



Report of the Meat Regulatory and Inspection Review

FARM TO FORK

A STRATEGY FOR MEAT SAFETY IN ONTARIO



The Honourable Roland J. Haines

THE MEAT INSPECTION REVIEW

The Honourable Roland J. Haines



80 Dundas St., 2nd Floor, Unit "Q"
London, ON N6A 1E7

Tel: (519) 660-2700
Fax: (519) 660-2709
Website: www.meatinspectionreview.com

July 21, 2004

The Honourable Michael Bryant
Ministry of the Attorney General
720 Bay Street, 11th Floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2K1

Dear Mr. Attorney:

With this letter I transmit the Report of the Meat Regulatory and Inspection Review.

Yours very truly,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "R. J. Haines".

Roland J. Haines
Reviewer

Encl.

Published by
Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General

© Queen's Printer for Ontario, 2004

Cover Design: HONEY Design, Marketing & Communications

Translation by Government Translation Services

ISBN: O-7794-6427-3

Copies of this and other Ontario Government Publications are available from Publications Ontario at 880 Bay Street, Toronto. Out-of-town customers may write to Publications Ontario, 50 Grosvenor Street, Toronto M7A 1N8. Telephone (416) 326-5300 or toll-free in Ontario 1-800-668-9938. Fax (613) 566-2234. Internet: www.publications.gov.on.ca. The hearing impaired may call toll-free in Ontario 1-800-268-7095. MasterCard, Visa and American Express are accepted. Cheques and money orders should be made payable to the Minister of Finance. Prepayment is required.

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Executive Summary | 11 |
| Chapter 1 - Introduction | 53 |
| 1.1 The Mandate | 53 |
| 1.2 Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) | 53 |
| 1.3 Aylmer Meat Packers Inc..... | 54 |
| 1.4 Wallace Beef Inc. | 54 |
| 1.5 Meat Inspectors..... | 55 |
| 1.6 Meat Production In Ontario..... | 56 |
| 1.7 Free Standing Meat Processors | 58 |
| 1.8 Two Systems of Meat Inspection..... | 58 |
| 1.9 A Science-Based Approach to Meat Safety..... | 58 |
| 1.10 HACCP | 60 |
| 1.11 Ontario..... | 61 |
| 1.12 Farm to Fork..... | 61 |
| 1.13 Principles and Priorities..... | 62 |
| Chapter 2 - Current Structure of Meat Regulation in Ontario | 67 |
| 2.1 Introduction..... | 67 |
| 2.2 Constitutional Responsibility for Safe Meat | 67 |
| 2.3 The Current Federal System | 69 |
| 2.4 The Current Provincial System | 70 |
| 2.5 Ontario Food Safety Strategy and the Food Safety and Quality Act, 2001 | 73 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Chapter 3 - A Science-Based Approach to Food Safety | 81 |
| 3.1 Introduction..... | 81 |
| 3.2 Fundamental Principles of Meat Safety | 83 |
| 3.3 The Role of Government in a Science-Based Food Safety System | 85 |
| 3.4 Risk Analysis in the Development of Public Policy..... | 86 |
| 3.5 Foodborne Illnesses..... | 92 |
| 3.6 Food Safety Programs and HACCP | 99 |
| 3.7 Implementation of HACCP-Based Food Safety Programs..... | 109 |
| 3.8 United States..... | 112 |
| 3.9 HACCP in the Canadian Federal System..... | 114 |
| 3.10 HACCP-Based Food Safety Programs in Ontario Abattoirs and Meat Processing Plants..... | 117 |
| 3.11 Will HACCP Work in Ontario? | 119 |
| 3.12 Should HACCP be Voluntary or Mandatory?..... | 120 |
| 3.13 HACCP in Small and Medium Sized Enterprises..... | 122 |
| 3.14 Summary and Conclusions re HACCP | 126 |
| 3.15 Traceability | 129 |
| 3.16 Biosecurity | 143 |
| 3.17 Surveillance..... | 146 |
| 3.18 Microbiological Standards for Meat..... | 163 |
| 3.19 Science Capacity in Ontario..... | 168 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chapter 4 - Farm Livestock Production | 171 |
| 4.1 Overview of Meat Safety Issues on Farms..... | 171 |
| 4.2 Farming in Ontario | 173 |
| 4.3 HACCP-Based On-Farm Food Safety Programs..... | 177 |
| 4.4 Prerequisite Programs for On-Farm Food Safety Plans in Ontario..... | 185 |
| 4.5 Training and Certification..... | 196 |
| 4.6 On-Farm Food Safety Programs in Other Jurisdictions..... | 198 |
| 4.7 On-Farm Slaughter | 200 |
| 4.8 On-Farm Sales to Consumers | 202 |
| 4.9 On-Farm Inspection | 203 |
| Chapter 5 - Transportation and Livestock Sales | 207 |
| 5.1 Transportation..... | 207 |
| 5.2 Livestock Community Sales | 216 |
| Chapter 6 - Abattoirs | 231 |
| 6.1 Introduction..... | 231 |
| 6.2 Food Safety Issues at Abattoirs | 231 |
| 6.3 History of Abattoir Inspection in Ontario | 232 |
| 6.4 Ontario Legislation Affecting Abattoirs..... | 234 |
| 6.5 Abattoir Licensing in Ontario | 235 |
| 6.6 Abattoir Inspection and Audit | 237 |

6.7 Provincial Abattoir Standards.....254
6.8 Abattoir Standards in Other Jurisdictions.....267
6.9 Provincial Abattoir Services.....270

Chapter 7 - Disposal of Meat Production Waste 283

7.1 Introduction.....283
7.2 Food Safety Issues.....283
7.3 Existing Meat Production Waste Disposal Regime in Ontario284
7.4 Existing Methods for Disposal of Meat Production Waste.....292
7.5 Emergency Disposal305
7.6 Meat Production Disposal Systems in Other Jurisdictions308
7.7 The Future of Meat Production Waste Disposal in Ontario.....310

Chapter 8 - Meat and Fish Processors..... 321

8.1 Introduction – Meat Processors.....321
8.2 Food Safety Risks – Meat Processors.....321
8.3 Current System – Meat Processors.....322
8.4 Introduction – Fish Processors.....335
8.5 Food Safety Risks – Fish Processors.....336
8.6 Current System – Fish Processors.....336
8.7 The Future – Fish Processors.....341

Chapter 9 - Meat Retail and Distribution 345

9.1 Introduction.....345
9.2 Food Safety Issues.....345

| | | |
|---|--|------------|
| 9.3 | Current Ontario System..... | 346 |
| 9.4 | Meat Retail and Distribution Standards..... | 359 |
| 9.5 | Public Health in Ontario and the Delivery of Public Health Food Safety Programs in Ontario..... | 360 |
| 9.6 | Food Safety Investigations, Outbreaks and Responses..... | 369 |
| Chapter 10 - Consumers..... | | 377 |
| 10.1 | Introduction..... | 377 |
| 10.2 | Consumer Food Safety Risk Analysis | 378 |
| 10.3 | Consumer Awareness and Education..... | 380 |
| 10.4 | Partnerships in Consumer Education..... | 385 |
| 10.5 | Labelling and Traceability..... | 387 |
| 10.6 | Provincial Government Role in Education on Food Safety..... | 389 |
| Chapter 11 - Compliance and Enforcement | | 399 |
| 11.1 | Introduction..... | 399 |
| 11.2 | Current Compliance and Enforcement Issues..... | 399 |
| 11.3 | Current Compliance and Enforcement Services and Recommended Changes..... | 406 |
| Chapter 12 - Role of Communication in Meat Safety..... | | 455 |
| 12.1 | Introduction..... | 455 |
| 12.2 | Communication Concerns..... | 455 |
| 12.3 | An Informed Public..... | 457 |
| 12.4 | Food Safety Policy Development..... | 458 |
| 12.5 | Crisis Communication..... | 460 |

Chapter 13 - Reconciling the Provincial and Federal Systems..... 465

| | | |
|------|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 13.1 | Introduction..... | 465 |
| 13.2 | The Differences in the Systems..... | 465 |
| 13.3 | The Need for Local Abattoirs..... | 467 |
| 13.4 | Harmonization..... | 469 |
| 13.5 | Food for Thought – An “OFIA” | 470 |
| 13.6 | Interprovincial Trade..... | 471 |
| 13.7 | Implementation Audit..... | 471 |

Chapter 14 - Process of the Review..... 475

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| 14.1 | Introduction..... | 475 |
| 14.2 | Participation by Ontario Government Employees..... | 475 |
| 14.3 | Time Line..... | 476 |
| 14.4 | Procedure..... | 477 |
| 14.5 | Consultations..... | 477 |
| 14.6 | Expert Advisory Panel..... | 479 |
| 14.7 | Research..... | 484 |
| 14.8 | Acknowledgments..... | 484 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Glossary | 487 |
| Appendix A - Order-In-Council | 499 |
| Appendix B - Aylmer Meat Packers Inc. – Its History with Ontario Ministry of Agriculture and Food | 501 |
| Appendix C - Wallace Beef Inc | 518 |
| Appendix D - Farmed Animal Statistics | 523 |
| Appendix E - Codex Alimentarius Commission Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Point (HACCP) System and Guidelines for Its Application (Annex to CAC/RCP 1-1969, Rev. 3 (1997)) | 524 |
| Appendix F - An Assessment of Biological, Chemical and Physical Hazards, Sources of the Hazards, Possible Interventions Associated with Production of Raw Food of Animal Origin During the Slaughter, Processing, Retail Distribution and Food Service Phases | 537 |
| Appendix G - Veterinary Certificate for Direct Transport to Slaughter | 541 |
| Appendix H - Commencement of Mandatory Meat Inspection in Ontario | 542 |
| Appendix I - Slaughter Statistics for Provincially Inspected Abattoirs in Ontario | 543 |
| Appendix J - Letter Inviting Submissions | 544 |
| Appendix K - List of Individuals and Groups Who Provided Written Submissions to the Review | 546 |
| Appendix L - Public Meeting in Peterborough – March 24, 2004 | 548 |
| Appendix M - Public Meeting in London – March 31, 2004 | 550 |
| Appendix N - Documents Relating to Reprisal Protection | 552 |
| Appendix O - Biographies of Reviewers of the Expert Advisory Panel Report | 555 |