

***Lessons Learned
Literature Review on Employment,
Labour Market and Economic
Development Policies, Programs and
Services for Aboriginal Peoples***

Technical Report

***Prepared for:
Evaluation and Data Development
Strategic Policy
Human Resources Development Canada***

May 1998

**SP-AH141T-05-98E
(également disponible en français)**

Table of Contents

1. Purpose of the literature review	1
1.1 Identifying insights into the effectiveness of labour-market and community-development planning for Aboriginal populations	1
1.1.1 Programs directed to individuals	1
1.1.2 Programs that create strong communities to support employment and foster business development	1
1.2 Our review excludes certain social-welfare policies	2
1.3 Structure of the review	3
2. Employment/labour market policies and programs directed to individuals	5
2.1 Overview	5
2.1.1 Aboriginal labour market and employment programming in Canada	6
2.2 Education and training for the economically disadvantaged.....	7
2.2.1 The mainstream programs in the United States.....	7
2.2.2 Job Corps — a program that works.....	10
2.2.3 The Center for Employment Training (CET) — An approach that shows promise	11
2.3 Training for displaced workers	11
2.4 Welfare-to-work programs	13
2.5 School-to-work transitions	16
2.6 Operational issues in education and training	17
2.6.1 Using performance measures in education and training.....	18
2.6.2 Is there a distinction between education and training?	19
2.6.3 Differences in how training is delivered	20
2.7 Summary of education and training programs.....	22
3. Community Development as the basis for an employment and economic-development strategy	25
3.1 Defining a community	25
3.2 Relationship between regional and community development	27
3.3 Recent advances in community-development techniques.....	30
3.3.1 Models of community development	30
3.3.2 Public-sector employment as a regional economic-development strategy.....	32
3.3.3 Business policies that create employment	33
3.3.4 Entrepreneurship and community economic development.....	34
3.3.5 Networks and community economic development	37
3.4 A review of federal policy for regional and community development in Canada	38
3.4.1 Department of Regional Economic Expansion (DREE).....	38
3.4.2 Community Futures and community development.....	41

3.4.3	Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS)	42
3.4.4	Regional Bilateral Agreements.....	45
3.4.5	Summary of regional development programming	46
3.5	Selected examples of Aboriginal economic development.....	47
3.5.1	Examples from the United States.....	47
3.5.2	The failure and success of U.S. policy for community Aboriginal development	50
3.6	Aboriginal community and economic development in Canada: the past 25 years	50
3.6.1	Summary of Canadian Aboriginal programming	51
3.6.2	Examples of successful Aboriginal development from Canada	53
3.7	Australian Aboriginal Development.....	55
3.8	The critical role of governance.....	56
4.	Summary and synthesis	59
Appendix A — Historical Perspective of Human Resources Development in Canada — 1965 to the Present		61
Appendix B — Overview of Australian Labour Market and Training Programs —1970s-1990s		73
Appendix C — Labour-market Training Programs in the United States — Last Four Decades		81
Appendix D — Bibliography		87

List of Tables

Table 1	Differences between education and training.....	19
Table 2	Oriations for Economic Development	31
Table 3	Summary of Lessons Learned from CAEDS	44
Table 4	Overview of selected federal Aboriginal economic development initiatives in Canada from the 1970s to the 1990s	51
Table A1	1965-71 — Human Resources Development in Canada	67
Table A2	1972-79 — Human Resources Development in Canada	67
Table A3	1980-89 — Human Resources Development in Canada	69
Table A4	Component Programs of the Canadian Job Strategy	70
Table A5	1990s Human Resources Development in Canada	71
Table B1	TAP — Training for Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders Programme Description	75
Table B2	Australian Training Programs, 1970-1990 Period	79
Table C1	1960-1990 Period	85

1. Purpose of the literature review

This report reviews employment, labour-market and economic-development policies and programming in Canada, the United States and Australia. It looks at both mainstream programs as well as initiatives directed to Aboriginal people and communities.

1.1 Identifying insights into the effectiveness of labour-market and community-development planning for Aboriginal populations

We review general descriptions of programs as well as research featuring statistical designs to test a particular form of labour-market intervention. Our goal is twofold: (i) to summarize the findings of the last 30 years of research into labour-market and economic-development planning; and (ii) to present insights into what has worked and what might work when applied to the unique needs of Aboriginal people in Canada. We are selective, stressing those studies that lead to substantial insights into the design and delivery of this form of programming. We also do not delve into the various evaluation methodologies unless they qualify the findings.

1.1.1 Programs directed to individuals

The most common form of public-sector programming in labour-market and economic development is designed to increase the chances of a person securing and maintaining employment. These “primary” interventions benefit individuals as workers and typically range from motivational and cultural programming to intensive training in job-specific skills. These “supply side” interventions are offered through the public education system and increasingly by private trainers contracted to a publicly funded organization.

1.1.2 Programs that create strong communities to support employment and foster business development

In the past decade, interest has grown in the role of the community in economic development. Today, community economic development is seen as important to the welfare of citizens and is often cited as being vital to Canada’s Aboriginal people. Interventions such as infrastructure creation, entrepreneurship and leadership development are all elements of a community development process. These interventions are on the “demand side” because they increase the need for workers.

In addition, a tendency exists to focus the discussion of Aboriginal development at the community level, generally defined as on-reserve. However, growing numbers of Aboriginals, especially youth, live in urban areas. Increased economic welfare for this group is most likely to come through the acquisition of skills that allow them to participate in the modern economy. For this reason, the insights from the mainstream training programs are highly pertinent to this study.

1.2 Our review excludes certain social-welfare policies

Employment, labour-market and economic-development policies connect to social-welfare policy. Income assistance and policy such as the Canada Assistance Plan clearly affect the welfare of workers. In this report, we exclude a direct discussion of such welfare policies, except in regard to a range of policies that encourage, induce or compel people on income assistance (welfare)¹ to secure and maintain full-time work.

Health policies also affect a person's welfare. The ability to learn and work is clearly defined by one's mental and physical health. Our review does not include health policies and how they influence labour-market and economic-development planning.

Another important way to increase the economic welfare of specific groups is through programs such as affirmative action. Although their impact on human resources and individual economic welfare is clear, we do not consider these forms of programming in this review.

The report also focuses on federal programming. Many important provincial programs exist; however, these have often not been evaluated, or the evaluations are not readily available. Further, much of what is done by the provinces to help people gain employment occurs in close conjunction with social services and education. Most recently, provincial governments have assumed primary responsibility for education and training directed to those in the labour market. Often, these programs are similar to those administered by the federal government and include many Aboriginal clients. We came across few provincial programs directed exclusively to Aboriginal populations.

Finally, the education system is obviously related to employment and labour markets. We do not review educational policy in its own right. However, a major finding from our review of training programs is that the separation of occupational and vocational training from the education system has had negative consequences for labour training. Further, dropping out of school is now widely accepted as a major factor in the non-employment and non-employability of many, particularly young, men. Preventing dropping out of school must be the core goal of current employment and labour-market programs, especially for Aboriginal youth.

¹ Canada and the provinces support an income assistance plan. More common, especially in the U.S. literature and in everyday language are the terms "social assistance" and "welfare." We use these terms interchangeably. Generally, we use "welfare" when referring to U.S. programs and historical programs in Canada, and "income assistance" when referring to recent programming covered by the Canada Assistance Plan.

1.3 Structure of the review

This report groups employment/labour-market and economic-development interventions under two main categories, each of which is dealt with in a separate section. Each section examines sub-themes that help clarify what is known about the net benefit of these interventions.

- Section 2 presents a summary of interventions directed to individuals including education and training offered to the economically disadvantaged, training for displaced workers, welfare-to-work programs, school-to-work transitions, and the management of training programs.
- Section 3 considers what is meant by community economic development. It features a review of regional development policy in Canada and the United States. In addition, case studies about Aboriginal development in both countries highlight the essential preconditions needed for Aboriginal community economic development.

Three appendices summarize the main policy developments in Canada, the United States and Australia over the last 30 years. These are included as a background to the main discussion and to illustrate how diffuse policy development has been.

2. Employment/labour market policies and programs directed to individuals

This section summarizes the main findings from over 30 years of designing, executing and evaluating education and training programs. Broadly speaking, these programs have tried to remedy skills deficits and lead people on income assistance to economic independence. Economic independence generally refers to paid employment at a level sufficient to allow individuals to maintain themselves (and their families).

2.1 Overview

Since the early 1960s, governments have defined and funded many education and training programs. Most of these interventions have also been subject to evaluations of varying sophistication. The targets for these programs have been persons appearing to be permanently on welfare, unemployed youth, workers displaced from their jobs due to recession and corporate restructuring, and equity groups,² who are seen as needing increased access to employment.

Aboriginals in Canada are in a comparable position to people in the “mainstream” whose education and life experience excludes them from employment. Analogies can also be drawn with racial minorities in the United States, where discrimination exists as a barrier to employment. Of course, the legal position of registered Indians in Canada is much different from that of Blacks in the United States, but the position of many urban non-registered Aboriginals is not. For this reason, a close reading of “mainstream” education and training offers important clues as to what elements may comprise a viable human resource planning process for Aboriginal peoples in urban Canada.

In the United States, the origin of current education and job training programs directed to individuals is the war on Poverty and the Great Society programs spawned in the political activism of the 1960s. In Canada, the steady increase in unemployment during that decade led to the creation of the Department of Employment and Immigration and the consolidation of federal programming in this area. The Canadian Jobs Strategy and, most recently, the Strategic Initiatives are examples of umbrella arrangements³ that have shaped and defined federal policy in this area.

A key difference between Canada and the United States is the relatively greater scope and autonomy enjoyed by the federal government in the United States to implement programming. In Canada, many federal initiatives are created as joint ventures with the provinces and, most recently, directly with Aboriginal organizations.

² Equity groups usually comprise women, visible minorities, ethnic, religious and racial minorities.

³ Umbrella arrangements refer to groups of program components, initiatives or agreements under a larger policy framework. An example is the National Framework Agreement with national Aboriginal organizations that led to the negotiation of many regional bilateral agreements.

2.1.1 Aboriginal labour market and employment programming in Canada

From the early 1970s to the late 1980s, labour market and employment training programs targeted Aboriginal and other mainstream disadvantaged communities.

- The Local Employment Assistance Program (LEAP), started in 1973, was designed to strengthen attachment to the labour force of persons unable to compete for employment. An evaluation found that there were marginal impacts in terms of employability.
- The Community Employment Strategy (CES) of the mid-1970s was designed to open up employment opportunities for persons experiencing continuing difficulty finding and keeping employment. It was a joint process between federal and provincial governments who were reluctant to get involved in long-term projects that forced communities to emphasize short-term job creation measures.
- The Local Economic Development Assistance (LEDA) program in 1980 was intended to help communities experiencing slow growth play a role in stimulating private-sector employment through local enterprise development.
- The Local Employment Assistance and Development (LEAD) program in 1983 emerged from the restructuring of direct job creation programs such as LEDA. It later became the main component of the Community Futures Program in 1986. An evaluation found that the development of communities was well-suited to the development of the small-business sector.
- The Community Futures Program (CFP) targeted non-metropolitan communities suffering from slow growth, chronic high unemployment and/or a limited economic base. The program's legislative basis was the Canadian Jobs Strategy Terms and Conditions approved by Treasury Board.

In the 1990s, there were a number of changes to labour-market programming. First, up to this time, Human Resources Development Canada's labour-market and employment-training programming targeted all Canadians and treated Aboriginal people as an equity group. Second, since the 1970s, this programming had been linked to community economic development, but with the transfer of Community Futures to Industry Canada, this role ceased. Third, separate programming for Aboriginal people was introduced in 1990 with the Pathways to Success Strategy, the subsequent National Framework and the recent regional bilateral agreements.

Pathways to Success introduced Aboriginal area management boards for the purpose of co-managing Human Resources Development Canada programming. The successors to Pathways to Success are the regional bilateral agreements that allow Aboriginal communities to design and deliver program components. We discuss these initiatives further in the context of federal policy for regional and community development in Canada in Section 3.4.

The Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development recognized that market failures and structural problems impede the matching of workers to jobs. The department introduced the Aboriginal Workforce Participation Initiative (AWPI) to increase employers' awareness, promote the hiring of Aboriginal employees and encourage partnerships with businesses. An evaluation framework was prepared, and data such as the number of employers participating, the increased skills of employers, awareness and partnerships will be collected. Data collection instruments have been designed and a database will track indicators and program results over the next few years.

2.2 Education and training for the economically disadvantaged

The term "economically disadvantaged" covers a broad cross-section of poor people who typically have little education and few job skills. It may include social-assistance recipients, school drop-outs and those who have been displaced as a result of corporate restructuring. This is the most generic group targeted for educational and training upgrading. Usually, these programs do not restrict eligibility to people who are on assistance, displaced from work, receiving unemployment insurance or members of an equity group. The only requirement is that recipients be unemployed and have little education. This is in contrast to other programs where receipt of income assistance is a program requirement.

2.2.1 The "mainstream" programs in the United States

Mainstream programs in the United States (see Grubb: 1995 for a concise summary) are exemplified by the interventions offered by the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA), the Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA). In Canada, they are exemplified by various programs under the Canadian Jobs Strategy and Strategic Initiatives.⁴ These programs typically involve classroom training, on-the-job training, work experience, academic upgrading and life-skills training such as job-search assistance, résumé preparation, interview skills and motivation. In some cases, life skills may also include time management, budgeting and other personal and organizational abilities. The typical participant has serious educational and training deficits that preclude participation in anything but the casual labour market.⁵

⁴ The Canadian Jobs Strategy also included significant programming directed to business and communities.

⁵ The casual labour market features part-time and short-term employment, usually at or slightly higher than the minimum wage. Employees typically have few fringe benefits, are not represented by a union, and are not included in firm-based on-the-job training.

Early evaluation of these interventions used a quasi-experimental method (regression).⁶ Typically, the outcome of treatment groups (those participating in the program) are compared to those of control groups (“identical persons” who did not participate). Usually, identifying comparison groups presents a complex challenge, and researchers have developed ingenious methodologies to compensate for flawed designs.⁷

Longitudinal studies such as the “Panel Study on Income Dynamics” have followed program participants over an extended period. These studies have demonstrated a “decay” in program-effect where training recipients return to welfare after a period in the labour force.

Recently, economists have adopted experimental (random assignment) methods to assign participants to various levels of treatment.⁸ These designs have typically evolved in the context of “workfare,” where compulsory training can be allocated randomly, thereby overcoming some of the ethical challenges of withholding training from certain individuals.

Lalonde (1995) summarized some 30 of the most prominent studies of *the Manpower Training Development Act* (MTDA) and CETA. The evaluations showed disappointing results for these interventions, which typically comprise varying combinations of classroom and on-the-job training as well as life-skills courses. Women tend to enjoy benefits in terms of increased post-program wages and employment. Typical wage increments range up to \$3,000 a year in some programs (Ashenfelter and Card, 1985) but are typically \$500-\$700 a year. The gains for men are lower; and for youth they are disappointing with negative returns commonly reported.

The fact that different programs should appear to offer such a wide variation in outcome is disturbing. It suggests that either researchers are using different methodologies or that the programs differ fundamentally in design and delivery, or both. Lalonde (1995) believes that small differences in statistical methods and the composition of the comparison group are responsible for this variability. Barnow (1987) investigates this variability and also concludes that “the great variation in the impact estimates shows that the findings are highly sensitive to the methods used” (p.189).

⁶ A quasi-experimental methodology assigns differing levels of treatment to participating individuals and creates comparison groups of those who do not participate, but for whom outcome data are available. The focus of the evaluation is the estimation of a statistical relation between treatments (measured as training intensity such as number of course hours, number of courses, or even just a dummy variable to significant course attendance) and outcomes (measured by increased earnings, job holding and so on.) Included in the model are a variety of statistical control variables such as age, gender, prior education and ethnicity. These methodologies are tricky. As Lalonde (1995) notes: “unbiased estimates of the training effect depend both on the criteria used to select the comparison group and on the specification of the earnings and program participation equations” (p. 155).

⁷ Bell et al. (1995) review this literature and argue that program applicants not yet accepted into a program constitute an ideal program-comparison group.

⁸ Lalonde (1995) notes that experimental methods suffer from selection biases where those entering a program are not the same as those who do not. Further, random assignment is difficult to execute since it requires program administrators to withhold programs from apparently deserving clients. Ethical challenges are difficult to resolve, and research protocols are sometimes subverted by well-meaning program managers.

In 1996, the General Accounting Office⁹ evaluated a broad range of training programs under the JTPA with uniformly negative conclusions. The programs did not produce higher earnings after training, nor did they reduce the spells on social assistance.

Heckman (1996) comes to the same conclusions in a widely ranging review. Using research by Lynch (1992) and Lillard and Tan (1986), he argues that training offered by the private sector has a higher rate of return than training offered by the public sector. Typically, private-employer-based training, if offered to those who are going to be given a job, will have high success rates. Because employers pre-screen applicants before offering these programs, much of the higher return is explained by the selection process.¹⁰ Heckman also advocates investment in public education. He notes that the returns to investment from formal education are highest for the young because they accrue over a longer life span and because “early learning begets later learning” (p. 340).

Recently, Friedlander and Greenberg (1997) have synthesized the literature on training programs for economically disadvantaged persons. This survey includes the latest studies on the JTPA.¹¹ Friedlander and Greenberg confirm Lalonde’s findings of a decade earlier that:

- training programs for the disadvantaged have produced modest positive effects on employment and earnings for adult men and women that are roughly commensurate with the resources expended.
- these programs have not made substantial inroads in reducing poverty, income inequality, or welfare use.
- despite a large number of evaluations of government training programs and the development of a variety of sophisticated evaluation methods, considerable uncertainty remains about the kinds of training that works best, the effectiveness of training for certain demographic groups and the appropriate policies for increasing aggregate effect (p. 1810).

Friedlander and Greenberg note that adult women benefit the most from training, although the recent JTPA evaluations show modest positive impacts for men. For youth, the impacts are mixed, and aside from the Job Corps (see below, Section 2.2.2), systematic positive impacts on wages and welfare use by youth are difficult to detect. Since the programs touch a fraction of all welfare recipients, the aggregate financial effects are small. In other words, the overall rate of return in terms of reduced use of welfare is inconsequential.

⁹ General Accounting Office, (1996) *Job Training Partnership Act: Long-term earnings and employment outcomes*, Washington, D.C.

¹⁰ This is known as “creaming” and we will return to it below.

¹¹ The JTPA included important differences compared to the CETA programming. Most notable is the use of partnerships with other levels of government, firms and non-governmental organizations. This increases its flexibility in offering job-training venues.

It is also unclear whether expanding the programs might not include less suitable candidates for training who would not benefit from program involvement. This is a complex issue which suggests that many are beyond the scope of these interventions. Relapse is also common — many participants return to welfare after a short-term start in the labour force. Finally, training programs do not have the same sustained impact as increases in formal education.

In summary, the results of 30 years of designing and implementing job training in the United States shows small increments in earnings for participants and relatively low returns for the taxpayer's investment.

2.2.2 Job Corps — a program that works

Established in 1964, the Job Corps is one of the oldest programs in the job-training portfolio. The key features of this program are a rigorous selection process¹² and a residential setting that takes poor (male) youth out of their home setting. This program reflects the view that “poor individuals are trapped in an inter-generational “culture of poverty” which can best be combated through intensive services to youth” (Levitan and Gallo, 1988).

According to Levitan and Gallo, the Job Corps has high success if program participants remain enrolled until the conclusion. Those who leave early are much more difficult to place into jobs and typically have both lower wages and much shorter employment duration. The key element of the program appears to be the residential nature of the setting and the focus on core academic skills, especially reading and writing.

Lalonde (1995) critically analyzed Job Corps' claimed net social benefit of \$5,590.¹³ Much of this is generated by a calculated reduction in the social costs of crime that would have been committed by the program participants had they not participated. Nonetheless, evaluators widely cite the Job Corps as an effective, albeit expensive, program (at about US\$ 16,000 a year in 1985).

Clearly, the residential aspect of the program might strike a discordant note in its possible application to human resource programming for Aboriginal youth. However, training young men has proved difficult, and with the attractions of a gang lifestyle in many Canadian cities, training that removes youth from this setting may offer a higher chance of success than other approaches. Residential training that is Aboriginal-oriented with appropriate cultural values certainly has little relation to the residential-school system of old. However, this is an expensive option compared to regular community-based education and training that features classroom and on-the-job instruction. But then again, these programs have generally not worked.

¹² Enrolment is limited to young men between 16 and 25 years of age. They must be economically disadvantaged, meet armed forces requirements, live in an environment that "substantially impairs" prospects for successful participation in other programs and be free of medical or behavioural problems (drug and alcohol dependency).

¹³ This is the estimate of Charles Maller et al. (1992) *Evaluation of the Economic Impacts of the Job Corps Program: Third Follow-up Report*, Mathematica Policy Inc.

2.2.3 The Center for Employment Training (CET) — An approach that shows promise

In recent years, authors such as Giloth, Harrison and Weiss (1998) refer to job-centred economic development that focuses on “good” jobs as an outcome of low-income communities. They state that traditional employment and training programs have not been effective for most groups, especially low-income communities. Job-centred economic development “underscores jobs outcomes, not simply economic adaptation, new business generation, job readiness or workforce attachment” (Giloth, 1998). These “employer-centered training programs are said to produce the greatest payoffs, especially for groups such as out-of-school youth, for which practically none of the existing programs have proven effective” (Bishop, 1994; Knocke and Kalleberg, 1994; Batt, 1993).

Besides the Job Corps program, these authors believe the San José-based Center for Employment Training (CET), which serves a large Chicano clientele, is one of the most innovative and successful programs for training people. This job-centred program is said to be successful because it combines strategies such as welfare-to-work programs, job training and economic development. It draws on a number of funding sources (Giloth, 1998).

Lautsh and Osterman also state that CET is effective because of its close ties to employers and a grounding in a community-based organization: “What distinguishes CET are efforts to alter the environment within which its clientele operates.” (Lautsh and Osterman, 1998) These programs might offer promise in Aboriginal low-income communities with strong economic-development organizations that have ties to local employers.

2.3 Training for displaced workers

Governments have placed a priority on training workers who are displaced from the labour market due to seasonal employment fluctuations or industrial restructuring. This group is not economically disadvantaged in that they often have high school education and work experience.

Training for displaced workers seems to have somewhat higher returns than training for the disadvantaged. Kodrzycki (1997) finds that displaced workers who undertake a combination of training and education generally do earn more after their lay-off. However, she uses micro-data to show that the increased income is often due to workers using the training to switch to a higher-wage occupation. Training alone is not the factor that leads to higher wages. Rather the training leads to career switches — it opens new doors. Also key is the fact that displaced workers frequently have more education than welfare recipients.

Leigh (1990) reviews programs in the United States, Canada and Australia. While the focus of his work is a review of training for displaced workers, he considers a fairly broad range of programs. He finds:

- Canadian and Australian studies echo the generally negative findings of the evaluations of U.S. programs. For example, the evaluation of the Canadian National Institutional Training Program found that wage increases and annual earnings were not improved by the skill training. In Australia, the Labour Adjustment Training Arrangements found that such training actually reduced the likelihood of re-employment, possibly because the training was inappropriate or delayed job assistance.
- For the Canadian Manpower Industrial Training Program (which purchased on-the-job training from private employers) little impact was observed on weekly wages.
- In an important conclusion, Leigh argues that job-search assistance has the largest benefit for displaced workers compared to education or vocational training.

In a recent study of training on Unemployment Insurance (UI) recipients in Canada, Park et al. (1996) found that training for UI recipients shows a wide dispersion in outcomes. Training that pays UI while training is being received (the claimant must arrange to pay for the course), programs to help women re-enter the workforce and training to meet projected skill shortages had high rates of return. Training that is part-time or directed to the long-term unemployed had lower or even zero returns.

A recent related project offered in Canada is the Earnings Supplement Project (ESP), which tops up the earnings of displaced workers and recipients of unemployment insurance.¹⁴ A displaced worker or UI recipient may have his or her wage supplemented for a limited time, provided the job starts soon after lay off and pays less than the previous job. With respect to the cost-benefit ratio of the training programs, the results are mixed. Given the increase in earnings across the population of participants, the aggregate benefits outweigh the costs.

In general, training for displaced workers appears to have higher returns than training for the economically disadvantaged. Their higher educational levels as well as the fact that participants usually have substantial job experience are important advantages in recovering economic independence.

These evaluations confirm the importance of completing high school. Short-term training for those with weak academic skills always shows poor long-term results.

¹⁴ The Unemployment Insurance Program is now the Employment Insurance Program. The new program is financed through premiums paid by the worker and employer but imposes a qualification on the hours worked, not insurable weeks. It adjusts the payments to reflect average and not actual wages earned in the weeks prior to job loss, reduces benefits for repeat users, adds a low-income supplement and increases the recovery of benefits through the income tax.

2.4 Welfare-to-work programs

Paralleling the most recent round of job training for the disadvantaged are programs designed to tackle the high and growing caseload of those on welfare.¹⁵ An important subset of programming targeted for welfare recipients is known as “work-related programs for welfare recipients.” This form of program usually requires those receiving welfare to participate in job-search assistance, workfare (unpaid work and community service in exchange for welfare) and other education and training. Typically, mothers with young children at home are exempt.

The first U.S. program to encourage welfare mothers to work was the Work Incentive (WIN) program announced in 1967. Under this program, Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) recipients could keep a percentage of their work earnings. Through the 1980s, financial support for WIN dwindled. Several states responded by creating demonstration projects that tested the effectiveness of measures to encourage long-term welfare recipients in obtaining employment. These demonstration projects used a wide range of inducements and penalties to get welfare recipients to obtain work. The Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation evaluated these demonstration projects using various experimental methods.¹⁶ According to Burtless (1992), the results are clear:

- Demonstrations that required community service and did not offer job-seeking assistance show little effect on wages or welfare use.
- Projects that intensively promoted participation showed the greatest results in terms of increased income.
- Later programs that included work experience also showed increased earnings among welfare recipients.
- While many participants in these programs enjoyed greater incomes, a portion of the extra income was received by taxpayers in the form of reduced welfare payments. This lowered the net pay to the recipients.¹⁷

¹⁵ Whitman (1987) captures the late-1980’s mood that set the stage for the recent round of legislative reforms. He argues that the key issue leading to the support of stronger legislation to limit eligibility for welfare was the large number of single-parent families that had used AFDC for more than a decade. Blank (1997) identifies the reasons for the increase in the United States after 1990 as increases in the number of child-only cases (payments made directly to a child), an increase due to the recent recession, and a long-term increase that is not easily explained. Public support for these more aggressive approaches to dealing with welfare appears to have emerged from frustration at the intractable nature of long-term welfare dependency.

¹⁶ These studies were able to assign welfare recipients to various treatments as part of the legislation. The compulsory nature of the programming eased many of the problems with random assignment.

¹⁷ Most of these programs solved the disincentive effect. Unlike most conventional social assistance programs, participants in these welfare-to-work programs were allowed to keep a portion of their earnings without suffering a decline in welfare payments.

The modest increase in net income did not encourage many participants to leave welfare permanently. This echoes the results from the training evaluations. Workfare in the 1980s did not reduce participation in welfare programs and had little effect on poverty.

Bell and Orr (1989) countered this pessimistic assessment. They conducted experiments with seven state demonstration projects and found that: “The training and subsidized employment programs examined here produced significant increases in earnings and reductions in welfare dependence in at least one of the two post-demonstration years in six of the seven demonstration projects. Subsidized employment is a cost-effective tool for improving the economic status of welfare recipients” (p. 59 and 60).

In the 1990s, lawmakers in the United States, and to a lesser extent in Canada, have been even more persuaded that a significant reduction in long-term welfare caseloads can be effected by offering incentives and penalties, especially for adults with no physical or intellectual barriers to employment. The recent mandatory maximum time limits in AFDC eligibility in the United States and in Canadian provincial programs such as Making Welfare Work¹⁸ illustrate this legislative mood.

The Job Opportunities and Basic Skills Training, Greater Avenues for Independence (GAIN), and Project Independence programs in the United States concentrated on short-term treatments such as job search and quick educational upgrading as opposed to longer-term training. The thinking appears to be to “jump-start” the back-to-work process and spread the money among many participants. In general, most evaluations of these initiatives have shown statistically significant increases in earnings, but the likelihood of coming off welfare has not been reduced.

Three findings are important:

- These programs do not work in weak economies.
- The largest impact was on those least ready to work. This contradicts the common idea that those who are the most job-ready are more likely to secure full-time employment and are the easiest to place.
- Since earnings increases were small, the reduction in welfare payments were commensurately small.

¹⁸ The Making Welfare Work initiative of the Manitoba government requires everyone on income assistance to enter an employability enhancement measure or program. Single parents with children under 6 or with disabilities are not expected to enter such programs. Other clients have a “work expectation” attached to their eligibility for income assistance and face sanctions in the form of reductions in payments if they do not respond. The enhancement measures range from job-search instruction and brief skills refreshers for those judged to be employment-ready to more substantial academic and life-skills training for those who face greater barriers to economic independence.

The most recent review of welfare-to-work in the United States (O'Neill and O'Neill, 1995) finds that: "there is no evidence that any of the large number of education, employment and training programs that have been offered or mandated for AFDC clients since 1967 has had a significant impact on the duration of time spent on welfare" (p. 108).

The authors go on to say: "It has proven extraordinarily difficult for any government program to transform a subgroup of recipients with multiple problems into workers who can earn a high enough income to support a family on their own and compete with the benefits offered to welfare recipients" (p. 109).

The Canadian context for social security differs from the United States. No national welfare program exists: rather the Canada Assistance Plan (CAP) offers federal-provincial cost sharing in the provision of income assistance. Each province administers its own income-assistance program.¹⁹ Most provinces use a needs test and offset income-assistance payments if the recipient obtains employment or other income. This is widely acknowledged to be a significant disincentive to work, since an extra dollar earned by employment results in a commensurate reduction in the income-assistance payment.

The Self-Sufficiency Project in Canada (SSP) is designed as "an opportunity to provide an alternative approach to encouraging work among welfare recipients, with safeguards to minimize disincentive effects, while at the same time substantially increasing income" (Card and Robbins, 1996: p. 3). The three features of the program are:

- a money incentive to work;
- low marginal tax on earnings; and
- a requirement that participants work at least 30 hours a week.

This project measured whether these incentives could encourage income-assistance recipients to move to full economic independence. Initial indications are that the SSP does encourage income-assistance recipients to seek and maintain full employment. In just over a year, the fraction of former income-assistance recipients who participated in SSP and had found employment was significantly higher than the control group.

In light of the pessimism that surrounds the literature on training and welfare-to-work programming, these forms of financial incentives to seek work are likely to grow in popularity. It is also important to note that the strict workfare and eligibility restrictions that have been enacted in the United States have yet to be adopted in Canada, although Ontario and Alberta have come closest.

¹⁹ In some provinces, municipalities may have the discretion to adjust eligibility and payments, but these arrangements are gradually being eliminated.

2.5 School-to-work transitions

As stated in the introduction, we have not considered how the education system and policies affect employment and labour-market planning. However, there are important links between human resource planning and education — specifically in the way vocational and occupational training are integrated with the academic curriculum. The school-to-work transition literature offers important insights as to why various training programs have not worked well.

A significant area of human resource planning falls under the rubric of school-to-work transitions. Closely related is the growing awareness that students need to be maintained in formal education for as long as possible. Evaluations confirm the value of basic formal education as the foundation of job-related training and eventual success at securing and maintaining employment.

A common reason advanced for early drop-out before high school completion, especially among young males, is that the link between academic education and occupational preparation has not been made sufficiently clear. This has led to a growing awareness by educators and parents that academic education needs to become occupationally relevant in order to hold the interest of most students, particularly young men.

In the United States, the *School to Work Opportunities Act* (STWOA) involves employers and the public schools “to create more effective arrangements of school and work for young people” (Urquiola et al., 1997). Initial efforts focused school-to-work (STW) strategies on targeting people not destined to go to college. These traditional “shop” classes stigmatized their students and have given way to broader programming. Recent efforts have refocused the initiatives to include a general integration of work and occupation issues into the curriculum for all high school students.

Key features of the STW include integration of academic and occupational courses, work-based training, creating clear paths from high school to post-secondary education, and including technical and four-year colleges and universities. Typical programs involve high school students working with an employer for a two- or three-month period and obtaining a course credit for successfully completing work assignments.

The STW process tries to connect work to the public education system and post-secondary education. The idea is that even students who are academically oriented benefit from an exposure to occupations. Including university-bound students in the STW programs removes the stigma for students who are non-college bound.

Typical evaluations of STW Urquiola et al. (1997) include the following:

- Wisconsin Youth Apprenticeships Program evaluation found that STW had significant impacts on in-school performance (lower absenteeism, higher grades) and improved labour-market outcomes after graduation.

- Manufacturing Technology Partnership Program is a joint effort by the United Auto Workers and General Motors to attract more minority and female workers to the car industry. This program was generally successful, but this may be more the result of ample funding from GM and highly paid union employment than the program itself.

Urquiola et al. cite several other evaluations but are forced to conclude that “Even on a small scale, most studies of individual programs have not yielded clear results.” They also believe that it is unlikely that STW can be evaluated using random assignment methods, the approach most researchers advocate for assessing job-training impacts. Because the implementation of STW varies so widely, the tightly controlled evaluations needed for random assignment studies are not possible. Further, STW involves all students in a school, making random assignment ethically unfeasible.

STW has rapidly emerged as a counterpoint to the fragmentation between education and training. Rather than being a direct outcome of the apparent failure of the training strategies, STW has emerged along a parallel course. Integrating occupational and academic activities addresses many of the criticisms levelled against the training and welfare-to-work programs. In this way, the school-to-work literature offers important insights on how educational reform has long-term human-resource consequences.

Canadian research again tends to be more diffuse, with several studies examining the school-to-work transition. Lowe and Krahn (1995) analyze the extent to which high school graduates engage in labour-market training of their own volition. Using longitudinal data, they note that many younger workers do engage in lifelong learning by taking courses and job-related training. Significantly, students that had received job-related training in school (e.g., community college) were more likely to continue investing in job-related education once employed.

Lowe and Krahn admit that this represents a well-educated sample, but they believe their findings have policy relevance. They find that formal education offers occupational-specific training, while informal training offers job-related information. In essence, Lowe and Krahn point to a process in which the formal education system and the informal employer-based education system are converging. This confirms the need to meld the academic education system with occupational and vocational training.

2.6 Operational issues in education and training

Much of the research into education and training for disadvantaged groups focuses on the outcomes in terms of increased wages and the changed likelihood of remaining on welfare. Comparatively little has been written on the delivery models used to provide human resource interventions. With the increased devolution of training to partners and the use of contract training, these management issues are very pertinent.

2.6.1 Using performance measures in education and training

Recently, training programs in Canada and the United States have introduced performance measures and incentives in an attempt to secure benefits from the training expenditures. Many programs subcontract training to private consultants and use performance measures as elements of the contract to ensure education and employment targets are met. For example, JTPA and other training projects within the Strategic Initiatives programs in Canada may compensate trainers only after their students graduate and maintain employment for a specified period.

JTPA used “value-added” performance standards that included a reduction in measured unemployment, increases in earnings and a reduction in long-term welfare dependency. Payment was made upon a measure of a beneficial change in these indicators after training. However, Cragg (1995) illustrates the problem of “moral hazard”²⁰ and “creaming” that can undermine training programs. If trainers are paid according to employment and wage results, incentives exist to direct their programs to the most job-ready. As others have shown, this group is likely to find their own way back to the labour force. People who face higher barriers to employment and for whom successful training has the highest payoff for the taxpayer may not receive adequate training because the rewards to the contractor can be realized only after prolonged training (and cost).

Cragg’s research on the JTPA confirms that performance incentives for training create responses on the part of trainers that can frustrate the achievement of program goals and allocate resources to those least in need. At the same time, the author believes outcome measures can raise the overall performance of a program and offset the impacts of creaming.

Stecher et al. (1995) review the use of performance measures in vocational training under the Carl D. Perkins Applied Technology and Vocational Education Act (1990). Earlier evaluations (Stecher 1994) have found that performance standards and measures did not produce the outcomes intended. The states that participated in the earlier round of the Act were found to have engaged in prolonged implementation, and technical assistance was unavailable to help schools translate performance measures into changed approaches.

Stecher et al. (1995) recommend the following as key to effective use of performance measures in vocational training:

- Include teachers in the evaluation and measurement process since they are the primary agents of program change.
- Compare the progress of special groups to the population as a whole to ensure that this targeted programming is as effective as other activities.

²⁰ Moral hazard exists when a regulation leads to perverse results. For example, mandated seat belt usage leads some drivers to believe they can safely drive at a higher speed, but higher speed negates the benefit of the seat belts.

- Weave evaluation into all phases of a training activity.
- Embed an improvement plan in the organization’s training program.

2.6.2 Is there a distinction between education and training?

This may appear to be a conceptual question. But the fact that most policy-makers answer this question affirmatively defines a fundamental feature of mainstream education and training. Specifically, policy-makers have divorced the formal academic education system from the training infrastructure. Grubb (1995) in a wide-ranging and highly critical review of education and training, identifies this as a serious mistake. Table 1 shows the distinctions that Grubb says have been drawn between education and training.

TABLE 1	
Differences between education and training	
Training	Education
Generally short — (as low as 2 weeks to a year) JTPA averages 3.5 months or 4.	Longer programs with post-secondary certifications taking up to 2 or even 3 years.
Defined by eligibility (e.g., those on social assistance and Employment Insurance, Aboriginal people).	Open to all members of the public.
Offered by a wide array of public and private suppliers.	Located within accredited institutions.
Uses traditional classroom setting as well as on-the-job training, job clubs, work experience and counseling (individual and group).	Courses located in a traditional setting (classroom or labs) with distance education emerging.
Sponsors often take on the responsibility to find work for their clients.	Employment is not seen as a responsibility of the sponsor.
Goals are narrow and focused on training participants to secure employment.	Goals are broad and include ethical, political, moral and liberal education objectives as well as occupational goals.
Often defined as a “second chance” or compensatory for not having used the education system well in the first place. This system is regularly changed as government identifies new target groups and objectives. Funding is typically short-term and just a fraction of that spent on education.	The primary method for readying citizens for life, in which employment is an important but not the only part. Students move through the system in sequential process. This system is formalized and deeply rooted, so it is difficult for government to design programs for specific needs.
Source: Adapted from Grubb (1995)	

The JTPA and the Strategic Initiatives programs often feature many partners in the delivery. Typically, community-based organizations and private-sector trainers are the primary agents offering programs to the economically disadvantaged. Certainly, formal educational institutions, especially community colleges, have become more involved in delivering these programs, but they still account for a small fraction of the total funding.²¹ This schism accounts for much of the failure in the human resource programming directed to the economically disadvantaged.

2.6.3 Differences in how training is delivered

The evaluations of education and training offer a range of insights into the design and delivery of these programs. Many of these evaluations inform the development of human resource planning for Aboriginals.

- Most of the training programs do not address fundamental educational deficits. The programs are very specific and usually short term in comparison to conventional certification programs at a college.
- The funding is small in relation to the problem being solved. The dollars spent on training are a tiny fraction of the funding needed to support income-assistance programs.
- Often the strategy is wrong in that the objective is to secure any job. The programs combine a specific skill-deficit remedy with a threat of welfare attenuation. In reality, many programs fail because the labour market cannot consistently deliver low-wage and low-skill jobs. The casual low-wage labour market is unstable, and those jobs that are created are just as regularly destroyed.

This contrasts with a strategy that seeks to move participants into higher skill areas where employment stability is greater. According to Grubb, the focus should be on the enhancement of basic academic skills, not job-specific training. The earnings profiles of those who experience short-term training are profoundly different from those that go through a more conventional academic certification program. Training welfare recipients to participate in this unstable job market is likely to produce poor outcomes and to perpetuate their involvement with income assistance.

- Grubb offers a broad indictment of training offered under the JTPA:
 - Business sometimes uses the partnerships between private employers and training to secure low-wage workers rather than as training to lift welfare recipients permanently out of dependency.

²¹ Examples of post-secondary institutional involvement are shorter training programs such as computer courses and three-day workshops.

- Many different organizations supply training to widely varying standards. Little quality control exists.
 - The theory of how to offer training to those with low education is poorly articulated. Attention to the needs of adult learners is often missing, and the pedagogy of training is deficient.
 - Most organizers of training in the programs offer little educational experience or understanding of how to organize and deliver these programs.
 - Program funders are equally unqualified to assess and monitor program performance by their service providers. Performance contracts are either deficient or poorly enforced.
 - Training programs are local and may be subject to political influence. The reallocation of resources from ineffective to effective programs can be complicated by the interests of training providers who are involved in the contracting process.
- Job-related training with effective placements typically has a higher return than general training with poor placement.
 - Many training programs offer a single course. Some programs even limit eligibility, and training is usually not part of a sequence of increasing skills (i.e., a ladder of competency). This is in sharp contrast to the academic model where prerequisites channel the student to increased competency. Lifelong learning requires that lower skills-training needs to be followed by a sequence of increasing intensity. Training programs should also flow upwards.
 - Until the recent economic recovery, the labour market has had little capacity to absorb the surplus of low-skill workers.
 - A three-tier population exists among the economically disadvantaged:
 - Tier 1 consists of those people who are most job-ready (first-time welfare recipients with recent job experience) and who have a high chance of making their way back to the labour market unaided.
 - Tier 2 includes people with some time on welfare and a basic education. They often show the greatest gain in terms of being able to come off welfare after training.
 - Tier 3 is the most disadvantaged group. These people often have long periods on welfare and low education. They require significant investment to secure permanent employment.

According to many evaluators, training Tier 2 shows the greatest gain to society in terms of a long-term reduction in welfare costs. Training for Tier 1 should consist only of job-search assistance. More training is not necessary since these welfare recipients can usually rejoin the workforce with little investment. Tier 3 welfare recipients comprise the largest investment and require a broad range of supports to enter the labour force. This detailed counseling and intensive support is referred to as “case management.”

Limited training programs simply cannot lift those Tier 3 persons on welfare into a level of competency needed to be competitive (Hansen, 1994; Grubb and McConnell, 1992).

- Youth unemployment may be due to a lack of high school education, a poor labour market, a rejection of school, or family destructiveness (Quint et al.). This is a typical pattern for many Aboriginal youth. The residential Job Corps program offers important potential advantages but it is very expensive.
- Those that abandon the first educational system (conventional education) often reflect an intellectual dysfunction. A dropout with a grade 8 education who requests training a decade later has educational deficits that require massive investments to rectify. The common use of the General Educational Development (GED) test as a proxy for high school is a pale reflection of a true secondary education. Passing this test does not equip the students to complete technology programs in community colleges.²² This leads to the inevitable conclusion that a key strategy must be to maintain attendance to at least the high school completion level.
- Following the insights of Lowe and Krahn (1995) and Urquiola et al. (1997), connecting academic programs with occupational training is important for maintaining a student’s interest in school.

Education and training need to be much more tightly bound. Educators need to connect their programming to the labour market and occupation. At the same time, trainers need to adopt the competency-based approach used by educators. Those who contract for training need to ensure value-for-training as it is being delivered rather than rely on outcome measures after the fact.

2.7 Summary of education and training programs

Generally, evaluations in Canada are less numerous than in the United States, and many of the interventions are heterogeneous. This makes it difficult to compare different interventions and programs. Certainly, the initial evaluations of the Strategic Initiatives tend to be more positive than the assessments emerging from the U.S. programs.

²² Grubb (1995) argues that the multiple-choice GED test is not the same as a high school education that involves students writing essays, solving word-problems in math and performing chemistry experiments.

In a mid-term process review of the Strategic Initiatives (SIs), the evaluator found that rather than leading to weak performance, the use of community-based training in the form of partnerships is a strength. Further, the evaluation concluded that subcontracting training to community-based organizations and private trainers is a positive feature that allows the programs to be tailored to community needs. The Evaluation of the Employability Improvement Program (EIP) found that gains were greater under those obtained under the Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS). The latter relied on Consolidated Revenue Funds (CRF) monies that focused on the long-term unemployed, youth and women entering or re-entering the labour market. EIP clientele were older, more experienced and had more years of formal education than CJS clientele. Other reasons for the success were program design, client selection and matching client labour-market adjustment needs with appropriate interventions. Therefore, the fact that the U.S. experience with the JTPA has been negative should not lead to the conclusion that parallel Canadian programming is similarly flawed.

However, the consensus of most evaluators is that mainstream education and training programs have failed to offer the benefits many had hoped for. The most important finding is that the better the basic education possessed by a person, the more likely that training will allow him or her to move to economic independence. This leads directly to preventing dropping out of high school as the pre-eminent labour-market strategy for dealing with poverty. Longer-term programs that raise the basic academic qualification of those on income assistance have the greatest potential for addressing their needs.

3. Community Development as the basis for an employment and economic-development strategy

Many who seek to reverse economic disadvantage focus on community economic development. This includes creating physical infrastructure and pursuing policies to attract new business as well as fostering the growth of existing firms. Community economic development operates on the demand side, creating employment opportunities for those who are trained.

An important finding from the American literature on welfare-to-work policies is that they are ineffective during a recession. Also, training economically disadvantaged people requires a substantial investment to compensate for poor education and weak occupational skills. Alternatively, the economy needs to generate more menial, lower-paid jobs. The latter strategy is becoming less viable and, as U.S. research shows, leads to employment instability.

For Aboriginal communities, it makes even less sense to push economic- and labour-market-development programming without a parallel focus on job creation. Training workers to seek work that does not exist or participate in low-level employment risks perpetuating welfare use and joblessness. For Aboriginal communities, there is a significant risk that this approach will lead to out-migration, community dissolution and assimilation.

To begin this section of the document, let us review what is meant by the term “community.”

3.1 Defining a community

The concept of community is at once simple and complex. Community may be defined as “a network of social relations marked by mutuality and emotional bonds” (Bender, 1978).

Bender notes three elements that comprise the concept of a community:

- limited membership;
- restricted social space or network; and
- common values and sense of obligation to other members.

The core idea is intuitive. Communities consist of a delimited, although not necessarily spatial, group with members who have a strong sense of loyalty and obligation to the group.

Non-urban Aboriginal communities are often characterized along tribal and band grounds and usually identified within specific geographical areas. The term “reserve” is used to legally identify villages and other small settlements, but it usually bears only the most tenuous connection to the place where community members lived historically.

The term “Aboriginal community” also refers to Indians in general, or when used as the “Aboriginal community in Winnipeg” to all Aboriginals living within the city, regardless of their sense of obligation to each other. In this case, the community is often defined by how mainstream society excludes it.

Most of the literature on community development refers to smaller towns and settlements that have created enhanced economic welfare for their residents. This literature certainly applies to the rural reserves of Canada. It is much more difficult to apply this theory to urban dwelling Aboriginals, for whom economic development usually means a tight connection with the mainstream economy.

Although common usage allows for communities to be defined without a spatial or geographic area, this is not useful for Aboriginal communities. As we shall show, self-governance and control over resources are essential for successful community economic development. To achieve these goals necessitates a geographic delineation of the community.

In his review of the Department of Regional Economic Expansion (DREE), McGee (1992) uses a three-part classification to sort communities and their prospects:

- *Unconnected communities* are often oriented to a primary activity (mining, logging, trapping, and so on) that is resource-based or where a single, large public employer such as an airbase or regional hospital. These communities are vulnerable to global prices and decisions made by remote governments. Increased connectedness to other communities and global markets are important strategies for diversification.
- *Networks of communities* are collections of settlements that are able to exploit a common-location advantage or some other basis for economic cooperation. These communities are often close to a large city and operate within its “economic shadow.”
- Finally, *urban centres* account for the bulk of wealth generation in the modern economy. Little doubt exists that Canada’s large cities compete with each other and other cities in the world to attract and keep large employers.

Aboriginal communities fit into this framework with one important amendment:

- Isolated reserves and the Métis communities are scattered throughout Canada. Typically, these communities are connected to the resource-extraction industry, or they secure employment as part of a regional service centre.

- Networks of Aboriginal communities are often collected into Tribal councils or may form “collectives” to take advantage of opportunity. This approach is used in some Community Futures programs (Kitayan CF²³ has 10 Aboriginal communities).
- Urban Aboriginal (including Métis) communities are often comprised of many sub-groups that have varying allegiances to home reserves and/or local groups.
- As a fourth group, the Inuit have recently negotiated a large territory that offers a substantial basis for economic development.

While the concept of community need not have a spatial aspect, this is the most common way planners conceive it. It is likely that the urban reserves emerging in some Canadian cities will have geographic definition within the city. As we will also demonstrate, the precondition for effective governance within Aboriginal communities will usually require a spatial dimension to delimit authority.

Before dealing with community economic development, it is important to consider the broader question of economic development and how various theorists view the ability of governments to change the future. Specifically, is there a basis for being optimistic about the future of remote and desperately poor Aboriginal communities or the large numbers of Aboriginals in cities?

3.2 Relationship between regional and community development

In mainstream theory, there is a hierarchy in development programming from country to region to community. The conventional policy levers for national economic development consist of taxation, interest rates, government spending and international trade. Economists often view national economic growth as relatively immune from political, legal and cultural institutions.²⁴

At the regional level, political institutions are often acknowledged as more important, but much of the literature still focuses on purely economic factors in development. Physical infrastructure (roads, airports, waste water, and the like), tax policies and location incentives for business are often cited as essential to regional development.

²³ Kitayan Community Futures Development Corporation supports the economic development of 10 communities in Northeast Manitoba: Garden Hill First Nation; God’s Lake Narrows First Nation; God’s Narrows Community Council; God’s River First Nation; Island Lake Community Council; Oxford House First Nation; Red Sucker Lake First Nation; Shamattawa First Nation; St. Theresa Point First Nation; and Wasagamack First Nation.

²⁴ The recent collapse of the Asian currencies and the consequent recession has been largely attributed to political mismanagement and weak financial institutions. The painful conversion of the Soviet Union to a market economy also demonstrates how limited conventional economic theory can be. The work of D.C. North, a recent recipient of the Nobel prize in economics, has re-established the critical importance of institutions in economic development.

At the community or local level, leadership and political institutions have a large role in determining economic development. This role has been increasing as planners grapple with previous policy failures in generating increased economic welfare.

An enduring feature of development literature is the need to resolve regional economic disparity. This awareness is certainly the basis for Canadian efforts to redress regional imbalances. Two polar views exist on regional and community development. As we show, neither approach allows for proactive interventions to deal with economic disparities and neither leads to constructive policies for Aboriginal leaders.

Perspective 1 — correction of regional disparity belongs to the market.

A cogent expression of this perspective is found in the writings of Tom Courchene, who notes: “The failure over time to submit the provinces and regions to the discipline of the market has exacerbated regional disparities and tended to rigidify our industrial structure” (Courchene, 1981, p. 506).

Courchene is right to stress that ignoring the economic realities of producing any good or service is sure to court failure. Control over some resources, unique products and services, sensible taxation and spending are all important ingredients for regional growth. Government policy cannot spread economic welfare evenly across the country like jam on bread.

Melvin (1987) is not quite as accepting about the inevitability of regional economic differences as Courchene but still believes that little can be done to alleviate these disparities. He notes: “[Regional] Differences which have a structural genesis are typically solved either through letting the market work, which generally implies labour mobility or [accepting that]... for political reasons a region will require continuous subsidization” (p. 315).

Under this view, the only rational community and regional development policy for poor areas is to let the market operate and allow the settlement to withdraw to other richer areas. According to this perspective, poor Aboriginal communities should be abandoned — a view that most find unacceptable. This perspective also gives insufficient weight to the political, legal and financial institutions needed to promote economic activity. Many flourishing communities have overcome few resources and infrastructure deficits.

This view also reminds us that some minimal conditions make it easier to foster economic development. While a group of 200 people might be able to create a viable economy in the middle of Baffin Island, this is more likely to happen if the group settles on prime farmland within a half hour of the Trans Canada Highway. Location and resources are useful community assets.

Perspective 2 — regional and community disparity is the result of exploitation of the periphery by the centre.

According to this very Canadian view, regional disparity results from the exploitation of the peripheral areas by the central cities. Everything is politics and remedies require political solutions. As Matthews (1981) notes: “[economic] dependency is caused by the systematic draining of capital and resources out of a region by other regions” (p. 280).

Proponents of this perspective advocate aggressive redistribution of economic power and the creation of barriers to the transfer of wealth out of the community. At the root of this disparity is the process of exploitation, which will change only with political revolution to reverse the economic disparity.

This view identifies the critical role of political institutions in the development process. However, it downplays the economic reality that location, transport costs and other forces create centres of economic activity. These forces are surely changing in a global information economy, but strong centres emerge because economies of scale are intensified in the Internet world.²⁵

Neither view offers much insight for Aboriginal development. Fortunately, between these views exist a range of perspectives that admit many forms of response to regional and community underdevelopment. In the last 20 years, the concepts of community development have become more elaborate, with labour-market and human-resource planning integrated within a range of business and institutional policies.

Canada has focused on regional disparity to a much greater extent than the United States. This focus on regional balance began with confederation and the use of national economic policy, the most important element of which was the construction of the national railway. With the creation of the Department of Regional Economic Expansion in 1969, the federal government dramatically increased its attention to correcting regional disparity and regional development policy.

Another important difference exists between regional development policy in the United States and Canada. Regional disparities in the United States do not provoke a national response to move resources to the afflicted areas. Instead, those who are unemployed are encouraged to move. In Canada, the “stay-option” embedded in national and provincial policies suggests that government has an obligation to create regional policy to allow people to live where they choose.

²⁵ Some argue that the information age allows remote communities and small firms to compete on a level playing field with large companies and global cities. It is more likely that the large lead possessed by Microsoft, IBM and other information-age giants will grow. To feed these giants requires large supplies of highly trained workers who are attracted by high pay and lifestyle amenities. Certainly, remote communities can become “connected,” but this is only a necessary and not a sufficient condition for competing with the information giants.

3.3 Recent advances in community-development techniques

The community development literature has recently identified key factors that appear to be conditions for growth. What has impelled these developments is the observation that many smaller communities have grown without being endowed with natural resources, favorable location or investment by a single large employer.

3.3.1 Models of community development

Most communities of any size have some form of long-term development. Most cities of any size also usually have a portion of a staff person's time devoted to economic and business development. For the most part, local economic-development strategies consist of using tax incentives and other inducements to attract external firms. Other strategies have started to evolve and broaden the community developer's portfolio.

Isserman (1994) identifies three broad economic-development processes applied to communities. Within each general orientation, the community uses specific techniques to promote growth.

1. The "pursuit" model views economic development in terms of promoting the community to attract business activity (boosterism). Many politicians routinely participate in trade missions to promote their country, province and city.
2. The "attract" model uses various inducements to attract business. The theory goes like this: If we subsidize business and adjust taxes to increase the profits, then new firms will relocate and existing firms will expand, the result of which will be increased employment. Most provinces, states, cities and towns are engaged in some form of economic inducement to attract business to locate plants and bring jobs.
3. The "reinventing government" model is not often seen but is being used in some centres to create new styles of government. Strategic partnerships and new forms of governance are being used to simulate growth. Examples include the use of performance measures to create "excellence" in government. As we shall show, some Aboriginal communities have stressed excellence in financial management to dispel previous poor images and create opportunities for increased business financing.

TABLE 2
Orientations for Economic Development

Orientation	Activity	Comment
<p><i>Chasing/Acquisition:</i> Community reaches out to attract development and employers to relocate. This is the conventional approach to local economic development.</p>	Marketing	Brochures, videos and other sales promotions.
	Prospecting	Contact with potential relocators.
	Financial Incentives	Tax relief, grants, utility-rate reduction.
	Enterprise Zones	Tax and other cost relief for specific geographic areas.
	Business Climate	Municipality adjusts quality of life measures to increase its score on standardized indexes.
	Target Proposals	Large public-sector projects (e.g., federal departments, airports, processing centres), tourism, retirees, etc.
<p><i>Self-improvement:</i> Policies that make a community more attractive and competitive.</p>	Education/Training	Public, vocational and university training to raise qualifications of the workforce.
	Technology	Government supported research and development (often aligned with university).
	Technology Transfer	Programs to encourage companies to adopt and adapt new technology.
	Venture Capital	Investment programs (e.g., pooling union funds, UI funds etc.).
	Infrastructure	Physical upgrading, especially in transportation, water, sewer, etc.
	Community Institutions	Special project to channel funding locally and raise capacity in sector public-management.
<p><i>Knowledge and Information:</i> Technology applies recent advances in management theory to local and community development.</p>	Competitive Clusters	Growth aligned to exploit geographic coincidence of resources and facilities.
	Flexible Networks	Networks of manufacturers created to exploit economies of scale.
	Performance Measures	Recently, communities have developed benchmarking to raise the level of public service and communicate “professionalism”.
	Reinventing Government	Emergent programs to create innovative processes to stimulate development — stresses partnerships.
<p>Source: Adapted from Isserman (1994)</p>		

Teitz (1994) notes that more communities appear to be shifting to the second tier of development strategy. He notes that rather than “an emphasis on attracting outside investment in manufacturing, the new theory concentrates on enhancing a local community’s ability to create and retain employment from within” (p. 101). However, he also notes that this approach has yet to be proved, even though many economic-development planners embrace the idea. According to Teitz, the old “attract” and “pursuit” programs remain in place largely because the appeal of bringing in the big plant is so high for local politicians. It requires a sustained process to secure increased growth among local firms and to spawn viable start-up ventures that have a future.

The third tier of policy identified by Isserman reflects the increasingly widespread adoption among city governments of a corporate planning model that might be termed the “Harvard Business School” approach. This increased use of corporate planning techniques stands in contrast to the “planning-as-if-people-mattered movement.” At its most simplistic level, this literature calls for more empowerment and participatory approaches. However, more sophisticated practitioners combine community empowerment with the more corporate “reinventing government” approach cited by Isserman. As we shall see, some Aboriginal communities have applied these approaches to their own development.

3.3.2 Public-sector employment as a regional economic-development strategy

In the post-World War II era, the role of the public sector in managing the business cycle became well accepted throughout academic and government circles. Even though the 1980s saw a major and largely successful challenge to the continued expansion of government, some advocated the dispersion of government services to help regional economies. In Canada, we have seen the relocation of taxation centres and even entire departments to provinces.

Trainor (1993) argues that certain “mobile” public-sector activities can and should be dispersed to help weaker regions. (Mobile refers to activities such as pension-cheque preparation, income-tax-return verification, and so on.) These are largely self-contained operations, and few have direct contact with the public. They can also be supported by a network of communication.

In effect, a community that attracts a large government facility is no different in pursuing that policy than when it seeks to attract a large plant. In a resource-rich community, the attraction is for developing the mineral or some other resource. When communities have a large supply of underemployed and unemployed workers, the “resources” being extracted are the labour.

Where government is the employer, longer-term stability may be expected. However, care is needed. Technology may change the basis for defining a mobile activity. For example, a large centre that processes paper-based cheques would be vulnerable to technological change that allowed all payments to be processed electronically. The large regional taxation centres in Canada now employ less than one third of their previous peak labour

force as a result of electronic filing. Government now has the difficult task of closing a plant and provoking sharp regional decline.

For the same reason, a large private employer should be viewed as a mixed blessing; so too should a large public-sector employer be viewed with some caution. While the increased wealth arising from well-paid workers should be welcomed, the community would be wise to maintain its economic development program.

3.3.3 Business policies that create employment

Business enhancement is a direct method for promoting growth in the labour market and expanding employment opportunities. Business expansion also induces other business growth through suppliers and service provision (transportation, Internet, storage, accountancy, legal, and so on). The following are examples of policies that provide valuable community-development programs.

- Policies that strengthen the business directly, either by offering help with the employment process, increasing management skills or supporting investment in capital. Canada Business Service Centres (CBSCs) are good examples of this information-based advice. The Federal Business Development Bank (FBDB) also offers consulting and financial assistance in the form of low-interest loans. Finally, the Community Futures program offers a broad range of support to small business within a specific community (see Section 3.4.2 below).
- Programs that combine business support with a clear employment development spin-off.
 - The Canada Student Connection Program (SCP) trains students in their second or third year of university or college to help small and medium enterprises (SMEs) get on-line. Students are typically hired by the business for up to three days and receive basic training in Internet and e-mail techniques.
 - The International Trade Personnel Program (ITPP) of Western Diversification offers financial assistance to businesses wishing to develop an international marketing program. Support (\$37,500) is offered for up to three years to hire an unemployed or underemployed recent graduate to execute the plan.

These are excellent examples of a policy designed to simultaneously benefit business and train students for a business career. Both programs are well received by business and students and graduates. Participating firms report that the subsidy has materially advanced their marketing plans.²⁶

²⁶ This information is based on interim evaluations in process by Prairie Research Associates (PRA).

3.3.4 Entrepreneurship and community economic development

Entrepreneurship emerges in the community economic development literature in two ways:

- First, entrepreneurship is often advocated as a basis for business creation and community development.
- Second, usage of the term “entrepreneurial community” is applied to communities exhibiting the traits of risk-taking, imagination and self-reliance that are the hallmarks of the entrepreneur.

Entrepreneurship is advocated as a viable option for people displaced from work or the economically disadvantaged. Many programs now include entrepreneurship training. Little doubt exists that new businesses are important sources of community economic development. Much of the service offered by the CBSCs and the FBDB is targeted to prospective businesses. Also, and this is very important, many private-sector supports exist to help the new business get started.²⁷ These services are essential to ensuring that those who wish to start a business are able to find the resources to increase their chances of success.

A key distinction must be made between self-employment and entrepreneurship. Learning a trade such as plumbing or hairstyling and then offering one’s services out of the home is not entrepreneurship that leads to economic growth. Once that self-employed person makes an investment sufficient to hire workers and additional equipment beyond personal tools of the trade, then an entrepreneur has been born. The essence of the outcome from entrepreneurial activity is that a “multiplier” effect occurs in terms of employment and wealth-generation.

The salient features of entrepreneurs are that they can identify a business opportunity, mobilize personal and other resources, and then create a business plan. More fundamentally, the question is: Can entrepreneurship be taught or does it emerge as a personality and intellectual trait?

Jackson and Rodkey (1994) examine this theme by asking how children acquire the desire to become entrepreneurs. They found that parental support is a key factor in creating entrepreneurial desire, and that this encouragement tends to be stronger for boys than girls. Interestingly, they find that teachers and schools do not promote entrepreneurial behaviour and tend to favour academic and professional careers.

²⁷ Many consultants offer business planning. Increasingly, banks and financial institutions such as credit unions are advertising that they are business-friendly. Many of the complaints that prospective business owners have about banks are really due to their own inability to develop a business plan that will persuade investors to make a commitment.

Jackson and Rodkey show that parents and the school system have important influences on how children and young adults acquire the attitudes needed to start a business. This is the starting point of a business start-up. Certainly, constraints such as lack of capital and information are barriers to the creation of a new business, but without the initial desire to assume the risk and create the new venture, the start-up will never occur.

Lenzi (1996) has advanced the concept of community economic development by identifying the confluence of factors responsible for a local economy to grow. In the “Entrepreneurial Community Approach,” he identifies the following as the basis for this type of development:

- A “comprehensive focus,” which means coordinating financial resources, improving business efficiency and effectiveness, attracting new business, creating new business, and attracting support from other levels of government.

Peterson (1990) captures this thought in his “total development paradigm,” which is “based on the premise that everything is connected in the community — economic base, physical infrastructure, and leadership infrastructure” (Peterson, 1990). As we will show in Section 3.5, this perspective resonates with the case studies in Aboriginal development.

- “Partnership between public and private entities” is often stressed in the “Entrepreneurial Community Approach.” Lenzi cites the need to have broad participation in planning and policy development as well as joint public-private financing of projects. Communities that are able to lever private financing for commercial services by using public funding for basic infrastructure (roads and sewers) illustrate this principle in action.
- Although a broad base is needed, community development requires “targeted projects,” according to Lenzi, and must produce increased wages or wealth. These targeted projects are obtained through the chasing and acquisition activities identified by Isserman and by concentrating on projects that “fit” with the community’s assets and are the most likely to succeed.

Lenzi argues that targeting means only specific industries are actually pursued — those that are aligned with community values and objectives. He criticizes many local development programs for using a “shot-gun” approach to attract any business that promises jobs, no matter how incongruent that business might be with long-term plans.²⁸

- Using an “entrepreneurial attitude” at the community level means financing, creativity in defining opportunities and decisiveness in execution. As an example, he uses Rock Hill, South Carolina, which promotes its spring flowers as a draw for over

²⁸ An example would be a community that has decided to maximize its quality of life to attract science and high-technology activities, which then allows an operation with significant pollution side-effects to locate there without controlling these effects.

300,000 visitors annually. Closer to home, Buffalo Point, an Aboriginal community in Manitoba, has created a cottage resort, while the Tsawwassen band in B.C. has created condominium developments adjacent to the Victoria-Vancouver ferry terminal.

- Finally, Lenzi borrows from the reinventing government literature and argues that the entrepreneurial community measures results: “What gets measured gets done. The simple act of defining measures is extremely enlightening to many organizations. Typically, public agencies are not entirely clear about their goals or in fact are aiming at the wrong goals.... Entrepreneurial organizations are learning organizations. Without feedback on outcomes, innovation is impossible” (Osborne and Gabler, 1992).

In conclusion, Lenzi writes that “the Entrepreneurial Community approach calls for a comprehensive outlook followed by focused action leading to measurable results.” This is exactly what successful Aboriginal communities have done.

Other commentators have also elaborated on the entrepreneurial communities concept. Deller (1993) acknowledges that “certain levels of physical infrastructure are necessary for economic development and growth but its presence is not sufficient for it to occur” (p. 3).

Rather, he isolates quality of community leadership as the most important factor in development. He notes that stagnant communities are often marked by residents that fail to adopt a collective-leadership model, preferring instead to allow a council or small coterie to act as community leader. Growing communities seem to have a broad base of diversified leadership with many residents leading specific aspects of the community’s welfare. “Involvement in the development process, and indeed all community activities,” he says, “must be as widespread across the community as possible” (p. 7).

Deller also identifies the nature of business leadership (i.e., entrepreneurship) as consisting of factors such as independence, self-confidence, optimism, innovation and self-starting. He notes that: “where it is through entrepreneurship that an economy adjusts to change, it is through leadership that a community can adjust to change.”

He identifies three attributes of entrepreneurial social structure that are essential to effective community development:

- *Diversity* — the community can depersonalize politics, and personal disagreements are set aside for the common good. Small community politics are often incestuous, which can be detrimental to entrepreneurship.
- *Resource mobilization* — the community is willing to make the sacrifices needed to invest. Imposing taxes on themselves and mobilizing individual savings are examples of the focused discipline needed to counteract the fiscal restraint of the recent past. More important is that funds raised within the community are likely to be spent with more due diligence than grants awarded by government.

- *Network capacity* — creation of commercial, financial and intelligence networks that allow the community to process the information to make strategic decisions. This means knowing when to contract with external consultants and when to develop the talent within the community.

The importance of community leadership is apparent in most studies of regional economic development. McKee et al. (1997) identified three main variables in successful community economic development:

- *Economic development leadership* — the most important factor, refers to the realistic appraisal of opportunity, awareness of the competition (other communities), use of information, openness to external expertise and self-reliance. Local leadership is the key ingredient to successful community economic development.
- *Community spirit* — encompasses concepts such as community pride, focus on quality, readiness to invest, participatory decision-making and cooperation. These attributes capture the willingness of the community to unite around a common goal.
- *Focus on growth industries* — reflects the ability of the community's leaders to identify business activities that have growth potential. This leads to the creation of unique activity that allows a community to develop products without competing in existing markets.²⁹

The mainstream community economic-development literature has clearly identified leadership as a critical element. Certainly, location and natural resources help, but the only necessary precondition for local economic development is community leadership.

In the next section, we review federal regional development policies as a context for the Community Futures program and the Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS). From there, we proceed to a detailed review of Aboriginal development in Canada and the United States that confirms these lessons as fundamental.

3.3.5 Networks and community economic development

Formal labour markets present two main paths for job seekers: job postings in print and, more recently, on the Internet, and firms that specialize in placement. Government policy has identified efficiency in the formal labour market as one method to enhance employability.

Less well recognized, at least from a policy perspective, are the informal networks through which many secure employment. Harrison and Weiss (1998) have identified the “intersecting social and business networks” that are responsible for much of the hiring in any economy. We all are aware that “it’s not what you know, but who you know” that often results in finding work.

²⁹ A basic truism of business is that the first business can dominate all others. To copy activities rarely results in the same level of income as to develop a unique product. Being the third, fifth or tenth community to offer fly-in fishing means competing against the other communities that got there first.

These authors note that the analysis of informal networks is very much undeveloped. They make the following points:

- Job seekers from impoverished communities who have low skills have weak contacts with prospective employers because their social networks do not “intersect” with business.
- Having strong ties to these networks is important for two reasons:
 - A wide range of acquaintances is an asset for the job seeker. Job-seeking success depends on knowing many potential employers. Youth in poor areas or smaller communities have few strong ties, none of which are connected to a potential job.
 - A second key feature of networks is referrals from existing employees. Job seekers with many friends and acquaintances who are working are likely to be able to find potential job openings.

From this perspective, drawing employers closer to the training process is critical to increasing success for job seekers. Using case studies from several small communities and development programs in urban neighborhoods, Harrison and Weiss conclude: “Our strongest finding is the central importance to a community based organization of becoming an ongoing, trusted part of the recruiting and training networks of a region’s employer” (p. 150).

3.4 A review of federal policy for regional and community development in Canada

There are important lessons to be learned for Aboriginal economic development by examining Canada’s record of regional economic development. Of particular importance is the role of federal-provincial and interdepartmental agreements, which offer insights for the use of Regional Bilateral Agreements. The following section provides a general overview of regional and community development at the federal level over the last two decades. Compared to the education and training interventions reviewed earlier, fewer evaluations are available on the effectiveness of these initiatives.³⁰

3.4.1 Department of Regional Economic Expansion (DREE)

A three-decade consensus has existed at the federal level on the objectives of regional development. Disparities in economic welfare and social services are widely seen as inimical to nation-building. Removing disparities can be accomplished partially through transfers from the federal government to provinces that have personal per capita incomes below some norm. Another policy that has been pursued by the federal government is regional development programming.

³⁰ Bartik (1994) notes that “better evaluation is essential if economic development is to play a major role in the economy.” He also argues that evaluation that compares the effectiveness of various regional and community-development techniques should be as common as the studies of the effectiveness of education and training. Better evaluation is needed for economic-development programs to thrive. (*Economic Development Quarterly*, vol. 8: 99-106).

The Constitution states the federal government has a national objective of furthering economic development to reduce disparity.³¹ Before this, the federal government created the Department of Regional Economic Expansion in 1969 and sharply focused its approach to dealing with regions. Specifically, one department took the lead for all federal programming.

DREE created several important features in regional development programming:

- As a “horizontal”³² department, DREE cut across the federal government. It could clarify regional planning by acting alone or by defining initiatives in cooperation with other departments.
- McGee (1992) ascribes three operational modes to DREE:
 - First, it developed completely unique programs to meet specific regional needs.
 - Second, it partnered with other departments.
 - Third, it created federal-provincial agreements that may be seen as precursors to all other development agreements, including the current bilateral agreements between Human Resources Development Canada and Aboriginal organizations.

McGee also argues that the approach used by DREE in the federal-provincial agreements proved successful since most subsequent regional development programs have replicated it.³³ As well as using the federal-provincial agreement approach, DREE also focused on specific investments to encourage regional economic growth, including:

- infrastructure, especially transportation (airports, marine services, and so on);
- natural resources including energy;
- tourism;
- industrial and business development including technology;
- urban development;
- education and skills development including management skills for small firms; and
- community development.

Of particular interest is the community-development programming articulated through several DREE initiatives. For example, in 1972-73 the department focused research on local community development, entrepreneurship and telecommunications and computer

³¹ Disparity in a regional and community context refers to differences in income, employment/unemployment, health, education and social resources. Economic measures of welfare must be balanced with non-economic measures such as a country as opposed to an urban lifestyle. The essence of the concept is economic independence and self-sufficiency. The core notion is that Canadians everywhere should have the opportunity to attain economic independence.

³² The Standing Committee on National Finance used the term “horizontal” in 1982 to describe the uniqueness of DREE.

³³ The most recent example was the infrastructure agreements.

equipment. As a result, community-development and regional planners understood that single-industry towns dependent on extracting resources such as minerals or forest products were both increasingly non-viable and undesirable. From their perspective, true regional development was not compatible with the instability inherent in natural-resource extraction.³⁴

DREE's analysis focused on the need to create local infrastructure in its broadest sense. More than roads and sewers, infrastructure included the local business and community decision-making to "create the many small-scale, linked activities" so needed in building a viable and stable local economy.³⁵ This is a critical perspective. Although it is true that investment in physical structures is beneficial, creating the institutions to support development has proved to be more important.

In 1982, the federal government reversed its policy and disbanded DREE, arguing that regional development had to become the interest of all departments. Analysts have advanced many reasons for the demise of DREE. None are relevant to the discussion here. It is only necessary to say that the focus on regional and community development supported by having a single federal department has not been replicated.

With the cessation of DREE, initiatives to promote regional development shifted to specific departments. Community Futures, one of the more significant community-development programs of the federal government, started in Employment and Immigration Canada (EIC) and was then transferred to the regional development agencies.

McGee (1993) states that key insights have flowed from DREE's experience in regional development. They include the following:

- Local leadership is essential in the form of business and community leaders as well as industry associations willing to take the lead in promoting growth.
- The degree of delegated authority must be proportional to the capacity of the community. Community structures must be capable of managing the programming offered by senior levels of government.
- Momentum exists in regional development — in other words, success breeds success. Similarly, stagnation creates inertia that is difficult to overcome.
- Communities with few resources or location advantages have not done well.

³⁴ This perspective is found throughout the regional- and community-development literature. Planners understand that the price instability of resources creates an uncertain future for communities based on this sector. Indeed, the recent history of Canadian industrial development have been its diversification away from resource extraction to industry and, more recently, high-tech services such as telecommunications. The application of the Heritage Fund to diversify the Alberta economy is an example at the provincial level.

³⁵ This apt phrase is from McGee (1992) p. 106.

McGee also argues that federal departments in the post-DREE era must develop an enhanced capacity to cooperate. He notes that all too often, “the objective of executing sensible development initiatives is overshadowed by the objective of spending public monies.”

At this point, it is unclear whether the three regional development agencies offer the same leverage for regional and community development as did DREE. It is premature to express an opinion about the effectiveness of Western Economic Diversification Canada (WD) in the west, FORD-Q in Quebec and the Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency (ACOA) in promoting community development. For example, WD no longer makes direct loans to business. It now administers a number of small grants programs to businesses, some 88 Community Futures Programs, four Women’s Enterprise Centres and four Canada Business Service Centres. The net impact of these activities on the development of the West and its communities has yet to be evaluated.

3.4.2 Community Futures and community development

Community Futures started as one of several local development initiatives in EIC during the early eighties. A Community Futures Corporation (CFC) is an independent, non-profit board of local representatives. It concentrates on helping communities develop and implement long-term community strategic plans leading to the development and diversification of the local economy. It also supports business counseling services and investment in small businesses in selected communities. Originally, the program focused on helping communities overcome job loss through displacement or relocation of a public facility. Its mandate has evolved considerably since then. Now CFCs help local business diversify, thereby stabilizing the employment base for the community. A key element of the support it offers is loans administered by a local board. It also offers advice and facilitates access to other programs.

Early in the program, a key challenge for the CFCs was coordinating their activities with provincial and municipal development organizations, all of which were intent on securing employment and business growth within the community. Provinces that had a highly regionalized system for delivering business (such as Saskatchewan) found they had an abundance of policy infrastructure when they included all federal, provincial and municipal programs.

The Community Futures initiative has continued to flourish and has shown remarkable resilience. It can be used by a single isolated community or a neighborhood in a city. It can also be used to help a cluster of communities and is open to Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal communities alike.

An evaluation completed in 1989-90 found that it was too early to attribute any tangible economic benefits to the program. Aside from the expected benefits being long term and difficult to measure, the 1989-91 recession overrode any measurable benefits that may have accrued.

Other evaluation findings were that the program failed to distinguish between economic-development and adjustment-assistance measures. The CF communities also showed weaknesses at long-term strategic planning due to insufficient guidance. In addition, the study found that both the Purchase of Training and Relocation/Exploratory Assistance Options had failed Aboriginals. Information on the length of the clientele's employment was unavailable at the time of the evaluation. The federal government has not evaluated the contribution of the Community Futures Program since 1989-90 and little is known about its net impact or value-for-money.

3.4.3 Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS)

CAEDS started in 1989 as a joint responsibility of the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development (DIAND), Employment and Immigration (EI)³⁶ and Industry Science and Technology (IST). Its purpose was "to address economic disparities between Aboriginal peoples and other Canadians."³⁷ Other departments had a role in the strategy but had no direct accountability: DIAND took the lead for community economic and resource development; EIC focused on skills development; and IST concentrated on business development. Outcomes expected from CAEDS programs included increased employment for Aboriginal people, a wider business base, enhanced entrepreneurial skills, decreased dependency on social welfare, and increased capacity for Aboriginal communities to manage their own affairs.

DIAND focused on community economic development

- DIAND used the Community Economic Development Program as its centrepiece and focused its activities on:
 - developing community economic strategies;
 - initiating business and resource developments;
 - financial participation (equity) in private and community firms; and
 - supporting job training.
- Other strands of DIAND's CAEDS strategy consisted of a Commercial Development Program, a Resources Access Negotiations Program and a Regional Opportunities Program.³⁸
- It also jointly shared responsibility for research and advocacy with EIC and IST.

³⁶ EIC and, later, Human Resources Development Canada never signed the agreement and operated its component, Pathways for Success, more or less independently of CAEDS.

³⁷ *Report of the Auditor General of Canada, 1995, p. 281.*

³⁸ The Regional Opportunities Program was cut midway through the five-year strategy, after which DIAND focused mainly on community economic development organizations (CAEDS).

*EIC focused on skills development*³⁹

- The key program for EIC is called “Pathways to Success” or just “Pathways.”
- This program operates as a partnership between EIC and Aboriginal groups. It allows communities to have a significant role in decision-making through the creation of local Aboriginal management boards. These boards (some 86 of 110 planned were created) operated in conjunction with Canada Employment Centres to identify, design and deliver training.

IST focused on business development

- The Aboriginal Business Development and Joint Venture Program offered financial and developmental assistance to create new businesses and expand existing operations. Using external delivery organizations, the department hoped to extend its limited capacity for program delivery to Aboriginal organizations.
- Aboriginal Capital Corporations receive funding for loans to Aboriginal businesses.

Evaluations of CAEDS noted a range of structural improvements such as increased involvement by Aboriginal organizations and increases in their capacity to deliver programs. However, data deficiencies precluded measuring impacts on employability, actual employment impacts or social-welfare dependency.

³⁹ EIC and, later, Human Resources Development Canada never signed the joint CAEDS agreement, and the department prefers to view Pathways separately from CAEDS. The Auditor-General treats the three components as comprising CAEDS.

TABLE 3
Summary of Lessons Learned from CAEDS

DIAND Component	EIC Component (Pathways)	IST Component
Interdepartmental coordination well remains weak, reducing the effectiveness of the overall strategy.	The program increased awareness of issues and the amount of training related to Aboriginal peoples.	Clients rated program delivery but wanted speedier decision making and more industry data.
Variation exists in the effectiveness of Community Economic Development Organizations.	The program is an improvement in the training available.	Lending to larger band-owned corporations may not have been as effective as concentrating on businesses owned individually.
Band leadership, especially its business orientation, training and leaders, is the key to success.	Participation by Aboriginals increased.	Program support has resulted in Aboriginal businesses accessing other conventional sources of financing.
Quantified impacts are lacking. No information is available on expected program impacts such as increases in employment and income, increased diversification of business and economic base, and lessening of social problems associated with welfare dependency. Data produced by the program precluded any measurement of impacts.	Measuring the impact of job-holding is difficult because of the 1991 recession. Typically the recession resulted reduced training impact (percentage of a training group that is either employed on in further training). ⁴⁰	Direct financial assistance to Aboriginal business has resulted in the creation of jobs, increased community wealth and reduced dependency on social welfare.
Overall, participating communities have increased their capacity to initiate and manage economic development.		The program helped create an entrepreneurial class.
		External delivery organizations proved to be effective.

⁴⁰ The 1994 evaluation suggests that Aboriginal impact rates were better than non-Aboriginal rates through the 1988-92 period, but this may be a misreading of the data. The impact rates for non-Aboriginals actually fell less than those of Aboriginals. In any event, given the unreliability of the data and the fact that impact rates measure such a short-term effect, the only thing that can be concluded about the Pathways program is that its net employment results remain to be proved.

Programs that attempted to work on the “supply side” by increasing the training and skills of Aboriginals had little measurable impact on the economic welfare of such communities or persons. In large measure, this may have been the result of the 1990-91 recession that increased unemployment generally.

On the other hand, direct lending through the Aboriginal Capital Corporations appears to have had an impact on employment. Most important for the longer term, is that these programs appear to have supported the creation of an entrepreneurial class within Aboriginal communities. It is essential to stress that the data quality remains poor, and many of the outcomes are not strongly quantified.

One result from CAEDS is that the Industry Canada component appears to have been relatively more successful than the other initiatives. The focus on business development and the financing of new ventures seems to have had important benefits for selected Aboriginal communities. However, this apparent success may be the result of a few communities effectively using the business-development programming. The objectives for the DIAND and HRDC components of CAEDS are longer-term, more diffuse, and do not show relatively quick returns.

3.4.4 Regional Bilateral Agreements

The Pathways for Success program increased the role of Aboriginal leaders, organizations and communities in decision-making related to design and management of their own training and employment-development programs. Increasing the capacity of Aboriginal communities and organizations to design and deliver their own programs (part of what is termed “capacity-building”) is intended to make these initiatives more relevant, responsive and ultimately more effective.

With the expiry of Pathways, HRDC initiated regional bilateral agreements (RBAs) with individual First Nations, Inuit and Métis communities. Included in these agreements are Aboriginal Flexible Funding Arrangements (AFFA) designed to enhance the ability to allocate financial resources in response to need.

The RBAs are based on four principles:

1. building the capacity of Aboriginal (including Métis and Inuit) organizations to design and deliver training programs;
2. increasing access to training programs through increased outreach;
3. devolving federal responsibilities for training (similar to mainstream programs devolving to provinces); and
4. reducing use of income assistance by improving the targeting of training to job availability.

Several interim evaluations have been completed. An evaluation of impact in a conventional sense, such as whether these agreements are materially changing conditions within signatory communities, is premature. Several of the interim reviews do call for increased attention to measuring the impacts of the spending in terms of training and employment effects.

Overall, the RBAs are well received by the communities and the clients served. Much of the training is purchased from training suppliers, but none of the evaluations have examined the quality of this training. In some cases, clients attend accredited post-secondary and vocation schools. In other cases, they attend courses offered by private contractors.⁴¹ Although mid-term evaluations of the RBA reveal that clients are satisfied with training initiatives, few details are available on the effectiveness of these training contracts or performance measures — an important issue in light of the most recent findings from the U.S. experiences.

Most of the evaluations of the RBAs focus on the development of capacity. At this point, these agreements appear to be performing as intended. Most participants report that various Aboriginal signatories and affiliated organizations are improving their abilities to design and deliver training programs.

The RBAs have two very noteworthy features:

- First, no mechanism exists to maintain the business-development aspect of CAEDS delivered by Industry Canada. These agreements are not focusing on entrepreneurial and business development.
- Second, capacity-building is limited to the design and delivery of training programs. While these are important, a wider skill set is needed for community economic development (as is shown in the case studies below).

3.4.5 Summary of regional development programming

Several key insights emerge from the regional development experience in Canada:

- To produce economic activity within a current level of technology and consumer demand requires a minimum level of resources, access to markets, and physical infrastructure.
- Community and entrepreneurial leadership is vital to creating local economic activity. Such leadership can overcome many deficits in resources and infrastructure.

⁴¹ In the case of the RBA with First Nations of Saskatchewan, the Saskatchewan Indian Institute of Technology has a partnership with the Saskatchewan Institute of Applied Science and Technology.

- Direct lending to businesses can be an important supplement to existing financing and often leads to recipients expanding their financing. Also, support for individual entrepreneurs appears to be more effective than supporting band-owned companies. We will explore reasons for this later in this section.
- Recent developments such as the Regional Bilateral Agreements appear to be creating additional capacity, albeit in the specific area of managing training.

3.5 Selected examples of Aboriginal economic development

In this section, we present several cases of successful Aboriginal community development from the United States and Canada. Viewed together, they highlight several core lessons on what is needed to support community economic development.

3.5.1 Examples from the United States

The following illustrations of Aboriginal⁴² economic development in the United States demonstrate the importance of community leadership in this context.

The Navajo — Disenfranchisement, recovery and stagnation

It is a mystery that the Navajo, recipients of significant public spending and richly endowed with natural resources, should have experienced dismal economic welfare throughout the twentieth century. After surrendering in 1864, the Navajo entered an unsettled period of confinement in a tiny reserve, where they were engaged in frequent conflict with the federal government. In 1868, they signed a treaty with the U.S. government and, in exchange for relinquishing a lifestyle of raiding, received substantial acreage and livestock.

They lived and prospered until the 1920s, when their expanding population (people and livestock) created pressure on their resources. Between 1934 and 1940, the federal government implemented a livestock-reduction program to cope with overgrazing. This produced severe economic dislocation and, in turn, a deep suspicion of all public support programs. Ruffing (1978) states that:

The fault can be laid to federal planners who failed to see that sheep were a way of life for the Navajos. Reduction of sheep meant abandoning old ways and values; it meant a cultural transformation as well as an economic one. Because the federal government did not offer viable economic activities, one could hardly expect the Navajo to scuttle both the traditional economy and their culture (p. 17).

⁴² The United States literature refers to “Indian” as opposed to Aboriginal.

Ruffing points to a series of barriers to economic development faced by the Navajo:

- They lacked control over resources. At the time of this research (20 years ago) the Bureau of Indian Affairs was reported to favour leasing Indian resources (land, mineral rights and so on) to non-Indians. It apparently believed that the Navajo “lack[ed] the skill and capital to properly develop their resources” (p. 31). Ruffing also argues that these leases were typically poorly drafted, resulting in lowered returns to the Navajo.
- Lack of capital prevented the Navajo from creating viable businesses to exploit their resources.
- Lack of managerial skills led to an inability to professionally manage tribal resources.
- Lack of commercial infrastructure in the form of retail and business services created leakages away from the community.
- Conflict existed between the modern Navajo bureaucracy and traditional philosophies. Ruffing offers several examples where conflict within the decision-making councils seriously compromised development. In particular, conflict had arisen between Indian entrepreneurs wishing to pursue standard capitalist-oriented businesses and the council who were interested in supporting more cooperative ventures. These conflicts were eventually resolved by recasting the issue in terms of traditional Navajo values in which the royalties from developing Indian-owned resources were shared among all community members.

Ruffing argues that economic development was limited by the Navajos’ lack of ownership over their own resources. The conflict to be resolved was that while most Navajo probably preferred a traditional social structure, they could not maintain this lifestyle. The traditional economy was not viable. However, economic models based on tribal resource-based activities are preferred, such as labour-intensive-investments.

The Lummi

The experience of the Lummi is similar to that of the Navajo. After signing a treaty, the federal government allotted them land, but continued expansion by non-Indian development progressively encroached on their settlements. As Deloria (1978) notes, the success of the Lummi resulted from a combination of historical accident and astute tribal leadership.

- In the early 1900s, the Lummi won a 5,000-acre tract of tidewater land in a lawsuit in the face of determined pressure from surrounding businessmen who believed the Indians should be dispossessed of their land and compensated with financial securities (stocks and bonds). Years later, these tidewaters became the basis for an innovative aquaculture project.
- The Lummi enjoyed benign neglect in that they were never large enough or owned enough property to be real objects of control by the Bureau of Indian Affairs.

- Federal bureaucrats never understood the tribe or its culture and tended to dismiss their values and “style” of operation. When the Lummi coalesced politically, they took the federal government “off guard.”

A key asset that the Lummi maintained was close relationship to the sea. Whenever possible, they fished. While the Bureau of Indian Affairs offered various forms of economic activity, the Lummi did not respond until they were offered aquaculture, an activity that was completely compatible with their heritage. A key insight from this “success” is that the eventual path to economic independence aligns completely with the heritage of the Lummi.

Recent success stories from the United States

Cornell and Kalt (1992) have offered important insights into the basis of Aboriginal economic development in the United States. Recently, Cornell (1997) noted that many believe recent favourable Indian economic development in the United States is due to gambling.⁴³ While this is true for some bands, many reserves have experienced significant economic development without relying on gaming.

- The Mississippi Choctaws have become one of the largest employers in the state by creating a manufacturing and service centre. They are important state employers of many non-Indians because their enterprises require more labour than can be supplied by the reserve.
- The White Mountain Apaches in Arizona have created a highly efficient timber operation, which, coupled with their recreational activities, acts as a major anchor for the state.
- In Montana, the Salish and Kootenai tribes of the Flathead reserve use tourism, agriculture and retail services to produce a lower unemployment level than the rest of the state. The community college created by the Flathead is attended by many non-Aboriginals because of its quality.
- In New Mexico, the Cochiti Pueblo have one of the lowest unemployment rates of western tribes and run one of the top public golf courses in the country.

These cases are remarkable for the range of economic activity used by Aboriginals. They all demonstrate a key feature in the success of Aboriginal economic development.

⁴³ A significant difference between Aboriginals in the United States and Canada is that in the United States the federal government has allowed various tribal councils to organize and manage casinos. Little doubt exists that these casinos have generated significant wealth and are often important employers of non-Aboriginals.

3.5.2 The failure and success of U.S. policy for community Aboriginal development

Stanley (1978) argues that the basic mistake in U.S. policy toward Aboriginals is that it has treated them as if they all have the same culture and values. In fact, as the case studies show, each community has tried to deal with economic development in the context of its own history and values. Stanley identifies factors that most Aboriginal tribes in the United States have experienced:

- a military defeat or other form of coercion;
- the need to cope with severe change in their traditional relationship to the environment and to give up a functioning economic system;
- a new political system imposed by the external power and the need to deal with bureaucracies;
- the loss of land rights;
- severe dislocation and the imposition of foreign forms of social and political decision-making; and
- an external community that demanded they abandon their values and have their children educated in another culture, often away from their homes.

The key lesson offered by the case studies is that economic development for Aboriginals must occur within their own cultural and political framework. Further, the term “American Indian” includes many cultures and languages, often as different as German and Chinese. Awareness of this fact alone shows the importance of allowing each Indian population to define its own economic future. Generic models are likely to fail.

Stanley cautions that band leadership expects to do everything, from the lowest-level job to highly skilled professional employment. As bands pass through this stage, they realize that “they would benefit from their resources more by managing them as the Middle Easterners are doing with their oil... it might be more beneficial to the tribe if they were the “board of directors” and hired external technical experts to develop their resources” (p. 586).

3.6 Aboriginal community and economic development in Canada: the past 25 years

During the late 1960s and 1970s, Aboriginal communities used many mainstream programs such as EIC’s Local Initiatives Program (LIP) and the Local Employment Assistance Program (LEAP). While HRDC had only one Aboriginal-specific program until Pathways to Success (Native Internship Program, 1977), DIAND and IC (formerly ISTC and DRIE) introduced numerous initiatives. Two problems confronted us in reviewing these programs:

- Most programs have been reviewed at the micro level, and most evaluations focus on effectiveness in terms of operation and outputs such as number of projects, participants, businesses and loans. The evaluations did identify factors such as management skills and infrastructure as being important.

- Aboriginal economic development programs (like their mainstream counterparts) have been continually modified, changed or amalgamated. This has made it impossible to assess results, especially on a long-term basis. For example, ISTC's Native Employment Development and Business Development Programs became the Aboriginal Business Development Program (under CAEDS) and later Aboriginal Business Canada. Another example is the Indian Community Human Resources Strategy (ICHRS). Introduced in 1985, the evaluation suggests this initiative was similar to the CJS and may have duplicated activities. ICHRS became the Community Economic Development Program (under CAEDS) with a much more streamlined and narrow focus on community economic development organizations (CEDOs).

3.6.1 Summary of Canadian Aboriginal programming

Table 4 summarizes the history of Aboriginal economic development policies and programs in Canada.

In terms of provincial economic-development policies, we identified few programs. Two reports created inventories of these programs in 1996 (Blauer Consulting) and 1997 (Prairie Research Associates). A key insight is that information on existing sources (e.g., provincial expenditure estimates, public accounts, and so on) is inconsistent and grossly inadequate (Blauer, 1996).

TABLE 4			
Overview of selected federal Aboriginal economic development initiatives in Canada from the 1970s to the 1990s			
Program/Initiative	Agency/Department	Year	Description
Indian Economic Development Fund	DIAND	1970	Commercial financing of last resort for Indians on — reserve. There is also a separate Eskimo Loan Fund and the Indian Loan Guarantee Program.
Northern Affairs On-the-job Training Program	DIAND (Northern Affairs)	1973	Vocational training and paid allowances for trainees.
Oil Sands Economic Development Corporation and Indian Equity Foundation	DIAND	1976	Institutions that entered into an agreement with Syncrude (resource development) and later become the Indian Business Development Services (1983).
Special Agricultural and Rural Development Agreements	Department of Regional Economic Expansion (DREE)	1970s	Commercial development, infrastructure development and structural adjustment measures (SAMs).

TABLE 4 (continued)
Overview of selected federal Aboriginal economic development initiatives in Canada from the 1970s to the 1990s

Program/Initiative	Agency/Department	Year	Description
Saskatchewan Indian Agricultural Program (SIAP) Manitoba Indian Agricultural Program (MIAP)	DIAND	early 1980s	Community initiatives that allowed First Nations to develop their agricultural resources and Sectoral Development Institutions. Later, they were also funded under CAEDS Regional Opportunities Program (ROP), which was eliminated.
Native Economic Development Program	Department of Regional Industrial Expansion (DRIE)	1983	Included \$345M for institutions, business activity and entrepreneurship development; it expired in 1989 and become the Aboriginal Business Development Program.
Economic Development Agreements in the NWT and Yukon	DIAND (Northern Affairs)	1980s to mid-1990s	Three 5-year agreements signed with the territories included several components such as tourism, renewable resources, mining, arts and crafts, community enterprises, and so on.
Indian Community Human Resources Strategy (ICHRS)	DIAND	1985 to 1989	Predecessor to CAEDS Community Economic Development Program; it provided support to Indian and Inuit communities through training and employment initiatives.
Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS)	DIAND, ISTC, EIC	1989 to 1996	CAEDS attempted to bring federal Aboriginal programming in the areas of community development (DIAND), business development (ISTC), and training and employment (EIC).

TABLE 4 (continued)			
Overview of selected federal Aboriginal economic development initiatives in Canada from the 1970s to the 1990s			
Program/Initiative	Agency/Department	Year	Description
Post-CAEDS Programming (excluding HRDC initiatives): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community Economic Development Program • Aboriginal Business Canada 	DIAND IC	1996 to present	DIAND and IC programming has been cut since CAEDS ended. Since then, officials have discussed a renewed initiative, but this did not materialize. Instead, the federal government has encouraged the private sector and lending institutions to partner with Aboriginal communities. One such initiative is the Procurement Strategy for Aboriginal Business. Regional development agencies are also more involved.

3.6.2 Examples of successful Aboriginal development from Canada

The following success stories were obtained from best practices, evaluation studies and other anecdotal information over the past few years. We have not followed up to verify or assess the recent success of these initiatives.

Skidgate, B.C.

With a small land base, Skidgate’s economic base is historically related to the commercial fishery, logging and tourism (Queen Charlotte Museum). Commercial services, a canning operation and quarry also offered employment but at a low level. Its population has expanded to over 500 (up from about 275) as a result of Bill C-31.⁴⁴

In 1991, the band council created Gwaalgaa Naay Development Corporation to manage economic-development activities. The purpose of this corporation with its independent board is to guide “the development of the economy of Skidgate towards achieving and maintaining economic self-sufficiency, with a focus on generating revenue for community development and employment for the people of Skidgate.”

⁴⁴ Bill C-31 returned registered Indian status to many who had been previously disenfranchised.

Important business activities include:

- a commercial centre (retail and office) that features equity participation from private banks, investment funds, government programs and the band's equity;
- the purchase of Crown land to expand the reserve to accommodate the increase in population; and
- a new school and medical services that involve joint ventures with off-reserve organizations.

Key features that led to the expanded economic development include a progressive council, an independent economic-development corporation, community consultation and consensus-building, access to other programs (and funds) and effective use of funding arrangements.

Mikisew, Alberta

With a population that expanded by 500 persons to 1,700, this community on the banks of the Athabaska River supports a commercial fishery and canning operation that has slowed due to pollution. Habitats have been disturbed by water-level variations attributable to hydro dams up stream. Tourism is also a source of revenue.

Specific development projects have included:

- a multiplex that supports the operations of two bands and offers rental space for provincial offices;
- Kenyo College Campus;
- an independent economic-development corporation that has supported a growing number of commercial ventures;
- a workforce agreement with Syncrude and 2,000 Plus that has generated high-income jobs for the community; and
- Fort Chipewyan Lodge.

The success factors are similar to Skidgate — namely, progressive political leadership and an independent economic entity. Another factor has been the willingness of major oil companies to form progressive workforce arrangements. In addition, the band elected to have the financial proceeds from its land-claim settlement managed within a conventional financial institution rather than the consolidated revenue fund of the band, again an example of progressive leadership.

Saskatoon Tribal Council

What makes this case unique is that it is the first attempt in Canada to create an urban reserve. Including some six bands scattered throughout west-central Saskatchewan, the land-claims process culminated in the extension of the Muskeg Lake First Nation rights within the corporate boundaries of Saskatoon. The existing reserve was 100 miles to the north.

Major economic developments include:

- a centre for commercial and retail operations; and
- joint ventures in the city with non-Aboriginal businesses.

The success of the Tribal Council can be attributed to:

- its advanced education and business experience;
- an orientation to the external world that allows leaders to visualize creative responses to economic problems;
- community consensus and consultation;
- the ability to access other funding (e.g., the Industry Canada component of CAEDS); and
- the use of alternative funding arrangements.

3.7 Australian Aboriginal Development

Information on community economic development in Australia is relatively sparse. In part, this may be due to the fact that Australian Aboriginals do not have the same legal and constitutional relationship to the federal government as North American Indians. The economic development directed to Australian Aboriginals is therefore similar to mainstream programming directed to economically disadvantaged minority groups such as Blacks in the United States. As the Australian *Task Force Review of the 1987 Aboriginal Employment Strategy* notes:

Any new policy proposals must be realistic and recognize that the development of an economic base for many Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities, particularly those in distant areas, will be influenced by remoteness, underdeveloped technical and entrepreneurial skills, sometimes contradictory cultural values, lack of local and regional infrastructure, and a lack of capital. Economic empowerment will not occur overnight and an array of government strategies and interventions, together with industry co-operation will be needed.⁴⁵

The Indigenous Land Corporation (ILC) also plays a significant role in economic development. The Corporation develops strategic plans and identifies what land should be bought by various indigenous communities. The government recognizes the importance of a land-base for Aboriginal economic development.

⁴⁵ Cited at www.atsic.gov.au/programs/cdep.

An example of the programming offered to Australian Aboriginal people is the Community Development Employment Projects (CDEP), which has been in existence since 1977. Some 268 communities (and 30,000 individuals) have participated in its various initiatives. The Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission (ATSIC) provides a grant to the community to undertake community-managed activities. Program participants forgo their unemployment insurance benefits in exchange for wages.

A recent evaluation of CDEP found that:

- participants have derived considerable employment, income, training, and social and cultural benefits from the program;
- CDEP participants are likely to have a strong sense of cultural identity, have fewer interactions with the criminal justice system and drink less alcohol than unemployed Indigenous persons; and
- of all training received in the year, 77 percent was received through CDEP, and 68 percent of this was accredited courses.⁴⁶

Evaluators made the following suggestions:

- greater access by CDEP participants to the Department of Employment, Education, Training, and Youth Affairs training and employment information within CDEP;
- improvement of training opportunities in the areas of business and financial management; and
- encouragement of participants to remain in the job until they have a job to go to, as this is likely to lead to longer-term employment.

As yet, there is no overall assessment of how these initiatives have changed the economic welfare of Aboriginal people in Australia. The techniques and the course of economic development is sharply different than that being followed in North America, which features community empowerment.

3.8 The critical role of governance

Cornell and Kalt (1995), after reviewing the experiences of many bands in the United States, identify four attributes that “taken together, constitute a set of necessary and sufficient conditions for real economic development to take place on a reservation.” They include: “(1) cultural match with formal institutions, (2) a formal governmental system that provides for a separation of powers, (3) a willingness to specialize and trade “internationally” with off-reservation economies and (4) a modest endowment of either labor or natural resources.”

⁴⁶ Ibid.

Most recently, Cornell (1997) has extended the analysis and made the very important observation that the critical element in Aboriginal economic development is self-governance.⁴⁷ He notes that three preconditions exist for economic development on reservations:

- First, is *de facto* sovereignty in the sense that Aboriginals have genuine control over their own affairs. As long as federal bureaucrats are in control, they will make decisions in their own interest and not the interests of the tribal members. This is both inevitable and natural. Only by aligning the consequences of a decision with the decision-maker will decisions become most informed.

Cornell believes that sound governance precedes economic development, not the reverse. Further, self-government is needed before any economic policies and programs should proceed. He notes: “The change came when, first, the federal government undertook to respect the tribal practice of sovereignty and, second, when tribes asserted the powers they supposedly possessed” (Cornell, 1997).

He also stresses that self-governance does not mean the exclusion of other governments. Every sovereign government needs to have relationships with other orders and governments. An effective system of Aboriginal self-government needs to relate to other governments and engage in the normal intergovernmental relations needed to arrange economic and social services.

- Having the rights and powers inherent in self-government is not enough. Also needed are the institutions of government such as stability in rule enforcement as well as processes to adjudicate disputes and enforce contracts appropriate to the bands’ situation. This implies the following points:
 - Politics must be separated from the process of managing business. Long-term planning is done by the governing councils, but businesses with independent (and accountable) boards manage the operations of the firm.
 - The adjudication of disputes is separate from the political process. If the courts and tribunal process is controlled politically, risk-taking is discouraged and joint ventures with outside firms is constrained.
 - Aboriginal development needs an effective professional public service.
- Cornell echoes the sentiments of Stanley 20 years ago. These institutions of self-government need to resonate with the cultural traditions of the individual band. In some cases, this may mean a hierarchical political process such as that adopted by the White Mountain Apache Tribe, or a less centralized one such as that of the Sioux of the Pine Ridge reservation. Each band needs to develop its own effective self-government that wins the allegiance of the people governed.

⁴⁷ Self-governance refers to the creation of a set of community-based institutions that offer members of that community the ability to control their own development. It is not the same as self-government.

The case studies from Canada illustrate these principles well. Progressive band leadership and the creation of independent economic-development corporations are two vital ingredients. Also important is attention to financial management with a view to creating high levels of confidence with key external organizations such as private lenders and governments. Cornell and Kalt (1995) write that key ingredients for tribal development can be divided into three categories:

- external opportunity (market opportunity, access to financial capital and distance from markets);
- internal assets (natural resources, human capital, institutions of governance and culture); and
- a development strategy (overall economic system and choice of development activity).

These factors need to be coordinated to produce a positive outcome.

4. *Summary and synthesis*

Labour-market, employment and development policies are tightly integrated conceptually and practically. The experience with education and training of economically disadvantaged persons has been disappointing. Typically, the gains in terms of increased earnings are small and often not high enough to serve as an incentive to remain employed. The financial advantages of income assistance are often greater than the incomes available to those with low education, poor skills and no job experience.

Three critical lessons emerge from 30 years of training and education:

- Overcoming the educational and skill deficits for many economically disadvantaged persons is a long-term and expensive proposition. Only by addressing these substantial educational deficits can individuals be equipped to manage their own economic futures without continuous subsidization.
- Many of the training programs of the last decade rely on external service providers. Sometimes, these are accredited technical and academic schools. Increasingly, however, private-contract trainers and consultants are being used in “partnerships” as a way to design training to meet specific needs. This runs counter to the exceptional deficits that most clients present. Skills training is appropriate for well-educated people who may be displaced but usually has little benefit for those who have experienced long-term welfare dependency.
- Trainees need jobs. Focusing only on improving skills misses one half of the equation and usually fails to make substantial change.

For these reasons, legislators have turned to increasing the pressure on welfare recipients. Workfare in its many North American manifestations is likely to become entrenched as a policy response in an effort to return income assistance to its initial form — temporary relief to overcome misfortune. Certainly, training and education will continue, but they will do so against a background of welfare eligibility that requires active and successful participation in strategies to gain economic independence.

With the realization that long-term economic independence will require job creation, increased emphasis is being placed on business development and partnerships with private employers. For Aboriginal persons, community economic development forms an essential element in a long-term economic-growth strategy.

Based on the literature review and case studies, it is clear that both mainstream and Aboriginal community development requires the same set of circumstances:

- Effective and imaginative leadership to identify business opportunities;

- independent political and business-development processes;
- community consensus offering broad support to development initiatives; and
- the community adopting progressive and outward perspectives, seeking opportunities to interact and form joint-ventures with external governments, businesses and organizations.

For Aboriginal organizations, self-governance is the most important precondition. Self-governance is not self-government in the constitutional sense. By self-governance, we mean Band and Tribal leadership that:

- understands the need to separate politics and business;
- can adjudicate commercial disputes fairly and form contracts with non-Aboriginal organizations;
- can nurture a business class; and
- can integrate its education and training within its longer-term business and economic-development strategy.

The fact that self-governance is the precondition to community economic development does not mean that growth is guaranteed. Infrastructure, access to markets, and products and services with commercial value are required. Some communities simply may not have sufficient resources to develop economic independence.

Appendix A

Historical Perspective of Human Resources Development in Canada — 1965 to the Present

Overview

The Canadian government has offered services to unemployed, disadvantaged and underemployed workers for the past 60 years. However, its role in employment and labour-market policy and development surged in 1965 with the creation of the Department of Manpower and Immigration. This focus has continued since then, although the form and content of programming has shifted considerably.

The Sixties

From 1965 to 1971, major initiatives within the Department of Manpower and Immigration included the following:

- the creation of Canada Manpower Centres (CMCs);
- Programs targeted to youth, including the creation of CMCs for Students;
- On-the-job training programs, including the Canada Manpower Training-On-the-Job Program; and
- An Automatic Client Information System (ACIS) for the employment service.

Planners involved in manpower development also made concerted efforts to improve labour-market analysis. They created mechanisms for tracking the demand and supply of workers as well as forecasting tools to estimate the medium- and short-term demand for specific occupations.

The Seventies

In the early 1970s, a Standing Senate Committee on National Finance reviewed the activities of Canada's Manpower department. Consequently, in 1977, the Unemployment Insurance (UI) Commission amalgamated with the Department of Manpower and Immigration to form the new Employment and Immigration Canada (EIC). In response to the recommendations of this Standing Senate Committee, EIC created many new programs targeted to the unemployed.

Employment equity issues also emerged throughout this period, and targeted programs were created for natives, women and youth. In 1977, for example, the government created the Native Employment Policy to assist Aboriginal persons.

At the end of the 1970s, many programs existed within the mandate of EIC. In some instances, they overlapped or duplicated each other. Critics argued that EIC did not have a comprehensive labour-market strategy and that programs appeared to be ad hoc.

During the late 1970s, unemployment and inflation were high. Economists debated the timing and method of government intervention in the labour market. Many advocated a range of theories, but no single, unified solution emerged. Development of a labour-market strategy based on sound economic principles and theories became a priority for government officials going into the next decade.

The Eighties

In the early 1980s, recession posed a major challenge to the Canadian political system and public service. The recession provoked increased government spending on unemployment insurance, social assistance and employment creation. The consensus appeared to have been that government's short-term measures were reactionary and again made little long-term change. A diversity of employment initiatives existed with little coherent labour-market strategy.

The government also embarked on a community-development initiative by creating the Local Economic Development Assistance Program (LEDA). This program was designed to stimulate private-sector employment through local enterprise development within communities. It was intended to create jobs and encourage local employer participation.

To address the diverse labour-market programming, two task forces (The EIC Task Force on Labour-Market Development and the Parliamentary Task Force on Employment Opportunities for the 1980s, respectively) focused on the following areas :⁴⁸

- employment goals;
- occupational training;
- job creation;
- employment service;
- employment equity; and
- adjustment and adaptation.

In addition to these task forces (known as the Allmand and Dodge Reports), the government commissioned other labour-market policy and development studies. This resulted in yet another initiative — the “Revitalization of the Employment Service.” Now, the department's role in the employment service was refocused on:

- labour market information;
- labour exchange (job-placement function); and

⁴⁸ Hunter, John. *The Employment Challenge, Federal Employment Policies and Program, 1900-1990*. (Ottawa: Public Affairs, 1993, pp. 267-273).

- Adjustment Services (such as counseling and training).

Many of the recommendations of the Revitalization Initiative supported the previous two task forces. Major conclusions included the following:

- having adequate labour-market information is vital to meeting clients' needs within the local offices;
- streamlining and automating the labour-exchange function to support the use of self-service techniques on the part of the job seeker; and
- building flexibility in the adjustment service, so that local-office program staff have flexibility in making decisions on how to spend the program funds.

Upon completion of the Revitalization Initiative, the government consolidated 12 existing job-creation programs into 4 main programs: Canada Works; Local Employment Assistance and Development (LEAD); Career Access; and Job Corps. These programs were again targeted at the unemployed and the employment-disadvantaged.

The 1980s was an era of evaluation and restructuring for the employment department. In addition to the various task forces and the Revitalization Initiative, the government initiated five commission reports (Macdonald, Neilson, Forget, House and Abella). Each commission investigated various aspects of the labour-market efficiency and emerged with the following themes:

- The efficiency of the labour market and its capacity to adjust to the domestic and international economic environment were being negatively affected by government policies, especially UI and job creation policies.
- Policies to combat regional unemployment, such as regionally extended UI benefits and job creation projects, were not working and, in fact, were exacerbating the problem by their effect on the attitude and behavior of workers and employers.
- The UI program should return to its initial role as a social insurance scheme but not become involved in income supplementation or support, which should be handled by a form of guaranteed annual income.
- Funding for short-term job creation should be shifted to community development schemes designed to generate permanent economic growth for depressed areas.⁴⁹

By 1985, the department concluded it could not serve everyone; instead, it should serve those "most in need." Consequently, the programs consolidated in 1983 were once again revised in 1985. The resulting Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS) now contained six major components (see Table A4).

⁴⁹ Ibid., pp. 337-338.

CJS maintained the conservative perspective of “intervening in the market place only when necessary” and was based on five principles:

- Training and job creation must be economic in orientation, with emphasis on small business and support of entrepreneurship;
- Programming is to be innovative, flexible, and responsive to regional and local needs;
- Governments and the private sector must share responsibility for training and employment development;
- There must be a commitment to equality of access to training and employment development programs;
- Programs are to be simple and understandable and should avoid wasteful duplication.⁵⁰

Following the recommendations of the CJS Task Force, the government improved the various CJS components:

- simpler generic terms and conditions were introduced;
- forms and guidelines were reduced by 50 percent;
- local decision-making was increased;
- certain criteria were relaxed (i.e. the 24 of 30 rule in the Job Development program and the three-year rule in the Job Entry);
- contracting and claims procedures were simplified;
- greater emphasis was placed on measuring results rather than effort; and
- simplified administration helped to free up resources in the regional and local offices.⁵¹

Toward the end of the 1980s, the government introduced more private-sector participation in labour-force training. It created the Labour Force Development Strategy (LFDS) that allowed UI funds for income maintenance to be shifted to occupational training and job assistance in order to encourage unemployed people to go back to work. It also created non-governmental Labour Force Development Boards at the national and regional level. These boards had the authority to influence national and provincial labour-market initiatives and played a role in shaping Canada’s labour-market programs and policies. They also helped develop a plan for the use of UI funds at the national and regional levels.

⁵⁰ Ibid., p. 343.

⁵¹ Ibid., p. 350.

Around the same time as the creation of the LFDS, the federal government introduced the Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS) and, within it, the Pathways for Success Strategy run by EIC.

The Nineties

The government activities in the 1990s has focused on four major areas:

- social security reform;
- unemployment insurance reform;
- initiatives targeted at Aboriginal peoples; and
- devolution of labour-market training to the provinces.

The first major changes to the *Unemployment Insurance Act* occurred in 1992 with Bill C-105 (*The Employment Insurance Act or EI*). Conditions in Bill C-105 reduced the level of insurable earnings from 60 percent to 57 percent. The net effect was to make being on employment insurance a less attractive option.

In 1991, with the introduction of the Pathways for Success Strategy, HRDC created national and regional Aboriginal management boards (NAMBs and ABMs). These boards had the responsibility of setting training priorities for Aboriginal communities. The Pathways era initiated the partnering of HRDC and Aboriginal organizations that continues in the form of Regional Bilateral Agreements.

In response to the social security reform, the government introduced Strategic Initiatives in 1994. This five-year federal-provincial cost-shared program was designed to test innovative approaches to social-security reform. The government also launched a similar program for Aboriginal peoples — Aboriginal Strategic Initiatives. This program has the same objectives as Strategic Initiatives but is 100 percent funded by the federal government.

By the end of 1995, a Structural Review of Pathways for Success Strategy was completed, and the government shifted to the use of bilateral agreements in its dealings with Aboriginal peoples. In 1996, national framework agreements were signed between the government and the Assembly of First Nations, the Métis National Council and the Inuit Tapirisat of Canada. The government has allotted \$200 million a year until 1999 to address Aboriginal human-resource-development needs. Over 50 regional bilateral agreements have now been signed by the government and Aboriginal organizations across the country.

Nineteen ninety-six marked the start of the federal governments devolution of its labour-market development and programs to the provinces. Bill C-12 gives HRDC three years to withdraw from current training programs. A total of \$2 billion has been set aside to help provinces get unemployed people back into the labour market.

Nineteen ninety-six also saw the introduction of two new special initiatives: the Transitional Jobs Fund and the Urban Aboriginal Initiative. These initiatives are designed to assist in the transition from the old UI legislation to the new *EI Act*. The Transitional Jobs Fund is a \$300-million initiative to stimulate economic growth in high-unemployment areas. The Urban Aboriginal Initiative helps urban Aboriginals gain employment.

TABLE A1
1965-71 — Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
Creation of the Department of Manpower and Immigration	1965	Canada adopted the Swedish manpower policy model with a commitment to improve the operation of the labour market. The federal government made a significant leap in its scope and involvement in the labour market.
Employment policies and programs for students including the establishment of the Canada Manpower Centres for Students	1970	Centres initiated "Hire a student" campaigns to persuade employers and the general public to hire students.
Opportunities for Youth	Spring 1971	OFY provided summer employment and tried to avoid creating competition between students and permanent members of the labour force.
Local Initiatives Program	Fall 1971	To create additional jobs between November 1971 and May 1972; to foster the creation of new facilities and services that would benefit the whole community; to invoke the participation of community groups and the unemployed in developing and carrying out the projects.
Canada's Manpower Training-on-the-Job Program (CMTJP)	1971	To encourage and assist employers by providing unemployed people with on-the-job-skills training. The government reimbursed 75 percent of the trainees' wages.
Employment Service Computerization Establishment of the Automated Client Information System (ACIS)	1970	To design a system that captures information about job seekers. This information is used by counselors to match the requirements of the job vacancy listed by an employer. The system was used for research, planning, evaluation, management and control purposes.

TABLE A1 (continued)
1965-71 — Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
Improved labour-market analysis and forecasting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Job Vacancy Survey • Occupational Shortages Survey • Canadian Occupational Forecasting Program (COFOR) • Forward Occupational Imbalance Listing (FOIL) 	During the 1970s	Instruments developed to measure current activity in the labour market. A mechanism for tracking the duration, nature and location of shortages of qualified personnel in certain occupations was also created. Efforts were made in developing forecasting tools to estimate the medium — and short — term demand for various occupations.
Source: Consolidated information from <i>The Employment Challenge, Federal Government Policies and Programs 1900-1990</i>, (Hull: Public Affairs, Government of Canada, 1993)		

TABLE A2
1972-79 — Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
Local Employment Assistance Program (LEAP)	1972	To create employment for the unemployed and those receiving public assistance who are not likely to become employed through normal labour-market activity.
Report of the Standing Committee on National Finance on Canada Manpower	1973	Identified the need to assist the unemployed job-seeker.
Work Adjustment Training (WAT)	1973	To help clients who had the basic skills and knowledge required for employment but were unable to apply them to regular work. It consisted of two elements: assessment of the client's strengths and weaknesses, and a period of adjustment training.
Basic Job Readiness Training (BJRT)	1974?	To assist unemployed workers or persons who had been out of the labour force for a prolonged period of time due to seriously deficient educational or employment skills.
Training Improvement Program (TIP)	1974	To provide funds to colleges and trade associations to enable them to undertake developmental projects.
Community Employment Strategy (CES)	1974	To create employment for Canadians who experience particular and continuing difficulty in finding and keeping satisfactory employment and who rely on some form of transfer payment for most or all of their income.
Creation of Employment and Immigration	1977	To integrate the UI Commission with Employment and Immigration Canada.

TABLE A2 (continued)
1972-79 — Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
Canada Works Program	1977	To create employment opportunities for unemployed Canadians by using their skills to provide services and facilities to their communities. The program was designed to be more down to earth than Local Initiative Program, and the projects were to be screened and monitored more closely.
Young Canada Works	1977	To create jobs to facilitate students' future entrance into the labour market by enabling them to test possible career choices and obtain practical work experience. The program was similar to Opportunities for Youth Program. However, only established organizations could sponsor the projects.
Summer Job Corps	1977	To create short-term jobs for young people, primarily students, with challenging work experience for career and educational development.
Job Experience Training Programs	1977	The program was aimed at providing jobs for unemployed persons from 15-24 who had been out of school for more than three months and had been registered with CEC for at least six weeks. The employers participating in the program received a wage subsidy.
Native Employment Policy	1977	To achieve the full realization of the productive potential of Canada's Native population, while supporting the initiatives of Native individuals and communities in pursuit of their economic needs and self-fulfillment through work.
National Occupational Classification and Jobscan	1979	To replace the Canadian Classification and Dictionary of Occupations (CCDO).
Source: Consolidated information from <i>The Employment Challenge, Federal Government Policies and Programs 1900-1990</i>, (Hull: Public Affairs, Government of Canada, 1993).		

TABLE A3
1980-89 — Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
Local Development Assistance Program (LEDA)	1980	To stimulate private-sector employment through local enterprise development within communities.
Training Opportunities for Natives Initiative	1980	To provide institutional training for natives.
Focus on Labour-market Studies • Dodge Report • Allmand Report	1981	The Dodge Report focused on labour-market development; the Allmand Report focused on employment opportunities.
<i>National Training Act</i>	1982	Retained the provision of the two basic categories of institutional and industrial training but added a third category — the Skills Growth Fund (SGF).
Employment equity targeted at older workers, natives, women and youth	1981-82	The Portable Wage Subsidy Program; the Program for Employment Disadvantaged; Women's Counseling Centres; and Specialized Youth Units.
Revitalization of the Employment Service	1983	Establishment of a committee to reach an agreement and consensus on a mission statement for the employment service. Divide the role of the employment service into three basic functions: 1) labour-market information; 2) labour exchange; and 3) adjustment services.
Consolidation of Job Creation Programs	1983	The existing 12 job-creation initiatives were consolidated into four major year-round employment programs and one summer program. To establish three labour-market objectives: 1) contra-cyclical stabilization and adjustment; 2) local employment growth; and 3) human-resource development.
Canada Works	1983	To create productive term-employment for unemployed persons. To help stabilize the labour market and respond to worker dislocation.
Local Employment Assistance and Development (LEAD)	1983	To increase the number of permanent jobs in localities of chronically high unemployment.
Career Access	1983	To provide employment opportunities for the inexperienced, the disabled and others facing barriers to employment.
Job Corps	1983	To help severely employment-disadvantaged persons acquire the necessary preparation and skills.
Commissions of Inquiry	Mid 1980s	Addressed issues related to the efficiency of the labour market (Macdonald, Neilson, Forget, House, Abella).

TABLE A3 (continued)
1980-89 — Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
Canadian Job Strategy	1985	To ensure federal resources are used effectively to bring direct assistance to those in need.
CJS Task Force	1985	Recommended how programs could be streamlined.
Labour Force Development Strategy (LFDS)	1989	To establish greater private-sector participation in and responsibility for labour-force training.

Source: Consolidated information from *The Employment Challenge, Federal Government Policies and Programs 1900-1990*, Hull: Public Affairs, Government of Canada, 1993.

TABLE A4
Component Programs of the Canadian Job Strategy

Program Name	Description	1986-87 Expenditures (\$millions)	1986-87 Participants (000s)
Skill Shortages	Subsidize employers to train workers in high-demand skills in short supply.	182.2	70.9
Skill Investment	Helps experienced workers retain their jobs by updating their skills. Five options are available.	41.2	17.8
Job Entry	Helps youth make the transition from school to work, and helps women having difficulty re-entering the labour market after an absence from the workforce.	402.9	149.0
Job Development	Assists the re-employment of the long-term unemployed.	768.7	176.2
Community Futures	Helps single-industry communities hit by plant closings and mass layoffs.	63.5	3.1
Innovations	Funds pilot projects and demonstration projects.	14.8	

Source: EIC (1988: 48-49 and 64-65).

TABLE A5
1990s Human Resources Development in Canada

Activity	Year	Objective/Actions
Pathways for Success Strategy	1991	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To invest in and develop a trained Aboriginal labour force. • To develop an effective partnership Aboriginal between HRDC and Aboriginal organizations. • To facilitate broader Aboriginal participation in unique Aboriginal labour markets and the broader Canadian labour market. • Established national and regional Aboriginal management boards to set the training priorities of Aboriginal communities.
Bill C-105 (UI Changes)	1992	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced benefits for 1993 and 1994 to 57 percent of insurable earnings from 60 percent.
Bill C-113 (UI Changes)	1993	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Eight areas of “just cause” were added to the existing five areas contained in the <i>UI Act</i>.
Strategic Initiatives — five-year provincial cost-shared program	1994	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To test innovative approaches to federal-social-security reform.
Aboriginal Strategic Initiatives	1994	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To test innovative approaches to social-security reform — specifically targeted to Aboriginal peoples.
Development of National Framework Agreements and Regional Bilateral Agreements	1996	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government provides \$200 million a year until 1999 in funding for Aboriginal human-resource development.
Bill C-12/Proposed <i>EI Act</i> Legislation	1996	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transfer responsibility for human-resource development from HRDC to the provinces — three-year period of transition granted.
Transitional Jobs Fund	1996	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To stimulate economic growth in areas with high unemployment and few employment opportunities.
Urban Aboriginal Initiative	1996	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To help urban Aboriginals gain employment.

Appendix B

Overview of Australian Labour Market and Training Programs — 1970s-1990s

The Seventies

During the 1970s, Australian labour-market programs and policies focused on three areas of intervention:

- job creation;
- wage subsidies; and
- structural adjustment assistance.

Australia's Department of Employment and Industrial Relations targeted its manpower programs to the disadvantaged and long-term unemployed.

- In 1974, the Department created the Regional Employment Development Scheme (REDS). The short-lived public-sector job-creation program was created to combat high unemployment levels. A change in government in 1975 resulted in a new mandate and the elimination of REDS.
- During the early 1970s, it was believed that employment subsidies were a better approach than public-sector job creation.
- By 1976, the government shifted its focus to private-sector job creation, thereby recognizing that employer participation in training programs was critical in addressing employment gaps and high levels of unemployment.
- Throughout the mid- and late 1970s, labour-market programming focused on structural changes believed to be responsible for high levels of unemployment and the displacement of workers in key industrial sectors. The government responded by creating the Structural Adjustment Assistance (SAA) program in 1973. This program was reviewed in 1975 and discontinued for the following reasons :⁵²
 - special benefits to designated displaced workers reduced the mobility of those affected by structural change;

⁵² Bureau of Labour Market Research, 1987 report of the SAA Review. They are summarized in the following book by Leigh, Duane E.: *Does Training Work for Displaced Workers? A Survey of Existing Evidence*. (Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1990), p. 93.

- determination of whether particular workers were unemployed as a result of government's specific policy decisions was difficult and arbitrary; and
- pressures existed to extend benefits to other unemployed workers not eligible for program assistance.

The Eighties

In terms of mainstream programming, although the SAA program was eliminated, the government continued to supply adjustment-assistance services to displaced workers. Two new programs emerged in the 1980s:

- *Labour Adjustment Training Arrangements Program (LATA)* — An evaluation of the program in 1990 revealed that training curriculums must match the interests and backgrounds of targeted workers to be effective. The study also indicated that the type of training provided makes a substantial difference in the net impact analysis.
- *Heavy Engineering Labour Adjustment Assistance Program*

In the late 1980s, the government also introduced labour-market programs and policies specifically for Aboriginal people.

- In 1987, the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) responded to high levels of unemployment among Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples.
- The government's employment and training initiative under the AEDP was the Training for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders Programme (TAP). TAP was designed to meet the needs of Aboriginal job seekers who could not be appropriately assisted through mainstream labour-market programs. It also involved linking assistance with mainstream initiatives. TAP consists of several elements such as Skills Development, Transition Assistance, Formal Training and Ancillary Allowances.

The table below, provided by the Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs, identifies the many program elements of TAP.

TABLE B1			
TAP — Training for Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders Programme Description			
Program Category	Type of Assistance	Duration	Assistance Available
Skills Development	Provides wage subsidies to employers to provide employment-based training placements to increase the level of skills and employment of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples.	The duration of the traineeship or apprenticeship; Non-accredited employment placements — up to 6 months.	Traineeships: up to 100 percent of the award wage; Apprenticeships: up to 50 percent of the award wage; and Non-accredited training placements: up to 100 percent of the award wage.
Transition Assistance (Work Transition)	Provides wage subsidies to employers so an Indigenous jobseeker can be provided with the opportunity to trial a type of employment, allowing the jobseeker to make an informed choice about a career path.	Initially up to 6 weeks, may be extended to 13 weeks.	100 percent of the award wage
Transition Assistance (Mentor Services)	Provides an Indigenous jobseeker with a mentor while participating in employment or training to assist with overcoming obstacles which may affect the employment or training placement.	12 months.	Limited to a maximum of \$2,000 worth of assistance in any given 12-month period.
Transition Assistance (Career Information Events)	Provides Indigenous jobseekers with the opportunity to attend industry expos, career information days and enterprise information sessions which will assist make an informed decision regarding a career path.	Duration of event.	Costs associated with attending the event including fares to and from the event, registration fees, accommodation costs and the jobseeker to other costs directly associated with attending the event.
Formal Training	Provides Indigenous jobseekers with formal, institution based training that is pre-vocational or job-specific.	Non-accredited training courses — 6 months; Accredited training that does lead to other accredited training — 6-12 months.	Income support (equivalent to unemployment benefit); and training component.

TABLE B1 (continued)			
TAP — Training for Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders Programme Description			
Program Category	Type of Assistance	Duration	Assistance Available
Ancillary Allowances (Course Costs)	Pays for the cost of a course.	One-off payment.	Amount of course cost.
Ancillary Allowances (Books and Equipment)	Provides financial assistance to the jobseeker to meet compulsory course costs including books and equipment associated with the employment/training placement.	Cash limited payment in any given 12-month period.	Up to \$350
Ancillary Allowances (Special Grant)	Provides financial assistance to meet extraordinary costs associated with the employment/training placement	Cash limited payment in any given 12-month period.	No dependents up to \$350 With dependents up to \$500
Ancillary Allowances (Local Fares)	Provides financial assistance to a client to attend a training or employment opportunity in the local region.	For the duration of a training placement or 20 weeks for clients participating in an employment placement.	Under 18 up to \$52-90/week 18 and over up to \$57-90/week
Ancillary Allowances (Forward Fares)	Provides financial assistance to assist an Indigenous jobseeker to move to a new location to take up an employment or training opportunity or attend an interview where there exists a reasonable chance of success.	This is a one-off payment.	Cost of fare
Ancillary Allowances (Accommodation)	Provides financial assistance to a jobseeker to obtain adequate accommodation while participating in a DEETYA labour market programme away from the client's home for short periods (e.g., to attend block release training).	Assistance is available for the duration of the labour market programme in which the participant is participating.	Costs met are limited to the current non-SES travel allowance rates.

Table 1 provides a general guide for possible assistance available under the TAP — Training for Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders Programme.

Included with the table is the following information:

The amount and duration of assistance provided to a client will be determined by the individual client's employment and training needs and is subject to the approval of the local CES.

Employment Strategies target significant employers, which include the public and private sectors, community organizations, regional employers and employer representative groups, by providing a range of assistance to employ Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples and develop career paths. This is achieved through the development of an Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander recruitment and career development plan for the employer. Under this plan, assistance may be provided to support the appointment of an Employment Strategy Coordinator and the implementation of the above elements of TAP. This approach is specified in an Agreement between the employer and the DEETYA which sets specific targets and outcomes for the employment of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples within the sponsoring organization and is overseen by a joint Steering Committee. Other assistance included within a strategy may include cross-cultural awareness training for employees of the sponsoring organization, establishment and maintenance of contacts and networks for Indigenous peoples employed by the organization, and organization specific training and career development.

The Nineties

In the 1990s, Australia introduced major changes to mainstream and Aboriginal labour-market programs and policies. We identified the following developments:

- The Commonwealth Employment Service Advisory Committee's *Review of Labour Market Programmes* recommended streamlining labour market programs in October 1996. These recommendations were also the catalyst for developing a performance management framework and focusing on program results or outcomes. As a result, the Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs (DEETYA) changed to one of purchaser of services and provider of policy advice. The department's role in direct service delivery diminished as it took on that of contract manager overseeing a network of public and private employment and training service providers.

- In the past few years, there have been reforms to employment insurance benefits and a focus on persons with an attachment to the labour market. The emphasis of employment and training programs is based on “case management” that attempts to deal with all aspects of the individual’s needs to prepare them for employment.
- Labour market programs have been privatized and are delivered by private employment and training service providers and the government’s newly created public enterprise that competes with them. Employment and training agencies are to provide services to “employment-ready” clients and “less employable”, higher risk clients. Agencies sign a contract and must meet the terms and conditions as well as targets set out or they will not meet their contract requirements. There are several Aboriginal service providers throughout the country.
- The government has also established Centrelink which is a one stop centre for the unemployed. This network of centres refers clients to employment and training providers or offers support and assistance to prepare the individual for training. Centrelink integrates training interventions with income assistance.

Aboriginal specific programming has also changed.

- Employment Strategies is a new element of TAP and recruits Aboriginal people for career development. This initiative develops agreements with organizations to increase the number and status of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people employed. Local Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Employment Promotion Committees (LAEPCs) may be used to fund these organizations. Organizations (businesses, government, or non-profit agencies) can enter into five models of agreement with the federal government.
- In the late 1990s, the direct assistance element of the TAP was eliminated. This component involved assistance with traineeships, wage subsidies and assistance to meet employment related training costs and expenses. Direct assistance also provided financial payment for services such as work experience, mentor services, attendance at career information events, and literacy training. Direct assistance might have been provided to an individual over a number of years as he/she prepared for eventual training and employment. This support will now come from Centrelink and other community supports.

TABLE B2
Australian Training Programs, 1970-1990 Period

Activity	Year	Objectives
Structural Adjustment Assistance (SAA) program	1973-1976	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide income-maintenance allowances to trade-displaced workers.
Labour Adjustment Training Arrangements (LATA) program	1982	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop flexible training packages to meet displaced workers' needs within the steel industry. • Vocational-oriented training provided in government or private educational institutions. • Government covers direct costs of classroom training. • Income-maintenance allowances provided to trainees — allowances equal UI benefits plus a supplementary adult training payment. • Costs of textbooks, equipment, and special course fees are also covered.
Heavy Engineering Labour Adjustment Assistance program	1986	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop assistance packages for displaced workers of the heavy engineering/capital good industries. • Encourage employer to provide on-the-job training (use of wage subsidies). • Provide formal training (up to 12 months) for workers displaced from designated employers. • Provide income-maintenance support to displaced workers. • Provide relocation assistance to displaced workers.
Aboriginal Employment Development Policy	1987	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieve broad equity between Indigenous and other Australians in terms of employment, economic status, education, and a reduction in welfare dependency.
Training for Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders Programme (TAP)	1987	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide training and employment opportunities to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> — increase the numbers in ongoing employment; — increase occupational skills; — improve employment prospects in the labour market; and — achieve a greater distribution of employment across a range of occupations across industry sectors.
Employment Strategies	1990s	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase the number and status in ongoing employment, taking into account the need for an appropriate geographic, industrial and occupational spread of employment opportunities. • Improve career prospects with a particular focus on increasing the number in managerial, professional and technical occupations.

Sources: Duane E. Leigh, *Does Training Work for Displaced Workers? A Survey of Existing Evidence*. (Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1990) p. 91-99. Website information and other documentation from the Department of Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs (DEETYA). Interviews with contacts at DEETYA.

Appendix C

Labour-market Training Programs in the United States — Last Four Decades

Overview

The federal government has long perceived skills and education upgrading as a solution to rising unemployment and chronic social assistance. The attention of the federal government in the 1960s with the War on Poverty, and more recently various state government in dealing with expanding welfare rolls, has produced many responses. The program emphasis has moved from sharply defined skills-training to using incentives and penalties to encourage economic independence. On a parallel track, increased attention is now being paid to the school-to-work transition.

The number of job-training programs in the United States proliferated over the last 30 years in response to unemployment, underemployment and poverty. The federal government saw job training as a potential solution to these types of problems. In many instances, the gains are significant enough to move participants out of poverty and off welfare or unemployment. Critics of U.S. training programs argue education and job training are interrelated, and any divisions between education and job training should be eliminated.

The Sixties

The Manpower Development Training Act (MDTA) changed vocational education practice in the United States. It gave the Department of Labor the opportunity to provide non-traditional training for adults outside the school system, including:

- single-occupation classroom training;
- referrals to vocational and technical schools; and
- subsidized on-the-job training.

Analysts argued that the vocational education programs of the early 1960s inadequately addressed the needs of adults. To compensate for this, the government created a number of new programs under the MDTA in 1963, 1965, 1966 and 1968 that expanded training to youth and the poor. The best-known, most-expensive and intensive MDTA program was the Job Corps Program. This program targeted disadvantaged youths and provided a comprehensive number of services (counseling, education, training, work experience and health care). Participants would receive training for an entire year in a residential setting away from home. The Job Corps Program served 40,600 persons in 1966 at a cost of \$37,000 per participant (in 1994 dollars).⁵³ As of 1995, the Job Corps Program was still in

⁵³ Robert Lalonde, "The Promise of Public-Sector Sponsored Training Programs," *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 9 (Spring 1995) p. 151.

existence under the *Job Training Partnership Act*. The Program served 104,000 persons in 1995 at a cost of \$16,000 per participant (in 1994 dollars).⁵⁴

In the late sixties, the federal government shifted its focus to welfare reform. It made amendments to the Social Security Act in 1967, and new programs emerged which required certain welfare recipients to either work and/or participate in training programs (i.e., Work Incentive Programs). Failure to comply meant loss of benefits. The welfare-to-work experiments during this period emphasized work rather than education and job training.

The government faced many challenges in measuring the effectiveness of job-training programs in the late sixties. Programs varied in intensity and objectives. The government had entered into roughly 40,000 contractual agreements with various state and local organizations for the implementation of specific employment and training activities.⁵⁵ As a result of this diversity, standardization of the administration and operation of the training programs became paramount.

By the end of the 1960s to the early 1970s, unemployment was edging up, and the government was focusing its efforts on creating public-sector jobs. In 1971, the government introduced the *Emergency Employment Act*, which provided funding to create jobs within the public sector.

The Seventies

The next major shift occurred around 1973 with the introduction of the *Comprehensive Employment and Training Act* (CETA). Programs under this Act targeted low-income unemployed and economically disadvantaged persons. Program services and administration became more standardized. States and local governments levels received grants from the federal government to administer and operate employment and training programs. They had responsibility for deciding the types of training to be provided, who should be served, and how the training was provided.

Effectiveness in job-training programs became a priority, and, consequently, programs were evaluated under the CETA. The evaluations concentrated on quasi-experimental methods and regression analysis methodologies and have generated much of the insight into the effectiveness of education and training.

The Eighties

The *Job Training Partnership Act* (JTPA) replaced the CETA program in 1983. While the decentralized structure of CETA was maintained under JTPA, the Act granted the states the right to designate local service-delivery areas (SDAs). The JTPA required the SDAs to meet specific performance standards. Enforcement of performance standards by the government ensured the effectiveness of the program in meeting the individual needs of each SDA.

⁵⁴ Ibid., p. 151.

⁵⁵ John Palmer, "The Next Decade: The Economic, Political, and Social Context of Employment and Training Policies," *Policy Studies Review*, Vol. 6 (May 1987) p. 701.

The program also emphasized the need for training to be responsive to the needs of employers and, therefore, instituted local administering boards (Private Industry Councils). JTPA programs focused on the unemployed, on dislocated workers who had lost their jobs due to foreign trade, and on the economically disadvantaged. Also, no public-sector employment was eligible for assistance, correcting a significant defect of CETA.

By the end of the 1980s, the government passed the *Family Support Act* to require states to establish training programs for welfare recipients to raise their employment levels. The most prominent program of this kind is the Job Opportunities and Basic Skills Training (JOBS) program introduced in 1988.

The Nineties

The federal government has made a significant number of major welfare reforms throughout this decade, including:

- providing full federal funding for the JOBS program in 1993 under the *Work for Welfare Act* — in fact, funding for the program tripled;
- introducing a welfare bill in 1993 with two tiers of Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) — a transition and work program; and
- introducing a *Welfare Reform Act* in 1994 that allowed states the option of ending AFDC support to a recipient after two years.

A majority of the welfare reform in the early 1990s restricted a welfare clients' length on a particular program. Under the welfare changes in 1993, for example, states could opt to drop AFDC clients from the rolls after five years of participation in the program. The *Welfare Reform Act* of 1994 restricted the eligibility of welfare term to two years and also required welfare teen mothers to live with their parents. Finally, the Act allowed for “the establishment of a voucher program whereby the combined value of AFDC and food-stamp benefits could be used as a wage subsidy.”

The largest undertaking of the government was the *Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act* of 1996. This Act ended welfare as Americans knew it. It essentially replaced the long-standing Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) program with a new program called Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF).

This new program provides “block grant” funding to the states. These funds are then provided to welfare recipients in a cash entitlement, with time restrictions.

One year later, the government introduced the Welfare-to-Work Grant Program under the 1997 *Budget Reconciliation Act*. Under this program, states received grants based on a particular funding formula, taking into account the states’:

- population under the poverty level;
- unemployment rate; and
- welfare caseload.

Amendments to the *Budget Reconciliation Act* also “funded communities for projects that emphasize innovation, collaboration, and sustainable strategies to attain employment, earnings, and other successful outcomes for welfare recipients.” Tribal and Native American organizations are eligible to apply for these grants.

In addition to the major welfare reforms, the government made concerted efforts to address Indian and Native American peoples’ needs. In 1992, for example, it established the Native American Employment and Training Council under Section 401 (K) of the *Job Training Partnership Act*. This council is to be the voice of Indian and Native American communities with respect to employment and training issues. It is expected to develop an effective partnership with the Department of Labour in these areas. The Department of Labour announced recently (March 18, 1998) that it will provide \$15 million in Welfare-to-Work grants to tribal governments for the purpose of assisting long-term welfare recipients become employed. This council is expected to assist in the allocation process.

TABLE C1
1960-1990 Period

Activity	Year	Objectives/Actions
<i>Manpower Development and Training Act (MDTA)</i>	1962	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Began as a program to aid dislocated and unemployed workers. • After the passage of the <i>Economic Opportunity Act</i> in 1964, the focus of the program shifted to serve more welfare recipients and low-income youth.
Amendments to the <i>Social Security Act</i>	1967	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided funds for social services to states, which had the authority to decide what services should be provided.
Work Incentive Program	1971	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Established as a voluntary work program for welfare recipients (included education and training components).
<i>Emergency Employment Act</i>	1971	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided in excess of \$2 billion for the creation of public-sector jobs.
<i>Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA)</i>	1973	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided training and employment services to low-income, unemployed and economically disadvantaged persons. • Provided temporary public service employment to eligible unemployed persons.
<i>Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA)</i>	1983	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintained the decentralized structure of CETA. • Eliminated public service employment component. • Reduced expenditures on traditional services for the economically disadvantaged. • Authorized funding for unemployed, dislocated workers who were not economically disadvantaged. • Created partnerships with private firms, state governments and NGOs to offer training and skills upgrading. • Used performance measures and performance contracts with training providers.
JOBSTART	1985	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Targeted youths (17-21 years of age) who had dropped out of high school — similar to the Job Corps Program except it was less intensive and non-residential.
<i>Family Support Act</i>	1988	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Required all states to establish training programs to increase the employment of welfare recipients.
Job Opportunities and Basic Skills Training (JOBS) program of the <i>Family Support Act</i> of 1988	1988	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Required 55 percent of states' JOBS funds be spent "most at risk" of long-term welfare dependency — includes mandatory participation for all AFDC recipients (single heads-of-households with no children under the age of three).

Appendix D

Bibliography

BIBLIOGRAPHY	
Source	Page
Reports, Papers, Books, Academic Journals	87-101
Evaluation Reports	103-112
Web sites	113-116

Reports, Papers, Books, Academic Journals

Aboriginal Employment Development Policy Statement, Policy Paper No. 1, 1987. Australia.

Aboriginal Employment Development Policy Statement, Policy Paper No. 2, Private and Public Employment Strategies, 1987. Australia.

Aboriginal Issues, pp. 276-293.

Aboriginal Liaison Directorate, *Issues Manual*, 1997.

Anderson, Kathryn et al. "The Effect of Creaming on Placement Rates Under the Job Training Partnership Act." *Industrial and Labour Relations*. Vol. 46 (July 1993) pp. 613-624.

Anton, Thomas. "Economic Development, Employment and Training Policy, and Federalism." *Policy Studies Review*, Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 728-732.

Armstrong, Robin and Tim Rogers. *A First Nations Typology Patterns of Socio-Economic Well-Being*. Ottawa, Research & Analysis Directorate, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, 1996.

Ashenfelter, Orley and David Card. "Using the Longitudinal Structure of Earnings to Estimate the Effect of Training Programs." *The Review of Economics and Statistics*. Vol. 67 (1985) pp. 648-660.

Atkinson, Anthony. "Unemployment Compensation and Labour Market Transition: A Critical Review." *Journal of Economic Literature*. Vol. 29 (December 1991) pp. 1679-1717.

Barnow, Burt. "The Impact of CETA Programs on Earnings: A Review of the Literature." *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 22 (1987) pp. 157-193.

Bartik, Timothy. "The Effects of Local Labor Demand on Individual Labor Market Outcomes for Different Demographic Groups and the Poor." Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper 93-23. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, September 1993.

Bartik, Timothy. "Using Performance Indicators to Improve the Effectiveness of Welfare-to-Work Programs." Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper 95-36. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1995.

Bartik, Timothy. *Who Benefits from State and Local Economic Development Policies?* Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1991.

Bartik, Timothy. "Jobs, Productivity and Local Economic Development: What implications does economic research have for the role of government?" *National Tax Journal*. (December 1994) 847-861.

Bartik, Timothy and Richard Bingham. "Can Economic Development Programs be Evaluated?" Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper 95-29. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1995.

Bassi, Laurie. "Estimating the Effect of Training Programs with Non-Random Selection." *The Review of Economics and Statistics*. (1983) pp. 36-43.

Bassi, Laurie. "The Effect of CETA on the Post Program Earnings of Participants." *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 18 (1983) pp. 541-556.

Bell, Stephen et al. *Program Applicants as a Comparison Group in Evaluating Training Programs*. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1995.

Bell, Stephen and Larry Orr. "Subsidized Employment Cost Effective for Welfare Recipients? Experimental Evidence from Seven State Demonstrations." *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 29 (1989) pp. 42-61.

Bender, Thomas. *Community and Social change in America*. New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1978.

Benello, George et al. *Building Sustainable Communities: Tools and Concepts for Self-Reliant Economic Change*. New York: Bootstrap Press, June 1997.

Bickerton, James. *Nova Scotia, Ottawa, and the Politics of Regional Development*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, June 1990.

Blauer Consulting. "Overview of Provincial Expenditures in the Area of Social and Economic Programing." *Inventory of Employability, Training and Income Security Programs: 1995-1996*. (July 1996).

- Bloch, Farrell. *Research in Labour Economics, A Research Annual, Evaluating Manpower Training Programs*. Greenwich, Connecticut: JAI Press, 1979.
- Booth, Douglas and Louis Fortis. "Building a Cooperative Economy: A Strategy for Community Based Economic Development." *Review of Social Economy*. Vol. 42 (December 1984) pp. 339-359.
- Bothby, Daniel. "Schooling, Literacy and the Labour Market: Towards a Literacy Shortage." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 19 (1993) pp. 29-35.
- Buckley, Helen. *Why Indian Programs Failed. A brief to the Royal Commission on Aboriginal People*, 1997.
- Burtless, Gary. "When Work Doesn't Work, Employment Programs for Welfare Recipients." *The Brookings Review*. (Spring 1992) pp. 27-29.
- Burtless, Gary and Larry Orr. "Are Classical Experiments Needed for Manpower Training?" *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 21 (1986) pp. 605-639.
- Canabal, Maria. "Native Americans in Higher Education." *College Student Journal*. Vol. 29 (December 1995) pp. 455-459.
- Canada — Government. *The Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy*. 1989.
- Canada Mortgage and Housing. *Annual Report 1996*. published 1997.
- Canada Mortgage and Housing. *Housing Internship Initiative for First Nations and Inuit Youth: Proposal Development Guide*. (1997).
- Canadian Social Council on Social Development. *Impact of Social Security Reform Options on Aboriginal People*. (May 1994).
- Caron, Daniel J. and Terry Hunt. Evaluation Directorate, Departmental Audit and Evaluation Branch, Corporate Services, Department of Indian and Northern Affairs Canada. *Socio-Economic Indicators in Indian Reserves and Comparable Communities*. (June 1995).
- Caron, D. J. and Sharman Glynn. Evaluation Directorate, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada. *Social Development Expenditure Forecast*. (June 1989).
- Card, David and Phillip Robins. *Do Financial Incentives Encourage Welfare Recipients to Work? Initial 18-Month Findings from the Self-Sufficiency Project*. Social Research and Demonstration Corporation: February 1996.

Copet, Wayne. "An Approach to Community Planning in Aboriginal Settlements." *Canadian Journal of Native Studies*. Vol. 12 (1992) pp. 37-50.

Cornell, Stephen. "Accountability, Legitimacy, and the Foundations of Native Self-Governance." Paper prepared for the Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development. November 1992.

Cornell, Stephen. "Assessing Economic Development in Indian Country: The Role of Self-Governance." Paper presented at the Alaska Native Law Conference. October 21, 1997.

Cornell, Stephen and Joseph Kalt. "Pathways from Poverty: Economic Development and Institution-Building on American Indian Reservations." *American Indian Culture and Research Journal*. Vol. 14 (1990) pp. 89-125.

Cornell, Stephen and Joseph Kalt. *WHAT CAN TRIBES DO? Strategies and Institutions in American Indian Economic Development*. University of California: American Indian Studies Center, 1992.

Cornell, Stephen and Joseph P. Kalt. *WHAT CAN TRIBES DO? Strategies and Institutions in American Indian Economic Development*. University of California: American Indian Studies Center, 1998.

Cornell, Stephen and Joseph Kalt. "Where Does Economic Development Really Come From? Constitutional Rule Among the Contemporary Sioux and Apache." *Economic Inquiry*. Vol. 33 (July 1995) pp. 402-426.

Council for the Advancement of Native Development Officers. *Education and Training for Economic Development*. (March 1994).

Courant, Paul. "How Would You Know a Good Economic Development Policy if You Tripped Over One? Hint: Don't Just Count Jobs." *National Tax Journal*. (December 1994) pp. 863-881.

Courchene, T.J. "A Market Perspective on Regional Disparities." *Canadian Public Policy — Analyse de Politiques*. (Autumn, 7:4) pp. 506-518.

Cragg, Michael Ian. *Performance Incentives in Government Subcontracting: Evidence from the Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA)*. (July 3, 1995).

Davidson, Carl and Stephen Woodbury. "Wage-Rate Subsidies for Dislocated Workers." *Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper* 94-28. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, January 1995.

Decker, Paul and Christopher J.O. O’Leary. “Evaluating Pooled Evidence from the Reemployment Bonus Experiments.” *Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper* 94-28. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1994.

Defining a Mid-Term Plan of Action on Community Economic Development. Final Report prepared by New Economy Development Group for National Welfare Grants. Health and Welfare Canada, March 31, 1992.

Deloria, Vine Jr. “The Lummi Indian Community: The Fishermen of the Pacific West.” In S. Stanley, *American Indian Economic Development*. Paris: Mouton Publishers, 1978.

Deller, Steven. *Entrepreneurial Rural Communities: 1993 Governor’s Conference on Community Development* — Keynote Address. 1993.

Departmental Statistics, Information Quality and Research Directorate, Information Management Branch, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada. *Aboriginal Labour Force Characteristics from the 1991 Census: Counts and Rates for Canada, Provinces and Territories*. (November 1995).

Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development Legislation Branch, Research and Analysis Directorate. *Selected Population, Employment and Income Statistics on Aboriginal Youth*. (May 1996).

Department of Labor. *Employment and Training Administration Job Training Act Summary*. Federal Register. Vol. 62, Thursday, May 29, 1997 USA.

Development Resource Guide for American Indian Tribes. 1997.

Devine, Theresa and James Heckman. “The Economics of Eligibility Rules for a Social Program: A Study of the Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA) — a summary report.” *Canadian Journal of Economics*. Vol. 29 (April 1996) S99-S104.

Eberts, Randall. *Urban Labor Markets*. Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper 95-32. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, June 6, 1994.

Economic Council of Canada. *From the Bottom Up, The Community Economic-Development Approach*. 1990.

Edin, Kathryn and Laura Lein. “Work, Welfare, and Single Mothers’ Economic Survival Strategies.” *American Sociological Review*. Vol. 61 (February 1996) pp. 253-266.

Elias, Peter Douglas. “Worklessness and Social Pathologies in Aboriginal Communities.” *Human Organization*. Vol. 55 (Spring 1996) pp. 13-24.

Employment and Immigration Canada. *Pathways to Success: Aboriginal Employment and Training Strategy, A Policy and Implementation Paper*. (November 1990).

Employment and Immigration Canada. *Pathways to Success: Aboriginal Employment and Training Strategy, A Background Paper*. (November 1990).

Evaluating Job Training Programs in the United States: Evidence and Explanations. Report from the National Center for Research in Vocational Education. Supported by the Office of Vocational and Adult Education, U.S. Department of Education.

Evans, Patricia. "From Welfare to the Social Contract: Implications for Canada of Recent U.S. Welfare Reforms." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 19 (1993) pp. 54-67.

Faini, Ricardo and Fabio Schiantarelli. "Incentives and Investment Decisions: The Effectiveness of Regional Policy." *Oxford Economic Papers*. Vol. 39 (1987) pp. 516-533.

Fainstein, Susan and Norman Fainstein. "A Proposal for Urban Policy in the 1990s." *Urban Affairs Review*. Vol. 30, (May 1995) pp. 630-634.

Final Report of the Working Group on Native Education, Training and Employment. Prepared for the Minister of Career Development and Employment, Government of Alberta, 1987.

Fischer, Manfred and Nijkamp. "The Role of Small Firms for Regional Revitalization." *Annals of Regional Science*. Vol. 22 (1988) pp. 28-42.

Fishlow, Albert. "Review of Handbook of Development Economics." *Journal of Economic Literature*. (December 1991) pp. 1728-1737.

Foley, Paul. "Local Economic Policy and Job Creation: A Review of Evaluation Studies." *Urban Studies*. Vol. 29, (May 1992) pp. 557-598.

Fraker, Thomas and Rebecca Maynard. "The Adequacy of Comparison Group Designs for Evaluations of Employment-Related Programs." *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 22 (Spring 1982) pp. 194-227.

Friedlander, Daniel et al. "Evaluating Government Training Programs for the Economically Disadvantaged." *Journal of Economic Literature*. Vol. 35 (December 1997) pp. 1809-1855.

Gardner, Peter. "Aboriginal Community Incomes and Migration in the N.W.T.: Policy Issues and Alternatives." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 20 (September 1994) pp. 297-317.

George, Peter and Peter Kuhn. "The Size and Structure of Native-White Wage Differentials in Canada." *Canadian Journal of Economics*. Vol. 27 (February 1994) pp. 20-42.

Giloth, Robert. *Jobs and Economic Development: Strategies and Practice*. Sage Publications, 1998.

Ginger Group Consultants. *New Approaches to Aboriginal Programs: Shifting Focus From Individual Status Indians To First Nations As Collectives*. (January 1995).

Gittell, Ross. "Managing the Development Process: Community Strategies in Economic Revitalization." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*. Vol. 9 (1990) pp. 507-531.

Gramlich, Edward. "Infrastructure Investment: A Review Essay." *Journal of Economic Literature*. Vol. 32 (September 1994) pp. 1176-1196.

Gregory, R. and A.E. Daly. "Welfare and Economic Progress of Indigenous Men of Australia and the United States, 1980-1990." *Economic Record*. (June 1997) pp. 101-119.

Greenberg, David. "The Leisure Bias in Cost-benefit Analyses of Employment and Training Programs." *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 32 (Spring 1997) pp. 413-439.

Grubb, Norton W. *Evaluating Job Training Programs in the United States: Evidence and Explanations*. National Centre for Research in Vocational Education, MDS-1047, May 1995 (<http://vocserve.berkeley.edu/MDS-1047>).

Gueron, Judith. "Welfare-to-Work Programs: Lessons on Recent State Initiatives." *Policy Studies Review*. Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 733-743.

Gueron, Judith. "Work and Welfare: Lessons on Employment Programs." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. (Winter 1990) pp. 79-98.

Hansen, J. *Preparing for the Workplace: Charting a Course for Federal Post-secondary Training Policy*. Washington, DC: National Academy Press, 1994.

Harrison, Bennett and Marcus Weiss. *Workforce Development Networks: Community-Based Organizations and Regional Alliances*. Sage Publications, February 1998.

Health Canada Medical Services Branch. *Aboriginal Head Start on Reserve*.

Heckman, J. "What Should Our Human Investment Policy Be?" in Mangum, G. and S. Mangum (eds) *Of Heart and Mind: Essays in Honor of Sar A. Levitan*. Kalamazoo, Michigan, W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1996.

Heckman, James and Joseph Hotz. "Choosing Among Alternative Non-experimental Methods for Estimating the Impact of Social Programs: The Case of Manpower Training." *Journal of American Statistical Association*. (December 1989) pp. 862-874.

Heckman, James and Richard Robb. "Alternative Methods for Evaluating the Impact of Interventions." *Journal of Econometrics*. Vol. 30 (1985) pp. 239-267.

Hollenback, Kevin. "A Framework for Assessing the Economic Benefits and Costs of Workplace Literacy Training." Paper presented at "Workplace Learning: The Strategic Advantage Conference" in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, April 29, 1996.

Hollinsworth, David. "Community Development in Indigenous Australia: Self-Determination or Indirect Rule?" *Community Development Journal*. Vol. 31 (April 1996) pp. 114-125.

Hollis, Aidan and Arthur Sweetman. *Complementarity, Competition, and Institutional Development: The Irish Loan Funds through Three Centuries*. (March 1997).

Howland, Marie. *Plant Closings and Worker Displacement: The Regional Issues*. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1988.

Hughes, J.T. "Evaluation of Local Economic Development: A Challenge for Policy Research." *Urban Studies*. Vol. 28 (1991) pp. 909-918.

Hujer and March Wellner. *Estimating the Effect of Training on Unemployment Duration in West Germany*. Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University, Frankfurt am Main.

Hunter, John. *The Employment Challenge, Federal Employment Policies and Programs, 1900-1990*. Ottawa: Public Affairs Canada, 1993.

Indian Affairs and Northern Development. *Multiple Regression Analysis of the Relationship Between Economic Development and Social Assistance Expenditures*. (October 1991).

Indian Employment, Training and Related Services Demonstration Act of 1992. USA.

Indian and Northern Affairs Canada. *Annotated Bibliography: First Nations Social Assistance*. (April 1996).

Information Quality and Research Directorate Issue. "How Do Aboriginal and Non-Aboriginal Living Conditions Compare?" No. 6, July-August 1995.

Isserman, Andrew. "State Economic Development Policy and Practice in the United States: A Survey Article." *International Regional Science Review*. Vol. 16 (1994) pp. 49-100.

Jackson, John and Gretchen Rodkey. "The Attitudinal Climate for Entrepreneurial Activity." *Public Opinion Quarterly*. Vol. 58, pp. 358-380.

Jensen, J. Martin. "Economic Motives for Social Programs: The Federal Direction." *Policy Studies Review*. Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 705-721.

Jones, F.L. "Unlucky Australians: Labour Market Outcomes Among Aboriginal Australians." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. Vol. 16 (July 1993) pp. 420-458.

Kimmel, Jean. *Child Care and the Employment Behavior of Single and Married Mothers*. Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper 93-14. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, November 1992.

Kimmel, Jean. *Reducing the Welfare Dependence of Single-Mother Families: Health-Related Employment Barriers and Policy Responses*. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, March 1996.

Kozdrycki, Yolanda. "Training Programs for Displaced Workers: What Do They Accomplish?" *New England Economic Review*. (May/June 1997).

Lafer, George. "The Politics of Job Training: Urban Poverty and the False Promise of JTPA." *Politics and Society*. Vol. 22 (September 1994) pp. 349-388.

Lalonde, Robert. "Evaluating the Econometric Evaluations of Training Programs with Experimental Data." *American Economic Review*. Vol. 76. (September 1986) pp. 604-620.

Lalonde, Robert. "The Promise of Public-Sector Sponsored Training Programs." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. Vol. 9 (Spring 1995) pp. 149-168.

Leigh, Duane. *Does Training Work for Displaced Workers: A Survey of Existing Evidence*. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1990.

Lenzi, Raymond. "The Entrepreneurial Community Approach to Community Economic Development." *Economic Development Review*. Vol. 14 (Spring 1996) pp. 16-20.

Levitan Sar A. and Frank Gallo. *A Second Choice Training for Jobs*. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1988.

Lewis, Mike and Frank Green. *Strategic Planning for the Community Economic Development Practitioner*. Vancouver: Westcoast Development Group, 1992.

Lewis, Mike and William J. Hatton. *Aboriginal Joint Ventures Negotiating Successful Partnerships*. 1992.

Linking Community Resources to Family Survival Strategies, paper of the Centre for Community Economic Development, University of Wisconsin Staff paper 96.6. Paper was originally presented at the 1996 Annual Meeting of the Community Development Society, July 19-22, 1996, Melbourne Australia.

Lockhart, Alexander and Don McCaskill. "Towards an Integrated, Community-based Partnership Model of Native Development and Training: A Case Study in Process." *Canadian Journal of Native Studies*. Vol. 6 (1986) pp. 159-172.

Lowe, Graham and Harvey Krahn. "Job-Related Education and Training Among Younger Workers." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 21 (1995) pp. 362-378.

McDonald, Josephine. *The Four Winds Child Care Centre: Conne River, Newfoundland Miawpukek Band*. Conne River Health & Social Services.

McGee, Harley. *Getting it Right: Regional Development in Canada*. Montreal: McGill Queens University Press, December 1992.

McKee, Daryl, Milan Wall and Vicki Luther. "Community Culture and Marketing Strategy as Sources of Economic Development Competitive Advantage: A Study among U.S. Communities." *Journal of Macromarketing*. Vol. 17 (Spring 1997) pp. 68-87.

Maller, Charles et al. *Evaluation of the Economic Impacts of the Job Corps Program: Third Follow-Up Report*. Mathematica Policy Inc., 1992.

Manitoba Industry, Trade and Tourism. *Ota-Miska (Where to find it Resource Manual)*. 1997.

Mawson, J. "Training as an Instrument of Regional Policy: The New Panacea." *Regional Studies*. Vol. 9 (Fall 1990) pp. 357-363.

Matthews, Ralph. "Two Alternative Explanations of the Problem of Regional Dependency in Canada." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 7 (1981) pp. 268-283.

Mead, Lawrence. "Optimizing JOBS: Evaluation versus Administration." *Public Administration Review*. Vol. 57, (March/April 1997) pp. 113-123.

Melvin, James. "Regional Inequalities in Canada: Underlying Causes and Policy Implications." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 13 (1987) pp. 304-317.

Moffitt, Robert. "Symposium on the Econometric Evaluation of Manpower Training Programs." *The Journal of Human Resources*. Vol. 22 (1987) pp. 148-155.

Moffitt, Robert. "The Effect of Employment and Training Programs on Entry and Exit from the Welfare Caseload." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*. Vol. 15 (1996) pp. 32-50.

Munns, Joyce Matthews. "Implementing an Employment and Training Program for Food Stamp Recipients: Dilemmas and Choices." *Policy Studies Review*. Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 744-769.

Norecan Ltd. *Canada-NWT EDA Evaluation Literature Review*. October 1995.

Nuckols, Dan. "Public/Private Partnerships as Implementing Strategy: The Job Training Partnership Act." *Journal of Economic Issues*. Vol. 24 (June 1990) pp. 645-651.

O'Neill, Dave and June Ellenoff O'Neill. *Lessons for Welfare Reform: An Analysis of the AFDC Caseload and Welfare-to-Work Programs*. Kalamazoo, Michigan: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1995.

Osborne, David and Ted Gaebler. *Reinventing Government: How the Entrepreneurial Spirit is Transforming the Public Sector*. Addison Wesley. Reading MA. 1992.

Palmer, John. "Employment and Training Policy: The Evolution of a Federal Role." *Policy Studies Review*. Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 685-693.

Park, Norm and Bob Power, et al. "An Assessment of the Impact of Government-Sponsored Training." *Canadian Journal of Economics*. Vol. 29 (April 1996) S93-S98.

Pauktuutit Inuit Women's Association. *Inuit Child Care Program in Nunavut 1997-1998*. January 1998.

Perry, Stewart. *Rebuilding Local Economies in the United States and Canada*. New York: State University of New York, 1987.

Peterson, Mark. "The Total Development Paradigm — Community, Economic and Industrial Development for the 21st Century." Excerpts from a report to the Lower Mississippi Delta Commission, March 1990.

Peterson, Paul. "Evaluating Employment and Training Programs: Some Thoughts on the Lessons Learned." *Policy Studies Review*. Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 771-781.

Pines, Marion. "Federal Employment and Training Policy: A View From the Local Level of Government." *Policy Studies Review*. Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 782-788.

Prairie Research Associates Inc. *Catalogue of Income Security Programs at the Provincial, Territorial and Federal Level*. May 1997.

Prairie Research Associates Inc. *Housing and Social Assistance: A Methodology Report*. September 12, 1994.

Promotion of Cooperation Amongst Research and Development Organizations in the Field of Vocational Training: Working Papers 11 and 12.

Programme of Research and Actions on the Development of the Labour Market: Local Employment Initiatives: An Evaluation of Support Agencies. Washington, DC: European Community Information Service, 1986.

Psacharopoulos, George. "From Manpower Planning to Labour Market Analysis." *International Labour Review*. Vol. 30 (1991) pp. 459-474.

Rees, Albert. "An Essay on Youth Joblessness." *Journal of Economic Literature*. Vol. 24 (June 1986) pp. 613-628.

Regional Development and Vocational Training: Development of Human Resources in Regions of Economic Reconversion Benefitting from Community Financial. Washington, DC: European Community Information Service, June 1987.

Rietveld, Piet. "Infrastructure and Regional Development: A Survey of Multiregional Economic Models." *The Annals of Regional Science*. Vol. 23 (1989) pp. 255-274.

Rosenbaum, Allan. "Employment and Training Policy and American Political Ideas: Old Problems and Emerging Problems." *Policy Studies Review*, Vol. 6 (May 1987) pp. 695-704.

Ross, David. *From the Roots up: Economic Development As If Community Mattered*. Toronto: J. Lorimer & Co., 1986.

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples. *People to people: Nation to nation*. April 1997.

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples Final Report — Economic Development section (on paper and on computer file) 1996.

Ruffing, Lorraine Turner. "Navajo Economic Development: A Dual Perspective." *American Indian Economic Development*. Edited by S. Stanley. Paris: Mouton Publishers, 1978.

Salisbury, Richard. *A Homeland for Cree: Regional Development in James Bay 1971-1981*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, November 1986.

Saskatchewan Education, Training and Employment, Strategic Planning Services Branch. *Regional Training Needs Assessment: Provincial Summary Report*. October 1995.

Savoie, Donald. *The North and the Federal Government: The Next Step*. 1990.

Savoie, Donald. *Regional Economic Development: Canada's Search for Solutions*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, February 1992.

Savoie, Donald. "The Toppling of DREE and Prospects for Regional Economic Development." *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 10 (1984) pp. 328-337.

Sawhill, Isabel. "Poverty in the United States: Why is It So Persistent?" *Journal of Economic Literature*. Vol. 26 (September 1988) pp. 1073-1119.

Schauble, Paul et al. "Cost Effectiveness of Internship Training Programs: Clinical Service Delivery Through Training." *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*. Vol. 20 (1989) pp. 17-22.

Securing Our Future Together, *Expanding Opportunity for Aboriginal Peoples*, pp. 78-83.

Sheak, Robert and Warren Hayden. "Real Welfare Reform Requires Jobs: Lessons from a Progressive Welfare Agency." *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*. Vol. 23 (1996) pp. 91-111.

Shragge, Eric. *Community Economic Development: In Search of Empowerment*. Montreal: Black Rose Books Ltd., June 1, 1997.

Snipp, Matthew. "Public Policy Impacts on American Indian Economic Development." *Contemporary Sociology*. Vol.19 (1990) pp. 100-102.

Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. *Creating an Alternative to Welfare: First Year Findings on the Implementation, Welfare Impacts, and Costs of the Self-Sufficiency Project*. December 1995.

Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. *How Important are "Entry Effects" in Financial Incentive Programs for Welfare Recipients, Experimental Evidence from the Self-Sufficiency Project*. August 1997.

Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. *Implementing the Earnings Supplement Project: A Test of Re-Employment Incentive*. October 1997.

Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. *The Struggle for Self-Sufficiency: Participants in the Self-Sufficiency Project Talk about Work, Welfare, and their Futures*. December 1995.

Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. *When Work Pays Better than Welfare: A Summary of the Self-Sufficiency Project's Implementation, Focus Group and Initial 18-Month Impact Reports*. March 1996.

Stanley, Sam. *American Indian Economic Development*. Paris: Mouton Publishers, 1978.

Stecher, Brian. *Improving Perkins II Performance Measures and Standard: Lessons Learned from Early Implementers in Four States*. A NCRVE Study, 1994.

Steidlemeier, Paul. "The Business Community and the Poor: Rethinking Business Strategies and Social Policy." *American Journal of Economics and Sociology*. Vol. 52 (April 1993) pp. 209-221.

TAP — Training for Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders Programme. CES Manual. Australia.

Taylor, J. "Measuring the Occupational Segregation of Australia's Indigenous Workforce: A Census-Based Analysis." *Social Indicators Research*. Vol. 31 (1994) pp. 175-204.

Teitz, Michael. "Changes in Economic Development Theory and Practice." *International Regional Science Review*. Vol. 16 (1994) pp. 101-106.

Trainor, C.W. Jefferson. "Public Sector Employment in Regional Development." *Environment and Planning A*. Vol. 25 (1993) pp. 1319-1338.

Toner, Phillip. "Public Sector and Private Sector Employment Programs as Competing Solutions to Unemployment." *Australian Journal of Social Issues*. Vol. 20, (1985) pp. 56-71.

Turcotte, Yves. *Educators in Native Childcare Services — JEE.03*. Collegial Attestation Studies Program.

United States General Account Office (GOA). *Job Training Partnership Act: Long-Term Earnings and Employment Outcomes*. Washington, D.C., 1996.

United States General Accounting Office (GOA). *Multiple Employment Training Programs: Most Federal Agencies Do not Know If Their Programs are Working Effectively*. Report to the Ranking Minority Member, Committee on Labour and Human Resources, U.S. Senate, March 1994.

Urquiola, Migel. *School to Work, College and Career: A Review of Policy, Practice and Results 1993-1997*. Report from the National Center for Research in Vocational Education, 1997.

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. *Indicators of Welfare Dependence and Well-being — Interim Report to Congress*. October 1996.

Van Buijen, Shirley. *Programme of Research and Actions on the Development of the Labour Market: The Quantitative Significance of the Emergence of Local Initiatives*. Washington, DC: European Community Information Service, 1986.

Ward, Carol. "What Can Tribes Do? Strategies and Institutions in American Indian Economic Development." *Contemporary Sociology*. Vol. 23 (1994) pp. 451-452.

Wilson, Patricia. "Empowerment: Community Economic Development from the Inside Out." *Urban Studies*. Vol. 33 (1996) pp. 617-630.

Woodward, Robert. "Effective Location Subsidies: An Evaluation of DREE Industrial Incentives." *Canadian Journal of Economics*. (August 1974) pp. 501-510.

Woodward, Robert. "The Capital Bias of DREE Incentives." *Canadian Journal of Economics*. (May 1974) pp. 161-173.

Work-Related Programs for Welfare Recipients. Report of the United States, Congressional Budget Office, April 1987.

Young, Douglas, Minister of Human Resources Development, 1996. *Federal and Provincial Support to Post-Secondary Education in Canada: A Report to Parliament 1994-95*.

Zaslow, Martha et al. "The Family Support Act and Children: Potential Pathways of Influence." *Children and Youth Services Review*. Vol. 17 (1995) pp. 231-249.

Evaluation Reports

Aboriginal CAEDS Assessment Project, February 1994. *An Aboriginal Community Perspective of the Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy Executive Summary.*

Abt Associates of Canada, December 1989. *Systematic Approach for Evaluation Economic Development Programs.*

Allen, Don R. & Associates Consultants Ltd., March 1994. *Case Studies of Results-Oriented First Nations Organizations.*

Anishinaabe Translation Services, 1998. *NAN-RBA Mid-term Review: Final Report.*

ARA Consulting Group Inc., February 1994. *Aboriginal Economic Development Agencies, Structuring An Agency For Program Delivery: Lessons Learned From The SDI Experience.*

Auditor General of Canada. *Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy, Chapter 11, Fall 1994.*

Auditor General of Canada. *Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, Social Assistance, Chapter 23, 1994.*

Auditor General of Canada. *Human Resources Development Canada, Support for Training, Chapter 22, 1995.*

Baseline Measures Workgroup Final Report, prepared for American Indian and Alaska Native People and the Indian Health Service, September 1996.

Boudreault, Karl, Anna Sicoli and ABT Associates. Departmental Audit and Evaluation Branch, Indian Affairs and Northern Development, October 1994. *The Evaluation of DIAND's Components of The Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS).*

Canada East-West Centre Ltd., October 1987. *A Literature Survey and Evaluation Synthesis of Publicly Funded Employment Services: Final Report.*

Canada Mortgage and Housing, Program Evaluation Division, May 1987. *Evaluation of CMHC On-Reserve Housing Programs.*

Canada Mortgage and Housing, Program Evaluation Division, February 1992. *Evaluation of the Rural and Native Housing Programs: The Rural and Native Housing Programs Evaluation Report-Main Report.*

Caron, Daniel J. Evaluation Directorate, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, April 1988. *Evaluation Report for the Youth Entrepreneurship Program.*

Caron, Daniel J. and Terry Hunt. Evaluation Directorate, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, January 1992. *Evaluation Report of the Entrepreneurship Initiative Program.*

Common Knowledge Social Research Inc., April 1996. *New Careers Corporation Program Evaluation Phase 1: Operational Study: Background Report #1 & #2.*

Common Knowledge Social Research Inc. & Prairie Research Associates Inc., March 29, 1996. *A Framework for the Evaluation of the Joint Planning Arrangements, Co-Location Projects and Strategic Initiatives.*

Curley, Austin & Associates, March 31, 1993. *Evaluation Report Northern Native Broadcast Access Program.* Prepared for Program Evaluation Directorate, Department of the Secretary of State.

Department of Indian & Northern Affairs, February 1978. *Evaluation Report on Summer Employment Programs for Indian Youth (1977).*

Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 1997. *Gathering Strength — Canada's Aboriginal Action Plan.*

Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Departmental Audit and Evaluation Branch, June 1996. *Financial Audit of Indian Economic Development Fund, Loan Guarantee Program-Year Ended March 31, 1995.*

Department of Supply and Services, July 1982. *Five Year Plan and Strategy for the Evaluation of the Economic Development Activity in Indian and Northern Affairs.*

Desautels, Denis L. and Auditor General of Canada. FCA, November 1993. *1993 Audit of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism, NWT Development Corporation, and NWT Business Credit Corporation.*

Discussion Paper Developing a Framework for the Ongoing Operations of the First Nations and Inuit Child Care Initiative, 1998.

DPA Consulting Group for the Program Evaluation Branch, Employment and Immigration Canada, June 1982. *Local Economic Development Assistance Program, Interim Evaluation.*

DPA Group Inc., June 24, 1986. *Evaluation of IBDS Indian Business Development Services Ltd. and Indian Equity Foundation — Final Report (vol. I).*

DPA Group Inc., June 1985. *Program Evaluation of the Indian Economic Development Fund.*

Ekos Research Associates Inc., February 1987. *Evaluation Study of the Indian Community Human Resource Strategies Program.*

Ekos Research Associates Inc., November 1994. *Evaluation of the Departmental Data for the Post-Secondary Education Support Programs. (Revised Final Report).*

Employment and Immigration Canada, June 1992. *Canadian Jobs Strategy Evaluation Outcomes: Lessons Learned.*

Employment and Immigration Canada, April 1994. *Evaluation of Employability Initiatives for Social Assistance Recipients (SARS) in CJS.*

Employment and Immigration Canada, January 1994. *Inventory of Program Evaluation Findings.*

Environment Canada, Review Branch, December 1996. *Evaluation of the 1996 Student Employment Program.*

Evaluation and Data Development Branch, Strategic Policy, Human Resources Development Canada, January 1998. *Student Loans Research — Lessons Learned from Past Experience.*

Evaluation Directorate, Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, July 1987. *Economic Development Program Description.*

Evaluation of the Local Employment Assistance and Development (LEAD) Program, November 1986 (summary).

Gardner, Leslie & Associates, January 29, 1993. *Walking the Talk: Implementation Evaluation of the Canada-Yukon Funding Agreement on the Development and Enhancement of Aboriginal Language.*

Gardner, Leslie & Associates, August 13, 1997. *We Are Our Language — An Evaluation of the Implementation and Impact of the Canada-Yukon Cooperation and Funding Agreement on the Development and Enhancement of Aboriginal Languages.*

Gladue and Associates, 1998. *Mid-term Review of the MNO Regional Bilateral Agreements.*

Goss Gilroy Inc., June 1993. *Financial Performance and Employment Creation Relating to Firms Assisted by ABDP.*

Goss Gilroy Inc., June 1993. *Financial Performance and Employment Creation Relating to Firms Assisted by ABDP — Appendices.*

Goss, Gilroy Inc., January 1994. *Economic Impacts of Aboriginal Businesses: A Preliminary Analysis*.

Goss Gilroy Inc., June 1995. *A Profile of Clients of Aboriginal Business Canada*.

Goss Gilroy Inc., November 28, 1996. *Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS) — Industry Canada Components Evaluation Study*.

Goss Gilroy Inc., Management Consultants, May 1996. *Summary Report for the Evaluation of the Canada-GNWT Economic Development Agreement (EDA)*.

Goss Gilroy Inc., August 8, 1997. *Economic Impacts of Aboriginal Businesses in Rural and Remote Locations*.

Government of Canada. Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy. *Status Report*, March 1991.

Government of Canada. Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy. *Status Report, National Highlights*.

Graham, Katherine A., May 1984. *A Strategy for Evaluation of the Northern Economic Development Component of the Northern Affairs Program*. Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development.

Group of the Council on Rural Development, September 1993. *Evaluation of the Effects of Employment Creation Measures in Rural Areas*.

Groupe Développement Économique, 1998. *Mid-term Evaluation of the Canada — Kativak Regional Authority Regional Bilateral Agreement*.

Harvey, Ted Adam and Don McCaskill, January 1988. *Evaluation of the Native Friendship Centre Program: Final Report*, prepared for Program Evaluation, Department of the Secretary of State.

Hickling-Partners Inc., March 1983. *An Evaluation Study of the Band Training Program Indian and Inuit Affairs Program DIAND*.

Hill, Jamie, October 1997. *Evaluation Framework: Sharing Innovation: A Coordinated Approach to Knowledge Development and Service Delivery*.

Human Resources Development Canada, October 1997. *Disability Policies and Programs: Lessons Learned — Final Report*.

Human Resources Development Canada, June 1997. *Effectiveness of Employment-Related Programs for Youth: Lessons Learned from Past Experience: Final Report*.

Human Resources Development Canada, November 1997. *Evaluation Brief: Summer Career Placements Program.*

Human Resources Development Canada, March 1994. *Evaluation of the Canada/Newfoundland Youth Strategy.*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund (Overview Report).*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund, Technical Report No. 1: Analysis of Administrative Data.*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund, Technical Report No. 2: Literature Review.*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund, Technical Report No. 3: Key Informant Interviews.*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund, Technical Report No. 4: Peer Reviews.*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund, Technical Report No. 5: Survey of Project Sponsors.*

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1995. *Evaluation of the Child Care Initiatives Fund, Technical Report No. 6: Case Studies.*

Human Resources Development Canada, June 1994. *Evaluation of the Cooperative Education Option.*

Human Resources Development Canada. *Evaluation of the Employability Improvement Program. Obtained from the Internet.*

Human Resources Development Canada, November 1990. *Evaluation of the Community Futures Program, Survey of Clients, Participants, Facilitators, and Managers: Final Report.*

Human Resources Development Canada, November 1997. *Evaluation of the Summer Career Placements (SCP) Program.*

Human Resources Development Canada, January 20, 1998. *Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs.*

Human Resources Development Canada, July 1996. *A Review of Programs for Integrating Social Assistance Recipients into the Workforce.*

Human Resources Development Canada, February 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-1, Student Work and Service Program (Newfoundland and Labrador)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, November 1995. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-5, Investing in People (Northwest Territories)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, June 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-6, Integrated Training Centres for Youth (Alberta)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, March 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-8, Strategic Employment Opportunities (Newfoundland/Labrador)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, March 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-9, Graduate/Employment/Self-Employment (Newfoundland/Labrador)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, October 1995. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-11, Nova Scotia COMPASS (Nova Scotia)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1997. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-12, Improved Access to Child Care Supported Child Care Transition Project (British Columbia)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, October 1997. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-13, Improved Access to Child Care One-Stop Access Centres/Regional Delivery Models (British Columbia)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-14, Ontario JobLink Resource Centres (Ontario)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, November 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-15, New Brunswick Job Corps (New Brunswick)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, May 1997. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-16, Assessment, Counseling, and Referral (British Columbia)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, September 1997. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-17, Labour Market Information (British Columbia)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, March 1997. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-18, Community Skills Centres (British Columbia)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, December 1996. *Strategic Initiative Evaluation SI-19, Investing in People Year 2 (Northwest Territories)*.

Human Resources Development Canada, January 1998. *Western Aboriginal Development Alliance Strategic Initiative: Formative Evaluation — Final Report*.

Investing in the Children's Future: An Evaluation of the First Nations/Inuit Child Care Initiative — Summary of Key Findings.

Indian and Inuit Affairs Program, September 7, 1981. *Sectoral Programs and Economic Development Institutions: An Overview.*

Indian Affairs and Northern Development, October 1996. *Overview of DAEB Evaluation Studies of DIAND Funding Arrangements.*

Institute for Human Resources Development, Terence Hickey & Associates, Goss Gilroy Inc., February 16, 1998. *Mid-Term Review of the Regional Bilateral Agreement Between Human Resources Development & The Federation of Newfoundland Indians.*

Institute for Human Resource Development, Terence Hickey & Associates, Goss Gilroy Inc., February 16, 1998. *Mid-Term Review of the Regional Bilateral Agreement Between Human Resources Development Canada & The Miawpukek First Nation.*

Jacobs, Mel W., Campbell Research Associates, Kelly & Associates, Smith & Associates. January 1998. *Evaluation of Anishinabee Social Services Reform Pilot Project. Mid-Term Report.*

JAG & Associates, April 1997. *Management Model for the Evaluation of the "Challenge to Change" Project.*

Kativik Regional Government. *Report from Nunavik Concerning the First Nations/Inuit Child Care Initiatives.*

Kelly, Doug & Jim Morrison, 1997. A Story of "One Window" in B.C., Pathways to Success: "Toward a Trained Aboriginal Workforce." Federal Native Employment Strategy.

Létourneau, Claude, February 21, 1997. *The Strategic Initiatives Mid-Term Review Final Report.*

Lougheed and Associates, September 1986. *Report on the Native Communications Program and the Northern Native Broadcast Access Program*, prepared for Program Evaluation Directorate, Department of the Secretary of State.

Lummi Nation Self-Governance Communication and Education Project, 1995. *Self-Governance: A New Partnership.*

Lutra Associates Ltd. July 1996. *The Richness That Language and Culture Brings: An Impact Study of Canada — NWT Languages Agreements — Final Report*, prepared for the Official Languages Unit, Department of the Executive, Government of the Northwest Territories.

McDavid, J.C. and Associates, February 1996. *Summary Report of the 1991-1996 Canada/Yukon EDA Evaluation.*

Martin Spigelman Research Associates, The Project Group, & Terriplan Consultants, November 1997. *Investing in the Children's Future: An Evaluation of the First Nations/Inuit Child Care Initiative.*

Menominee Consulting Services, Timmins, Ontario, February 1998. *Mamo-Wichi-Hetiwin Employment and Training, Mid-term Review: Final Report.*

Menominee Consulting Services and Aniskinaabe Translation Services, 1998. *Nishnawbe-Aski Nation, Regional Bilateral Accord, Mid-term Review, for Mamo-Wichi-Hetiwin Employment and Training Mushkegowuk Council and Sioux Lookout Area Aboriginal Management Board: Summary report.*

Menominee Consulting Services and McLeod Wood Associates, February 1998. *Mushkegowuk Employment and Training, Mid-term Review: Final Report.*

Nand Tandan Evaluation Services, July 21, 1997. *A Review of Programs for Older Worker Adjustment — Technical Report.*

New Economy Development Group, November 1993. *Evaluation of the Canada-NWT Cooperation Agreement for French and Aboriginal Languages in the NWT — A Literature Review: Maintenance and Revitalization of Aboriginal Languages.*

New Economy Development Group, December 1993. *Evaluation of the Canada-NWT Cooperation Agreement for French and Aboriginal Languages in the NWT — Parts I, II and Appendices.*

New Economy Development Group Inc., November 1997. *Framework for the Evaluation of the ASI Strategy (Final Report)* for the Inuit Tapirisat of Canada and Human Resources Development Canada.

Nichols Applied Management, The Genesis Group, & Nunavut Consulting, December 1996. *Evaluation of the Investing in People Initiative — Year Two.*

Noonan, Anne & Associates, November 1997. *Career Place — A Proposal for Project Evaluation.*

Pathways to Success Structural Review: Stage I: Report and Recommendations, January 14, 1995.

Pathways Structural Review, Stage II: Strategic Directions, Options for Consideration, March 30, 1995.

Peat Marwick Partners, May 1984. *Evaluation of the Local Employment Assistance Program (LEAP) Report, Volume 1.*

Peters Coolican Associates, Onchiota Inc., & Nordicity Group, February 1986. *A Review of Aboriginal Representative Funding*, prepared for The Ministers, The Secretary of State, and Indian and Northern Affairs Canada.

Pommen and Associates Limited, February 1998. *Evaluation Regional Bilateral Agreements in Alberta — Formative Report*.

Prairie Research Associates Inc. March 9, 1994. *The Evaluation of the Canadian Aboriginal Economic Development Strategy (CAEDS): Case Study for Meadow Lake Tribal Council*.

Prairie Research Associates Inc., June 2, 1995. *Comparison of DIAND and Provincial Social Assistance Benefits in Manitoba: Phase 3 — Estimates of Benefit Gaps and Deficiencies*.

Prairie Research Associates Inc. October 1997. *Interim Evaluation of the DIAND Youth Strategy: Final Report*.

Prairie Research Associates Inc., December 9, 1997. *Taking Charge! Formative Evaluation Report (Phase 1)*.

Prairie Research Associates Inc. February 20, 1998. *Mid-Term Review of the Regional Bilateral Agreement Between Canada and the First Nations of Saskatchewan*.

Program Evaluation Branch, April 1981. *Evaluation of the Community Employment Strategy*.

Program Evaluation Directorate, Secretary of State, September 21, 1984. *Assessment of the Native Representative Organizations Program: Evaluation Report*.

Program Evaluation Directorate, Secretary of State, September 1987. *Evaluation Report Synthesis: Aboriginal Women's Program*.

Regional Bilateral Agreement Mid-Term Review: Final Draft, December 5, 1997.

Savoie, Donald J., March 1993. *Revisiting The Cooperation Program*.

Social Research and Demonstration Corporation, November 1996. *Evaluating the Effectiveness of Employment-Related Programs and Services for Youth*.

Sovereign Nations, *Newsletter of Tribal Self-Governance*, June/July 1996 and several other issues.

Status Report of the First Nation/Inuit Childcare Initiative in the Nine Cree Communities of James Bay Area in Quebec, February 19, 1998.

The Pathways to Success Strategy: A Five Year Report.

Tremblay, Dr. Paulette, November 1997. *Evaluation of the Aboriginal Strategic Initiatives Project of the Assembly of First Nations.*

United States Department of the Interior, FY 1999, Bureau of Indian Affairs. *Budget Justifications and Annual Performance Plan.*

Universalia, March 1994. *Assessment of the Pathways to Success Strategy, Final Report to the National Aboriginal Management Board.*

Urban Social Housing Programs Assessment Report. *Post-1985 Section 95 Urban Native Housing Program.*

vanRaalte, Dixie Lee. February 1998. *Written Report/Assessment — Mawiw ChildCare Initiative Update: FNICCI Meeting.*

Woodrow, Maureen, Evaluation Directorate, Department of Indian and Northern Affairs, February 1987. *Evaluation of the Northern Affairs On-The-Job Training Program.*

Web sites

ABSTUDY: An Investment for Tomorrow's Employment, review of ABSTUDY, prepared by Owen Stanley and Geoff Hansen (Australia)

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/abstudy/preface.htm>

ARTICLE: "From War to Self-Determination: A History of the Bureau of Indian Affairs", article by C.L. Henson

<http://www.americansc.org.uk//indians.htm>

ATSIC homepage (Australia)

<http://www.atsic.gov.au>

ATSIC Corporate Plan (Australia)

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/organis/corpp2.htm>

ATSIC Pathways to Sustained Economic Development

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/programs/pathways.htm>

ATSIC Annual Report 1997

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/ar97/>

— including Chapter 8: Evaluation and Audit of various programs

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/ar97/chapter8.htm>

— including Chapter 4: Economic Programs

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/ar97/chapter4.htm>

Aboriginal Economic Development in Western Australia

A Strategy for Responsive State Government Services and Programs, April 1997

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/>

A Vision for Aboriginal Economic Development

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/vision.html>

Putting the Institutional Mechanisms in Place

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/mechan.html>

Strategies for Aboriginal Economic Development

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/strat.html>

Agencies responsible for assisting Aboriginal Economic Development

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/appendix.html>

Ministerial Forward

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/minister.html>

Statement of Principles

<http://www.wa.gov.au/commerce/aed/principi.html>

Book reviews by Richard L. Schott:

“What can Tribes Do? Strategies and Institutions in American Indian Economic Development”

“American Indian Policy: Self-Governance and Economic Development”

http://www.fsu.edu/~spap/orgs/apsa/vol14_no2/schott.html

Bureau of Indian Affairs — 1995 Annual Report

<http://www.doi.gov/pfm/ar5bia.html>

“Bureau of Indian Affairs Aid to Native Americans

<http://www.dowling.edu/applying/financia/federal/indian.htm>

Bureau of Indian Affairs Mission Statement

<http://www.doi.gov/bia/mission.html>

Bureau of Indian Affairs Strategic Plan

<http://www.doi.gov/bia/plan930.html>

Communities Economic Development Fund (Manitoba)

<http://www.gov.mb.ca/chc/archives/accessguide/cedf/foicedf.html>

Community Economic Development Fund (U.S.)

<http://www.bridgenet.org/sites/cedf/>

Congressional Research Documents on Job Training

Abstract of a paper by Kathryn Anderson, et al. “Reality or Illusion: The importance of Creaming on Job Replacement Rates in Job Training Partnership Act Programs”

<http://www.clark.net/pub/pennyhill/jobtng.html>

Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs (DEETYA, Australia)

<http://www.deet.gov.au/>

“What is the CDEP?” (Australia)

<http://www.atsic.gov.au/programs/cdep/whatis.htm>

“Engendering Community Economic Development” (Canada)

<http://ccn.cs.dal.ca/CommunitySupport/CUSO/engender.html>

Enterprise Development Website: Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise Development in developed and developing countries

<http://www.enterweb.org/>

First Nations Effective Practices: Getting Things Done in Aboriginal Communities, Businesses, and Organizations
<http://www.inac.gc.ca/pubs/fnepi/>

Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development
<http://www.ksg.harvard.edu/hpaied/intro.htm>

Indian Economic Development (USA)
<http://aspe.os.dhhs.gov/96cfda/p15032.htm>

Indian Loans-Economic Development (USA)
<http://ntserver.advance.org/sbc/GOVIND.HTM>

“Infrastructure in a Structural Model of Economic Growth.” Abstract of an article by Douglas Holtz-Eakin and Amy Ellen Schwartz, *Regional Science and Urban Economics*, Vol. 25 (1995) 131-151.
<http://www.elsevier.com/cgi-bin/ca>

“Jobs Evaluation: Child Impact Study”, pgs. 1-16
<http://aspe.os.dhhs.gov/hsp/cyp/jobchdxs.htm>

JOBS Evaluation: Early Findings on Program Impacts in Three Sites
<http://aspe.os.dhhs.gov/hsp/isp/XSIMPACT.HTM>

Job Training (Iowa state)
<http://www.pionet-net/~nwiowa/stormlake/SLADC/train.htm>

“Moving to a Higher Standard: New Directions for Accountability and Program Improvement.” Article by Gary Hoachlander. (Vocational education in the U.S.)
<http://vocserve.berkely.edu/CW84/NewDirections.html>

Nebraska Tribal Development Summit Final Report, 93 & 95 Reports
<http://crd.ded.state.ne.us/>

Northern Territory Government Implementation Report on the Recommendations of the Royal Commission Into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody (RCIADIC) (Australia)
<http://www.nt.gov.au/oad/rciadici.html> *Seattle Indian Center — Employment and Training*

Department (JTPA)
<http://www.brigadoon.com/~seaindn/emplotrn.htm>

Office of Aboriginal Development, Northern Territory Government (Australia)
<http://www.nt.gov.au/ntt/9697bps/bp2/b2ps31.html>

Office of Indian Education Programs (USA)

<http://shaman.umn.edu/oiiep/home.htm>

Tribal Self-Governance Demonstration Program

Planning and Negotiation Cooperative Agreements and IHS Compacts (USA)

<http://aspe.os.dhhs.gov/96cfda/p93210.htm>

Public and Indian Housing Economic Development and Supportive Services (EDSS)

Grants <http://www.tdh.texas.gov/hrs/support/rls/fic/8-16-96b.htm>

Tribal College Education Equity Grants Program — USDA

<http://web.fie.com/htdoc/fed/agr/crs/edu/prog/min/agrpgaag.htm>

United States General Accounting Office, Labour Issues, Report No. GAO/OCG-93-

19TR <http://wiretap.spies.com/Gopher/Gov/GAO-Trans/labor.019>

“U.S. Senators Say Gaming is Critical Tool for Indian Economic Development”

<http://one-web.org/oneida/press-release/gaming212.html>

Western Economic Diversification Canada — Manitoba Community Futures
Development Corporations

<http://data.ctn.nrc.ca/mb/content/type1/org392/div635/division.htm>

Whitman, David. The Key to Welfare Reform. June 1987

<http://www.theatlantic.com/atlantic/atlweb/flashbks/welfare/whitmanf.htm>