrease the taxes to fund these programs. The reasons for this decline are the need to be "competitive in the global economy". The author also stresses the impact of globalization on Canadian public policy through international trade agreements that erode democratic decision-making, environmental protection and labour and human rights. It concludes with a call for action.

13. Stienstra, Deborah, <u>Mapping Our Place: Gender, The Global Economy and Canadian Governments</u>, Canadian Feminist Alliance for International Action, FAFIA, 1999, available at http://www.fafia.org/resources/doc5 e.htm

This discussion paper gives a brief overview of the institutions involved in economic and trade policymaking in Canada, international institutions involved in trade issues and the commitments taken by Canada on economic equality. This action-oriented document also proposes ways for Canadian women to take part in economic decision-making. The audience for the document is the general public, and therefore, the information remains at a very high level of generality. It concludes with interesting ideas of community actions on globalization: gather information on local impact, how to make the information public, among others.

14. Vosko, Leah. <u>The Last Thread: Analysis of the Apparel Goods Provisions in the North American Free Trade Agreement and the Impact on Women</u> Ottawa: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, 1993.

This brief paper mostly focuses on describing the provisions of NAFTA dealing with the garment industry, especially the rules of origin which determine how garments can be considered "Made in Canada" and receive duty-free treatment in the US. The paper also examines the allocation of quotas, and the classification of garment (wool apparel). The paper does not provide much analysis of the impact of these new rules for Canadian women, except to note that this sector is the lead industrial employer for women in the country, that this industry is in decline and that NAFTA may lead to more home-based work for women, as apparel manufacturers attempt to decrease their production costs. An updated analysis of this sector would be very useful, as the apparel industry has grown steadily since the adoption of NAFTA, contrary to expectations.

International Literature

15. Babb, Keturah, Ancelma Rose Morgan and Mariama Williams, <u>Gender, Trade and WTO in the Caribbean: A Preliminary Report</u>, Caribbean Gender and Trade Network, August 2001.

This scoping document includes a description of the trade liberalization initiatives in the Caribbean and a brief case study of how a regional network of farmers (WINFRA) were involved in policy debates on trade liberalization, focusing on banana farmers where recent WTO decisions will have enormous effects of female and male farmers. The document notes that heavy reliance on low cost female labour in light manufacture assembly, electronics, data processing and textiles and apparel in Caribbean countries, leads to high level of women's employment in the region. This document is still quite preliminary and needs to be fleshed out.

16. Benería, Lourdes and Amy Lind, <u>Engendering International Trade: Concepts, Policy</u> and Action, New York, UNIFEM, 1995.

The objective of the paper is to conceptualize some of the relevant issues for future policy research on gender and trade. The authors identify the key gender dimensions of trade: impact of trade liberalization on employment, on price/consumption, and on income. They provide a concise review of interesting empirical work analyzing the gender impact of trade liberalization. They identify three emerging issues in the literature on gender and trade: 1) gender, environment and trade 2) gender, trade and biotechnology 3) trade, technology transfer and gender. Finally, they have a number of suggestions for future research such as micro-level study of effects of trade liberalization on employment and wages in one geographical area or industry.

17. Cagatay, Nilüfer, Gender, Poverty and Trade, UNDP Background Paper, New York, October 2001.

This excellent background paper offers a very up-to-date overview of the state of knowledge on gender and trade. The debate is structured in the context of human development and human rights, going much further than an income-based definition of poverty. As for the impact of trade liberalization, the author concludes that in general, an increase of exports in a country is associated with an increase in women's paid employment. Insofar as paid work can help women's empowerment within the family and society, this may be interpreted as a benefit. However, there are many caveats, such as:

- Growth in women's employment has not led to a closing of the gender-based wage gaps and the conditions of work do not seem to have improved (insecurity)
- Overall increase in women's employment disguises sectoral reallocation (women with lower skill levels lose employment while others have paid employment for the first time)
- Women's inclusion in paid labour generally means an increase of their overall work burden (no reduction of their unpaid domestic work)
- Trade liberalization can reduce the fiscal capacity of the government and be translated by a decrease of social programs. When social services are reduced and less accessible, poor people and women suffer. Women may suffer doubly because they would benefit less from public services and their workload of household and care unpaid work may increase, to compensate for the withdrawal of the State.

In agricultural economies, trade liberalization can disadvantage women as small farmers (or benefit them less than it benefits men). For instance, in many sub-Saharan African countries, women's agricultural production focuses on food crops, not cash crops destined for export. New export opportunities are especially hard to take advantage of for small producers with no access to credit, technology and marketing. The report ends with recommendations to achieve gender-sensitive trade policies.

18. Cardero, Maria Elena, "The Impact of NAFTA on Female Employment in Mexico", in Women's Empowerment and Economic Justice, New York, UNIFEM, 2000.

This study examines the impact of NAFTA on Mexican women's employment in three non-service sectors: export agriculture, processing industry (maquila) and textiles and clothing. It concludes that its impact has been uneven. There has been a general growth in women's employment, but not necessarily an improvement in living standards. In the export agriculture sector, this took the form of longer working hours. In the manufacturing sectors, the author points to the trend of increasing male employment in the maquiladoras, linked to technological change in the production in these plants. Men predominate among technicians responsible to operate/supervise programmable machines and electronic equipment. In her conclusion, the author highlights the needs for labour training for women in order to gain technical skills. The main strength of the paper is to provide much statistical information about employment trends in Mexico.

19. Durano, Marina Fe B. <u>Gender Issues in International Trade</u>, International Gender and Trade Network, Discussion Paper, Washington DC, 2000. Available at http://www.genderand.trade.net/Archives/Marina's%20paper.htm

This paper discusses the impact of international trade on women at the macro, meso and micro-economic level, focusing on the latter, i.e. the impact on household. It proposes to use a framework to examine the impact of trade reforms on household dynamics, focusing on time allocation, task allocation, and access to resources. Regarding the meso-level, the author stresses that gender analysis of trade policy focuses on that level, i.e. income and employment impact of trade reforms. The article provides a good discussion of analytical issues related to trade reform, but does not test it with a particular reform.

20. Espino, Maria Alma, "Women and Mercosur: The Gendered Dimension of Economic Integration", in <u>Women's Empowerment and Economic Justice</u>, New York, UNIFEM, 2000.

This paper offers a quite general discussion of the impact of economic integration on women. It highlights some of the modalities of women's integration in the labour force in Argentina, Brazil, Paraguay and Uruguay, such as the high level of informal employment (especially domestic workers). It also describes briefly the participation of women's group in the regional integration process. However, the paper does not really go beyond advocating an analysis of the impact of regional integration on women that would take in account the diversity of women (age, class, family status, education, urban vs. rural, etc.)

21. Fontana, Marzia and Adrian Wood, "Modeling the Effects of Trade on Women at Work and at Home", World Development, Volume 28, no. 7 (July), 2000.

Article published in a special issue on *Growth, Trade, Finance, and Gender Inequality*. The paper developed a gendered computable general equilibrium (CGE) model that covers all sectors of the market economy as well as social reproduction and leisure activities, to examine the effects of changes in trade policy on women and men. The model is applied to a set of data for Bangladesh. This very good article is a first attempt to use the traditional methodological tools of economics to examine the impact of trade policy on women.

22. Fontana, Marzia, Susan Joekes and Rachel Masika, <u>Global Trade Expansion and Liberalization: Gender Issue and Impacts</u>, A study prepared for the Department of International Development, UK, Brighton, IDS, Report no 42, 1998.

This extensive study provides a very good assessment of the state of knowledge about gender inequality and trade and identifies the gaps in the literature. It highlights the benefits of trade expansion for women's employment in developing countries, but this is largely limited to the industrial sector. In agriculture, the limited evidence shows that the effects of increased exports of cash crops in Africa are generally less favourable to women than men. The authors highlight the lack of research on the impact of trade liberalization in non-traditional agricultural sectors, in primary processing activities, in services industry and small-scale informal sector manufacturing.

The study also offers a gender-aware approach to trade liberalization focusing on women's employment. The authors test their checklist matrix with six cases (Ghana, Uganda, Bangladesh, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, Jamaica). The report concludes that gender equality objectives are not intrinsically in conflict with trade expansion and therefore there is no *a priori* reason to oppose trade liberalization on these grounds. It does not discuss the impact of trade agreements on the capacity of the State to promote gender equality.

23. Joekes, Susan and Ann Weston, <u>Women and the New Trade Agenda</u>, New York, UNIFEM, 1994.

This book argues that increasing international trade provides women with new opportunities for improving their status. It also argues that women's groups need to be involved in the design of trade policies, and may be able to influence it. It highlights that new trade agreements can place important constraints on government's national economic policies. The effects of these constraints on a government's ability to ensure the economic participation of all its citizens, including women, must be closely monitored. This early study on gender and trade is still relevant now, as it offers a detailed analytical discussion of the impact of trade liberalization on employment.

24. Kucera, David and William Milberg, "Gender Segregation and Gender Bias in Manufacturing Trade Expansion: Revisiting the 'Wood Asymmetry'", <u>World Development</u>, volume 28, no. 7, July 2000.

Article published in a special issue on *Growth, Trade, Finance, and Gender Inequality*. This very good empirical research examines the "asymmetry hypothesis" according to which trade between developed and developing countries correspond with an increased female intensity of employment in developing countries and no noticeable negative symmetric effect on the female intensity of employment in the traded-goods sector of industrialized countries. The authors used data from 10 OECD countries from 1978-1995 to analyze the gender bias in North-South trade expansion. Contrary to Wood findings

but confirming earlier research, they found that for most countries (including Canada), growth in trade with developing countries resulted in employment declines that disproportionately affected women. Analysis at the industry level shows that these findings are associated with development in the textiles and clothing sector. The absence or weakness of the gender bias in France, Italy and Germany is mainly due to differences in trade performance of the textiles and clothing industry in these countries.

25. Riley, Maria and Rocio Mejfa <u>Gender in the Global Trading System: Analysis and Strategies from a Gender Focus,</u> Washington: Centre of Concern, 1996.

This policy paper was submitted to the WTO Ministerial Conference in Singapore in 1996. It urges an awareness of gender issues to be reflected in the discussions at the Singapore meeting and advocates for continuing work to redirect trade policies toward equity goals. It does not include original material or new ideas. It calls for: monitoring of trade agreements and national trade policies from a gender perspective; expanding research on the gender dimension of changing global realities; organizing lobbies to influence local, national, regional and international governments and groups to influence trade policy; and developing more participatory, accountable mechanisms for setting international development and trade policy.

26. Vander Stichele, Myriam, <u>Gender, Trade and the WTO: A Ghana case study,</u> Manchester, Women Working Worldwide, 1998.

Women Working Worldwide aimed at providing concrete insights into the gender dimensions of trade and WTO rules. This paper is an original initiative to do so within the existing mechanisms. It was published at the same time as the WTO Trade Policy Review of Ghana in 1999, as a way to introduce gender perspectives into WTO proceedings. The analysis focuses on agriculture, industry and mining. The case study highlights that women in Ghana have traditionally dominated domestic trading, marketing and regulating the markets, but women's participation in international trade seems to be small, limited to importing consumer goods from neighbouring countries or overseas. In the agriculture sector, men mainly control export crops and their earnings. Women's production is mostly limited to food for the family and the domestic market.

27. White, Marceline, "GATS and Women", <u>Foreign Policy in Focus</u>, Vol. 6, No. 2, January 2001.

This brief position paper of a US-based organization, Women's EDGE, focuses on the risks that the GATS represents for public services, which are particularly important for women as workers in these sectors and as consumers of these services. The paper stresses the dangers linked to privatization and liberalization of public services for poor women in developing countries. It recommends that the US Trade Representative (USTR) agency incorporate gender and development in its consultative process and its

trade policymaking. A final recommendation argues that USTR should support developing countries to include safeguards and exemptions for health care, public education, water provisioning and other public welfare needs. The paper does not provide much new or original thinking and material on this topic.

28. Whitehead, Judy, "Women and Trade Policies in the Caribbean", <u>Women's Empowerment and Economic Justice</u>, New York: UNIFEM, 2000.

This paper presents the results of three studies commissioned by UNIFEM on the impact of NAFTA on Caribbean women in Jamaica, in Trinidad and Tobago and in St. Lucia and Barbados. The study concludes that the effects of NAFTA will be largely detrimental to the Jamaican economy in general, and women in particular, due to the competition from Mexico in sectors that traditionally employ large numbers of women such as the garment industry. These types of consequences are less likely to occur in Trinidad, Barbados and St. Lucia, because they do not have a large garment manufacturing sector or any other manufacturing sector dominated by female workers. All the studies agreed that while low-wage industries may move to Mexico, the Caribbean's higher standard in education could allow the region to attract more high-technology industries. The author stressed that the researchers suggested the need for greater research on the actual preferences of Caribbean women regarding work outside the home. The paper includes an interesting discussion of methodological challenges and highlights "case specificity", i.e. the importance of examining each national context to understand the impact of trade on women.

29. Williams, Mariama, <u>Gender and Trade in the International Economy: A Brief Overview</u>, Presented at Seminar on "Financing for Development: New tendencies, new exclusions and new strategies for women in the Region", REPEM-DAWN, Colombia, July 15-1, 2001.

This brief review of some of the academic and NGO literature on the impact of trade liberalization on women identifies two main trends: 1) trade liberalization can exacerbate gender inequalities and 2) existing inequalities can undermine the effectiveness of trade policy because they may adversely affect the re-allocations critical to the successful implementation of the policy. The paper lacks structure in its argumentation and presentation of the material.

TRADE AND LABOUR STANDARDS

Canadian Literature

30. Agocs, Carol, "On the need for effective employment equity and pay equity policy in a global labour market", <u>Roundtable: Globalization of the Economy: The Implications for Labour Markets, society and the State- Conference Proceedings,</u> 2001, available at http://www.cwrn-rcrmt.org/eng/roundtable.cfm

This clear and well-argued policy paper argues that the FTAA should include provisions to ensure effective employment equity and pay equity policies. It points to the leadership Canada has played in that sector. For instance, South Africa, Northern Ireland, the Netherlands, and Australia have used Canada's federal Employment Equity Act as a model for their own legislation. The inclusion of labour rights needs to be addressed in the core of the Agreement (not as a side agreement) and include real enforcement mechanisms.

31. Neil, Maria and Laidlaw-Sly, Cathy, "Globalization and Women's Human Rights: The Implications for Labour Markets, Society and the State", <u>Roundtable: Globalization of the Economy: The Implications for Labour Markets, society and the State- Conference Proceedings</u>, 2001, available at http://www.cwrn-rcrmt.org/eng/roundtable.cfm

This policy brief from the National Council of Women of Canada mentioned a large number of issues for female workers, some of them linked to globalization. For instance, the Council expresses concerns that the decline of state sovereignty caused by the trade agreements can have an impact on working conditions, health and safety of workers and their employment security. It also expresses concerns about the rise of short-term contract employment increasingly used by employers to cut cost and be more competitive in the global markets. This type of employment may not allow women to have sufficient savings for their later years, as it does not offer employment benefits. This policy brief would benefit from a clearer focus, but raises several important questions about globalization and labour markets for women.

32. Lynda Yanz, Bob Jeffcott, Deena Ladd, and Joan Atlin, <u>Policy Options to Improve Standards for Women Garment Workers in Canada and Internationally</u>, Maquila Solidarity Network (Canada), January 1999, available at www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/publish/research/yanz-e.html

Globalization and trade liberalization policies have caused profound changes not only in the international division and global organization of labour, but also in how, by whom and under what conditions our clothes are made in Canada and other countries. The phasing out of Multi-Fibber Agreement quotas by the year 2005, and the elimination of all tariffs between Canada, the US and Mexico under NAFTA by 2003, will only

accelerate these global processes. Although there is considerable debate about the specific impact of trade liberalization in the garment sector on particular countries in the South, the paper argues that competitive pressures will increase on countries, manufacturers and workers to increase productivity and/or the speed of production, and to lower labour costs.

The authors assert that the consequences for the women who sew our clothes (the young women migrating from rural areas to export processing zones and maquiladora regions in the South, the immigrant women of colour recruited to subcontracting and home-based underground economy in the North) are very negative. They have to deal with precarious, virtually unregulated employment; intensive labour and excessive hours of work; inadequate wages and few legally required benefits; discrimination on the basis of gender, race and place of origin; and limited opportunities to organize and improve their situation. The authors examine a variety of possible responses to the deterioration of standards and labour practices in the garment industry caused by trade liberalization. This extensive and well-structured study provides much useful information about garment workers in Canada and abroad.

33. Wiggins, Cindy, <u>The Current Social, Economy and Political Context in Canada and the Implications for Women's Equality Work</u>, Canadian Labour Congress, 1998, available at http://www.clc-ctc.ca/woman/commretreat.html

This paper describes how the new political and socio-economic context makes activism for gender equality more difficult. The paper argues that there has been a shift away from the notion that the government has a social responsibility to act in the public interest toward the privatization of social responsibility. The results are cuts in social programs and the welfare state that serve, in part, to alleviate structural basis for women's inequality. This essay provides a good overview of a union's perspectives on globalization, economic restructuring and gender equality, but do not focus on trade agreements particularly.

International Literature

34. Fontana, Marzia, Susan Joekes and Rachel Masika, <u>Global Trade Expansion and Liberalization: Gender Issue and Impacts</u>, A study prepared for the Department of International Development, UK, Brighton, IDS, Report no 42, 1998.

Part of this report (Section 4) focuses on the mechanisms for review, monitoring and enforcement of labour standards and human rights linked to trade expansion. It provides a good and clear review of the debates about the inclusion of social clauses (labour standards) in trade agreements. It points to the weaknesses of this approach to improve gender equality, as social clauses overlook gender disparities and do not include with women's work that takes place in the informal sector. The authors argue, that on the

other hand, social clauses could enhance female worker's rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining.

35. Kabeer, Naila, <u>Globalization</u>, <u>labour standards and women's rights: tensions and possibilities</u>, Paper presented at conference on "Global Tensions" at Cornell University, March 9-10th, 2001.

The paper examines the tension between labour standards and women's rights. The first section of the paper traces changes in the international division of labour and its implications for North-South trade. It examines the growing demand for linking labour standards and international trade agreements and explores the case of women workers in the Bangladesh export-oriented garment industry and their perspectives on their working conditions. Finally, the paper explores the conditions necessary to use the demand for labour standards to promote women's rights. The discussion on trade is generally superficial, but the information about Bangladeshi women is quite interesting. Surveys and interviews with garment workers show that these women generally have a positive evaluation of their work, often much more than their family or neighbours have, probably reflecting the remaining negative societal views attached to wage-earning women in Bangladesh.

36. Lee, Eddy, "Globalization and Labour Standards: A Review of Issues", <u>International Labour Review</u>, volume 136, no 2, 1997.

The article provides a good and useful review of some of the major contending positions in the ongoing debate on the role of international labour standards in the context of globalization. It covers the debate in international political fora and in recent economic analyses on the desirability and feasibility of a social clause, the impact of core labour standards on competitiveness and economic development, and the relative merits of alternative instruments for achieving a fuller observance of core labour standards. It argues that a wide gulf still prevails between contending positions and that the empirical evidence to resolve some of these differences remains limited and inconclusive.

37. Women Working Worldwide, <u>Trade Liberalization and the Rights of Women Workers: Are Social Clauses the Answer?</u> Manchester, 1996, available at http://www.poptel.org.uk/women-ww/trade_liberalisation.htm.

This position paper challenges the view that the integration of a social clause in trade agreements would be very useful for female workers. Indeed, women's work tends to be beyond the reach of existing national and international regulation. Much of it is unrecognized and unremunerated domestic, agricultural and industrial labour. Even paid employment in export industries is often hidden in homes or small workshops, at the end of a company's subcontracting chain. Women workers generally are more likely to be employed on a part-time, casual or temporary basis. A social clause can only relate to

paid work. It is also highly unlikely that international standards would be enforced beyond the formal sector.

Therefore, it argues that the inclusion of a social clause in international trade agreements should not be seen as a panacea for the protection of worker's rights. The benefits of existing proposals are uncertain and much would depend on the manner of implementation. A social clause could only improve conditions for women workers in the context of a wider international programme in support of both workers' and women's rights. The priority should be the commitment of more international resources to initiatives which among others: challenge the free trade agenda, combat the power of multinationals in the global economy, and support workers mobilization. The paper is quite short, but the argument regarding the social clause is clear and interesting.

TRADE AND MIGRATION

Canadian Literature

38. Gibb, Heather (ed), <u>Canadian Perspectives on Labour Mobility in APEC</u>, Ottawa, The North-South Institute, 1997.

This book includes one brief chapter adopting a gender analysis, i.e. a paper on Filipina domestic workers in Canada. The chapter provides some historical background on the Canadian immigration rules for domestic workers and an overview of the policy issues raised by this program: rights and benefits of these workers, the unequal relationship with the employer, working conditions and ability to ascertain their rights. The strength of the paper is that it is based on focus group- based research with Filipina workers in Canada.

39. Young, Allison, <u>Liberalization and Regulation of the Movement of Service Suppliers:</u> Comparing the Provisions for Labour Mobility in the General Agreement on Trade in Services, the North American Free Trade Agreement, and the European Union, Doctoral Thesis, Dalhousie University, 2001.

This doctoral thesis examines how the movement of services suppliers is not only required by multinational corporations to be competitive in trade in services, but also relates to foreign direct investment, technology transfer, remittance as well as to sensitive domestic regulatory issues such as immigration, labour market development and professional accreditation. Accommodation between the objectives of trade liberalization and domestic regulation is one of the key issue negotiations on trade in services. This thesis does not include a gender perspective but provides a thorough background on the mobility provisions of the GATS, NAFTA and the European Union treaties.

International Literature

40. APEC, <u>Firm Expatriation Policy and Practice in Service Trade: The Gender Dimension</u>, May 14, 2001.

This paper presents the results of a survey of 80 multinational companies located in Chinese Taipei and 80 Chinese Taipei multinational companies on the participation of female professionals in intra-company transfers. The survey focused on firms providing services (75% of the sample vs. 25% for manufacturing firms). When asked what factors provide men with an advantage over women as candidates for intra-firm expatriation, the respondents perceived "personal safety concern", "spousal employment" and "personal interests and motivations". Therefore, the report suggests that WTO governments incorporate personal safety measures and adaptation for family members in the package in the package of expatriate adjustment facilitation, as reduction of mobility barriers for this expatriate (which constitute an important portion of mode 4 trade) could help liberalize mode 4

A critical view of this suggestion would highlight two points. First, the survey is based on the perception of multinational firms of the cross-border mobility barriers for women professionals. A survey of female expatriates or candidates for such positions would be more useful to measure barriers to mobility. Secondly, the report does not discuss whether it is the government or the firm's role to provide adjustment facilitation for the relocated employees. This report is a useful exploratory survey, but could not be the basis for policy decisions at this point.

41. Fitzpatrick, Joan, Kelly, Katrina R, "Gendered Aspects of Migration: Law and the Female Migrant", <u>Hastings International and Comparative Law Review</u>, Volume 22, no 1, 1998.

This paper discusses national and international responses to female migration. It aims to "expose ways in which the legal regulation of migration reproduces and exacerbates the social and cultural inequalities that disempower female migrants." However, it also points out where law has the potential to promote and protect migrant worker's rights. The authors conclude that although the international system has paid little attention to the particular needs of foreign female household workers, it does offer some hope. The abuses suffered by these women implicate several established international norms, which include but are not limited to the right to physical integrity and the prohibition against forced labour. Recently, international law has begun to turn its attention to the violence directed at female migrant workers. For example, the Declaration on Violence Against Women and reports of the Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women reflects a growing consensus that states must protect domestic workers from violence by their employers. The authors also discuss the problems and benefits of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and their Families and the International Labour Organization's efforts to address the rights of domestics. This article provides interesting legal analysis of women's migration.

42. Ghosh, Bimal. <u>Gains from global linkages: Trade in services and movements of persons</u>, New York, St. Martin's Press, 1997.

The author argues that further liberalization of trade in services under the General Agreement on Trade in Services will increase trade-related migration, and that this migration will benefit both developing and industrial countries. Thus, trade-related migration should, Ghosh argues, be regulated by an internationally harmonized visa regime for trade-related movements as distinct from migration for employment or permanent settlement. GATS already covers the movement of all types of temporary movements of natural persons as service providers and consumers. The author would like signatories to GATS to adopt this principle to facilitate all types of temporary labour movements, skilled as well as non-skilled workers; intra-firm transferees and self employed service providers. Once this principle is established, the author believes that immigration systems could be modified to facilitate non-immigrant movements. The paper does not examine the gender implications of this proposal.

43. Huang, Fung-Yea <u>International Migration and Labour Standards: The Gender</u> Dimensions and APEC's Role, Taiwan Institute of Economic Research, 2000.

This report provides a good case study of migrant women workers in APEC nations focusing on Taiwan and China flows. Based on this examination, the paper argues that regional trade organizations such as APEC may have an advantage over the WTO in addressing labour standards in the short and medium terms, because they can building on cooperation on education, training and gender statistics collection. The analytical section where the paper examines how globalization extends household sexual division of labour into international sexual division of labour is a bit weak.

44. Simmons, A. (ed) <u>International Migration</u>, <u>Refugee flows and Human Rights: The Impact of Trade and Restructuring</u>, New York, The Centre for Migration Studies, 1996.

This book concerns regional trade agreements and how North and Central America, Mexico, the United States, and the Caribbean are responding to globalization and associated patterns of inequality, social conflict, and international migration. The papers in this volume provide observations based on recent economic or migration statistics, surveys, and field observations. This volume addresses the links between NAFTA, migration, and human rights in the Hemisphere - a central topic in the current debate on regional economic integration, impacts on women, racial minorities, and the poor. The gender analysis is still limited.

45. Sweetman, Caroline (ed), <u>Gender and Migration</u>, Oxford. Oxfam, 1998, available at http://www.oxfam.org.uk.

This book is a collection of eight short articles that covers women working as maids in Canada and Lebanon, seasonal migration in India, Asian immigrants in the UK and migrants in Uganda and Bosnia. There is a useful list of recommended readings and addresses for further information

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND ABORIGINAL WOMEN

Canadian Literature

46. Brascoupé, Simon and Karin Endemann, <u>Intellectual Property and Aboriginal People:</u> <u>A Working Paper</u>, Paper commissioned by the Research and Analysis Directorate, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Intellectual Property Policy Directorate, Industry Canada, 1999.

This paper argues that while existing Canadian intellectual property (IP) laws are not well suited for protecting all types of traditional knowledge in all instances, they may be useful in some cases. The value of using existing IP regimes is that the law is established, and can be enforced throughout Canada. Lessons from the use of existing IP systems by Aboriginal people may help identify issues that need to be addressed, and help to ensure that benefits from using indigenous knowledge are shared with the Aboriginal custodians. This paper is intended to raise awareness of issues related to protecting Aboriginal traditional knowledge and intellectual property from misappropriation and misuse. It is also intended to help Aboriginal people address issues of control and access related to their traditional knowledge and culture. This is a good first exploration, but does not include a focus on aboriginal women's traditional knowledge.

47. Simon Brascoupé and Howard Mann, <u>A Community Guide to Protecting Indigenous Knowledge</u>, Paper commissioned by the Research and Analysis Directorate, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 2001.

This guide outlines key issues and practical steps that can be taken to empower communities to recognize, protect, preserve and share their knowledge in keeping with their goals and traditions. It begins by exploring what indigenous knowledge means and includes, and the reasons why Aboriginal peoples have begun to take active measures to preserve and protect it. The guide then suggests specific steps that can be taken, using a community development model, to begin the process of preserving and protecting community indigenous knowledge. The guide does not include specific recommendations for women's knowledge.

48. Julie Delahanty, "Gender and the Gene Giants: Research and action on women and the new genetics", in <u>The Gender of Genetic Futures: The Canadian Biotechnology Strategy, Women and Health</u>, Proceedings of a National Strategic Workshop held at York University, February 11-12, 2000.

This brief paper reviews the key gender equality research and policy questions linked to four intellectual property issues: the use of genetics in the pharmaceutical industry, corporate concentration in the biotechnology industry, the creation of genetically-modified plants producing sterile seeds and the risk of biological warfare. Several of the gender equality research questions on these new issues raised by the author are quite innovative.

49. International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, Protecting Indigenous Women's Intellectual Property, 1999.

This brief report lists the guiding principles to govern the trade relations related to indigenous women's cultural heritage. Ownership of the cultural heritage is collective, permanent, and inalienable. The guideline indicates how indigenous groups should enter in a contract where commercial companies use elements of their cultural heritage. This is a very practical document, with an exhaustive list of what should be included in contracts involving indigenous women's intellectual property.

50. Rosemary J Coombe, "Preserving Cultural Diversity through the Preservation of Biological Diversity: Indigenous Peoples, Local Communities, and the Role of Digital Technologies", The Gender of Genetic Futures: The Canadian Biotechnology Strategy, Women and Health, Proceedings of a National Strategic Workshop held at York University, February 11-12, 2000.

This policy article commissioned by the Council of Europe examines how the Convention on Biological Diversity can be used to protect traditional knowledge in a more useful way than intellectual property rights international agreements. This legal discussion highlights that in Canada, except for the Northwest Territories, no government has developed a policy regarding traditional knowledge. The paper also points at the lack of indigenous women's involvement in project using digital technology, such as the Internet, for biodiversity and cultural preservation purposes. However, gender analysis is quite marginal in the article, the focus being rather a legal analysis of international agreements.

51. Mann, Howard <u>Indigenous Peoples and the Use of Intellectual Property Rights in Canada: Case Studies relating to Intellectual Property Rights and the Protection of Biodiversity</u>, Commissioned by Industry Canada, Ottawa, 1997.

The study intends to provide case studies on intellectual property and to draw lessons from the experiences of Canada's Aboriginal communities. It describes six case studies relating to the use of intellectual property rights by aboriginal peoples in Canada, but none focuses on Aboriginal women.

TRADE AND HEALTH CARE

Canadian Literature

52. Blouin, Chantal, John Foster and Ron Labonté, <u>Canadian Foreign Policy and Health:</u> <u>Toward Policy Coherence</u>, Report prepared for the Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada, Health and Globalization Research Project, forthcoming.

This research paper reviews the different aspects of Canadian foreign policy as it relates to health. It includes our human rights commitments on health, our international development activities related to health, the provision of health global public goods and our trade commitments which have an impact on health such as agreements on intellectual property and health services. It concludes with recommendations for policy coherence. It does not include gender analysis of Canadian foreign policy on health.

53. Armstrong, Pat, "The Context for Health Care Reform in Canada", in Armstrong, Pat and al., <u>Exposing Privatization: Women and Health Care Reform in Canada</u>, Garamond Press, 2002.

This informative and well-written chapter examines a number of variables affecting health care reforms in recent years, including international trade agreements. The author reviews a number of opinions regarding the question of the potential impact of trade agreements, especially NAFTA, on the Canadian health care system. The paper discusses the impact of increased intellectual property rights protection to comply with trade agreements. This decreases access to prescription drugs protected by patents by increasing their prices. The chapter includes a good bibliography.

54. Canadian Health Coalition, <u>Standing Together For Medicare: A Call to Care</u>, A Submission to the Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada, November 2001.

This submission argues for the complete exclusion of health services from trade agreements. The document expresses concerns about the current exposure of the Medicare system to trade rules contained in the NAFTA and the GATS, which put in danger its public services character. It recommends that Canada negotiate a general exemption in all trade agreements for health care systems. This paper is mostly based on work done by Matt Sanger (see below) and does not provide new material or a gender analysis of the issue.

55. Canadian Labour Congress, <u>Statement by the Canadian Labour Congress to the Royal Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada</u>, December 2001.

The statement argues that given the public good nature of health care, it should be excluded from the rules of international trade, as they are designed to extend commercial activities into all sectors and to limit national government's ability to intervene in their economy. This submission is similar to the one by the Canadian Health Coalition: it also recommends the negotiations of a general exemption in all trade agreements for health care and does not include a specific gender analysis.

56. Lexchin, Joel, Matthew Sanger and Steven Schrybman, <u>Assessing the Impact of Trade and Investment Agreements on Canadian Health Services and Health Policy</u>, Report prepared for the Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada, Health and Globalization Health Project, forthcoming.

This paper reviews the legal consequences of Canada's international trade commitments on our health system. It focuses on the impact of the investment protection clauses of NAFTA and the impact of the GATS. Insurance for prescription drugs and homecare receive special attention in this study. The report includes policy recommendations and does not include a gender analysis of trade and health services.

57. The National Action Committee for the Status of Women, <u>Women, Globalization and Trade</u>, March 2000.

Brief issue paper highlighting the impact of the WTO General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) and Agreement on Intellectual Property (TRIPS) on access to health care, based on existing material such as Matthew Sanger's book on GATS and health. It also discusses the secrecy of trade negotiations and proposes strategies for action for Canadian women. The audience of the paper is the general public, and would not be useful for researchers. However, it offers a clear presentation of the views of a Canadian women's group.

58. Sanger, Matt, <u>Reckless Abandon: Canada, the GATS and the Future of Health Care,</u> CCPA, Ottawa, 2001.

This book examines the implications of the General Agreement on Trade in Services for the Canadian health care system. It argues that our health care system is already exposed to a number of the GATS trade rules. It also criticizes the export promotion strategy adopted by the Canadian government in that sector. Finally, it recommends that Canada build international mechanisms for addressing health as a global public good, not as a commodity. The book has a controversial tone, but started a dynamic public discussion around the impact of trade agreements on health care.

- 59. Sinclair, Scott, GATS: How the WTO's New "Services" Negotiations Threaten Democracy, Ottawa, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, 2000. {Comment below}
- 60. Sinclair, Scott and Jim Grieshaber-Otto, <u>Facing the Facts: A Guide to the GATS Debate</u>, Ottawa, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, 2002.

These two small books from Scott Sinclair are at the heart of a debate about the policy implications of the WTO General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS). The argument focuses on the broad impact of the GATS on the capacity of governments to determine national policy. Reviewing the content of the agreement, he examines how the GATS imposes a number of constraints on policymaking. Even though not expressed in these terms, one key concern of the author is that the policy paradigm of commercialization of services embedded in the GATS is not compatible with policy preferences focusing on protection of public services and regulation in the name of the public interest.

Given that there has not yet been a WTO dispute to test the compatibility of GATS with national government ability to regulate or to provide public services, the debate focuses on interpretations of the provisions of the agreement. Indeed, in the second book, the authors respond to the critics that highlighted the flexible character of the GATS in terms of providing for sectoral commitments, public services exceptions, right to regulate, and others.

The main objective of these two books are to alert analysts and citizens to the breath of the GATS in terms of its impact on national policymaking, and it is successful in doing so, in a relatively accessible and detailed way. The study does not include a gender-focused analysis. Its key contribution is to highlight for researchers how the various provisions of the GATS have potentially broad policy implications, including for gender-equality policies.

61. Vellinga, Jake, "International Trade, Health Systems and Services: A Health Policy Perspective", in Curtis, John (ed), <u>Trade Policy Research 2001</u>, Ottawa, Ministry of Public Works and Government Services, 2001.

This paper examines the impact of international trade agreements on health services. It examines how the four modes of services delivery of the GATS applies in the health sector, and attempts to bring together some empirical evidence of this trade in Canada. The author agrees that the debates about trade liberalization and privatization are closely linked, as the arguments for both are quite similar: better cost control, improved efficiency and quality of care. However, the empirical evidence does not support these arguments. The author stresses that most industrialized nations, except for the US, have health care systems that are predominantly publicly financed, and provide universal coverage and access to achieve better outcomes, efficiency and cost control. The public nature of these systems is reflected in the low-level of commitments taken by developed countries in the GATS in health services. Unlike Sanger, he does not believe the Canadian health care system is highly exposed to the disciplines of the GATS. This article does not include a gender-specific analysis.

International Literature

62. Correa, Carlos, "Implementing National Public Health Policies in the Framework of WTO Agreement", Journal of World Trade, vol.34, no 5, 2000.

This article explores how the application of the WTO agreements may affect the sovereign rights of States to protect and promote public health, when the exercise of such rights requires the adoption of policies that may be inconsistent with trade liberalization obligations. The article focuses on the room for manoeuvre left to WTO members to adopt public health measures, by examining the various WTO agreements which have an impact on public health such as the Agreement on Sanitary and Phyto-Sanitary Measures, Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade, Agreement on Intellectual Property and by reviewing the jurisprudence of WTO dispute cases. This good overview does not include a gender analysis of this question, but examines possible strategies to safeguard public health interests within the WTO system.

63. Sauvé, Pierre and Robert Stern (eds.), <u>Services 2000: New Directions in Services Trade Liberalization</u>, Washington DC, Brookings Institute and Centre for Business and Governments, Harvard University, 2000.

In the same vein as Stephenson (2000 see below), this book explores how to move the liberalization of trade in services forward, this time focusing on the multilateral agenda. The first part of this book provides quantitative and qualitative assessment of the benefits of trade and investment liberalization in the service sectors. One interesting point made in that sector is that trade policy has not been an important engine of liberalization in services up to now. In most national settings, the changes over the last ten to fifteen

years in telecommunications, financial and a variety of services have been national reforms based on the policymakers' assumptions that privatization, competition in previously monopolized markets, deregulation or allowing private investment are more efficient policy options. They have not originated in negotiated concessions.

The rest of the book focuses on a number of issues related to the GATS agreement itself and the new negotiations at the WTO. Domestic regulation receives particular attention. Some key points discussed include how to create a dialogue between national regulators and trade negotiators as well as how to ensure the equilibrium between trade liberalization and public policy objectives of national regulation. This book does not include a gender-specific analysis of trade liberalization in services. Its objective is to provide practitioners with reflections and reform proposals to make the GATS more effective, i.e. allow for greater liberalization of trade in services. Therefore, the broader political analysis of the impact of trade agreements is not provided.

64. Spieldock, Alexandra, <u>GATS and Healthcare: Why Do Women Care?</u>, International Gender and Trade Network Secretariat, October 2001.

This is a basic economic literacy module for the use of women's organizations and the general public that examines the impact of the WTO General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) on health care services. The brief overview is a very critical evaluation on the GATS, focusing on the various threats it can represent for women. Some the issues raised, such as brain drain and the danger of privatization, have been raised in other publications, whereas the issue of the dangers of telehealth and telemedicine for women's health are not well-argued and grounded on evidence.

65. Stephenson, Sherry (ed), <u>Services Trade in the Western Hemisphere: Liberalization</u>, <u>Integration and Reform</u>, Washington, D.C., Brookings Institution Press and General Secretariat of the OAS, 2000.

This edited book aims to compare the international agreements in trade in services linking the countries of the Hemisphere. The book is representative of a body of technical literature on trade in services, which is targeted primarily to policymakers and trade negotiators. Most chapters are limited to a legal and technical discussion of the agreements, and some include analysis and recommendations on how to improve trade agreements to achieve greater liberalisation of international services markets. The main weakness of the book is the lack of a broader analysis of the policy and social issues related to the liberalisation of trade in services. For instance, an analysis of the political economy of the sector would help to understand the actors involved, their interests and strategies and hence, the context within which agreements are developed. Unfortunately, the authors, who know very well the mechanics of the agreements, do not address the questions currently raised in the policy debates regarding the impact of GATS on government regulatory capacity and the commodification of public services implied in

the trade agreements on services. There is no gender specific analysis included in this volume as well as in this type of literature.

66. World Health Organization, <u>International Consultations on Assessment of Trade in Health Services and GATS: Research and Monitoring Priorities</u>, Geneva, 9-11 January 2002

Cross-border trade in health services is believed to be growing steadily, and negotiations on trade in services are moving forward at the WTO and in regional forums. However, there is very little known about the actual level of trade that is taking place and on the impact of this trade on health. This report presents the recommendations of a group of trade and health experts regarding a research agenda to examine these questions. The key public policy questions were: What are the net effects of trade in health services, i.e. can its effects on the health system be weighed or measured against trade or economic effects? How can trade in health services be used to improve health and health systems and contribute toward the goal of providing universal access to health care? What are the effects of liberalization on trade in health services under different types of regulatory systems and which regulations are effective in mitigating any harmful effects on the health system? The paper does not include gender analysis, but is an important document in terms of agenda setting. (Note: In April 2002, IDRC held a two-day workshop at its Regional office for Latin America and the Caribbean to discuss similar research agenda for the region).

67. WTO, <u>Health and Social Services: Background Note by the Secretariat</u>, S/C/W/50,18 September 1998.

The key elements of this background note on trade in health services are the following: 1) trade considerations have not proved a dominant policy concern for health, except for the international migration of health professionals, 2) there is a wide diversity of institutional arrangements for providing and financing health care in OECD countries 3) the exemption from GATS disciplines for services provided in the exercise of governmental authority only clearly applies to medical and hospital services provided directly through the government, free of charge (no competition, no commercial basis) 4) many developing countries have made wide ranging commitments on health and medical services. The document does not include gender analysis and is a bit outdated now.

TRADE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Canadian Literature

68. Bronson, Diana and Lucie Lamarche, <u>A Human Rights Framework for Trade in the Americas</u>, Montréal, Rights and Democracy, 2001.

This detailed and critical assessment of the potential negative impact of the FTAA on human rights focuses on three rights: health, education and food. The analysis is based on the experiences with NAFTA and the WTO. For instance, the authors examined how the capacity of the government to implement the right to health is limited by the investor protection in NAFTA, which has been used by foreign investors to challenge environmental and public health measures. The analysis does not include a specific focus on gender dimensions, but is thorough and clearly presented. Their recommendations stress that the primacy of human rights over international trade law must be recognized and that the process of negotiations should be made more transparent.

69. Howse, Robert and Makua Mutua <u>Protecting Human Rights in a Global Economy:</u> <u>Challenges for the World Trade Organization</u> Montréal, International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, 2000.

This paper does not adopt a gender analysis lens but offers a good analysis of the interaction between trade agreements and human rights treaties. The authors argue that trade and human rights regimes need not be in conflict, so long as the trade regime is interpreted and applied in a manner consistent with the human rights obligations of states. This interpretation respects the hierarchy of norms in international law, where human rights, to the extent that they have the status of custom in international law, and certainly where they have the status of preemptory norms, will normally prevail over specific, conflicting provisions of any treaties including trade agreements. The authors remind us that the preamble of the WTO Agreement, which establishes the framework for the entire WTO system, does not make free trade an end in itself. Rather, it establishes the objectives of the system as related to the fulfillment of basic human values, including the improvement of living standards for all people and sustainable development. Both in development literature as well as in numerous documents of international policy, these objectives cannot be reached without respect for human rights.

70. International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, <u>Globalization</u>, <u>Trade and Human Rights: The Canadian Business Perspective</u>, Report of a conference held in Toronto on February 22, 1996.

This conference aimed at stimulating debate in the business community about the relationship between globalization and human rights. Women rights' were not addressed directly. The discussions focused on: the inclusion of a social clause in the WTO

agreements, corporate codes of conduct, the positive impact of international trade, investment, capital and technology for greater transparency and democratization, and worker's rights abuses in China.

International Literature

71. Human Rights Watch, <u>Trading Away Rights: The Unfulfilled Promise of NAFTA's Labour Side Agreement</u>, 2001.

This well documented report evaluates the North American Agreement on Labour Cooperation, the most ambitious link between labour rights and international trade ever adopted. They identify the lack of enforcement mechanisms and the lack of an independent oversight body as the key structural weaknesses of this NAFTA's side agreement. The evaluation does not include a gender specific assessment, but includes specific recommendations to make the agreement more effective.

72. Peratis, Kathleen, Kerr, Joanna, Schneider, Elizabeth M, "Markets and Women's International Human Rights (Roundtable Discussions)", <u>Brooklyn Journal of International Law</u>, volume 25(1), 1999.

This article is the transcript from two roundtable discussions on the impact of globalization on women's human rights held at the Brooklyn Law School, chaired by Kathleen Peratis. Joanna Kerr, a senior researcher at the North-South Institute, examined globalization as an economic growth model and the extent to which this model negatively impacts on women in their home and paid labour duties. Martina Vandenberg, a researcher with Human Rights Watch, discussed how globalization has impacted on women in concrete contexts - employment discrimination on the basis of sex in the Russian Federation and in Mexico, and the trafficking of women and girls into Thailand. Liz Schneider, a professor at Brooklyn Law School, provided a broader historical framework to talk about evaluating successes and future plans. In particular she discussed the challenge that feminist work has posed to the paradigms of international human rights and economic development and issues of the public/private. The three texts look at the issue from very different perspectives but still offer interesting insights, especially the first two that offer more specific examples of their analysis.

TRADE AND WOMEN ENTREPRENEURS

Canadian Literature

73. DFAIT and EDC, <u>Going Global: World Markets for Women Entrepreneurs</u>, in CanadExport, Winter 2002.

This supplement to the bi-monthly governmental newsletter on international trade "CanadExport" provides quick portraits of six Canadian women exporters with their advice for other women entrepreneurs. It provides interesting practical views on international trade from a Canadian perspective. The document also presents the new website for women exporters:

http://www.infoexport.gc.ca/businesswomen/default.asp

74. Foundation of Canadian Women Entrepreneurs, <u>Services to Global Markets: A Profile of Canadian Women Who Export Services</u>, 1998.

This short report presents the results of a survey of 65 Canadian women and of focus groups with 59 businesswomen in the service sector. Over 86 percent of Canadian businesses owned by women are in the services industries. This is the first national research that attempts to document who they are, what they do, where they export to, how they export and what their major challenges are. The report highlights some interesting points such as the high importance of personal networks and referral for success abroad and the challenge exporting represents for the family life of businesswomen, given the need for frequent travel. On a more positive note, the women surveyed stressed that foreign markets are less difficult to enter and that it is rare not to get paid, although timely payment is more difficult.

75. Menzies, Heather, <u>Women and the Knowledge-based Economy and Society</u>, Ottawa, SWC, 1998.

Status of Women Canada commissioned this discussion paper. It defines what the Knowledge-Based Economy and Society (KBES) means, particularly as it relates to women. It then explores the possibilities, and the dangers, associated with the KBES for women, as entrepreneurs, as self-employed and other non-standard workers, and as teleworkers. Regarding women entrepreneurs, the paper mentioned the problem of access to credit and the potential of ICT for networking and business development. This paper raises interesting questions and issues, but its main focus is not entrepreneurship, or trade issues.

76 Rayman, Ruth <u>Beyond Borders: Canadian Businesswomen in International Trade</u>, Ottawa, Government of Canada, 1999.

Based on a survey and in-depth interviews, this descriptive report provides a portrait of Canadian women exporters and identifies some of the impediments for export development. Their business activities focus on the American markets, and are mostly merchandise exports, not services. Canadian women exporters are experienced managers (with on average 15 years of business experience) who enter foreign markets quickly after start-up. The key challenges for women exporters identified in the study are: international marketing (cost of developing foreign markets, obtaining market information and establishing effective distribution networks), and that the business community does not take them seriously. The women interviewed agreed that personal contacts with potential customers and business associates are the key to international success (i.e. importance of networking and personal visits abroad). The report does not include a discussion of trade agreements, but offers original data on the activities of Canadian women entrepreneurs.

77. Zheng, Connie, <u>Gender and Lifelong Learning: Enhancing the Contributions of Women to SMEs in the Asia Pacific Region for the 21st Century, Asia-Pacific Research Institute, Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia, December 1998. 264 pp.</u>

The scope of the Canadian case study in this book is limited to national initiatives and concludes there is a segmentation of career preparation and business development needs of women in Canada: (1) basic education and skills upgrading for one group (2) professional training and management opportunities for a second group and (3) business training and supports for a third group. The major focus of the paper is on more advanced lifelong learning requirements of women managers and small business owners in high growth sectors. The book does not focus specifically on trade policy issues and hence may be of limited interests to researchers interested in the impact of trade agreements on women.

International Literature

78. Bang Jee Chun, Women Entrepreneurs in SMEs in the APEC Region, APEC, 1999.

This broad comparative study was a project of APEC's Policy Level Group on Small and Medium Size Enterprises. It contains parallel case studies providing a portrait of women entrepreneurs in Australia, Canada, Indonesia, Korea, Mexico, Philippines, Taiwan and the US. It also describes the policies and programs in support of women entrepreneurs in each country. These descriptive reports do not focus in particular on international trade and women, although it does mention programs supporting export development.

79. OECD, <u>Recommendations from the 2nd OECD Conference on Women Entrepreneurs in SMEs, "Realizing the Benefits of Globalization and the Knowledge-based Economy"</u>, Paris, 29-30 November 2000.

This conference led to recommendations with respect to measures that need to be taken in four areas: 1) further development of the entrepreneurship culture among women; 2) better access to financing for women-owned businesses; 3) improved knowledge and statistical data on women entrepreneurship; and 4) increased participation of women entrepreneurs in international trade. The latter can be achieved through better information on international markets and the establishment of private-public networks to support the internationalization of women entrepreneurs. Most of these four recommendations are complemented by specific and interesting proposals on how to implement them.

80. OECD, <u>Increasing Women Entrepreneurs' Participation in International Trade and the Global Economies: Technologies and Partnering</u>, Issues paper prepared for The 2nd OECD Conference on Women Entrepreneurs in SMEs, "Realizing the Benefits of Globalization and the Knowledge-based Economy", Paris, 29-30 November 2000.

This useful issue paper highlights the particular challenges for the internationalization of women-owned businesses such as the difficulties in obtaining the financing and guarantees for exports because of a lack of collateral. This is a common problem in the types of businesses many women are operating (i.e. services and retail sectors). The paper also briefly discusses the opportunities offered to women entrepreneurs by information and communications technologies (including on-line networking) for international trade.