

Department of Canadian Heritage

Evaluation of the Family Violence Initiative – Multiculturalism Program

FINAL REPORT
September 18, 2002

Submitted by:

Positive Outcomes Consulting Services

Erica Bell-Lowther, Ph.D., M.S.W.

Vera Radyo, M.A., B.Sc.

4336 Capilano Road, North Vancouver, V7R 4J7

Tel: (604) 904-3808; Fax: (604) 904-3775

E-Mail: veradyo@shaw.ca

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | Page Number |
|--|-------------|
| Executive Summary | 2 |
| I. Introduction | 7 |
| II. Program Profile | 8 |
| III. Evaluation Profile | 11 |
| IV. Evaluation Findings | 13 |
| 1. Program Relevance | 13 |
| 2. Program Logic | 15 |
| 3. Program Administration and Effectiveness | 31 |
| 4. Lessons Learned and Future Directions | 37 |
| V. Conclusions | 43 |
| VI. Recommendations | 45 |
| Management Response | 48 |

I. Executive Summary

This report presents the findings of the evaluation of the Department of Canadian Heritage (PCH) Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative (FVI) 1997 – 2002. It assesses the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative with respect to:

- Program relevance
- Program logic (capacity to produce the desired impacts and effects);
- Program administration and effectiveness; and
- Lessons learned and future directions.

Canadian Heritage is one of seven federal Departments that receives an annual allocation from Treasury Board through the national Family Violence Initiative. Of the \$460,000 that Canadian Heritage receives, \$215,000 is allocated to the Multiculturalism FVI, \$215,000 to the Aboriginal Women's Program and \$30,000 is allocated to the Strategic Policy and Management Branch for evaluation and research.

Program Relevance

The goal of the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative is to provide information for immigrants and first generation Canadians about the risk factors of family violence and the need for public involvement in responding to the problem. This clearly fits within the mandate of the Department of Canadian Heritage, which has the primary responsibility within government for connecting with ethno-cultural communities and ensuring that federal programs are accessible to Canadians of diverse cultural origins. The Multiculturalism FVI links to two of the Department's strategic objectives – *"Building Capacity"* and *"Canadians Connected to One Another"*.

In addition, the Multiculturalism FVI is a critical element in the federal Family Violence Initiative in that it supports the first strategic objective of the FVI of promoting "public awareness of the risk factors of family violence and the need for public involvement in responding to the problem".¹ It does this by reaching those people who have cultural and linguistic barriers to accessing information through mainstream media.

Program Logic

PCH constructed a Program Logic Model or Performance Indicator Chart that identifies the intended outputs and outcomes. Evidence gathered for the evaluation indicates that program activities and outputs are linked to desired short and long term outcomes in a valid and logical way. The primary targeted output was family violence prevention information through multilingual radio and television interviews. Four additional targeted outputs included: multilingual public service announcements (PSAs), ethnic print media, an English as a Second Language (ESL) resource kit and a French as a Second Language (FSL) resource kit. All respondents agreed that these were the primary vehicles to reach ethnocultural communities.

PCH has achieved outstanding results in its primary area of focus - multilingual radio and television interviews, as well as in the production of multilingual PSAs. Several respondents indicated this is likely the first initiative within Canada that had any real impact in reaching a wide range of ethnic audiences on the topic of family violence. A major contributing factor to

¹ Family Violence Strategic Plan 2001 - 2002, Draft April 6, 2001.

this success is the exemplary model of a true government, media and community partnership in planning and delivering desired results.

PCH delivered the multilingual radio and television broadcasts through community partners in the three largest immigrant receiving cities in Canada – Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver. Based upon defined criteria, including expertise in family violence issues within ethnocultural communities, PCH chose to work with COSTI-IIAS (Toronto), Shield of Athena (Montreal), People’s Law School (Vancouver) and Vancouver and Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services. These groups and the key staff within them, have been consistent providers of the program throughout the 1998 – 2002 years. This has resulted in building upon already established expertise within the community agencies. They have produced remarkable results: 98 original television programs and 174 radio programs directed at 48 linguistic and cultural communities. The television programs have been shown 502 times and the radio programs aired 261 times. From all accounts, there is now discussion within ethnocultural communities about the issues of family violence, where there was previously none. An invisible issue has now become visible!

The PSAs were produced by Rogers CFMT, a multilingual television station in Toronto, who worked with PCH and a community partner. The result was an award winning PSA in 14 languages (plus English and French) on the theme “Violence hurts us all”. CFMT covered the production and airtime costs. Over 3 million viewers² in Southern Ontario saw the PSAs in the first two months of campaign in 1999. In addition, the PSAs were distributed free of charge to 30 ethnic and specialty channels across Canada, with a minimum of 1500 showings in the first nine months.

While articles were developed on family violence for inclusion by ethnic print media, the organization, which had the contract for distribution, ceased operation before the articles were disseminated to the print media. The development of an ESL resource kit on family violence was delayed for unavoidable reasons and is now in process of being developed. Development of the FSL kit is awaiting the learnings of the ESL kit and is scheduled for the next phase of the FVI.

A review of current research strongly supports the continued relevance of family violence awareness raising activities for ethnic and visible minority communities, especially those in communities with a home language of other than English or French. The literature indicates that immigrant women’s cultures, contexts and legal status may increase vulnerability for abuse.

The literature also identified resiliency factors embedded in immigrant cultures and contexts, which can be used by policies and programs to better serve these populations. The research strongly supported the need for culturally tailored, educational outreach initiatives, targeted to specific immigrant communities, whose outcomes include increased community awareness. In addition, research findings indicate that community based organizations and community leaders should be encouraged to participate in educational outreach to ensure that messages are culturally appropriate.

There were many positive spin-offs from the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative over the past five years. These include:

² 3 million viewers or “gross impressions”, that is, the estimated audience of a program times the number of times the PSA is shown on that program.

- Additional family violence projects funded through PCH Departmental resources - PCH provided over \$1 million support for 48 additional multicultural family violence projects across Canada (often outside of the three largest metropolitan areas) between 1997 and 2002.
- Contributions by corporate and community partners – community and corporate partners contributed well over \$650,000 to the success of the initiative.
- Enhanced community capacity – the broadcasts were found to be a catalyst in bringing community members together to deal with family violence. The community partners reported that, in several cases, professionals subsequently formed collaborative teams to assist victims and communities develop parenting workshops and other educational initiatives.
- Increased community awareness and education – the tapes produced for the broadcasts have been in high demand by a broad range of organizations, including women’s shelters, police and ethnic groups. In addition, many communities have requested follow-up workshops or educational seminars on family violence.
- Increased organizational expertise – relatively few organizations in Canada have expertise on family violence issues within ethnic communities. The Community Partners have continued to build their expertise throughout the years and are often sought out by other parties for their consultation and advice.
- Increased mainstream awareness – as a result of the broadcasts, mainstream organizations have become more aware of the issues of family violence within ethnocultural communities as the victims have come forward for assistance.
- Awards – the work and expertise of the community and media partners have been recognized by others through the awards they have received.
- Ethnic media involvement – often local media were reluctant to become involved in portraying the sensitive issues of family violence in their communities. However, once they became involved and saw the results of the programs, they often became true partners and contributed substantially to the success.
- Change in government policy – through the ethnic broadcasts and the advocacy work of a Community Partner, the Quebec health and social service agency changed its policy on the use of interpreters.

The only negative observation was the lack of services to assist victims of violence in some cases. One group terminated involvement in the broadcasts until services could be developed to assist victims in their community. This is an important issue and Canadian Heritage can raise awareness of this lack of services with other government departments through its involvement in the Interdepartmental Working Group on Family Violence chaired by Health Canada.

Program Administration and Effectiveness

Generally PCH activities have been carried out in a cost effective manner, particularly in the development of the program. PCH used a strategic approach in identifying, funding, and coordinating the work of community partners. This has proven to be very effective. 70% of the

funds received for the Multicultural Family Violence Initiative have gone into direct program activities and the balance into planning and administrative support functions.

During implementation, there have been some staffing and communication difficulties, but they have begun to be addressed. There have been lapses in communication between PCH and its stakeholders and beneficiaries with respect to the FVI. The Multiculturalism Program Advisory Committee - Family Violence Initiative could play a significant role in improving communication but it has not been convened regularly and members were out of touch with the activities of the Family Violence Initiative. The composition of the Advisory Committee needs to be revised to include the community partners who are delivering the projects.

There are two levels of reporting: PCH reporting to the Inter-Departmental Committee on Family Violence, which is coordinated through Health Canada; and the reporting of Community Partners to Canadian Heritage. Evidence indicates that PCH has met its reporting requirements to the Inter-Departmental Committee. Although reporting requirement of Community Partners have increased since the Auditor General's Report 2000, project files 1997-2002 have been managed inconsistently. As of fall 2000, training and tools were provided to project officers and managers to ensure that file management and closure standards met due diligence and enhanced monitoring requirements. Previously, community partners were only asked to report on activities, while now they are asked to report on performance indicators as part of their contribution agreements for approved projects.

Lessons Learned

The 1997 – 2002 Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative is based upon the learnings of the 1991- 1996 FVI Initiative, which set a solid foundation for this recent initiative. The 1997 - 2002 cycle confirmed the previous learnings that:

- Prevention messages for ethno-cultural communities are most effective when they are community specific, in the first language of each community and when people who are known and respected by the communities deliver them; and
- Ethnic media are an effective way to reach large numbers of people and overcome the denial factor, because they make the prevention message community-specific and they broadcast in the first languages of the communities.

In addition, the work done during 1997 – 2002 demonstrated that:

- Targeting family violence prevention programs to key sectors of the population who would not otherwise obtain the message is effective.
- Delivering the program through community agencies that have expertise in family violence and credibility within their own communities can produce outstanding results; and
- Public-private-community partnerships have also proven to be successful in developing the PSAs and in developing the media programs in each community.

Many best practices were identified from the case studies. These include:

- A collaborative working relationship between PCH, community partners and the media is critical to success. Having key people at senior levels within each organization who understand and are committed to the goals of the Family Violence Initiative facilitates partnerships.
- Use of an Advisory Committee from the target community, which involves media representatives, community partners and professionals from the conception of the project, builds trust and an understanding of the issues faced.
- Program format of skit-panel-conclusion proved to be effective in gaining the attention of viewers.
- By having Community Partners work with ethnic communities to develop and implement the broadcasts and having them identify referral services for follow-up, previously unidentified needs could be addressed.
- Setting up a hot line to receive calls after a broadcast is aired, identifies what the needs are, refers people to services, and provides evidence that family violence is occurring within the community.

Conclusions

The study concludes that the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative appears to have been very successful in reaching immigrants and first generation Canadians about the risk factors in family violence. Many lessons were learned and best practices identified. It is important to build upon this expertise and continue to work with community partners and ethnic media in raising awareness about the risk factors and impacts of family violence. Like the “stop smoking” campaign, the messages need to be repeated and variations found on the theme. The approach and methodology used by Canadian Heritage is an excellent model for other Federal Departments to use in conveying sensitive information to ethnocultural communities.

Recommendations

The recommendations put forward in this report are intended to build upon successes and improve future results. They are:

1. The Department of Canadian Heritage should continue the current approach taken by the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative as it has proven to be a successful model for reaching first generation Canadians about the risk factors associated with family violence.
2. The Department of Canadian Heritage should expand upon its success by exploring other intervention strategies that will contribute to the reduction of family violence in ethnocultural communities in Canada.
3. The Department of Canadian Heritage should share with other federal departments the communication strategy, partnership approach, and lessons learned from this Initiative as a successful way to reach beyond linguistic and cultural barriers when delivering sensitive messages and information. This is in keeping with the Multiculturalism Program’s commitment to overseeing cross-government implementation of the Multiculturalism Act.
4. The Department of Canadian Heritage should ensure that a strategy is developed for collecting key performance monitoring information that captures the activities and impacts of

the Initiative in a succinct and cost-effective manner.

I. Introduction

This report presents the findings of the evaluation of the Department of Canadian Heritage's Multiculturalism Program's Family Violence Initiative funded activities for the period 1997 - 2002.

The objectives of the evaluation are to assess the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative with respect to:

- Program relevance
- Program logic (capacity to produce the desired Impacts and Effects);
- Program administration and effectiveness; and
- Lessons learned and future directions

The report outlines the methodology to conduct the evaluation, analyzes and discusses the findings according to each of the evaluation questions, provides conclusions on the overall performance of the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative and makes recommendations for strengthening the Multiculturalism Program's contribution to the Family Violence Initiative. The appendices contain: the list of interviewees; details of ethnic broadcast results by the three metropolitan areas involved: Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver; and eleven case studies, which illustrate the work of the community groups in developing the ethnic broadcasts and the lessons learned in the process.

Positive Outcomes Consulting Services would like to thank all the interviewees who generously shared of their time and expertise to assist the evaluators. In addition, we would like to specifically thank Canadian Heritage Multiculturalism staff, Suzanne Lemieux and Mona Hubbell, for facilitating the interviews, the Advisory Committee meeting and access to information required for the evaluation. Dianne Lepa, PCH Corporate Review Branch, also provided valuable guidance in the evaluation process and we are very appreciative of her support.

II. Program Profile

The Family Violence Initiative

The Multiculturalism Family Violence Program is part of the overall federal Family Violence Initiative established by the Government of Canada in approximately 1988.

The overall purpose of the Federal Family Violence Initiative is “to coordinate family violence prevention policy and programming across departments at the federal level and to influence players to contribute to the reduction of family violence in the Canada.”³

Annually, \$7 million is allocated to support and complement activities in seven departments: Health Canada, Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, Justice Canada, RCMP, Canadian Heritage, Status of Women Canada, and Statistics Canada. Additionally, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, Human Resources Development Canada, Citizenship and Immigration Canada, Correctional Services of Canada and the Department of National Defense address family violence issues through existing departmental programs and activities.

The work of the Family Violence Initiative is coordinated by the Interdepartmental Working Group on Family Violence, which has articulated five strategic objectives for the FVI:

1. Promote public awareness of the risk factors of family violence and the need for public involvement in responding to the problem.
2. Strengthen the ability of the criminal justice system to respond to family violence.
3. Strengthen the ability of the shelter system to respond to family violence.
4. Support data collection, research and evaluation efforts to identify effective interventions.
5. Coordinate the issue of family violence prevention across all federal departments with programming that directly or indirectly addresses the issue.

The Department of Canadian Heritage (PCH)

Many first generation Canadians would be missed if the FVI was delivered only in English and French. It is critical to provide information and programs in a linguistically and culturally appropriate context to reach people not functional in English/French. Canadian Heritage, which has the expertise in working effectively with ethnic groups, was given the responsibility to promote family violence prevention in a linguistically and culturally appropriate manner.

The Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative within the Department of Canadian Heritage is a response to strategic objective #1 articulated by the Interdepartmental Committee on Family Violence - “Promote public awareness of the risk factors of family violence and the need for public involvement in responding to the problem.” In addition, Canadian Heritage supports family violence prevention projects through projects focused to off-reserve Aboriginal women’s organizations; and targeted research and evaluation activities regarding family violence. The Department receives a total of \$460,000 per year for FVI activities - \$215,000 each for the Aboriginal Women’s Program and Multiculturalism Program and \$30,000 is allocated to the Strategic Policy and Management Branch for evaluation and research.

³ PCH, *Family Violence initiative Strategic Plan 2001 – 2002.*, Draft April 6, 2001

The Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative was developed by Canadian Heritage to achieve the results identified by the Interdepartmental Committee on Family Violence⁴ for strategic objective #1 of promoting public awareness. The components of the logic model developed for this objective are:

- **Activities** – Ensure that information provided the public is accessible, current and addresses identified gaps by:....providing information for immigrants and first generation Canadians
- **Outputs** – ...Pamphlets, videos, training workshops for new immigrants, Aboriginals and other groups...
- **Outcomes** – Public support for efforts to prevent and respond to family violence; public willingness to report family violence as a crime; incidence of acts of family violence as reported in public surveys
- **Measures** – increased reporting of family violence, public reports increased willingness to respond to family violence
- **Key Long Term Result** – public awareness of family violence issues and reduced tolerance for family violence in society⁵.

To obtain the results identified by the Interdepartmental FVI Committee for the period 1997-2002, Canadian Heritage worked through community and corporate partners to develop multiple strategies to reach immigrants and first generation Canadians, who were otherwise not impacted by mainstream information about family violence. The primary vehicle chosen by Canadian Heritage to convey information about family violence was ethnic media broadcasts in the three metropolitan areas with Canada's largest immigrant populations: Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver. Canadian Heritage also targeted work with ethnic print media and English / French as a Second Language (ESL/FSL) resource kits on family violence. An Advisory Committee composed of key stakeholders was instituted to provide advice to PCH in the development and implementation of the program.

The approach taken by PCH is consistent with the strategic objectives of Canadian Heritage, which include:

- *Building Capacity* - Community, institutional and industrial capacity and infrastructure to sustain and promote Canada's cultural diversity and social cohesion
- *Canadians Connected to One Another* – Canadians and their diverse communities bridge differences and distances to deepen understanding of each other and to build shared values.

In addition, the Multiculturalism Program within Canadian Heritage encourages the participation by all citizens in building and shaping a cohesive and inclusive Canadian society, with its three policy objectives:

- Identity,
- Civic Participation and
- Social Justice.

⁴ Interdepartmental Committee on Family Violence, Logic Model

⁵ Ibid.

PCH Family Violence Initiative contributes to the achievement of these objectives by reaching ethnocultural communities that are not otherwise reached by programs that provide information about family violence laws and sources of help for victims and their families.

The objectives of the Multiculturalism Program's family violence activities are:

- through English-and French-as-a-Second Language programs and programming on ethnic media, to increase awareness of ethnocultural minorities not fluent in English or French of Canadian laws relating to family violence and sources of help for victims and their families;
- Through better access to information and services, to reduce the incidence of family violence in the community⁶.

The Multiculturalism Program also encourages other Federal departments, with responsibilities related to family violence, to ensure that their programs benefit Canadians of all ethnic origins, despite linguistic, cultural and other barriers. Under the Canadian Multiculturalism Act, Federal Government departments are committed to serving Canadians of all origins. The Multiculturalism Program facilitates this process by providing advice and information about ethnocultural minorities and demographics⁷.

⁶ PCH, *Terms of Reference for an Evaluation of the Family Violence Initiative at the Department of Canadian Heritage*, January 9, 2002

⁷ Ibid.

III. Evaluation Profile

The objective of the evaluation is to assess Canadian Heritage's Multiculturalism Program Family Violence Initiative for the 1997 - 2002 period with respect to:

1. Program relevance;
2. Program logic (capacity to produce the desired impacts and effects);
3. Program administration and effectiveness; and
4. Lessons learned and future directions.

Information obtained from this evaluation is intended to assist PCH in its strategic planning activities. A summary of this evaluation will also be included in Health Canada's Report on the Interdepartmental Evaluation of the 1997-2002 FVI.

An evaluation plan for the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative was developed which outlined the performance indicators and data sources used to answer the research questions under each of the four areas. It was beyond the scope of the evaluation to measure the effects and impacts of the Multiculturalism Program Family Violence Initiative.

Data Collection

The methods used to collect data were the following:

- File & Document Review (Content Analysis)
The consultants reviewed past evaluation reports and program documents, which included policy documents, annual reports, program reporting data and promotional materials. As well, each of the projects completed tables which asked for details on their outputs: numbers and types of programs produced for radio and TV, extent of exposure, and estimate of audience reached.
- Secondary Research
The consultants conducted secondary research in the field of family violence to examine the literature documenting the use of ethnic media to increase awareness of ethnocultural communities, not fluent in English or French, of Canadian laws relating to family violence and sources of help for victims and their families.
- Key Informant Interviews (See Appendix A for a list of people interviewed)
In person and telephone interviews were conducted with:
 - Managers and Program Officers in the Multiculturalism Program, HQ and Regions, PCH;
 - PCH contacts in Corporate Review Branch and Research and Strategic Development;
 - Members of the FVI Multiculturalism Advisory Committee;
 - Family Violence Community Partners; and
 - Other Government Department FVI representatives.
- Focus Group
The consultants conducted a focus group with members of the Multiculturalism Advisory Committee and representatives of the Community Partner organizations to obtain relevant information on the beneficiaries of the family violence activities and impacts.

- Case Studies

The Consultants provided a guide to community partners to develop case studies of their FVI projects funded under the Multiculturalism Program. The purpose of the case study was to obtain in-depth information on the activities and impacts of the initiative.

Analysis of Data

An analysis of the data was conducted using matrices (tables). Responses to each of the research questions were entered into a table according to each of the key informants, focus group, and community agencies in order to determine consistencies and patterns. As well, data was analyzed from other sources to determine consistency and to provide further understanding.

Study Limitations

Because of time and resource limitations, the evaluation only included gathering information from the sources cited above. It did not include assessing the impact of the projects directly in the communities, other than through the informants mentioned.

IV. Evaluation Findings

This section presents the findings and analysis of Canadian Heritage's Multiculturalism Program Family Violence Initiative for the 1997 - 2002 period with respect to specific research questions related to:

1. Program relevance;
2. Program logic (capacity to produce the desired impacts and effects);
3. Program administration and effectiveness; and
4. Lessons learned and future directions.

1. Program Relevance

1.1. *Is the Family Violence Initiative - Multiculturalism Program Component consistent with PCH and government wide priorities?*

Yes, the Multiculturalism Program Component of the Family Violence Initiative is consistent with PCH and government wide priorities.

Respondents to this question were unanimous in their support of the importance of the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative within government generally and the Department of Canadian Heritage, specifically.

Both the Liberal Plan for the Future of Canada and The Speech from the Throne, 2001 lay the framework for the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative. The Liberal Plan specifies party support for "Safe Communities"⁸ and states we are a modern multicultural society that must protect our minorities. In addition, the Throne Speech states that "feeling secure in our homes and on our streets is a fundamental right of Canadian citizenship"⁹ and discusses how the government will support children and families.

The Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative is also an essential strategy within the overall Family Violence Initiative as it "provides information for immigrant and first generation Canadians" about the "risk factors of family violence and the need for public involvement in responding to the problem."¹⁰ Prior to PCH involvement, significant segments of the minority communities in Canada have not been reached by family violence prevention messages because of linguistic and cultural barriers. PCH contributes to reaching ethnocultural groups and getting the message out in a culturally sensitive way.

Clearly, the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative fits within the mandate of the Department of Canadian Heritage. The Department has long standing expertise in working effectively with culturally diverse communities across Canada. The FVI - Multiculturalism contributes directly to two of the Department's five strategic objectives – "*Building Capacity*" and "*Canadians Connected to One Another*". It does this by creating shared values and thereby, increasing social cohesion. Family violence is no less of a problem for minority ethnocultural communities, than it is for the population at large, but for a number of reasons, it has is less likely to be

⁸ Opportunity for All; The Liberal Plan for the Future of Canada, Liberal Party of Canada, 2000

⁹ Speech from the Throne, Government of Canada, 2001

¹⁰ Family Violence Strategic Plan 2001 – 2002, Draft April 6, 2001

acknowledged as a problem.¹¹ Confusion and lack of awareness have characterized minority communities understanding of Canadian laws and values related to child discipline/ neglect/ abuse, wife abuse and elder abuse. Information and awareness are critical first steps to understanding the issues and then to beginning to build capacity to respond to the issues. In addition, Canadians can only be “connected to one another” when attempts are made to bridge differences, deepen understanding of each other’s cultures and build shared values, including those around healthy families and the opposite - family violence.

The Multiculturalism FVI also contributes to two of three Multiculturalism policy objectives: civic participation and social justice, through removing barriers for ethnocultural communities to receive information about Canadian laws about family violence and the services available to help victims and their families. Justice is only served when it is dispensed equally amongst the population and communities can only participate in our Canadian social fabric when individuals are free from fear of abuse and violence.

Promoting diversity, respect and connections between all Canadians have been at the heart of our work in the Department of Canadian Heritage, including its Multiculturalism Program, for many years. The importance of these efforts was reinforced by the event of September 11, 2001. We will continue to work across the Government of Canada and with various partners and communities to promote core Canadian values of respect of diversity and inclusion.

Karen Ellis, Director General,
Multiculturalism and Aboriginal Peoples' Program Branch

¹¹ Barbara Preston, PCH, “Canada’s Family Violence Prevention Work with Minority Ethnic Groups”, unpublished paper, undated.

2. Program Logic

2.1. *What are the FVI activities and outputs at PCH?*

The major activity and output involved identifying and supporting community partners in Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver to develop culturally appropriate programs for ethnic communities about family violence through broadcast media. Four other activity and output areas were also identified: ethnic print media, public service announcements, English as Second Language and French as Second Language resource kits. Outstanding results were achieved in the development of ethnic media broadcasts and the public service announcements. The ESL resource kit is in progress and the FSL kit will be developed once the learnings of the ESL kit are available. The ethnic print media component did not materialize as the organization contracted to deliver this output ceased operation.

Activities

For the five year cycle of the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative, 1997-2002, Canadian Heritage received \$215,000 annually. PCH used the learnings and conclusions drawn from the projects and consultations of the previous cycle, 1991-95, to target very specific activities and outputs for this cycle.

Ethnic Broadcast Media

Learnings from the previous cycle of the Multiculturalism FVI indicated that educating ethnocultural communities about family violence through ethnic broadcast media could be quite effective. PCH targeted this area to be the focus of its activity for the 1997 - 2002 cycle.

Statistics Canada information was used to identify the location of largest immigrant populations within Canada. They were (and still are): Toronto, Vancouver and Montreal. Given the limited dollars, PCH identified community organizations in each of these metropolitan areas that had proven track records in dealing with family violence issues within minority communities. They were:

- Toronto – COSTI Immigrant Services – one of Canada’s oldest and largest immigrant serving agencies;
- Vancouver – Peoples’ Law School, which has a mandate for public legal education and had been involved with ethno-cultural communities for many years; and the Vancouver and Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services – Canada’s only multilingual, multicultural service agency dedicated to assisting victims of family violence.
- Montreal – Shield of Athena / Le Bouclier d’Athena – primarily a Greek serving organization that had previously implemented two very successful family violence education projects.

Public Service Announcements (PSA's)

The Public Service Announcements (PSAs) were seen as an opportunity to complement the outreach work of the community organizations in ethnic broadcast media. Rogers CFMT, Canada’s largest multilingual television station, offered to produce PSA's on family violence in multiple languages for distribution to ethnic television and radio stations across Canada.

PCH staff worked with CFMT and a community partner (Shield of Athena in Montreal) to develop the PSA. It was intended that the PSA would appeal to both men and women. CFMT also assumed responsibility for the development and printing of a poster to accompany the PSA campaign.

Ethnic Print Media

Canadian Scene was contracted to develop a series of articles about family violence for free distribution to ethnic print media. *Canadian Scene* was a news and information service for ethnic media. These articles would be translated and distributed in 21 languages to about 450 ethnic newspapers and magazines.

ESL/FSL Resource Kits

PCH identified a community organization which had expertise in family violence and could undertake the development of an English as a Second Language (ESL) resource kit for teachers to assist them to have more confidence in discussing the sensitive topic of family violence. Based upon the organization's track record, they approached the BC Institute on Family Violence (BCIFV). BCIFV applied for funding March 1999 to produce a video and resource kit on child discipline/abuse/neglect. The project was not approved until August 2001 (two and half years later) largely due to the concerns of Justice Canada that this project might prejudice a "spanking case" before the courts. In addition, PCH experienced staff turn-over during this time, which also contributed to the delay.

PCH decided to delay the funding of an FSL kit, until the learnings of the ESL kit are available.

Outputs

Ethnic Broadcast Media

Targeted Output

- Heritage language interviews about healthy families and family violence prevention on ethnic community television and radio programs.

Actual Output

- 97 original television programs and 174 radio programs were produced in Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver for 48 different ethnic / linguistic communities. The television programs were aired 502 times and the radio programs were aired 261 times. Topics were primarily: wife abuse, child abuse or elder abuse. Most programs used inter-disciplinary panels of community experts and some developed skits on the topics.

These are truly outstanding results and even more so given the limited funds the groups were awarded to develop the media programs. The following chart provides more information about the outputs related to ethnic media by city in which the broadcasts took place.

It is interesting to note the large difference in the exposures¹² per program among the projects. While one might expect an average of two exposures per program as occurred in

¹² An exposure is the number of times a program is played.

Toronto, the Vancouver TV programs on wife abuse were broadcast an average of 9.6 times. Appendices B, C, and D provide the details of the outputs in each city.

| All Three Cities | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|----------------------------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|
| Original Programs | | | | | | | Exposure 1997- 2002 | | | | | |
| Cities | Wife Abuse | | Child Abuse | | Elder Abuse | | Wife Abuse | | Child Abuse | | Elder Abuse | |
| | TV | Radio | TV | Radio | TV | Radio | TV | Radio | TV | Radio | TV | Radio |
| Montreal | 19 | 2 | 3 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 44 | 2 | 6 | 0 | 10 | 0 |
| Toronto | 16 | 32 | 9 | 34 | 7 | 24 | 32 | 33 | 18 | 35 | 14 | 25 |
| Vancouver | 13 | 35 | 13 | 26 | 13 | 21 | 125 | 64 | 133 | 53 | 120 | 49 |
| Totals | 48 | 69 | 25 | 60 | 24 | 45 | 201 | 99 | 157 | 88 | 144 | 74 |

| | Original Programs | Exposure |
|----------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------|
| Total TV | 97 | 502 |
| Total Radio | 174 | 261 |
| Communities Reached | | 48 |

Public Service Announcements

Targeted Output

- A multilingual public service announcement about family violence for ethnic television and, if possible, radio programs across Canada.

Actual Output

- An award winning PSA with the message “Violence hurts us all!” was produced in 14 languages and distributed to 30 ethnic broadcasters and specialty channels across Canada.

This is also a truly outstanding result. The results were achieved with very little PCH funding, as CFMT absorbed the costs for production and broadcast of the PSAs on their station. It is an exemplary model of a true government, corporate and community partnership.

Ethnic Print Media

Targeted Output

- A special multilingual family violence issue of *Canadian Scene*, a news and information service for 450 ethnic print media across Canada. The articles were to be translated into 21 languages and distributed to the ethnic print media, as well as, several hundred social service organizations across Canada.

Actual Output

- Seven articles were written on family violence, but the project sponsor, *Canadian Scene*, ceased operation before they could be delivered.

The articles demonstrated the complex issues of abuse and neglect through real life situations and indicated options for dealing with the situations. The topics covered were:

- Wife abuse (physical) and the impact on children
- Psychological wife abuse
- Sexual abuse within marriage
- Discipline or child abuse
- Child neglect
- Elder financial abuse and neglect
- Children who witness abuse¹³

It is the opinion of the consultants that the risk in funding this organization was worth taking as they had a previously positive record with PCH and the amount was relatively small (\$29,150) considering the potential benefit that may have been derived. No other organization in Canada, then or now, could translate the articles into 20 languages and distribute them to over 400 ethnic print media plus several hundred social service agencies across Canada for the limited available funds. Canadian Heritage contributed considerable effort in the development of the articles and they are still relevant.

ESL / FSL Resource Kits

Targeted Output

- An information kit for English-as-a-Second Language teachers about building information about family violence into adult ESL instruction programs.
- An information kit for French-as-a-Second Language teachers about building information about family violence into adult FSL instruction programs.

Actual Output

- The ESL Resource Kit is in the process of being developed and is scheduled for completion in 2002. The FSL kit will be developed after the learnings of the ESL are apparent.

2.2. Are the Program activities and outputs linked to the desired short and long-term outcomes in a valid and logical way?

Yes, Program activities and outputs are linked to the desired short and long-term outcomes in a valid and logical way. Multiple strategies are seen as effective ways to reach ethnic communities about a very sensitive topic and ethnic broadcast media is seen as the most effective.

The Program Logic Model or Performance Indicator Chart¹⁴ for the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative links the program activities, outputs, target population and outcomes (short and long term). It is illustrated on the next page.

All respondents agreed that there is a logical link from the designated Outputs (broadcasts in ethnic media, articles in ethnic newspapers and ESL / FSL resource kits) to the Short and Long Term Impacts (an increased awareness and understanding within ethnic communities about

¹³ PCH articles on family violence developed for the ethnic print project.

¹⁴ Provided in RFP and taken from the Interdepartmental Accountability Framework referred to above.

family violence). These multiple strategies were seen as effective ways to reach ethnic communities about a very sensitive topic.

Logic Model - Multiculturalism Program - Family Violence Initiative

| Activities | Outputs | Target population/Reach | Short-term Effects | Long-term Impacts |
|--|---|--|---|---|
| <p>MULTICULTURALISM PROGRAM</p> <p>Awareness-raising initiatives on family violence specifically targeted to ethnic and visible minority communities, especially those in communities with a home language of other than English or French</p> | <p>1. A special multilingual family violence issue of <i>Canadian Scene</i>, a news and information service, for 450 ethnic print media across Canada</p> <p>2. A multilingual public service announcement about family violence for ethnic television and, if possible, radio programs across Canada</p> <p>3. Heritage language interviews about healthy families and family violence prevention on ethnic community television and radio programs</p> <p>4. An information kit for English-as-a-Second Language teachers about building information about family violence into adult ESL instruction programs</p> <p>5. An information kit for French-as-a-Second Language teachers about building information about family violence into adult FSL programs</p> | <p>1. Approx. 450 ethnic newspapers with combined readership of approximately 2.5 million people</p> <p>2. The four major multilingual television networks (CFMT, CHIN, CINT, and Rogers Multicultural Channel) and “niche networks” for the Chinese, Italian, Hispanic, and Portuguese communities</p> <p>3. Program directors in major multilingual television and radio stations in Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver</p> <p>4. Approx. 3500 adult ESL teachers across Canada</p> <p>5. Approx. 1500 FSL teachers in Quebec</p> | <p>1. Free publication of one or more <i>Canada Scene</i> family violence articles in a heritage language, English or French</p> <p>2. Free airing of the PSA during heritage language programs as a community service</p> <p>3. Heritage language interviews on popular community programs about healthy (violence free) families, Canadian laws about family violence and sources of help for family violence victims and their families</p> <p>4. ESL class discussions about Canadian laws about family violence, sources of help for family violence victims and their families, and the importance of keeping families healthy</p> <p>5. FSL class discussion about Canadian laws about family violence, sources of help for family violence victims and their families, and the importance of keeping families healthy</p> | <p>1. Increased reader understanding of what is seen as family violence under Canadian law, the consequences for perpetrators and sources of help for victims</p> <p>2. Increased awareness of viewers/listeners that violence in the family is unhealthy because it can break up families</p> <p>3. Increased understanding of viewers/listeners about Canadian laws that protect women and children from abuse or neglect and that these laws apply to everyone</p> <p>4. Increased understanding of ESL students about Canadian laws about family violence, sources of help for victims and their families, consequences for perpetrators, and the importance of keeping families healthy</p> <p>5. Increased understanding of FSL students about...(as above)</p> |

Ethnic broadcast media were seen as the most effective vehicles to reach communities with limited English or French language skills in order to increase awareness and understanding of the impact of family violence, Canadian laws on abuse and sources of help for victims. Community groups told us that ethnic media programs are often watched or listened to by those who are isolated at home and may be victims of abuse. Community groups also indicated that to achieve the desired outcomes, it was critical that:

- Broadcast programs were developed by the target ethnic community, using an approach that is culturally sensitive. This way the community takes “ownership of the problem” and becomes part of developing the solutions.
- The programs included a team of people from various professions, indicating that family violence involves an entire system and is not just an individual or family issue.
- Respected leaders in the community discuss the topic to lend credibility to the issues. Denial of the occurrence of family violence in an ethnic community is very common and having respected leaders talk about the issue breaks down the denial.
- Broadcast media became partners in the development of the programming.

Respondents agreed that multiple strategies need to be used to reach target audiences. Each strategy has its advantages and draw backs. While respondents felt that ethnic print media was important, they also recognized that it is of limited value in some communities where literacy is an issue. The value of print is that it leaves a trace and an article can be clipped and circulated. ESL and FSL classes were seen as reaching a more limited audience, but could provide a personal approach and more in-depth discussion of the issues.

The Program Logic Model / Performance Indicator Chart proved a useful way to conceptualize the program and ensure that activities and outputs reached target populations and produced key results. However, the Chart is now outdated. A central vehicle to distribute information to ethnic print media no longer exists. In addition, “Target Populations” on the Chart does not include the community groups with which PCH works, nor the intended beneficiaries of the projects. The community agencies had not seen the overall Chart until the focus group.

2.3. What target group does the Family Violence Multiculturalism Program reach?

Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative reached immigrants and refugees who are neither functional in English nor French, and therefore not affected by mainstream media. The evidence indicates that: 48 ethnic communities in the metropolitan areas of Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver were reached by the ethnic broadcast programs; and that the Public Service Announcements reached 14 ethnic groups throughout Canada and had minimum of 3 million gross impressions.¹⁵

¹⁵ Gross impressions refers to the total viewers of each television program times the number of times the PSA was shown on the program.

These are truly outstanding results. The following table provides the information about which ethnic/linguistic communities were the intended audiences of the radio and television broadcasts, as well as by the PSA's.

| Intended Audience Communities | | | |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|---|
| Montreal TV & Radio | Toronto TV & Radio | Vancouver TV & Radio | PSA's |
| Arabic | Arabic | Afghani | Arabic |
| Armenian | Cantonese | Amharic (Ethiopia) | Cantonese |
| Bengali | Farsi (Persian) | Arabic | Farsi |
| Cantonese | Greek | Cantonese | Greek |
| Greek | Hindi | Croatian | Italian |
| Haitian | Italian | Farsi | Korean |
| Hindi | Polish | Greek | Mandarin |
| Iranian | Portuguese | Korean | Polish |
| Italian | Punjabi | Hindi | Portuguese |
| Portuguese | Russian | Italian | Punjabi |
| Russian | Spanish | Japanese | Somali |
| South Asian | Somali | Mandarin | Spanish |
| Spanish | Tamil | Polish | Tamil |
| Tamil | Vietnamese | Portuguese | Vietnamese |
| Urdu | | Punjabi | French |
| | | Serbian | English |
| | | Spanish | |
| | | Tagalog (Filipino) | |
| | | Vietnamese | |
| Total of 15 communities | Total of 14 communities | Total of 19 communities | Total of 14 communities (+ English & French) |

Ethnic Broadcasts

Evidence indicates that a total of 48 communities¹⁶ in the three Metropolitan centres have been reached by the broadcast programs. Each community partner first identified the largest ethnic or linguistic communities where there was a large population of non-English or non-French speakers and proceeded to work with those communities to develop the programs. In subsequent years, they began to work with smaller communities. They found that not only the needs but also the available avenues for heritage language broadcasting were different for each community. Some larger communities have several TV and radio outlets, while smaller ethnocultural communities may have had only radio program, and some even smaller communities had neither TV or radio programs available in their languages.

¹⁶ A community here is considered to be an ethnic group in a particular location, since a broadcast to Arabic speakers in Montreal does not reach the Arabic community in Vancouver.

Radio and TV connect with women at home and seniors, who spend much time at home and are often isolated. They don't speak well enough to listen to English programs. Sometimes programs are repeated various times during the day or week and that helps reach different audiences.

Community Agency Staff

While each community partner developed different broadcasts, the key messages were the same:

- No community is immune from abuse. It happens in every ethnic community or 'mainstream' community;
- It is important to discuss family violence openly because it will not be solved behind closed doors;
- Family violence produces dysfunctional and broken families;
- There are sources of support for victims and families¹⁷.

Although the programs on wife abuse, child abuse and elder abuse had a different focus, the key messages were consistent as mentioned above. The choice of whether to produce a program on wife abuse, child abuse or elder abuse depended upon the community leaders who gathered to develop the programs. They decided what were the priority issues in their community, how to best get the messages across and which key professionals would be involved. Most often an inter-disciplinary team was involved in discussing the issues and may have included: a police officer, a child protection worker (for child abuse programs), a social worker, a lawyer, a judge and a senior's advocate (for elder abuse programs). Sometimes the group decided to develop a dramatization of the issues, followed by a panel discussion.

No information is available on the estimated audiences of the TV programs. However, respondents indicated that the broadcast programs were successful in reaching the intended audiences. The community groups are certain they reached the intended audiences because they are aware of considerable discussion in the target communities about the programs. In addition, the community groups indicated that there was interest in follow-up activity from many communities and that requests for tapes of the programs and presentations on family violence have increased significantly. Producers and broadcasters who were initially reluctant to become involved in the programs, once they saw the success of the programs, subsequently became enthusiastic partners. COSTI in Toronto asked service agencies to provide them with information on calls for assistance that were received following the broadcasts. The numbers are significant and Appendix E, Case Study #7 provides a summary.

Public Service Announcements

In the nine months following production, the PSA had a minimum of 600 showings by CFMT and 1500 showings by key ethnic broadcasters across Canada.¹⁸ CFMT estimate of gross impressions from the first two months of the campaign (June – August 1999) was over 3 million

¹⁷ PCH documents, Message About Wife Abuse, Message About Child Abuse, Message About Elder Abuse

¹⁸ PCH document, *Producing a Multilingual Public Service Announcement (PSA) About Family Violence: a Collaborative Project*, stamped May 16, 2001. Data collected from broadcaster/networks and CRTC reports.

viewers on their station alone¹⁹. In addition, many of the television programs produced by the community partners incorporated the PSA into their own programming.

2.4. What are the perceived impacts on the target population?

Respondents unanimously agreed that the media projects and PSAs were successful in creating awareness about family violence issues within ethnic communities. Some indicated that this is likely the first initiative within Canada that had any real impact in reaching a wide range of ethnic audiences. Many also agreed that it was difficult to measure the success.

Ethnic Media Broadcasts and PSAs

Respondents were enthusiastic about the media projects and the PSAs in creating awareness about family violence. They mentioned that TV has “magic and power” and that both radio and TV were critical in making a previously invisible issue, visible. Experience shows that once the silence is broken, there is no going back. Groups agreed that ethnic communities had begun a dialogue about the issues and that this opened new doors. They also talked about communities who became empowered as result of their involvement in developing the radio and television programs.

Respondents also agreed that it is difficult to measure success in awareness campaigns, but like the programs to eliminate poverty or the Stop Smoking campaign, the results may not be immediate and messages need to be repeated over time. The community organizations indicated that victims of violence may not come forward for help for many months or even years. In addition, for some communities, this was the first time that the issues were addressed in their communities. Repetition of the messages was seen as key in building awareness and eventually, community capacity to respond to the issues.

Resources available to assist victims were part of every program and agencies agreed that if victims looked for assistance, they generally received it. In Toronto, where phone calls to services agencies were monitored, they often exceeded everyone’s expectations. In several ethnic communities, these phone calls continued for up to three weeks following the broadcast and were as high as 100 calls. Many were calls for service, others for information, and some to congratulate the producers for finally tackling issues that communities in general often deny exist.²⁰

Community organizations indicated that if the programs had not been effective, that there could have been major negative repercussions for their agencies. It would not have been difficult for certain members of the community to lobby for the closure of an agency if they found their work objectionable. None of this has happened. The agencies feel that since there was no public pressure against their work on family violence, this is an indication that the programs were done sensitively and effectively.

ESL Resource Kits

Since the ESL resource kit on family violence is in development, there are not yet any impacts. However, the following are the goals of the project:

¹⁹ CFMT document, Family Violence PSA Campaign, June 19 – August 29, 1999

²⁰ COSTI FVI Final Report, 2000 -2001

- To assist parents to feel more confident about parenting in Canada;
- To assist parents to understand the “context” of child protection laws in Canada;
- To raise issues and dispel myths about parenting and child abuse / neglect;
- To support and re-assure parents; and
- To assist parents to learn about the resources that are available to support them²¹.

The consultants have confidence that this project will meet its goals because the BC Institute on Family Violence has created a sound process for the development of the kit and has involved a very able advisory group. The advisory committee consists of: immigrant settlement workers, those with expertise in family violence in ethnic communities, linkage with the national body for Teachers of English as Second Language (TESL) and the Child Welfare League of Canada. In addition, a lawyer has been contracted to ensure legally accurate information.

2.5. Are the activities undertaken for the Family Violence Initiative still relevant to the target population?

The evidence strongly supports the continued relevance of family violence awareness raising activities for ethnic and visible minority communities, especially those in communities with a home language of other than English or French. Furthermore, using ethnic media has proven to be an effective medium to reach ethnocultural communities to discuss sensitive topics, such as family violence.

All respondents agreed that the activities undertaken for the Family Violence Initiative are still relevant to ethnic communities. Some said they are more relevant than ever as there are now more immigrants and refugees in Canada than there were five years ago. Toronto, Vancouver and Montreal are still the largest centres for immigrants.

Community partners and the Advisory Committee stated that using broadcast media to reach ethnic groups was a successful strategy and should continue. Some added that there should be the option to supplement broadcasts with print media – such, as newspapers and community magazines.

There has been very limited research on intimate partner violence against immigrant women and even less on the use of ethnic media to increase awareness of family violence within ethnocultural communities.

A recent review of legal, medical and social science research literature on violence against immigrant women²² found evidence from U.S. studies which suggests that violence against immigrant women has reached “epidemic proportions”. Furthermore, the article draws conclusions from the data that “immigrant women’s cultures, contexts, and legal status (a) increase vulnerability for abuse, (b) are used by batterers to control and abuse immigrant women, and (c) create barriers to women seeking and receiving help.”²³

²¹ Interview Penny Bain, Executive Director, BC Institute on Family Violence

²² Raj, Anita and Jay Silverman. (March 2002). Violence Against Immigrant Women. In *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 8 No. 3, March 2002, Sage Publications.

²³ *Ibid.*, p. 367.

The literature review also identified resiliency factors embedded in immigrant cultures and contexts, which can be used by policies and programs to better serve these populations.

Unfortunately, there is no statistical data available from Statistics Canada in regard to the extent of family violence in ethnocultural communities. A census survey of Canada's shelters for abused women is conducted every two year but there is no data on ethnicity. The unique situation faced by immigrant and refugee women who are abused and don't speak English or French was identified in the 1993 qualitative research project funded by the Department of Canadian Heritage (Multiculturalism) under the Family Violence Initiative²⁴. The authors found that most mainstream studies overlook this invisible population who face a double jeopardy of abuse and language and cultural isolation. This study built on an earlier study by MacLeod and Shin, which investigated the needs of immigrant and refugee women who are abused from the perspective of service providers.²⁵ Other studies reviewed included one for the India Mahila Association²⁶ and the proceedings from the Information Session with Ethnocultural Community on Family Violence held in Ottawa, March 1994. As well, a study by the Canadian Association of Social Workers investigating elder abuse in ethnocultural communities was reviewed.

The research reviewed confirmed the relevance of Canadian Heritage's Multiculturalism Program FVI as evidenced by the following findings:

- Considerable "research demonstrates that battered immigrant women are less likely than nonimmigrant battered women to seek both informal (e.g., social support) and formal (e.g., medical and legal services) help for intimate partner violence"²⁷;
- The cultural barriers to receiving help often come from pressure from community/religious leaders who "compel women to stay and not to speak publicly of the abuse" and from community members who "fear that disclosure to 'outsiders' promotes criticism of their culture or nation of origin"²⁸;
- Recent studies indicate that recently immigrated women are less likely to seek social and health services due to isolation, fear of deportation (especially for refugees), lack of information with respect to available services and their legal rights, concern that services are not culturally sensitive or safe²⁹ or are delivered in a ways which are antithetical to the values of the women. For example, Macleod and Shin (1993) found values implicit in existing services clashed with the values of many women who are abused. For example, services which emphasize individual rights and empowerment conflict with women who believe the values of the community should be the central concern.³⁰

²⁴ MacLeod, Linda and Maria Y. Shin. December 1993. *"Like a Wingless Bird..." A Tribute to the Survival and Courage of Women who are Abused and who Speak neither English Nor French*. Published by the National Clearinghouse on Family Violence, Ottawa, Canada.

²⁵ MacLeod, Linda and Maria Y. Shin. December 1990. *Isolated, Afraid and Forgotten: the Service Delivery Needs and Realities of Immigrant and Refugee Women Who are Battered*. Published by the National Clearinghouse on Family Violence, Ottawa, Canada.

²⁶ Dosanjh, raminder, Surinder Deo & Surjit Sidhu. August 1994. *Spousal Abuse in the South Asian Community*. Published by the India Mahila Association, Vancouver, B.C.

²⁷ Raj, Anita and Jay Silverman. (March 2002). *Violence Against Immigrant Women*. In *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 8 No. 3, March 2002, Sage Publications. p. 381.

²⁸ Ibid. p.382.

²⁹ Ibid. pp.381-391

³⁰ MacLeod and Shin (1993) p.41.

- Another factor contributing to lack of awareness of domestic violence services in the U.S. was that domestic violence agencies have no ties to immigrant communities and ineffective outreach³¹. The MacLeod and Shin (1993) study also found women had a "very low level of knowledge of both mainstream and ethno-specific community services".³²

The research reviewed strongly supported the need for culturally tailored, educational outreach initiatives, targeted to specific immigrant communities, whose outcomes include increased **community awareness** of:

- intimate partner violence (e.g., forms of abuse, prevalence in the community, and consequences for victims),
- legal protections for victims and details on rights and options of all people,
- legal consequences for perpetrators of wife assault and child abuse,
- where to get help - support available for victims and their children,
- how women can protect themselves, and
- where and how to make complaints about abuse.

In addition, the research findings indicated that "community-based organizations and community leaders in particular should be encouraged to participate in such training (education outreach) as they are commonly approached by those in need"³³. This is consistent with the approach of Canadian Heritage (Multiculturalism) to support community based organizations which are well connected to ethnocultural communities and this has proven to be effective in building the capacity of these communities to address family violence.

Although there is no direct research on the effectiveness of different methods of educational outreach to convey this information, research findings suggest that "receptivity to these messages may also be enhanced by the source being internal to the community, minimizing common reactions that the information presented is based on "Western ideology" and that the messages are not relevant to their community".³⁴

MacLeod and Shin asked women in the 1993 study what methods work best to convey information in ways that do not jeopardize the woman's privacy or safety. The women suggested three main ways to disseminate the information identified above to women who are abused and do not speak English or French:

1. Radio and TV in the language of the community;
2. Pamphlets for general distribution through places of worship, schools, community centres, doctors' offices, and community centres. Pamphlets should be produced in language of community and reflect values and culture of community and
3. Community newspapers.

These recommendations were substantiated in other studies. It was stressed that the whole community must be educated that wife, elder and child abuse is a crime in Canada and that help is available. It was also found that, if the message is conveyed through community leaders

³¹ Raj, Anita and Jay Silverman. (March 2002). Violence Against Immigrant Women. In *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 8 No. 3, March 2002, Sage Publications. pp.381-391

³² MacLeod and Shin (1993) p.40.

³³ Raj, Anita and Jay Silverman. p. 393.

³⁴ Ibid.

and using local channels of communication, such as ethnic media, it will have much more credibility.

2.6. What unintended consequences (both positive and negative) have occurred as a result of the initiative during the 1997 - 2002 period?

There were many positive spin-offs from the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative. These include:

- Additional family violence projects funded through PCH resources;
- Contributions by corporate and community partners;
- Enhanced community capacity;
- Increased community awareness and education;
- Increased organizational expertise;
- Increased mainstream awareness;
- Awards;
- Ethnic media involvement; and
- Change in government policy.

The only negative observation was, in some cases, the lack of services to assist victims of violence.

Additional Family Violence Projects funded directly by Canadian Heritage:

The value of the Federal Family Violence Initiative funding contribution to PCH was multiplied as headquarters and regional offices of Canadian Heritage contributed an additional \$1.03 million of Departmental resources for 48 projects addressing family violence across Canada during the period 1997- 2002. An additional benefit was that most of these projects were sponsored by organizations located outside of Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver.

Family Violence Projects Funded by PCH (Non FVI \$)

| YEAR | # of Projects | Total PCH Funding |
|--------------|----------------------|--------------------------|
| 1997-1998 | 16 | \$403,650 |
| 1998-1999 | 16 | \$270,620 |
| 1999-2000 | 12 | \$279,215 |
| 2000-2001 | 4 | \$79,135 |
| 2001-2002 | 0 | 0 |
| TOTAL | 48 | \$1,032,620 |

Corporate and Community Contributions:

PCH media partner, Rogers CFMT, contributed well over \$ 350,000 for the production and airtime of the PSAs. Community groups also procured additional funds and in-kind contributions which are conservatively estimated at over \$300,000. This totals over \$650,000 in additional contributions for family violence awareness through corporate and community partners.

PSAs **Rogers CFMT** Production \$10,000+

| | | |
|-----------------------|--|-------------------|
| | Airtime ³⁵ | <u>\$340,000</u> |
| | Total Contribution | \$350,000+ |
| Media Outreach | Other Financial Contributions to projects | \$42,360 |
| | In-kind contributions – community partners ³⁶ | <u>\$260,500</u> |
| | Total Contribution | \$300,000+ |

Community Capacity Building:

The broadcasts were found to be a catalyst in bringing community members together to deal with family violence. Very often professionals from a variety of disciplines who came together for the TV or radio programs, subsequently formed collaborative teams to assist victims. In some cases, established ethnocultural communities developed their own family violence education programs. For example, the broadcasts resulted in one community coming together to organize a community conference on parent – teen issues and subsequently developing a mentoring program. In addition, many communities have since developed parenting workshops.³⁷ In Toronto, a Punjabi group recently received \$325,000 grant from Trillium Foundation to mentor community people who were victims of family violence.³⁸

Further Awareness and Education

The broadcasts had spin-off results in further increasing awareness and understanding on family violence in two ways: tapes and workshops.

Community partners talked about the high demand for the tapes that had been produced for the ethnic media broadcasts. These tapes have been requested by a wide range of social services organizations, including women’s shelters, police and ethnic groups and are often used in training sessions on family violence issues. The community partners mentioned that they are having a difficult time keeping up with the demand for tapes.

In addition, community partners mentioned the increased demand on their time for presentations and workshops on family violence in ethnic communities. For example, People’s Law School was asked to provide 18 seminars on a variety of family violence topics for six different ethnic groups and one multi-ethnic group as result of their involvement in the media projects.³⁹

Building Organizational Expertise

Relatively few organizations in Canada have expertise on family violence issues within ethnic communities. Since the same Community Partners have been involved in this entire cycle of the FVI (and the same lead personnel in each agency), they have continued to develop their expertise in family violence in ethnic communities. Consequently, their advice is often sought

³⁵ Airtime contributions are only from CFMT. Contributions from 30 media partners across the country were not available.

³⁶ Information compiled from 1997-2002 Research and File Review information supplied by: Shield of Athena, COSTI, People’s Law School and Vancouver and Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services.

³⁷ COSTI FVI Final Report, 2000 - 2001

³⁸ Interview with COSTI.

³⁹ People’s Law School, 1997-2002 Research and File Review

on the issues. Many of the partners participate or often take lead roles, on advisory committees dealing with family violence issues. A wide range of stakeholders, such as government, academics, mainstream organizations and others seek consultation from the Community Partners.

Increased Mainstream Awareness

As a result of the ethnic broadcasts, mainstream organizations have become more aware of the issues of family violence within ethnocultural communities. Victims have come to them for assistance and the groups have sought out the expertise of the Community Partners as mentioned above.

Awards

The work and expertise of the Community and Media partners has been unexpectedly recognized by others through awards they have received. They are as follows:

- CFMT won first prize for its Public Service Announcement, "Violence Hurts Us All" in the Television Bureau of Canada's Retail Comp 1999 for retail advertising. The 1999 Competition had 426 entries and was judged by consumers.⁴⁰
- Shield of Athena Family Services won the 2001 "Dare to Dream" Award for its vision and accomplishments in reaching out to ethno-culturally specific communities to increase awareness about domestic violence. The letter states, "*Your media awareness campaign on intimate partner abuse for various ethno-culturally specific communities is innovative and demonstrates what can be accomplished through dynamic, responsive, collaborations with communities*".⁴¹
- The Vancouver & Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services Society won the First Annual "Building a Safer Future" Award for 1999.

Ethnic Media Involvement

The Community Partners talked about the difficulty of initially involving the media as partners in developing the broadcasts. Often local media were reluctant participants and many independent producers do not have the facilities nor the resources for production. Community partners worked through these barriers in a variety of ways. For example, they enlisted the support of CFMT, which was an enthusiastic partner and had made substantial contributions of their own financial and human resources to the FVI. By being a role model, CFMT helped bring other media on side and break the taboo of dealing with these sensitive issues. Community partners also used their own community connections to involve the media.

Over time, initially reluctant producers became more receptive when they saw the success of the programs. They then became true partners in the production and sometimes even initiated programming of their own accord.

⁴⁰ Open Letter from Jim Patterson, President, Television Bureau of Canada, Toronto, Ont. (undated)

⁴¹ Letter from Peter Jaffe and Linda Baker, Centre for Children & Families in the Justice System, dated June 29, 2001.

Change in government policy

In Montreal, the advocacy work of Shield of Athena Family Services in conjunction with the television programs on family violence led to a CLSC⁴² examining and changing their policies of providing interpreters and avoiding the use of volunteers in family violence cases.⁴³

Lack of Services

There was only one area in which there was an unintended negative consequence perceived by the key informants. Concern was expressed by Community Partners that expectations were raised through the media broadcasts and then sometimes not enough services were in place to assist victims. Groups gave examples of organizations having difficulty responding to the calls they receive after a broadcast. In Toronto, one ethnic community terminated its broadcasts until there was an increase in service provision to their community.

This does not appear to be a problem in Vancouver as Vancouver & Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services Society (VLMMFSS) has staff to assist victims in all the languages used in broadcasts. VLMMFSS is a unique organization in Canada as its role is specifically to assist persons who are victims of abuse and have linguistic and cultural barriers in accessing mainstream services. The organization does this primarily through its bilingual staff, who have facility in about 20 languages and who have been trained in family violence issues.

3. Program Administration and Effectiveness

3.1 Have the Family Violence Initiative activities been delivered to and by stakeholders and beneficiaries in an efficient and effective manner?

Generally PCH activities have been carried out in a cost effective manner, particularly in the development of the program. During implementation, there have been some staffing and communication difficulties, but they seem to have been addressed. 70% of the funds received for the Multicultural Family Violence Initiative have gone into direct program activities and the rest into planning and administrative support functions.

Program Development

PCH used the learnings from the 1991-96 FVI initiative and identified the key results they were seeking. They determined that delivering the program through community partners was the most effective approach and developed criteria for selecting community organizations. All the respondents agreed that delivering the program through community groups was an effective model and in fact, the only model that made any sense.

The NGO partners for the broadcast media outreach were chosen on the basis of the following criteria:

1. Currently working on family violence issues with at least one target ethnic community;

⁴² In Quebec, health and social services are delivered through provincially funded Centres Locales des Services Communautaires or CLSCs.

⁴³ See Case Study, Shield of Athena Family Services.

2. Has an existing network of counterparts who work with other target ethnic communities;
3. Capable of expanding existing network as necessary (to reach ethnocultural and geographic priorities);
4. Has credibility with ethnic communities served and with other agencies working in the family violence field;
5. Experienced in media outreach activities;
6. Supportive of the message to be delivered;
7. Capable of undertaking a cross-community coordinating role; and
8. Capable of undertaking a multiculturalism-year project.⁴⁴:

Canadian Scene was chosen for the ethnic print project because they were the only organization regularly translating and distributing materials to ethnic print media across Canada. Since *Canadian Scene* ceased operation, there is no other organization that carries out this work. The BC Institute on Family Violence was chosen to develop the ESL kit because of their track record in family violence work and their ability to add ethno-cultural and ESL expertise. CFMT volunteered to develop public service announcements on the topic of family violence and PCH took them up on their offer.

For the media broadcast projects, consistent messages were developed, flexibility was provided for regional implementation and the community groups were supported to develop their programs. PCH requested the Community Partners to undertake the following tasks⁴⁵:

- | | | |
|----|--|---------|
| 1. | Establish a network of contacts in service agencies and family violence spokespersons for identified target communities; | Establi |
| 2. | Establish contact with broadcast media (radio and television) and selected heritage language program producers; | Establi |
| 3. | Promote heritage language programming to raise awareness about family violence; | Promot |
| 4. | Coordinate input by various ethnic communities to ensure consistency of approach, services, message and evaluation mechanisms; | Coordi |
| 5. | Coordinate collection of data for evaluation purposes; and | Coordi |
| 6. | Provide regular reports to PCH Multiculturalism Program. | Provid |

Program Implementation

Initially PCH had regular contact with the community partners and established a supporting working relationship. However subsequently, PCH experienced significant staff turn-over, which resulted in loss of expertise on family violence in PCH and lack of communication with the Community Partners. The groups mentioned that “often it seemed that no one was in charge” and when ethnic groups were ready to develop programming, there was no funding. Then when funding was finally approved, the groups only had months, instead of a whole year to develop the programming.

⁴⁴ PCH unpublished document, NGO Partners – Broadcast Media Outreach, Draft Nov 1997

⁴⁵ Ibid.

Besides the staff turn-over, the approval of the application by the BC Institute on Family Violence was held up for two and half years, largely due to Justice Department court case on “spanking”. PCH personnel were involved in attempting to resolve the difficulties with Justice.

Groups indicated that PCH appears to be on the right track now as communication and support has recently increased. For example, all community partners were invited to a meeting in Ottawa with the Advisory Committee and the evaluation consultants.

Some PCH staff indicated that the challenges arose from lack of senior management buy-in. These respondents perceived that some PCH managers did not clearly understand why PCH is involved in the Family Violence Initiative or that the initiative was low priority for them.

Funding

The attached chart⁴⁶ shows the funds received by PCH from Treasury Board for the five year period 1997- 2002. PCH received a total of \$1,075,000 for FVI and spent \$1,122,951, thus contributing \$47,941 Departmental funds. Direct deliverables such as the media broadcasts and the ESL project accounted for \$756,006 (70% of funds received for FVI) and indirect support accounted for \$366, 935. CFMT covered the costs for staff and production time for the PSAs, as well as, the final artwork and production of the poster. In addition, the Strategic Policy and Resource Management office of the Canadian Identity Sector provided funds for focus testing of the PSAs with five different communities.⁴⁷

⁴⁶ PCH document, *Family violence Initiative Funding Update, 1997 – 2002*, last revised April 18, 2002

⁴⁷ PCH document, *Family Violence PSA*, March 29, 1999, Sage Research Corporation

| 1997- 2002 FVI Revenue & Expenditures | | |
|--|-------------------------|--------------------|
| PCH Revenue | | |
| FVI Funding Rec'd | 5 years @ \$215,000/yr. | \$1,075,000 |
| PCH Expenditures | | |
| a) Expenditures for Deliverables | | |
| Media Projects | | \$670,186 |
| | Montreal | |
| | \$223,000 | |
| | Toronto | |
| | \$253,436 | |
| | Vancouver | |
| | \$193,250 | |
| ESL Resource Kit | BCIFV | \$50,735 |
| PSAs | | \$5,935 |
| Print Media | <i>Canadian Scene</i> | \$29,150 |
| Total Deliverables | | \$756,006 |
| b) Indirect Expenditures | | |
| Planning & Evaluation | | \$60,251 |
| Admin Support | | \$306,684 |
| Total Indirect | | \$366,935 |
| Total Expenditures | | \$1,122,941 |
| Net Cost Contributed by PCH | | \$47,941 |

3.2 Are the administration and delivery practices at PCH capable of ensuring that the stakeholders and beneficiaries are aware of and can access the Family Violence Initiative?

PCH used a strategic approach in identifying and funding community partners, which has proven to be very effective. There have been lapses in communication between PCH and its stakeholders and beneficiaries with respect to the FVI. The Multiculturalism Program Advisory Committee - Family Violence Initiative could play a significant role in improving communication but it has not been convened regularly and members were out of touch with the activities of the Family Violence Initiative. The composition of the Advisory Committee needs to be revised to include the community partners who are delivering the projects.

PCH was granted a small amount of money (\$215,000) annually from the Federal Government's Family Violence Initiative in order to increase awareness among culturally diverse groups within Canada about the impacts of family violence. Typically, PCH would distribute these funds to community groups by inviting proposals, assessing them and often funding

different groups in subsequent years in order to provide broad access to the funds. As discussed above under 3.1, this practice was not followed and PCH was more strategic in seeking out community partners according to certain criteria in order to implement certain predetermined tasks.

While this approach restricts the accessibility of funds to the identified groups, *Positive Outcomes* believes that PCH's approach demonstrated administrative effectiveness and efficiency. The focus was on achieving results and community agencies were chosen based their past performance of producing results. Continuing to fund the same organizations year after year has allowed these organizations to develop their expertise in the area of family violence awareness, to build upon established contacts with ethnic groups and to build upon relationships with ethnic media.

To provide guidance to the project from its stakeholders, PCH formed an Advisory Committee for the initiative. A joint meeting of the four community partners and the Advisory Committee was held March 1998, prior to the implementation of the projects in the communities, in order to finalize the key messages and implementation strategies. This proved to be an effective administrative and delivery strategy as there was a sense of ownership and commitment to the implementation plan, which the projects were able to maintain without much direction from PCH.

According to the Terms of Reference the membership of the Advisory Committee includes the following:

- 1 person representing the Family Violence Initiative of Multiculturalism program;
- 1 regionally-based person responsible for delivery of the Multiculturalism Program, and who has a particular knowledge/overview of family violence issues and services for ethnocultural communities;
- 1 person representing Status of Women Canada;
- 3 ethnocultural community persons with family violence expertise;
- 1 non-ethnocultural community person with family violence expertise;
- 1-2 persons with ethnic media expertise; and
- 1 community person with ESL or FSL expertise.⁴⁸

The role of the committee is to inform the direction of Multiculturalism's Family Violence Initiative by:

- Providing subject area advice on actions that will or will not work;
- Raising sensitive issues/problem areas for attention of Multiculturalism Program;
- Contributing to cross community (geographical and ethnocultural) sharing of information and strategies;
- Monitoring success of activities, or identifying barriers which might impede success; and
- Participating in one committee meeting and one conference call per year, and/or providing occasional reports that further the overall objectives of the project⁴⁹.

There was consensus in both the interviews and during the focus group, that the composition of the Advisory Committee should be reviewed and people should be added to the membership with expertise in: family violence within ethnocultural communities, family violence research, and

⁴⁸ Multiculturalism Program Family Violence Initiative Five-year Strategy and Action Plan 1997-2002, Advisory Committee Terms of Reference.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

the Montreal / Vancouver ethnic media. Members of the focus group strongly recommended the NGO partners become part of the Advisory Committee.

As well, there was concern about the lack of communication between the Advisory Committee and the Interdepartmental Working Group and the lack of awareness in other Departments with respect to ethnocultural issues around family violence. There is a need to improve communication among all the stakeholder groups.

There were no meetings of the Advisory Committee during 2001 and several members were unclear of their role. The PCH Regional representatives had little information about the Advisory Committee and had not seen any reports about FVI funded projects in their regions. One regional Program Officer saw the problem as a structural one, as there was "no mechanism for HQ to report to the Regions". It was suggested that information on learnings from successful federally funded projects would be helpful for regional staff allocating PCH funds.

3.3 Is the reporting level sufficient to meet accountability requirements? (Measure Performance Indicators and accounting requirements)

There are two levels of reporting: PCH reporting to the Inter-Departmental Committee on Family Violence, which is coordinated through Health Canada; and the reporting of Community Partners to Canadian Heritage. Evidence indicates that PCH has met its reporting requirements to the Inter-Departmental Committee. Although reporting requirement of Community Partners have increased since the Auditor General's Report 2000, project files 1997-2002 were managed inconsistently. As of fall 2000, training and tools were provided to project officers and managers to ensure that file management and closure standards met due diligence and enhance monitoring requirements. Community partners are now asked to report on performance indicators as part of their contribution agreement for approved projects.

Canadian Heritage Reporting

Evidence indicates that PCH has met its formal reporting requirements to the Inter-Departmental Committee on Family Violence Health Canada⁵⁰. However, government respondents outside of PCH indicated that Multiculturalism's representation on the Inter-Departmental Committee has not been consistent. All respondents indicated that the FVI Accountability Framework is a useful tool, but that results are often difficult to measure, not only for PCH, but other Departments.

Community Partners Reporting

Reporting and project approvals require considerably more documentation since the Auditor General's report 2000. In 1998, the Auditor General identified persistent "problems in compliance with program authorities, weaknesses in program design, instances of poor controls, and insufficient performance measurement and reporting"⁵¹ and a general "lack of

⁵⁰ An Evaluation of the Family Violence Initiative, Secretary of State of Canada and Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada, 1994

⁵¹ Report of the Auditor General of Canada to the House of Commons, Industry Canada and Canadian Heritage, Multiculturalism, 1998, Chapter 27

concern for results”.⁵² Although by 2000, the Department had begun to address some of the problems, the Auditor General concluded that the Department “has not yet made sufficient improvement in the management of grants and contributions in its Multiculturalism Program.”⁵³ By 2001, the Auditor General concluded that “the Department of Canadian Heritage has made satisfactory progress in addressing our 1998 recommendations”⁵⁴ and that the Department “has finalized a performance framework for the Multiculturalism program. This framework sets out goals, expected results and performance indicators.”⁵⁵ The Department has implemented a grants and contributions management system which meets the Auditor General’s requirements for due diligence. Contribution agreements, rather than grant funding, are now required for funding amounts over \$10,000. Larger contracts, such as the BC Institute on Family Violence (\$90,600 from PCH and \$20,000 from Health Canada) require even more accountability.

The PCH – FVI Multiculturalism funding files were a concern. The consultants’ review of the project files 1997 – 2002 revealed a lack of consistent information. Key documents, such as funding requests, funding approvals, financial reports, interim and final activity reports were not consistently found in the files. With the Auditor General’s review, new due diligence standards for file management came into effect and PCH hired an employee in early 2002 to ensure that the Multiculturalism FVI files complied with the standards for file management.

Community Partners had only been asked to report on activities and indicated that the first time they saw the overall accountability requirements was at the February 2002 meeting with the Advisory Committee. PCH has now asked them to report on performance indicators as part of the contribution agreement for approved projects.

The Performance Indicator Chart is now out of date and does not reflect the priority of the ethnic media broadcasts, nor the lack of a central delivery vehicle for information to ethnic print media across Canada. It needs to be revised as part of a new Performance Framework for the 2003 – 2008 period for the Multiculturalism FVI.

⁵² Ibid.

⁵³ Report of the Auditor General of Canada to the House of Commons, 2000, Chapter 33

⁵⁴ Report of the Auditor General of Canada to the House of Commons, 2001, Chapter 5, Section 9

⁵⁵ Ibid.

4. Lessons Learned and Future Directions

4.1 *What lessons can be learned from the Family Violence Initiative?*

The 1997 – 2002 Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative is based upon the learnings of the 1991- 96 FVI Initiative, which set a solid foundation for this recent initiative. It confirmed the learnings that:

- Prevention messages for ethno-cultural communities are most effective when they are community specific, in the first language of each community and when people who are known and respected by the communities deliver them.
- Ethnic media are an effective way to reach large numbers of people and overcome the denial factor, because they make the prevention message community specific and they broadcast in the first languages of the communities.

In addition, the work done during 1997 – 2002 demonstrated that delivering the program through community agencies that have expertise in family violence and credibility within their own communities can produce outstanding results.

The public-private-community partnerships have also proven to be successful in developing the PSAs and in developing the media programs in each community

There were significant learnings from the Family Violence Initiative and all respondents had many suggestions in response to this question. As well, focus group participants identified several factors, which contributed to the success or lack of success of the Family Violence Initiative. The lessons learned have been grouped into the following categories along with supporting evidence.

1. *Use of community leaders for broadcast messages about family violence increases credibility and impact.*

The sponsoring organizations found that radio and TV programs, which used respected community leaders and professionals from one's own community to lead the discussion, had significant impact. Leaders were talking about their own communities, from the perspective of their communities, and could not be accused of Western bias. In addition, a tape of the previous Minister of Multiculturalism, the Honourable Hedy Fry, discussing family violence from the Federal Government's perspective, was integrated into many of the programs produced. It was found this practice added credibility by demonstrating that the Canadian Government was behind the messaging.

2. *Community ownership is important - PCH flexibility in program delivery supported community ownership.*

Approaches taken by the Community Agencies were different in each city in response to the culture and resources available. For example, the Vancouver & Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services played a central role in producing and broadcasting the programs and being a source of referrals for victims. Whereas in Toronto, COSTI played more of a coordination role as each community produced and broadcast the programs and referred

victims to services within their own community. This has enabled the communities to own the issues and become leaders in responding to the issues.

3. Partnership with the media is the key to success.

The community partners found that the attitude of local media was key to their success in gaining access to both production expertise and broadcast airtime. Having the Vice-President of Rogers CFMT, Canada's largest multilingual television station, as a member of the Advisory Committee was instrumental in enabling this person to become a resource and champion of the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative, thereby increasing support from other media partners. As well, the production of a top quality PSA by CFMT increased the receptivity of local ethnic media broadcasters. It was also found that having a formal public launch of project with ethnocultural media inspired these people to go back into their own communities to examine the issue in their own communities.

To strengthen the relationship between the community partners and the local media, it was suggested that PCH could use its leverage with organizations such as the Canadian Association of Broadcasters and the Canadian Cable Association.

4. Culturally sensitive messages are key to being received by targeted groups.

It was found that using a family unity message (keeping the family together) is more palatable than pointing fingers. Although the key messages were agreed to by the Advisory Committee and community partners, each of the four partner agencies was free to develop programs which reflected the cultural context of the community with which they were working.

5. Services must be available for people seeking help after hearing broadcasts.

The availability of services in the language of victims of family violence varies among the three cities. In Montreal and Toronto, there were cases of victims unable to locate appropriate services. It was found that in Toronto, where victim assistance services are provided by the ethnocultural community, one ethnocultural group terminated its broadcasts as no services were available. In Montreal, where victim assistance services are provided by the local CLSC, the lack of services in the language of the victim, led to a CLSC policy change. In contrast, in Vancouver, Vancouver and Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services, who provides support to victims of abuse with linguistic barriers, found they had the facility to support victims following the broadcasts.

6. Stable and longer-term funding critical to success.

The community partners found that knowing the funding was over five years rather than just for one year was crucial to their ability to plan and implement the projects in an effective manner.

7. Sufficient and flexible funding is important.

Financial resources are critical to enable production and broadcasting of quality programs. PCH funds were used to pay for airtime as well as production costs and the availability of free cable broadcasts varied in each of the communities.

8. More partnerships are needed between PCH and other Federal Departments

PCH has expertise and experience in working with ethnocultural communities, which could be very valuable in assisting other departments to develop more inclusive programs, methods of service delivery and research projects. An example is the longitudinal study on adaptation being done by Citizenship & Immigration. Could this research also look at family violence, as currently there is no data available? As well, the Statistics Canada Shelter survey does not look at ethnicity and this information could be collected as part of this survey.

In addition, although provision of services to victims is a provincial and not a federal responsibility, Canadian Heritage can raise awareness of this lack of services with other government departments through involvement on the Interdepartmental Working Group on Family Violence chaired by Health Canada. In addition, its regional offices can convey the messages to their provincial counterparts.

9. Use of Advisory Committee to develop overall initial approach to program delivery created shared ownership.

The use of an Advisory Committee was instrumental in developing shared ownership for the overall framework for the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative. Key stakeholders, such as community groups, regional PCH offices, other Federal Departments, media and academics were involved and set the directions for the development of the program.

10. Family violence broadcasts targeting new immigrants builds "Social Cohesion".

The use of ethno-specific and culturally sensitive broadcasts have contributed to acceptance by diverse ethnic communities of core Canadian values as enshrined in Canadian law. This results in greater social cohesion as a broader range of Canadians, including immigrants and new citizens, come to understand the laws of Canada and share core Canadian values regarding family violence.

4.2. What best practices (case studies) can be shared between projects

Vancouver

A collaborative working relationship between the PCH, community partners and the media is critical to success. Having key people at senior levels within each organization who understand and are committed to the goals of the Family Violence Initiative facilitates partnerships and repeat broadcasts.

Vancouver and Lower Mainland Multicultural Family Support Services (VLMMFSS) ran into many road blocks attempting to develop programs for ethnic communities because local independent producers did not have the expertise nor production facilities. The Executive

Director of VLMMFSS contacted the Advisory Committee member from Rogers CFMT for support. This person contacted Rogers Cable in Vancouver, who subsequently provided “an excellent producer, whose product was acceptable to Rogers”, studio space and facilities for production, as well as airtime over two years. Consequently, Rogers (and now Shaw Cable) have aired individual programs for up to 19 times. In addition, People’s Law School partnership with an initially reluctant specialty broadcaster resulted in nine re-broadcasts of a program. According to the station, there was not only public demand for repeat broadcasts but also advertising support. Vancouver re-broadcasts were significantly higher than what other community partners have been able to achieve.

Use of an Advisory Committee from the target community, involving representatives from the media, community partners and professionals from the conception of the project, builds trust and an understanding of the issues faced.

The People's Law School uses Advisory Committees composed of representatives of key stakeholder groups from the target communities. For example, the media are reluctant to carry programs on sensitive issues such as family violence and by involving representatives from the beginning of the project, their concerns could be addressed. By involving professionals from the target community, the messages can be adapted to the cultural context.

Program format of skit-panel-conclusion proved to be effective in gaining the attention of viewers.

The skits overcome the taboo factor and are effective in paving the way to a frank panel discussion. The panel includes a mix of professionals to provide a balanced approach to the issue and the concluding remarks by a prominent leader of the community touched the hearts of the viewers.

Toronto

By working with ethnic communities to:

- a) develop and implement the broadcasts and***
 - b) have identified referral services for follow-up,***
- previously unidentified needs are able to be addressed.***

COSTI Immigrant Services has created a feedback form for ethnic communities who develop radio and TV programs to report on calls they receive subsequent to the broadcasts. They were relatively successful in tracking calls for service and information. (See Appendix Case Study #7.) In many of the communities, parenting workshops/courses and parenting support groups were organized and community foster homes were created as a result of the awareness created and the contact between the services and people experiencing abuse.

Montreal

Setting up a hot line to receive calls after a broadcast is aired, identifies what the needs are, refers people to services and provides evidence that there is family violence occurring within the community.

Shield of Athena found the ethnic media often denied any abuse within the community and refused to air the programs. In one case, there were 42 calls in response to the first program.

This helped to make a previously invisible problem, visible and the media rebroadcast the program.

4.3. *What recommendation can be made regarding future directions for the Family Violence Initiative?*

The use of ethnic media broadcasts have been very successful and PCH should continue working with existing community partners in the three cities to build on their expertise and successes. This approach could be expanded to other regions of Canada where there are sizable immigrant communities with access to local ethnic media.

The key informants and Advisory Committee focus group had many recommendations to improve the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative. They are summarized below:

1. *Continue existing media projects and investigate expanding to other cities*

PCH should continue working with existing community partners in the three cities to build on their expertise and successes. It is also recommended that the learnings from these projects could be applied in other regions of Canada where there are large immigrant communities and the availability of media in heritage languages. Once available, Census 2001 data on ethnic origins and home languages in major cities across Canada will provide additional information upon which to base decisions. This can be coupled with Immigration landing data.

2. *Develop more and different Public Service Announcements (PSA's) to disseminate messages*

The PSA's proved to be an excellence vehicle for disseminating the message about family violence in many languages. It is recommended that this success be used to produce additional PSA's. It is critical that they be professionally produced in order to have legitimacy.

3. *PCH funding should allow Projects to use a range of vehicles to deliver message*

As the resources, issues and culture of each community differs, community partners require more flexibility on how best to educate members. For example, some communities don't have radio or TV programming in their languages but do have newspapers. Some communities have asked for cassettes and pamphlets and young women have volunteered to write articles, which could be made available on web sites. There must be flexibility to use whatever works to reach communities with family violence messages.

4. *Increase PCH funding for projects to hire a coordinator.*

To increase the effectiveness of the media projects, PCH funding should also enable the community agencies to hire a paid person to work more closely with communities to provide support in scripting of actual broadcasts, more training on dealing with media, and coordinating meetings between groups to share information and successes. This person could also assist with the design and implementation of an evaluation to measure the impacts of the broadcasts.

5. *Build community capacity to begin to talk about family violence.*

PCH should recognize that some communities may not be ready to discuss family violence and Community Partners must begin at the level the community is willing to engage.

6. *Train media on how to deliver stories on family violence & train agencies on how to work with media*

PCH should facilitate training for community agencies on how to engage and work with the media and training for the media on how best to convey messages about family violence.

7. *PCH messages on family violence must be repeated over the long term*

The attitudes that condone family violence are often intransigent and embedded within cultural values and institutions. The messages which raise awareness that family violence is illegal and unhealthy must be broadcast repeatedly and over the long term.

8. *Key messages should be developed jointly by PCH, Advisory Committee and Community Partners. The success of their delivery in regard to quality and outcomes should be assessed on an ongoing basis by the Community Partners.*

It is critical that the key messages about Family Violence be jointly developed by PCH, its Advisory Committee and the sponsoring organizations. It is also critical that there is an ongoing assessment of both the quality of the products being produced (broadcast programs) and their impact on awareness of family violence and knowledge about laws and sources of help.

9. *Products developed by projects could be disseminated by National Clearinghouse on Family Violence*

There has been a huge demand for videos produced by the community partners. To facilitate their dissemination, the videos should be provided to the National Clearinghouse on Family Violence for national distribution in a timely manner. The Clearinghouse can also target certain population groups as a priority to begin distribution.

V. Conclusions

Significant segments of the minority communities in Canada had not been reached by family violence prevention messages because of linguistic and cultural barriers. The Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative was designed to address this problem by providing “information for immigrant and first generation Canadians” about the “risk factors of family violence and the need for public involvement in responding to the problem.”⁵⁶

For this public awareness campaign to be successful, it was essential that it be done in a culturally appropriate manner so that it would not alienate the intended audiences. The Multiculturalism Program of Canadian Heritage has extensive experience in working effectively with ethno-cultural communities and was the logical choice for implementing a public awareness campaign about family violence issues.

Clearly the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative fits within the mandate of the Department of Canadian Heritage. It contributes directly to two of the Department’s five strategic objectives – “*Building Capacity*” and “*Canadians Connected to One Another*”. It does this by creating shared values and thereby, increasing social cohesion. In addition, the FVI contributes to two of three Multiculturalism policy objectives: civic participation and social justice, through removing barriers for ethnocultural communities to receive information about family violence.

The evidence indicates that using ethnic media is an extremely effective way to reach minority communities on sensitive topics, such as family violence. Respondents indicated that the ethnic media projects were likely the only projects that had any real impact in raising awareness of family violence issues across the broad range of ethnic communities across Canada. The model that was used can be aptly adopted for awareness raising in ethnic communities about other sensitive issues, such as, HIV and AIDS. The critical success factors were:

- Delivering the program through community organizations that have credibility, not only in dealing with family violence, but also within ethnic communities
- Providing community organizations with guidelines on the key messages and allowing considerable flexibility in local implementation
- Involving ethnic community leaders in delivering the messages to their own communities
- Using a community problem-solving and community capacity building approach
- Forming partnerships with ethnic media, community organizations and government

Outstanding results were produced by the community organizations in all three cities, Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver as well, as the media partner, CFMT. During the 1997-2002 cycle, 97 original TV programs were produced and they have been aired a minimum of 502 times. As well, 174 radio programs were produced that have been aired 261 times. The most programs were produced on wife abuse, followed by child abuse and then elder abuse. These programs reached 48 different ethnic groups in the three Metropolitan areas. CFMT, in cooperation with Canadian Heritage and a community partner, produced a PSA in 14 languages that had 3 million gross impressions within the first two months of the campaign. Groups report there is increased discussion within communities about family violence issues, and often communities have become empowered to provide further education and activities on this previously “not talked about” issue. ***What was invisible has now become visible!***

⁵⁶ Family Violence Strategic Plan 2001 – 2002, Draft April 6, 2001

Development of the ESL resource kit on family violence is in process, but had been delayed due to a related court case. It is likely that this kit will be successfully completed in 2002 – 2003. Once the learnings of the ESL are apparent, PCH should proceed with the development of the FSL kit.

Print media is another important vehicle for delivering the key messages, both for reaching communities who do not have access to broadcast media and to reinforce the broadcast media messages. The original plan of using *Canadian Scene* was not achieved because the organization ceased operations. The funded community partners could be supported to broaden their tools to include print media.

The Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative is an essential element in the Federal Family Violence Initiative and it is vital that the momentum of this initiative not be lost. Much success has been achieved during this past cycle, which can be built upon. The evidence indicates that the model developed by Canadian Heritage to reach ethnic communities on the sensitive topic of family violence has been very successful in raising awareness within ethnic communities. It is important to build upon this expertise and continue to work with community partners and ethnic media in continuing to raise awareness about the risk factors and impacts of family violence. Like the “stop smoking campaign”, the messages need to be repeated and variations found on the theme.

VI. Recommendations

- 1. *The Department of Canadian Heritage should continue the current approach taken by the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative as it has proven to be a successful model for reaching first generation Canadians about the risk factors associated with family violence.***

The Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative model has proven to be both relevant to PCH and the target population and logical in its capacity to produce the desired results. PCH should continue to work with and provide funding support to community partners to develop media programs, which raise awareness within ethnic communities on family violence issues. The most significant success of the Multiculturalism FVI has been the original TV and radio programs that have been produced by the community partners, in conjunction with their media partners.

- 2. *The Department of Canadian Heritage should expand upon its success by exploring other intervention strategies that will contribute to the reduction of family violence in ethnocultural communities in Canada.***

The Department of Canadian Heritage can build on the success the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative and enhance its effectiveness by considering the following strategies recommended by a number of stakeholders:

- Provide and allow funding support for coordination of activities to enable community partners the needed time to coordinate the various media projects and to work with ethnic communities to assist them in building capacity to respond to the issues, including sharing with each other their learnings and successes.
- The Department of Canadian Heritage could extend the value of the audio and video tapes produced by the community partners by exploring with the National Clearinghouse on Family Violence the possibility of the Clearinghouse becoming a central distribution point for the tapes so that they can be more widely distributed and utilized.
- Multiple strategies are required to reach target audiences. Although broadcast media should continue to be the focus of this initiative, ethnic print media also has an important market and the information they provide stays around, while a broadcast leaves no evidence. Community partners could effectively use print media to supplement the broadcasts they produce. As well, there are many smaller and newer ethnocultural communities that do not have programming available in their own language but do have newsletters or newspapers in their mother tongue.
- The family violence articles that were produced as part of the ethnic print project provide real life scenarios that exemplify the issues and they are still relevant. So as not to lose the valuable work that was done in producing these articles, the articles could be finalized, up-dated where needed and then distributed to various sources for publication. For example, the Community Partners, may add local resources and then use the articles to supplement their own broadcast programs. Over time Canadian Heritage may selectively send the articles to various ethnic print media for publication. In addition,

Canadian Heritage could explore with the Canadian Ethnic Journalists' Association methods for effectively distributing and publishing the articles.

- The Department of Canadian Heritage should develop criteria for selection of community partner(s) to develop an FSL resource kit on family violence and begin to identify possible groups so that once the learnings from the development of the ESL kit become apparent, the FSL project could proceed without delay.
- During the next phase of the Family Violence Initiative, PCH should build on the partnerships with CFMT to develop partnerships with other broadcasters to develop new public service announcements for ethnic communities on the topic of family violence.

Canwest Global owns CJNT, a multilingual television station in Montreal and CRTC has recently approved the application of Multivan Broadcasting Corporation for a multilingual television station in Vancouver. PCH could reach out to the senior level of both Broadcasters to develop relationships, involve them in the family violence initiative, and work with them to develop new PSAs, using the successful model of a government, private sector and community partnership. Perhaps organizations such as the Canadian Association of Broadcasters could also be of assistance.

- The Advisory Committee for the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative was useful in the early stages of the development of this program and in particular in involving the partners in developing the key messages and the PSA. The Advisory Committee could again provide considerable direction to the next phase of the Family Violence Initiative if the right people are at the table. It is recommended that the membership of the Committee be expanded to include community agencies who are delivering the project, representatives from the media in the three cities, experts in family violence research and representatives from other key stakeholder groups, such as the regional offices of PCH.

3. *The Department of Canadian Heritage should share with other federal departments the communication strategy, partnership approach, and lessons learned from this Initiative as a successful way to reach beyond linguistic and cultural barriers when delivering sensitive messages and information. This is in keeping with the Multiculturalism Program's commitment to overseeing cross-government implementation of the Multiculturalism Act.*

During the evaluation, it was pointed out that those people with expertise in family violence issues were not necessarily knowledgeable about family violence within ethnic communities and sometimes even had preconceived notions. Canadian Heritage has much expertise that can benefit other government departments in their work with ethnic communities, not only in addressing family violence, but also in dealing with other sensitive issues. The partnership approach, the communication strategies and the lessons learned from this initiative would all be valuable for other federal departments, who want to ensure that their messages reach the broad spectrum of Canadians, including Canadians with linguistic and cultural barriers.

PCH should also communicate concerns from ethnic communities that can be solved by other Departments such as difficulties in accessing federal or federally funded services. The

Inter-Departmental Committee on Family Violence is one vehicle where two-way communication and problem-solving can occur.

In order to address this recommendation, the Department should ensure that a strong policy capacity exists at PCH to both coordinate the Family Violence Initiative activities within the Department as well as represent PCH at the Inter-Departmental Committee on Family Violence.

4. *The Department of Canadian Heritage should ensure that a strategy is developed for collecting key performance monitoring information that captures the activities and impacts of the Initiative in a succinct and cost-effective manner.*

Building on the evaluation findings, the Logic Model for the Initiative should be revised to reflect new realities. Community partners should be involved in the development of performance indicators to track key results and be expected to report on key indicators for both outputs and outcomes, as is now required by the Auditor General. It is recommended that two logic models and measurement frameworks be developed - one to measure the results of the Multiculturalism Branch activities and the second to measure the results of the community projects. The long-term impacts would be the same, a reduction in family violence, but the target populations, short and medium term effects would be different.

This evaluation was constrained by the two month time frame and limited resources. A future evaluation for another five year cycle would benefit from a much longer time frame to conduct the evaluation and by obtaining information from the beneficiaries of the projects: ESL teachers, FLS teachers and ethno-cultural communities. In addition, information from partners, such as ethno-cultural media and community professionals would provide a more complete picture of the results.

Rather than wait until the end of the cycle, it is recommended that once outcomes and indicators of success are established as part of a logic model and performance measurement framework, measurement tools be developed and data be collected from the beginning of the project. This would allow for collection of baseline data and the ability to monitor changes overtime to assist in project management.

Management Response and Action Plan

Overall Conclusions

Overall, the Multiculturalism Program agrees with the findings of the evaluation undertaken by Positive Outcomes Consulting Services. The consultants were selected following extensive consultations with the regions, the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative (FVI) Advisory Committee and community partners. Their solid knowledge and skills in community development, of government day-to-day operations, expertise in Family Violence and the role of the media in the process of social change, contributed to the quality of the document.

Management Response and Action Plan

| Evaluation Recommendations | Management Response/Action(s) | Time Lines |
|---|--|---|
| <p><i>1. The Department of Canadian Heritage should continue the current approach taken by the Multiculturalism Family Violence Initiative as it has proven to be a successful model for reaching first generation Canadians about the risk factors associated with family violence.</i></p> | <p>Recommendation accepted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Program will continue support to the NGO partners to deliver media programs to raise awareness on family violence issues within ethnic communities • Multi-year funding will be considered for Community Projects with multiple partners aimed at building capacity, improving coordination of media projects and sharing lessons learned and best practices. | <p style="text-align: center;">Ongoing</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Ongoing</p> |
| <p><i>2. The Department of Canadian Heritage should expand upon its success by exploring other intervention strategies that will contribute to the reduction of family violence in ethnocultural communities in Canada</i></p> | <p>Recommendation accepted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Program will develop a new FVI Strategy and Action Plan for 2003-2008 in order to expand its outreach outside the large metropolitan urban centres and in rural communities where there is a growing segment of ethno-cultural population. • Consultations with the Multiculturalism FVI Advisory Committee, NGO community partners and regional offices will be undertaken to identify new interventions which could contribute to the reduction of family violence. This will feed into the new FVI Strategy and Action Plan | <p style="text-align: center;">2004/03/31</p> <p style="text-align: center;">2004/03/31</p> |

| Evaluation Recommendations | Management Response/Action(s) | Time Lines |
|---|---|--|
| | <p>FVI Strategy and Action Plan.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In collaboration with the Sector Strategic Policy and Management Unit, future research will be undertaken to identify gaps in information, data and statistics concerning family violence and ethno-cultural communities. | <p>2003/12/31</p> |
| <p>3. The Department of Canadian Heritage should share with other federal departments the communication strategy, partnership approach, and lessons learned from this initiative as a successful way to reach beyond linguistic and cultural barriers when delivering sensitive messages and information. This is in keeping with the Multiculturalism Program's commitment to overseeing cross-government implementation of the Multiculturalism Act.</p> | <p>Recommendation accepted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Program has begun consultations to draft a communication strategy which would broadly distribute the lessons learned and best practices of the initiatives to date. The Program will present the findings of the evaluation to the Inter-departmental working group (IWG) in order to share experience, and raise awareness of the needs of the ethno-cultural communities with the aim to make government programs more responsive to the ethnic and visible minority populations in Canada. | <p>2003/03/31.</p> <p>2003/02/28</p> |
| <p>4. The Department of Canadian Heritage should ensure that a strategy is developed for collecting key performance monitoring information that captures the activities and impacts of the Initiative in a succinct and cost-effective manner.</p> | <p>Recommendation accepted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Program will develop a new Performance Measurement Framework as part of its FVI Strategy 2003-2008 reflective of TB Results Based Management Practices. All projects directly funded under this initiative will have individual Performance Measurement Frameworks reflective of the overall results expected to be achieved in the FVI Strategy. | <p>Ongoing</p> <p>Ongoing</p> |

