Canadian Security Guide Book

2007 EDITION

An Update of Security Problems in Search of Solutions

BORDER CROSSINGS

Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence

March 2007

39th Parliament – 1st Session

STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

The Honourable Colin Kenny, *Chair*The Honourable Norman K. Atkins, *Deputy Chair*

and

The Honourable Tommy Banks

The Honourable Joseph A. Day

The Honourable Wilfred P. Moore

The Honourable Rod A. A. Zimmer

Other Senators who participated during the 39th Parliament – 1st Session:

The Honourable George Baker

The Honourable Janis G. Johnson

The Honourable Michael A. Meighen

The Honourable Grant Mitchell

The Honourable Pierre Claude Nolin

The Honourable Hugh Segal

The Honourable Gerry St. Germain

The Honourable Terry Stratton

The Honourable David Tkachuk

^{*}The Honourable Marjory Lebreton, P.C., (or the Honourable Gerald Comeau)

^{*}The Honourable Céline Hervieux-Payette (or the Honourable Claudette Tardif)

^{*}Ex Officio Members

38th Parliament – 1st Session

STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

The Honourable Colin Kenny, Chair

The Honourable J. Michael Forrestall, Deputy Chair

and

The Honourable Norman K. Atkins

The Honourable Tommy Banks

The Honourable Jane Cordy

The Honourable Joseph A. Day

The Honourable Michael A. Meighen

The Honourable Jim Munson

The Honourable Pierre Claude Nolin

Other Senators who participated during the 38th Parliament – 1st Session:

The Honourable Ione Christensen

The Honourable Anne C. Cools

The Honourable Percy Downe

The Honourable Rose-Marie Losier-Cool

The Honourable John Lynch-Staunton

The Honourable Terry M. Mercer

The Honourable Wilfred P. Moore

The Honourable Donald H. Oliver

The Honourable Gerard A. Phalen

The Honourable William Rompkey

The Honourable Peter A. Stollery

The Honourable David Tkachuk

The Honourable Marilyn Trenholme Counsell

^{*}The Honourable Jack Austin, P.C. (or the Honourable William Rompkey, P.C.)

^{*}The Honourable Noël A. Kinsella (or the Honourable Terry Stratton)

^{*}Ex Officio Members

37th Parliament – 3rd Session

STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

The Honourable Colin Kenny, *Chair*The Honourable J. Michael Forrestall, *Deputy Chair*

and

The Honourable Norman K. Atkins

The Honourable Tommy Banks

The Honourable Jane Cordy

The Honourable Joseph A. Day

The Honourable Michael A. Meighen

The Honourable Jim Munson

The Honourable David P. Smith, P.C.

^{*}The Honourable Jack Austin, P.C. (or the Honourable William Rompkey, P.C.)

^{*}The Honourable John Lynch-Staunton (or the Honourable Noël A. Kinsella)

^{*}Ex Officio Members

37th Parliament – 2nd Session

STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

The Honourable Colin Kenny, *Chair*The Honourable J. Michael Forrestall, *Deputy Chair*

and

The Honourable Norman K. Atkins

The Honourable Tommy Banks

The Honourable Jane Cordy

The Honourable Joseph A. Day

The Honourable Michael A. Meighen

The Honourable David P. Smith, P.C.

The Honourable John (Jack) Wiebe

*The Honourable Sharon Carstairs, P.C. (or the Honourable Fernand Robichaud, P.C.)

*The Honourable John Lynch-Staunton (or the Honourable Noël A. Kinsella)

*Ex Officio Members

37th Parliament – 1st Session

STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

The Honourable Colin Kenny, *Chair*The Honourable J. Michael Forrestall, *Deputy Chair*

and

The Honourable Norman K. Atkins

The Honourable Tommy Banks

The Honourable Jane Cordy

The Honourable Joseph A. Day

The Honourable Laurier L. LaPierre

The Honourable Michael A. Meighen

The Honourable John (Jack) Wiebe

*The Honourable Sharon Carstairs, P.C. (or the Honourable Fernand Robichaud, P.C.)

*The Honourable John Lynch-Staunton (or the Honourable Noël A. Kinsella)

*Ex Officio Members

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Problem 1: The Need for a Culture Shift on Our Borders	2
Problem 2: Poor Threat Identification at Borders	7
Problem 3: Lack of Reliable Documentation	14
Problem 4: Inadequate Staffing Levels	19
Problem 5: Undertrained Part-Time Customs Staff	23
Problem 6: The Need for Proper Training for All Border Guards on Duty	29
Problem 7: Unsafe Border Posts	
Problem 8: Unconnected Border Posts	
Problem 9: Culture of Secrecy: Who Do You Trust?	38
Problem 10: Lack of a Credible System for Reporting Critical Incidents	
Problem 11: Unarmed Border Officers	45
Problem 12: Border Runners	49
Problem 13: Backing Up Infrastructure at Key Border Crossings	52
Problem 14: Reverse Inspection Could Save Damage to Crossings	55
Problem 15: No Plans for Reverse Inspection at New Windsor-Detroit Cross	sing
	58
Problem 16: W indsor-Detroit Border Crossing a "Public Order Emergency"	'61
Problem 17: Need for Greater Public Awareness of Benefits of Safer Canada	1 -
U.S. Border Crossings	
APPENDIX I	69
Order of Reference	69
APPENDIX II	71
Index of Recommendations	
Canadian Security Guidebook 2005	71
APPENDIX III	
Index of New Recommendations	
APPENDIX IV	81
Glossary of Terms	81
APPENDIX V	87
Who the Committee Heard From	
APPENDIX VI	
Biographies of Committee Members	
APPENDIX VII	
Biographies of the Committee Secretariat	131

Border Crossings

Canadian-U.S. border crossings offer security institutions the opportunity to scrutinize people who might otherwise go unnoticed. The vast majority moving back and forth between the two countries don't present a problem. At a guess 99.999 percent of people crossing Canadian-U.S. borders are doing so with honourable intentions. It is in both countries' interests to trip up the other 0.001 percent.

But how good are we at spotting these people, and trying to figure out what they're up to? We know that both governments have some of them on terrorist watch lists, and that various police forces have records on people who have committed crimes. Does the Canadian government have the personnel and the equipment at our borders to make a quick determination as to whether any given person deserves further scrutiny?

On a more philosophical level, do Canadian authorities share a mindset that security should be the priority at our border crossings? Or are our border officers too busy shaking shoppers down for duty on purchases that may have exceeded the prescribed limits for any given trip?

We think we have some answers to these questions.

The Committee is convinced that the Government of Canada pays too much attention to minor duty infractions at our border posts, and too little attention to security.

If there is going to be a greater focus on security, the Canadian Border Services Agency (CBSA) is going to have to acquire more full-time personnel and sophisticated equipment to do the kinds of efficient and effective security checks that would make Canada a safer place to live.

The CBSA told the Committee that it processes an average of 266,000 travelers entering Canada each day. In 2005-2006, it processed more than 97.1 million travelers arriving by highway, air, marine and rail – an increase of approximately 5 million over the 2003-2004 fiscal year and 2 million over the 2004-2005 fiscal year.¹

¹ Canada Border Services Agency, "CBSA Departmental Performance Report 2005-2006," (2006), Available on http://www.tbs-sct.gc.ca/dpr-rmr/0506/BSA-ASF/bsa-asf01_e.asp#s1

Problem 1:

The Need for a Culture Shift on Our Borders

The people who should get the Government of Canada's attention at our borders are would-be criminals or terrorists – not shoppers who got a little carried away at a factory outlet somewhere. Border inspectors need to spend less time looking for extra bottles of duty-free whiskey and more time trying to identify people who might be a genuine threat to Canada.

Any border officer can sense when a person in a car is nervous. But nervous people aren't necessarily the problem. Hardened criminals and terrorists tend to have better poker faces than most of us.²

We have largely consigned our border officers to playing the role of tax collectors.³ The testimony the Committee has heard makes it clear that security still ranks second to revenue gathering at Canada-U.S. land border crossings.⁴

How important is the money? Before income taxes were introduced in 1917, revenue from customs tariffs accounted for about three-quarters of the Government of Canada's national revenue. By 2004, the \$95.8 million the federal government collected in customs duties from travellers entering Canada accounted for only 0.147 percent of national revenue⁵.

That kind of money could easily be recovered through other types of taxation.

2

² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.11-12.

³ Standing Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.10.

⁴ Standing Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005). p.10-11.

⁵ Department of Finance, "Federal Government Public Accounts, Table 3 – Budgetary Revenues," (October 2004)

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that the government restructure the personal exemption limits to allow CBSA to better focus on security. The restructuring should include harmonization⁶ with U.S. levels by 2007 and incremental bilateral increases to \$2000 per visit by 2010.⁷ (June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

On July 4, 2006, the Department of Finance responded to the Committee's recommendation by saying:

"Concerning the issue of travellers' exemptions thresholds, imported goods are generally subject to the same taxes (at the same rates) that are imposed on domestic goods with a view to preserving a level playing field. The travellers' exemptions thresholds represent an exception to this rule insofar as they allow Canadian residents returning from abroad to bring in goods, up to specified thresholds, without having to pay customs duties or other taxes on those goods. The purpose of the travellers' exemptions thresholds is to facilitate the processing of returning travellers and to allow border officials to focus their attention on commercial imports and security matters. Travellers' exemptions thresholds are set at a level designed to reduce the administrative burden at border crossings, but without creating an undue tax advantage for foreign competitors of Canadian businesses or substantially affecting tax revenues.

The Standing Committee's June 2005 report 'Borderline Insecure' recommends that the travellers' exemptions

⁶ By harmonization the Committee means that U.S. and Canadian personal exemption limits should be synchronized and made equal.

⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, Borderline Insecure, (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005) p.14,, Recommendation # 1

thresholds be harmonized by 2007 with those that apply in the United States, and that incremental bilateral increases to \$2000 per visit should be undertaken by 2010. This recommendation could have very significant implications, not only for taxes and duties collected at the border, but also in respect of sales by retailers in Canada. It is likely that the adoption of harmonized levels would have a greater impact on Canada than the United States, for two reasons; a greater proportion of Canadians live within driving distance of the border and the Canadian tax system has a relatively greater reliance on sales taxes. On this basis, harmonized thresholds could create a competitive advantage for retailers in the United States vis-à-vis their Canadian counterparts.

Looking at border issues more broadly, the Government of Canada has taken practical, concrete action to facilitate the efficient and secure movement of low-risk trade and travellers. As set out in the federal budget that was presented in the House of Commons on May 2, 2006, our Government will invest \$303 million over two years to support a range of initiatives linked to the Security and Prosperity Partnership of North America. These measures enhancing cargo security expeditina include and processing at the border, as well as better technology to identify high-risk travellers and better procedures to expedite low-risk travellers. We are committed to a strategy that will build smart and secure borders, with a view to enhancing Canada's prosperity and security in one of the most economically dynamic regions in the world."8

r.

⁸ Finance Canada, "Response to Committee Recommendations," July 4, 2006. p. 2-3

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

It doesn't surprise the Committee that the focus of the response is on revenues rather than security, no matter how miniscule those revenues may be in relation to the taxes the government collects from Canadians every year.

Here is the essence of the government's argument for focusing on revenue collection:

We need to be more stringent with our duty-free limits for cross-border shoppers than the Americans are. It just wouldn't be fair to Canadian merchants if we weren't. That is why we tax goods coming into Canada at approximately the same rate as if they were purchased in Canada. Well, we acknowledge that we break this rule when we allow travelers to make duty-free purchases abroad up to a certain limit, depending on the time that they are away. But we only do that in order "to facilitate the processing of returning travellers and to allow border officials to focus their attention on commercial imports and security matters."

Aha! The government argues that the system must be designed to be fair to Canadian merchants. *Except when it isn't*. The government acknowledges that if it tried to be *too* fair to Canadian merchants, endless inspections would clog up borders crossings and officers wouldn't be able to devote sufficient resources to commercial imports and security matters.

So it turns out that it's a balancing act! Fine. In that case, the Committee suggests that the government take a more intelligent approach to this balancing act. The Committee suggests that the government bring its exemptions into line with what the Americans are offering their citizens. Would this really devastate Canadian merchants? If the higher exemptions for U.S. travellers were devastating American merchants, the Canadian government might have an argument here. But American merchants seem to be doing just fine – even with the exchange rate tipped in favour of buying in Canada.

The government should quit pretending that there are rational arguments for devoting so many of its resources to the collection of relatively small amounts of money from ordinary tourists. The government's focus should be on two other areas that it acknowledges to be important: <u>commercial imports and security matters</u>.

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

The government must change the current tax collector culture at our border crossings if these two much more important functions are going to get the attention they deserve.

TABLE 1: Current and Proposed Personal Exemption Structures in Canada and the United States⁹

Exemption Level	Canada			U.S.	
	2005	2007	2010	2005	2010
	Now	Harmonization within 2 years	Move to increased exemptions within 5 years	Now	Move to increased exemptions within 5 years
0 - 24 hrs	\$0	\$200 US	\$2000 US	\$200 US	\$2000 US
24 - 48 hrs	\$50 CDN	\$800 US	\$2000 US	\$800 US	\$2000 US
48 hrs - 7 days	\$200 CDN	\$800 US	\$2000 US	\$800 US	\$2000 US
7 days or more	\$750 CDN	\$800 US	\$2000 US	\$800 US	\$2000 US

6

⁹ This would include special items such as cigarettes, perfume and wine.

Problem 2:

Poor Threat Identification at Borders

Officials from the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) do not have access to sufficient resources or training to effectively screen persons who are a potential threat to Canada.

This makes life more unsafe for Canadians. It also constitutes a huge waste of resources. Our country has these expensive chokepoints in place at our borders. Why not make better use of their potential to help create a safer society? If policians really want to get tougher on crime, they should make more intelligent use of our border crossings to help thwart crime.

Both airports and land border crossings offer opportunities to scrutinize people who find it necessary to cross borders to engage in criminal behaviour. When our border officers come face to face with these people, the officers need to know everything they can about them – in a hurry.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

• The Committee recommended that by 30 June 2003 the Canada Border Service Agency offer substantive evidence that [it has] addressed the Auditor General's recommendations to improve training to help airport personnel identify persons "likely to engage in criminal activities or endanger the safety of Canadians."

The CBSA should also demonstrate that [it has] moved to gain access to police databanks that would assist in such identification, and provide their employees with the training and technology required to take advantage of these databanks.¹⁰ (Recommended in January 2003)

• The Committee recommended that CBSA upgrade the quality and fuse¹¹ the data that is available to officers on the primary and secondary inspection lines.¹² (Recommended in June 2005)

¹¹ By fuse, the Committee means that all data from various sources should be brought together into one data source.

¹⁰ Standing Committee on National Security and Defence, *The Myth of Security at Canada's Airports*, (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, January 2003) p.25,, Recommendation #I. 2

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response to the Committee's recommendation Public Safety and Emergency Prepardeness Canada (PSEPC) replied:

"Many of the recommendations pertaining to security at airports focused on improving the physical security of airports and aircraft (e.g. hardened cockpit doors, screening baggage and staff, training staff to respond to an incident etc). Advancements have also been made on improving intelligence information as a pre-emptive measure to interdict the threat before the passengers are allowed to board rather than solely relying on physically responding to a threat.

Following the passage of the Public Safety Act, 2002, two amendments were made to the Aeronautics Act. Section 4.81 now provides the Government of Canada with the legislative authority to develop a list of specified persons who pose an immediate threat to aviation security. Transport Canada, in consultation with PSEPC, CSIS and RCMP, is in the process of developing a Specified Persons List (SPL) that will be distributed to air carriers who will have the responsibility of assessing all passengers prior to boarding. This Program, known as "Passenger Protect" is expected to be implemented domestically in September 2006 and Internationally in 2007.

Section 4.82 (not yet in force) provides CSIS and the RCMP with the legislative authority to receive air passenger information and compare it against information under their control to identify individuals who may pose a threat to transportation or national security. It also allows the RCMP to act on warrants for serious offences that carry a punishment of five years or more and are listed in the proposed regulations.

8

¹² June 2005 - Borderline Insecure, (page 40). Recommendation # 16

The CBSA currently has access to Canadian Police Information Center (CPIC) Windows and is upgrading to CPIC Web which will give employees CPIC access at their desktops. The Department will also be deploying in the summer of 2006, the Integrated Border Query (IBQ) tool, an integrated query tool that allow the CBSA employees to query multiple systems at the same time, including CPIC. We are also working with Interpol, to obtain access to its data on lost and stolen documents for Integrated Primary Inspection line (IPIL) verification.

The CBSA will be the first PSEP partner to connect, on a pilot-project basis, to an RCMP integrated query tool (IQT) via the National Integrated Interagency Information System (N III) project. This tool will provide the CBSA with access to additional RCMP and police information databanks, which are not currently available. Additional funding will be required to expand this connection in a permanent manner, past the pilot-project phase.

Procedures have been implemented to ensure the prompt entry of information and quality control measures have been implemented to ensure the reliability of watch lists.

Since June 2004, the IPIL system used by border services officers at all major airports, cruise ship and bus terminals, has had the capability to identify lost, stolen or fraudulent immigration documents, including passports, where such information has been entered into the immigration enforcement database.

The National Risk Assessment Centre (NRAC) was established to act as a focal point to facilitate the timely flow of information between local, national and international agencies to target high-risk persons and goods. The NRAC supports information-sharing with the U.S. in accordance with the written agreement pertaining to

the automated exchange of lookouts (Canada - U.S MOU on API-PNR Sharing)."¹³

"The Department will also be deploying in the summer of 2006, the Integrated Border Query (IBQ) tool . . ." Will be deploying? The letter was written on August 30, 2006. By that time, presumably, the sender would have some idea of whether the tool had been deployed or not.

A pilot project is underway to allow CBSA to connect to RCMP intelligence. But it is just a pilot project, and it will require more funding to become more than just a test. Again, lag time raises its ugly head.

On August 30, 2006, PSEPC wrote in response to the recommendation that CBSA upgrade the quality of data that is available to officers on the inspection lines:

"Through implementation of improved systems and continuous upgrades to existing systems, the CBSA continues to make advancements in ensuring primary and secondary officers are provided with the necessary tools.

Examples include the following:

- Advance Commercial Information has been operational in marine-mode since 2004 and will be fully implemented by this summer for air-mode.
- The CBSA continues to deliver on its plans to provide enhanced connectivity for remote ports, and has made significant progress to connect unconnected sites. Most sites are now connected, with only three seasonal sites left to fully connect by the end of summer.

10

 $^{^{13}}$ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006). p.29-30

• The CBSA is replacing the existing Primary Automated Lookout System (PALS) with an updated system to ensure border services officers have access to the information they need."¹⁴

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Once again, the government's response is packed with acronyms and references to programs that do nothing to aid communication with the public. To aid the reader, here is a basic description of the acronyms and terms thrown at us in the above response:

CPIC: The Canadian Police Information Centre (CPIC) is a computerized information system to provide all Canadian law enforcement agencies with information on crimes and criminals, and is operated by the RCMP.¹⁵

IBQ: The Integrated Border Query Tool (IBQ) is a computerized tool that allows CBSA employees working on border crossings to query multiple databases and computer systems at the same time, including the Canadian Police Information Centre.¹⁶

IQT: Started in 2005, the Integrated Query Tool (IQT) is the information sharing tool for federal public safety agencies such as the RCMP, Canada Border Services Agency and Canada Firearms Centre.¹⁷

N-III: The National Integrated Interagency Information (N-III) System supports government departmental cooperation and information sharing. It is comprised of the Police Information Protocol (another query tool capable of electronically

¹⁴ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.6

¹⁵ Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "Canadian Police Information Centre (CPIC)," (February 2007), Available at http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca//factsheets/fact_cpic_e.htm, Assessed March 19, 2007

¹⁶ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.29.

¹⁷ Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "National Integrated Interagency Information (N-III) System," (January 2007), Available at http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/niii/index_e.htm , Assessed March 19, 2007

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

accessing data in police records), for Canadian police services and the Integrated Query Tool for federal public safety agencies.¹⁸

IPIL: The Integrated Primary Inspection Line (IPIL) system is an automated support tool that provides customs officers with an immediate system response which identifies whether the traveller is on a customs or immigration lookout or has previous customs infractions.¹⁹

NRAC: Established January 2004 by the CBSA, the National Risk Assessment Centre is a focal point and interface between intelligence agencies at the international, national, and local levels to protect Canadians against current and emerging threats. It operates on a 24/7 basis.²⁰

API-PNR: The Advance Passenger Information/Passenger Name Record program, established by Citizenship and Immigration Canada, identifies and intercepts persons posing security risks as early and as far away from our borders as possible. The program provides CIC with the information on air passengers and crew before they arrive in Canada. The goal of the API/PNR program is to intercept those who may pose a concern, such as: known terrorists; human smugglers; and other criminals.²¹

PALS: The Primary Automated Lookout System is a critical risk management system used by CBSA officers and is deployed along the land border all across the country. It is used to verify the license plates of vehicles entering Canada. The license plate information is then cross-referenced against enforcement databases.²²

The bottom line is that we need personnel, technology and systems that will give customs officers enough information to be able to say "yes" or "no" as to whether someone passes, or is relegated to secondary inspection for further examination.

19, 2007.

¹⁸ Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "National Integrated Interagency Information (N-III) System," (January 2007), Available at http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/niii/index_e.htm, Assessed March 19, 2007

¹⁹ Canada Border Services Agency, "Integrated Primary Inspection Line System" (January 2002), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/media/facts-faits/034-eng.html, Assessed March 19, 2007

²⁰ Canada Border Services Agency, "National Risk Assessment Centre," (January 2005), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/media/facts-faits/039-eng.html, Assessed March 19, 2007

 ²¹ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "The Advance Passenger Information / Passenger Name Record Program (API/PNR)," (January 2004), Available at http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/visit/api.html Assessed March 19, 2007
 ²² Treasury Board of Canada, "2007-2008 Part I - The Government Expenditure Plan," (February 28, 2007)
 Available at http://www.tbs-sct.gc.ca/est-pre/20072008/me-bd/part1/me-029_e.asp?printable=True, Assessed March

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

As a Customs and Excise Union (CEUDA) member told the Committee in January 2007, the ideal system would be for a customs officer to run a passport through the reader and know immediately if there is a problem with the person in front of them. Customs officers currently need to go through the lengthy process of accessing six different archaic computer systems to cobble together a complete picture to find out if a person constitutes a security risk. Obviously, with lineups waiting, there is pressure to avoid this process whenever possible.

Customs officers often have difficult decisions to make. They should have immediate access to as much information as possible to make those decisions.

Problem 3:

Lack of Reliable Documentation

The lack of any requirement for people entering Canada to present documentation that clearly and reliably identifies people significantly reduces a customs officer's ability to identify and nab someone who should not be entering our country. It therefore reduces Canada's capacity to use its border crossings as effective chokepoints for security.²³

Customs officers use licence plate readers that are supposed to identify the owners of vehicles, but these can be unreliable when licence plates are dirty. As for personal drivers' licences presented for identification, they can be from any one of 50 states, ten provinces or three territories, and it's hard to spot a phoney – especially when time is of the essence. Driver's licences simply aren't adequate for identification. Whatever replaces them needs to be reliable and machine-readable. Currently, border officers checking out a licence have to punch the licence number, a process that is not only time-consuming but prone to keyboard errors.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

- The Committee recommended that by 2007, the government require documentation of all people entering Canada (including Canadians) that is:
 - a) Tamper-proof
 - b) Machine-readable
 - c) Biometrically enhanced
 - d) Known to have been issued on the basis of reliable documentation²⁴ (Recommended in June 2005)

²³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43.

²⁴ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43, Recommendation # 19

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

On August 30, 2006, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) replied as follows:

"This recommendation concerns two key Canada-U.S. issues that are currently the focus of a great deal of work by Government officials.

The Security and Prosperity Partnership (SPP) contains provisions that deal specifically with standards, technologies and policies for documents that may be used to enter Canada. In particular, under Goal 1.1.3 of the SPP, a Canada-U.S. Working Group has produced draft recommended standards that apply to document security and program integrity. This work has been based largely on international travel document standards from the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO).

The Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative (WHTI) seeks to implement new document requirements for all travellers entering the United States by December 31, 2007. The Government of Canada is working collaboratively with the U.S. administration to consider the feasibility of alternative documents (other than passport and the U.S. PASS card) to ensure identity and status requirements.

Also under development is a strategy for implementing the WHTI in a way that will address the security needs of both countries while facilitating the flow of legitimate travelers and goods across our shared border. Proper implementation means finding low-cost, easy to obtain, secure travel documents and ensuring that there is the proper technology at the border to process these documents in a fast, secure and efficient way.

As the CBSA prepares the Canadian response to WHTI it will examine:

- The feasibility of introducing an entry or documentary requirements to determine the citizenship/status and identity for those persons seeking to enter or re-enter Canada who are currently exempt, recognizing that this would require a change in legislation.
- The steps necessary to enhance the integrity of a (sic) document used for border crossing (includes the use of document standards and the introduction of technology that meets International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) standards and makes these documents secure.)

Several departments and agencies, including Passport Canada and Citizenship and Immigration Canada are currently conducting field testing and other evaluations of new technologies, including biometrics and radio frequency identification (RFID) chips, while ensuring that any future implementation will be consistent with existing privacy legislation and Government of Canada policies.

The issue of reliable documentation is partially addressed through the National Routing System (NRS), a joint federal-provincial project that provides electronic verification of vital event data. This initiative needs to be funded to achieve full implementation. It should also be noted that amendments to existing Canadian document programs to make them more secure for cross border travel will also have funding implications." ²⁵

-

²⁵ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.8

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Here we trudge along again. Several years after the first indications that the U.S. government intended to require both Canadians and its own citizens to provide passports to enter the United States, we are "working collaboratively with the U.S. administration to consider the feasibility of alternative documents . . ."

It's about time. Let's quit fighting the inevitable and get on with ensuring that persons entering Canada – including Canadians – have reliable identity documents. There have been all kinds of Canadian resistance to the United States stiffening its requirements for security identity documentation for people entering its borders, but the Americans are going ahead. So should Canada.

The US already requires passports for all flights entering their county from Canada. By June 2009, all Canadians entering the US by land or water will be required to carry either passports or some type of enhanced secure identification document. Passports for trips down south will soon be inevitable unless Canada moves quickly to produce an enhanced identity pass similar to the one U.S. authorities are working on for Americans returning home from other countries.

These identity passes are described in a press release issued by the U.S. Department of State on October 17, 2006:

"To meet the documentary requirements of the Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative (WHTI), the Department of State, in consultation with the Department of Homeland Security (DHS), today announced and submitted for public comment a federal rule proposing the development of a card-format passport for international travel by U.S. citizens through land and sea ports of entry between the United States, Canada, Mexico, the Caribbean, and Bermuda.

The limited-use passport card will be adjudicated to the same standards as a traditional passport book. The rule published today proposes a wallet-sized card that would cost \$10 for children and \$20 for adults, plus a \$25 execution fee.

To facilitate the frequent travel of those living in U.S. border communities and those traveling on commercial maritime vessels, the Department of State has committed to producing a passport card that incorporates cutting-edge technology. The technology incorporated in the proposed card was designed in coordination with DHS specifically to address the operational needs of land border-crossings. The proposed passport card would use long-range, or vicinity, radio frequency identification (RFID) technology to link the card to a secure U.S. government

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

database containing biographical data and a photograph. The card itself will not contain any personal information, and DHS will implement protections to keep the database secure.

The passport card is the core element of the PASS (People Access Security Service) System announced by Secretaries Rice and Chertoff in January 2006, and will secure and expedite travel to and from the United States."²⁶

These two countries overcame incredible hurdles to create a system of free trade under the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA). There is no reason that they cannot coordinate their efforts in developing sophisticated identity cards that will work for both countries.

Of course, Canada does not want to share all the information it possesses about its citizens with U.S. authorities, so these cards should only permit the Americans access to enough information to show who a person is and whether they constitute a security risk.

Defence of North America is both an American and a Canadian responsibility. Border crossings provide ideal venues for identifying security problems. Creating secure and efficient identity cards is critical to this effort. Developing complimentary cards should not be beyond the technological capabilities of either of these two very advanced countries.

What is clear in the government's response is that no money has been set aside for the development and implementation of a new I.D. card. "Consultations" as discussed by the government in its response are useless if there is no funding to make this a reality.

The Committee is concerned that the government is dragging its feet and a lack of funding would hinder the government's ability to match deadlines set by the WHTI. If the government continues to move on this I.D. card at the same pace as it is currently issuing passports, then it will be years until the new I.D. card is designed and implemented.

Let's move.

²⁶ U.S. Department of State, "Department of State to Introduce Pass Card," (October 17, 2006) Available at http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2006/74083.htm

Problem 4: Inadequate Staffing Levels

The significant increases in traffic across the Canada-United States border has resulted in an increasing ratio of traffic volume to border personnel since 1994. However, the total number of officers on the Canadian side of the border has remained relatively constant since then. In April 2005, CEUDA, the union representing customs officers, told us that there had been only a marginal increase in the number of officers between September 11, 2001 and 2005. It isn't just the increase in traffic that should have led to the hiring of more officers. The threat to the security of Canadians has also clearly increased since 9/11. One would think that the combination of increased traffic and an increased security threat would have led to a sizable increase in border personnel. It has not.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that the number of personnel employed by the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) be sufficient to provide security commensurate with increased security threat associated with the increased traffic and threat at Canada-U.S. land border crossings in recent years.³⁰ (Recommended in June 2005)

²⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.20.

²⁸ According to the Department of National Revenue in 1992-93 there were 8,330 full-time equivalents delivering the customs program. According to the Auditor General in 2003, about 8,300 people were employed by the customs program. See Department of National Revenue, "1994-95 Estimates – Part 3, Expenditure Plan," (Ottawa: 1994) 2-34; Auditor General of Canada, "Canada Customs and Revenue Agency — Managing the Risks of Non-Compliance for Customs,"2003 Status Report, (Ottawa: May 2003): paras. 2-10. According to the Auditor General, there were 30 fewer persons delivering the customs program in 2003.

²⁹ Customs Excise Union, "Security Problems at Canada's Border Crossings: Evidence & Recommendations," Submission to the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, (April 7, 2005), p.23.

³⁰ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p..21, ,Recommendation # 5

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response to Committee recommendations, Public Safety and Emergency Prepardeness Canada (PSEPC) wrote:

"CBSA will hire 270 additional border officers over the next five years to respond to increasing demands at key border locations across the country. Included in this figure are 30 full-time equivalents that have already been hired in Windsor."³¹

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

54 New Employees a Year Over Five Years: Who's Kidding Whom?

The CBSA estimates that they will be employing about 13,000 people by the summer of 2007, ³² including more than 7,200 as uniformed officers. ³³ An increase in 270 staff members over five years – which amouts to 54 new employees a year – does not seem to the Committee to be an adequate response to the problem. There are a number of areas that call for more staffing:

GUN TRAINING – Those border officers who will carry weapons will be given firearms training beginning in July 2007.³⁴ Someone needs to replace them when they are on weapons training.

REPLACING STUDENTS – If the government takes our advice it will either offer part-time border officers as much training as permanent officers, or replace

-

³¹ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.2

³² Proceedings of the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, "Issue 4 - Evidence, Alain Jolicoeur, Canada Border Services Agency", (June 19, 2006).

³³ Treasury Board of Canada Secretariat, "DPR 2005-20006 Canada Border Services Agency"

³⁴ "With the assistance of the RCMP, CBSA trainers will begin delivering training in July 2007, after our course has been designed and tested. Armed Officers will begin to be deployed to the field in August 2007. Our objective is to train a minimum of 150 Officers by the end of March 2008." See Customs Excise Union, "Secure Border Action Plan," (November 2006), p.39. Available at

http://www.ceuda.psac.com/english/publications/reports/Other/SBAP.pdf

part-time officers with permanent officers. In either case, more people will be needed to staff border crossings.

SINGLE-OCCUPANCY POSTS – There are currently 138 border crossings staffed by a single officer, which is dangerous. The government has committed itself to double-staffing these posts by 2009. According to CBSA that will require at least 400 more border crossing officers while CEUDA, the customs union, says that the number should be 450.

Vehicle And Cargo Inspection System (VACIS) MACHINES³⁵ – VACIS machines are non-instrusive imaging technology that use penetrating gamma rays to efficiently inspect cargo containers. At present, CBSA operates 15 VACIS machines across Canada (3 pallet and 12 mobile), and has plans to add another VACIS on September 1st, 2007. At some border crossings these machines are not present. At other border crossings, such as the major crossing at Windsor-Detroit, the machines are operated only eight hours a day, allowing truckers to tip other truckers by phone when the machines are inoperative. One VACIS operator informed the Committee that at one particular crossing, VACIS machines were used only once a week. And when it was in use, only about 150-200 containers out of 1500 were scanned. The Committee has learned that the United States is not yet able to VACIS 100 percent of incoming cargo, even though the average American border post has three times the staffing that a Canadian one does.

There are currently 15 VACIS machines deployed Canada-wide.³⁶ The continuous use of these machines for 8 hours a day each requires a crew of 4 full time employees per machine.³⁷ If VACIS machines were run 24 hours a day, they would need a rotating crew of 12; if they were to run 7 days a week, they would need 5 shifts of rotating crew taking into account sick leave, vacation time, training etc. In theory then, there should be 300 full time VACIS operators for 15 machines, if they are run 24/7³⁸. Since allowances have to be made for breakdowns, and let's face it, 15 VACIS machines can in no way cover all of Canada's ports, land and railway border crossings; we are going to need a minimum of 30 VACIS machines for all of Canada's entry points. That means a minimum of 600 operators.

³⁵ VACIS machine: "is a gamma ray scanning system that captures an image, similar to an x-ray, of the contents of a container or vehicle to enable officers to detect anomalies that might suggest the presence of inadmissible goods or people." (CBSA, Customs Action Plan accessed at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/agency-agence/reports-rapports/ae-ve/2005/cap-int-eval-e.html)

³⁶ Researcher correspondence with Transport Canada official. (January 2007)

³⁷ Researcher correspondence with Ron Moran, President of CEUDA. (February 2007).

 $^{^{38}}$ 5 shifts of 4 FTEs for 15 VACIS: 5*4*15 = 300

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

Currently, we aren't using VACIS machines full-time at every location as we should be. Where are the plans for all this?

Problem 5:

Undertrained Part-Time Customs Staff

In recent years, the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) hired approximately 1,200 part-timers annually to augment its staff of full-time border officers. Most of them are students. Part-timers tend to work mostly in the summer, when full-time officers prefer to take holidays and students are more available. Summer, of course, is when border posts come under the heaviest pressure.

CBSA told the Committee that, in 2003-2004, approximately 22 percent of officers assigned to border crossings were part-timers³⁹.

Customs officers are the front line decision makers in Canada's border security system. The judgments they make on behalf of several departments – including CBSA, Agriculture Canada, Immigration Canada and Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada – affects the security of all Canadians.

Students receive only two to three weeks of training to prepare them for their responsibilities. They do not receive their training at Rigaud, Quebec, where permanent employees are trained. Rather, they are trained on the job. There have been disagreements between the Customs and Excise Union (CEUDA) and CBSA officials as to just how much of what part-timers do in their "training" amounts to work and how much amounts to actual training.

In the Committee's opinion, all border officers should be fully trained. We believe that putting undertrained students in positions of responsibility at border crossings is asking for trouble.

³⁹ Canada Border Services Agency, "Response to the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence – 66 Questions – Border Security," (February 1, 2005), p.2

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommended that all personnel on the primary inspection line be trained to the highest standard, without exceptions for short-term staff. (Recommended in February 2002)
- The Committee recommended that CBSA deploy only inspectors fullytrained to the level of indeterminate employees to perform primary duties on inspection lines. 41 (Recommended in June 2005)
- The Committee recommended that CBSA investigate the possibility of pairing students with full-time inspectors at land border crossings so that students could earn both summer wages and credits toward community college diplomas associated with policing and security. (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response to the Committee, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) wrote:

"All border services officers are qualified and appropriately trained for the duties they are expected to perform. All indeterminate, term and student border services officers undergo the same security clearance and the same screening tests.

New officers hired for permanent positions must pass a mandatory 13-week Port-of-Entry Recruit Training (POERT) program. The program is presently being redesigned to enhance and extend training for new recruits beyond the initial training. The new POERT will include further

24

⁴⁰ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Canadian Security and Military Preparedness*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, February 2002), p.121, Recommendation #15.A

⁴¹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.4, Recommendation # 4

⁴² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.25, Recommendation # 8

structured training at ports to position recruits for the port specific functions they will perform. This represents the last phase of the hiring process. Graduates of the POERT program are considered fully trained to perform primary duties on inspection lines.

The training curriculum for student border officers has been developed and tailor-made for the relevant duties that they will be performing at their work location, which may include service on the primary inspection line. Student officers also receive coaching, on-the-job training and job shadowing from indeterminate officers and their supervisors."⁴³

Responding to the recommendation that only inspectors fully-trained to the level of indeterminate employees to perform primary duties on inspection lines – PSEPC replied:

"All border services officers are qualified and appropriately trained for the duties they are expected to perform. All indeterminate, term and student border services officers undergo the same security clearance and the same screening tests.

New officers hired for permanent positions must pass a mandatory 13-week Port-of-Entry Recruit Training (POERT) program prior to being deployed to the CBSA. The program is presently being redesigned to enhance and extend training for new recruits beyond the initial training. The new POERT will include further structured training at ports to position recruits for the port-specific functions they will perform. This represents the last phase of the hiring process. Graduates of the POERT program are considered fully trained to perform primary duties on inspection lines.

25

⁴³ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.34

The training curriculum for student border officers has been developed and tailor-made for the relevant duties that

they will be performing at their work location, which may include service on the primary inspection line. Student officers also receive coaching, on-the-job training and job shadowing from indeterminate officers and their supervisors."⁴⁴ (Same answer as above)

Finally, in their August 30, 2006 response to the recommendation that students be "paired up" with full-time employees, PSEPC responded:

"To date, the CBSA has not explored the concept of pairing up students with full-time officers during their periods of employment with us. For many years, the CBSA (former Customs) has hired students to supplement the workforce during peak periods in summer and part-time throughout the year. Although the students do not perform the full range of duties and always have access to a senior officer or supervisor, they do work fairly autonomously and are trained to perform those duties.

Notwithstanding, we are currently reviewing our whole recruitment strategy for full-time Border Services Officers. This includes how the CBSA uses students to supplement the workforce, as well as how they can be 'bridged' into full-time positions. The concept of pairing students with officers can be examined along with other options, such as apprenticeship programs, better use of co-op programs and 'cadet' style programs."⁴⁵

⁴⁵ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.3.

_

⁴⁴ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.2

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Allow us to parse the "logic" set out in the first three paragraphs of this set of responses on the previous page.

"New officers hired for permanent positions must pass a mandatory 13-week Port-of-Entry Recruit Training (POERT) program . . . Graduates of the POERT program are considered fully trained to perform primary duties on inspection lines."

Clearly CBSA would not spend 13 weeks training permanent officers if the training courses were not considered important. Clearly they are essential, since it is only when these courses are completed [and later *augmented* with further structured training] that officers are "considered fully trained to perform primary duties on inspection lines."

Which brings us to:

"The training curriculum for student border officers has been developed and tailor-made for the relevant duties that they will be performing at their work location, which may include service on the primary inspection line."

This presents a dichotomy. Permanent workers are considered fully trained "to perform primary duties on inspection lines" when they have finished 13+ weeks of training. But the responsibilities of students – who receive only 3 weeks of on-site training – also "may include service on the primary inspection line."

One wonders why the CBSA considers it important to give permanent workers 13+ weeks of training to qualify them to serve on primary inspection lines, while students are expected to serve on those same lines with only two to three weeks of on-site training.

It should be noted that the primary line is where mistakes are most likely to be made. Often, decisions have to be made in a hurry – otherwise long lines of people and vehicles build up. Only when a person or vehicle is sent to a secondary line, is there more time to get things right.

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

It would be one thing if students on primary lines were under the constant supervision of permanent employees. But how often do you see two officers working together in the tiny concrete box that serves as the primary inspection point? In preparing its 2005 report *Borderline Insecure*, the Committee acquired time sheets which show that not only do some part-time employees work without supervision, some work alone.

Note the line on page 26: "Students always have access to a senior officer or supervisor." Perhaps. But there is a difference between being supervised and having "access" to a supervisor. In theory, all Canadians have "access" to national health care. The crucial question is always whether they can get the health care they need in a timely fashion. The same question must arise with the undertrained students at our border posts.

The Committee reiterates its 2005 finding:

"If part-time workers are to be used, there is no justification for having a less well-trained person on any line at any given moment. Either more full-time officers must be hired, or part-time officers must receive identical training."

These students are being placed in harm's way to do a vital job on behalf of the safety of all Canadians – yet they only receive the same type of on-the-job training typical of fast-food restaurants. This is clearly inadequate for work that is this important and this hazardous. That this outdated approach to hiring relief staff persists is unconscionable. It is a cost-saving measure awaiting its first tragedy.

28

⁴⁶ Standing Committee on National Security and Defence, Canadian Security Guide Book 2005 Edition, (December 2004) p.27

Problem 6:

The Need for Proper Training for All Border Guards on Duty

If the focus of our border crossings is to evolve from tax collecting to security, training for border officers must evolve as well. Systems are good, but successful systems depend on the quality of people running them. These people must be trained in a complex set of skills that will allow them to make critical judgments that impact on the security of the border every day.⁴⁷

There are two sides to this. Our border guards need to be able to identify potential trouble-makers. But they must also handle themselves in a way that doesn't infuriate people who feel they are being stereotyped. Hostility and bitterness are not likely to promote the more secure Canadian society that the Committee has in mind.

There is a need for better training to deal with human-to-human situations.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommended that the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) expand its training programs in line with its newly focused mission on security as opposed to tax collection. (Recommended in June 2005)
- The Committee recommended that CBSA improve its training programs for border agency personnel, with a special focus on components that increase skill sets for questioning techniques and cultural sensitivity. (Recommended in June 2005)

⁴⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.25.

⁴⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.27, Recommendation #9

⁴⁹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.27, Recommendation #10

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) responded to Committee recommendations on August 30, 2006:

"The Port-of-Entry Recruit Training Program provides expanded training to the CBSA new recruits. The content of this training program includes modules on secondary immigration and secondary food, plant and animal inspection in addition to the customs training modules. The additional knowledge acquired by the recruits allows them to better address security matters whether they are related to immigration, customs or food, plant and animal inspection issues. Also, the training program includes Officer Powers and Use-of-Force training, including the use of batons and Oleoresin Capsicum (OC) spray. The content of the Port-of-Entry Recruit Training program has been validated through consultations with focus program areas and regional management representatives in order to ensure that the CBSA mandate is reflected in the various modules of the next release of the program (January 2007)."

The CBSA is continually striving to improve its training programs for all employees, including border services officers.

The CBSA has developed a web-based learning product for employees who have face-to-face interactions with internal and external clients of the CBSA. This product will be additional to the diversity concepts, which have been imbedded into other training modules covering specific functions at a port. All Border Services Officers are required to take this learning product as part of the mandatory Port-of-Entry Recruit Training program. The product is also available to all other employees of the CBSA.

The main goals of this diversity and race relations webbased training are to:

- Promote the understanding of key concepts related to diversity and race relations;
- Provide strategies that the CBSA employees can apply, on the job, towards promoting a professional and equitable service to the CBSA's multicultural clientele, and employees; and
- Act as a vehicle towards creating positive conversations in the workplace about diversity and race relations.

The content of the Port-of-Entry Recruit Training Program has been validated through consultations with focus groups, program areas and regional management representatives. This will ensure that diversity and competencies such as questioning techniques and cultural sensitivity are appropriately and adequately addressed in the various modules of the next release of the program (January 2007)."⁵⁰

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

The response is good - as far as it goes.

A few questions here. The first is: who is getting trained? Is this more comprehensive type of training given to new employees only, or are refresher courses provided for veteran employees? How can students and other part-time employees be given this training but only receive three weeks of on the job training? Yet they work on primary lines!

⁵⁰ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), pp.3-4

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

Secondly, are tests being done to ensure that the training is taking hold? Have there been complaints about insensitivity? How does CBSA deal with these complaints, or with employees who don't put their lessons into practice?

Anecdotally, we hear from many Canadians who feel stereotyped and singled out. They need to know that the system is regularly tested to ensure that ALL Canadians and visitors are treated according to the rules and with respect.

Problem 7:

Unsafe Border Posts

The Committee learned that in 2002, there were 138 ports of entry across Canada at which border personnel worked alone at least part of the time. At these posts, a single official collects duties and taxes, performs primary and secondary inspections, does immigration checks, and conducts food inspections. That is simply too many functions for a lone border officer to perform effectively.⁵¹

The Committee has been expressing its concerns since 2002 about the practice of staffing land border crossings with a single officer. One isolated person has little or no hope of getting quick support from police or other border officers when there is an emergency or a surge in traffic.⁵² Worse, how are unarmed officers working alone expected to deal with potentially dangerous situations that could arise when dealing with dangerous criminals or terrorist elements crossing the border? The practice of leaving customs officials alone is risky for the officials and risky for Canadian security.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

- The Committee recommended that the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) ensure that no customs officers work alone at posts.⁵³ (Recommended in February 2002)
- The Committee recommended that CBSA ensure that at least half of all shifts at land border crossings be staffed by at least two persons by Dec. 31, 2006; and that all shifts at all land border crossings be staffed by at least two persons by Dec. 31, 2007.⁵⁴ (Recommended in June 2005)

⁵¹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.21-22.

⁵² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Canadian Security and Military Preparedness* (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, February 2002), p.121.

⁵³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Canadian Security and Military Preparedness* (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, February 2002), p), .121), Recommendation #15. B

⁵⁴ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p. 22, Recommendation # 6

• The Committee recommended that the CBSA significantly increase its capacity to move extra personnel to posts during surge/emergency conditions, and that it document such an increase in capacity by Dec. 31, 2006. ⁵⁵ (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response to Committee recommendations that no customs officers work alone at posts, and that at least half of all shifts at land border crossings be staffed by at least two persons by Dec. 31, 2006, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) replied:

"\$101 million was identified in Budget 2006 to begin arming border officers and eliminate work-alone posts. Part of this funding will be used to hire the estimated 400 officers needed to address the working-alone situation. Current plans call for the hiring and training of 50 officers in 2007/2008, with the hope that the remaining 350 can be hired and trained in 2008/2009. This plan is dependent on the availability of qualified recruits, who would eventually be trained to carry firearms, and the capacity of the CBSA to provide port-of-entry recruit training. The current plan is for these officers to be deployed without firearms initially in order to accelerate their deployment, with firearms training to follow." 56

In response to the recommendation that CBSA significantly increase its capacity to move extra personnel to posts during surge/emergency conditions by Dec. 31, 2006, PSEPC wrote:

"The CBSA has existing plans and processes to respond to surge/emergency conditions, which have been demonstrated and implemented in the past. The CBSA will hire 270 additional border officers over the next five years

⁵⁵ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.22). Recommendation # 7

⁵⁶ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.2

to respond to increasing demands at key border sites and to improve service delivery to the public. By maintaining appropriate levels of resources, the CBSA retains flexibility to respond to short-term surge/emergency conditions."⁵⁷

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Whenever a government responds to the Committee's identification of a problem by actually moving toward fixing the problem, some acknowledgement of their progress is appropriate. Before the congratulations, of course, must come some grumbling: as usual, this fix is taking too long and is too little.

The Committees would like to point out that the government has made two commitments in terms of increasing the number of personnel. One promise is to hire 400 new CBSA officers to eliminate work alone posts. The second commitment is to hire 270 new CBSA officers to respond to increasing demands at key border sites. The Committee assumes that 670 new CBSA officers will be hired, but this remains to be seen.

Having said that, it is clear that someone has been listening and that progress is being made. The Committee waits with baited breath for the day that all Canadian crossings are provided with the level of personnel and equipment required to protect Canadians and assure employee safety.

35

 $^{^{57}}$ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.3

Problem 8:

Unconnected Border Posts

The Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) seemed to be making little progress in connecting all its 119 land border posts with the databanks they require. Some databanks have not been providing the comprehensive and up-to-date information on persons of interest required by customs officers to do their job.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that CBSA connect all 62 unconnected border posts with real-time access to the customs mainframe by January 1st, 2006.⁵⁸ (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) maintained:

"The CBSA has made significant progress in providing connectivity for its remote ports. Over the past 2 years, more than 80 sites have been providing with enhanced connectivity to core the CBSA systems.

There are only 3 sites left to fully connect and the CBSA is working to improved connectivity at 18 sites.

The CBSA has developed an action plan, based on operational and security requirements, and is moving ahead to provide connectivity for the remaining sites including the use of satellite technology. This work is to be completed by the end of summer 2006."⁵⁹

36

⁵⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.40, Recommendation # 15

⁵⁹ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.6

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

While CBSA says that only three border posts out of 119 border posts remain to be connected, there is some question as to how "connected" the other 116 really are. According to a survey done by CEUDA, the customs union, 86 of the 119 border posts have no high-speed connection to the customs main frame. The Committee has also been told that at some border posts even logging on to the system can take in the neighborhood of 45 minutes.

The CEUDA survey asked the following question:

"Does your LAND BORDER CROSSING have a dedicated high speed connection to the Customs mainframe that permits you to use PALS⁶⁰ and search the ICES /CPIC/FOSS databases⁶¹ for lookouts/information?"

Responses:

NO - 82. YES – 36. No Answer –1.

Assuming the respondents are telling the truth, about 70 percent of Canada's border posts cannot provide officers with quick background checks on questionable people and vehicles.

It is imperative that all border posts have a high-speed connection to the customs mainframe. Without this, customs officers cannot readily access crucial government databases, such as PALS and FOSS which indicate whether or not a traveler has a criminal record or is wanted by the police. Without this kind of information, there has to be a lot more guesswork involved in who gets into Canada and who doesn't.

_

⁶⁰ According to CEUDA, PALS "refers to the Primary Automate Lookout System, a software system used only by BSOs at land border crossings and it provides access the ICES database". CEUDA, "Secure Border Action Plan," (November 2006), p.48

⁶¹ According to CEUDA, ICES/CPIC/FOSS refer, respectively to: the Integrated Customs Enforcement System, a database that contains what BSOs call the "bad-guy list/the Canadian Police Information Centre, a Canadian law enforcement database with information on crimes and criminals; it is by far the most comprehensive "bad-guy list" in Canada./Field Operational Support System, a database that used by Immigration that contains records and files on persons with immigration files. CEUDA, "Secure Border Action Plan," (November 2006), p.48.

Problem 9:

Culture of Secrecy: Who Do You Trust?

The government has an obligation to be open about how much risk its various security systems tolerate at any given time. ⁶²

The public has the right to be informed about the effectiveness of security systems that they pay for. Without these insights Canadians are flying blind when it comes to making decisions about how best to behave to assure their own security. It also weakens public debate about how to improve national security, and makes it more difficult for concerned Canadians to apply pressure on politicians to make improvements.

Governments do not have to release the kind of details that would help a criminal take advantage of a gap at a particular border crossing, airport or seaport. But Canadians need to know generally what measures are being taken to protect them. They also have every right to know the results of tests taken to determine the efficacy of those measures. If necessary, test results can be delayed for six months to a year to give the government time to redress a dangerous situation.⁶³

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommended that the government implement a system of periodic effectiveness testing that assesses the effectiveness of each of the components of Canada's national security programs at our borders.⁶⁴ (Recommended in June 2005)
- The Committee recommended that the government release the results of periodic effectiveness testing of border security programs, after a delay sufficient to remedy problems. (Recommended in June 2005)

⁶² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.14.

⁶³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.16.

⁶⁴ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.18, Recommendation #2

⁶⁵ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.18, Recommendation #3

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) wrote:

"The CBSA is committed to the on-going assessment of the effectiveness of our national security programs. A Multi-Year Risk-Based Evaluation Plan is in place and updated annually, which ensures coverage of programs during a 3-5 year cycle. This plan identifies priority program evaluations, which address key aspects of our national security programs. In addition, management has put in place, and periodically updates, Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for the delivery of national security programs at the border. Lastly, performance measurement frameworks are either in place or being developed to ensure accurate monitoring of the performance of all programs.

The CBSA's audit and evaluation reports are published on the CBSA and Treasury Board Secretariat internet sites. Recent reports include an interim evaluation of the Customs Action Plan, and forthcoming publications will evaluate the effectiveness of the Nexus Air, Nexus Marine and Partners in Protection programs. Additional studies of program effectiveness will be carried out in accordance with performance indicators identified in evaluation frameworks developed for major new projects or initiatives (such as the Vancouver Olympics). In addition, the CBSA publishes border wait times on its external website. It also reports annually to Parliament through the Departmental Performance Report, and publishes annual reports on the Modern War Crimes program. Other reports that are not published on a regular basis are available on reguest through the Access to Information process. The Agency will continue to monitor the effectiveness of its programs and to communicate the results to Canadians."66

⁶⁶ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.1.

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

The Committee has asked that the Canadian public be allowed to see the test results on the effectiveness of container screening at ports of entry, on license-plate readers at borders, and on the compliance verification measures in place for the Free and Secure Trade (FAST) and NEXUS⁶⁷ programs. For the most part, we have been stonewalled.⁶⁸

On October 31, 2005 Alain Jolicoeur, President of the Canada Border Services Agency, said:

"We are working on aspects of these areas. Obviously, we share the view that the only way to improve from year to year is to be more transparent about results. The specific concerns of senators at our last discussion were about the ability of our targeting machinery to allow us to inspect where inspections are warranted. As well, the committee wanted to see some numbers reflecting results. We have committed to, and we will deliver on, showing global results by the end of this fiscal year in terms of success, using targeting analysis vis-à-vis success. We will utilize random sampling of containers or trucks. We will have those global numbers and then determine how we can be more specific, without being specific about local rates of inspection, because that would create some difficulty."

In June 2006, the CBSA did show us the numbers from their study on the effectiveness of container targeting machinery. CBSA wrote:

"The Agency has undertaken some initial analysis of the effectiveness of the targeting approach, as set out in the background paper mentioned above. The Agency conducted over 870 random compliance examinations on marine containers between 2002 and 2005 that resulted in no major contraband seizures; targeted

40

⁶⁷ NEXUS: NEXUS is a joint Canada-U.S. program designed to expedite the border clearance process for low-risk, pre-approved travellers into Canada and the United States. (CBSA, "NEXUS" accessed at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/E/pub/cp/rc4209/rc4209-e.html)

⁶⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.16

⁶⁹ Proceedings of the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, "Issue 27 - Evidence, Alain Jolicoeur, Canada Border Services Agency", (October 31, 2005).

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

examinations using the risk assessment system resulted in 13 major seizures in 2005 alone.

The report concludes that "targeting is always the more preferred strategy". (Random examinations produce random results)"⁷⁰

This is a good first step in the long journey from secrecy to transparency. But as with other government responses, it doesn't go far enough. The Committee's recommendation was for the government to "implement a system of periodic effectiveness testing that assesses the effectiveness of each of the components of Canada's national security programs at our borders". *Each* of the components. One study on one aspect of security is far from this goal.

The Committee looks forward to receiving the promised upcoming studies into the effectiveness of the Nexus Air, Nexus Marine and Partners in Protection programs, as well as studies on issues not mentioned by the government response: issues shrouded in even greater secrecy, such as border running and critical incident management. The Committee hopes this step forward will be the first of many.

41

⁷⁰ Canada Border Services Agency, "The Canada Border Services Agency's Responses to Additional Questions Raised by the Senate Committee on National Security and Defence Subsequent to Mr. Jolicoeur's Appearance June 19, 2006," (July 2006), p.10

Problem 10:

Lack of a Credible System for Reporting Critical Incidents

Reports of violent incidents at land border crossings are relatively infrequent. But that doesn't mean these kinds of incidents don't happen. Between April 1, 2005 and March 31, 2006, a total of 65 critical incidents, (including verbal threats, assaults, bomb threats and suspicious packages) were reported at CBSA posts.⁷¹ This is not an insignificant number, but the Committee believes that it would have been higher if the CBSA had a credible system for reporting and cataloguing these types of incidents.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommended that the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) make mandatory the timely reporting and cataloguing of critical incidents faced by personnel.⁷² (Recommended in June 2005)
- The Committee recommended that the CBSA include a tally of those incidents in the Agency's annual report to Parliament.⁷³ (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its August 30, 2006 response to the Committee, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) wrote:

"It is currently mandatory for all employees and managers to report all critical incidents involving the CBSA staff to the Security Directorate at National Headquarters.

⁷¹ Canada Border Services Agency, "CBSA workplace investigations: Annex A", (September 28, 2006). Available at http://cbsa.gc.ca/agency-agence/reports-rapports/work-travail/2006incident-e.html

⁷² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation #11

⁷³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation #12

A supervisor is advised as soon as an incident occurs and as soon as is reasonable, a written report of the incident is prepared (usually on form RC166, Security Incident Report). There are no formal timelines for preparation of the report - but it is usually prepared within one week of the incident. The written report or form RC166, as the case may be, is submitted to the Regional Security organization for action (as required) and a copy sent to Corporate Security and Internal Affairs Division at Headquarters for data entry into a consolidated database of all security incidents.

The CBSA reports to Parliament on its performance towards achieving its strategic priorities in the annual Departmental Performance Report (DPR).

The CBSA will be publishing annual critical incident statistics on the Internet. These statistics will be available before the tabling of each fiscal year's DPR. Therefore, while each DPR will include a link to the critical incident statistics⁷⁴ on the Internet, the statistics themselves will not be published as part of the content of the DPR."⁷⁵

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Although this looks like a win for CBSA, the Committee has been informed by the customs union, CEUDA, that CBSA is not processing all the critical incident reports that it should be processing, so the seriousness of this issue remains understated. According to CEUDA, a number of factors contribute to this situation: the lack of consensus of what exactly constitutes a "critical incident", the disorganized manner in which critical incident reports are filed and compiled

⁷⁴ Canada Border Services Agency, "2005-2006 Departmental Performance Report", (November 23, 2006). Available at http://www.tbs-sct.gc.ca/dpr-rmr/0506/BSA-ASF/bsa-asf04 e.asp#s4

⁷⁵ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD,," (August 30, 2006),), p.5-6

Canadian Security Guide Book 2007 Edition – BORDER CROSSINGS

(different types of forms sent to different locations), and the lack of a centralized body to review and manage these incidents.

With the all the hazards that customs officers face, the government should take responsibility for ensuring that reporting procedures for these critical incidents are defined, streamlined and result in fixes when the system is at fault.

NEW RECOMMENDATION

B1. The Committee recommends that for the purposes of its public reporting, the Canada Border Services Agency define what constitutes a critical incident and also define the maximum timeline for these incidents to be brought to the attention of senior management.

Problem 11: Unarmed Border Officers

Part of any border officer's job is to try to prevent the entry into Canada of firearms, drugs and illegal entrants. This is likely to involve dealing with people who have been involved in criminal activity. Dealing with these kinds of people on a regular basis is a risky way to make a living.

There are two main questions here. First, do our unarmed border officers have the systems and equipment to perform this role effectively – that is, prevent guns, drugs, illegal immigrants and other unwanted people and things from entering Canada? Secondly, are our unarmed border officers capable of protecting themselves if these kinds of people turn nasty?

Answer to Question 1:

The "Canada Customs and Revenue Agency Interim Policy on the Handling of Armed and Dangerous Lookouts" states that "Customs Officer[s] should allow the individual [who has been identified as armed and dangerous] to proceed and immediately notify the police". Unfortunately, in the vast majority of cases there are no police - or at least, not any police close at hand, nor any police ready to drop their other duties and rush to the scene of a border incident.

The lack of police assistance and the number of armed and dangerous travelers coming through the border have led to border officers abandoning their posts. In 2006 alone, there were 62 instances of border services officers leaving their posts, as they have a right to do in certain circumstances. Is this right being overused and abused? Maybe.

Answer to Question 2:

Union officials have told the Committee over the years that border officers should be armed to underscore their position of authority. The union also argues that customs officers need weapons for their self-protection,⁷⁶ (although the Committee has received contrary testimony from some individual officers).⁷⁷

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommended that the federal government arm border officers if it is not prepared to station and maintain a Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) presence at all border crossings.⁷⁸ (Recommended in June 2005)
- The Committee recommended that if the government does go ahead with arming border officers, it create a firearm qualification and recertification program that meets or exceeds the Firearms Course Training Standards of the RCMP.⁷⁹ (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In response to Committee Recommendations, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) wrote on August 30, 2006:

"\$101 million was identified in Budget 2006 to begin arming border officers and eliminate work-alone posts. Part of this funding will be used to hire the estimated 400 officers needed to address the working-alone situation. Current plans call for the hiring and training of 50 officers in 2007/2008, with the hope that the remaining 350 can be hired and trained in 2008/2009. This plan is dependent on the availability of qualified recruits, who would eventually be trained to carry firearms, and the capacity of the CBSA to provide port-of-entry recruit training. The current plan is

46

⁷⁶ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.27-29.

⁷⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Canadian Security Guidebook 2005*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, December 2004), p.31.

⁷⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p..35, Recommendation # 13

⁷⁹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation # 14

for these officers to be deployed without firearms initially in order to accelerate their deployment, with firearms training to follow.

The CBSA has established a task force to oversee implementation of this initiative (i.e., develop policy and training). The task force includes members of the union, to develop the necessary policies, training and implementation strategies. Qualification and re-certification will be in accordance with the practices of other Canadian law enforcement agencies. Consultation will be maintained with the RCMP and other stakeholders throughout the planning and implementation of the arming initiative."

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

In the Customs and Excise Union's (CEUDA) November 2006 "Secure Border Action Plan" report, the union questions the need to wait ten years to arm border officers.

"CBSA has been tasked with completing this and has begun a process that it says will not permit deployment of any armed Officer until fall 2007 and will take ten years to complete. There has been significant questioning of why arming should take this long, and CEUDA is of the view that while a ten-year period for full completion may be acceptable to deal with accommodation issues, expedited initial deployment of armed Officers is both possible and desirable."

Possible and desirable indeed.

After Canada declared war on Germany on September 10, 1939, it took our country three months to move troops to the European theatre. But it's going to take us ten years to train and arm our border guards?

⁸⁰ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006), p.5

⁸¹ CEUDA, "Secure Border Action Plan" (November 2006), p 38. Available at http://www.ceuda.psac.com/english/publications/reports/Other/SBAP.pdf

No, Canada is not officially at war. But you would think that 9/11 would have given Canadian officials a little more sense of urgency. The government should expedite this arming and training process. In the meantime, it should hire off-duty police officers to provide protection at border crossings.

NEW RECOMMENDATIONS

- B2. The Committee recommends that until the Canadian Border Services Agency has completed the process of arming border guards, it should either place RCMP officers at all border crossings or hire off-duty police officers to provide protection for border officers and to assist in the apprehension of suspected criminals.
- B3. The Committee recommends that the Government of Canada ensure that once a border post has trained and armed border officers present, Canada Border Services Agency officers no longer have the right to unilaterally abandon these posts.

Problem 12: Border Runners

In a follow-up letter to his June 2006 appearance before the Committee, Alain Jolicoeur, President of the Canada Border Service Agency (CBSA) told the Committee that within a six month period, CBSA recorded approximately 459 vehicles that ran the border into Canada. Of these, only 242 were apprehended. Border running works like this: vehicles either drive through small border posts without stopping, or, after stopping to receive a first-stage inspection, they run the border if things aren't going well. Sometimes people run borders by accident, but often it's intentional.

There is a variety of reasons that it is relatively easy to run most of Canada's border posts. There are no police present. Lighting is often too poor to get a good look at licence plate numbers. There aren't usually any cameras to record violations. There are no temporary physical barriers, like "car traps," that can be activated to stop a border runner. Beyond all of these on-site failings, there is a larger problem: there doesn't appear to be much of a concern at the Canadian Border Services Agency that border running presents a danger to Canadians.

All this is part and parcel of some recurring themes: badly designed and understaffed posts, a lack of technological resources, a culture of secrecy about serious problems, and a lack of urgency about serious problems.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

There were no prior Committee recommendations.

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

There may be hope yet.

In the same follow-up letter to the Committee, Mr. Jolicoeur said:

"... In the short to medium term, the Agency is reviewing a series of measures to reduce the incidence of port running. The Agency has

setup a working group to carry out a comprehensive review of the issue. The working group will define the problem areas and formulate integrated solutions to inform travelers, motivate voluntary compliance, force compliance to the extent possible, and provide evidence for enforcement action. At the busier ports, these measures would have to be integrated in ways that do not exacerbate border congestion and delays.

The Agency is currently assessing the installation of movable barriers for each of its 345 primary inspection lanes as a deterrent to port running. To be effective, the primary inspection lane barriers would have to be complemented by other measures.

These other measures could include:

- Deploying barriers across the highway when ports are closed;
- Installing exit barriers and audible alarms to ensure that vehicles do not circumvent secondary inspection when directed;
- Dividing the highways from the border to a point beyond the port with concrete barriers to prevent the use of the United States bound lane to circumvent the port;
- Automatic cameras to record port running incidents to support prosecution; and Other measures that may be appropriate to address local issues or constraints.

The Agency will also review measures implemented by the U.S. Department of Homeland Security at ports of entry and the effectiveness of those measures. The Agency will coordinate the implementation of certain measures with the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, provincial highway departments, and with those local emergency services organizations that provide services in both the United States and Canada.

In addition to cost and operational effectiveness, the solutions selected for implementation would have to consider, traffic safety, officer safety, and the legal liability issues resulting from the deployment of these measures. Preliminary cost estimates, which continue to be analyzed, are significant for these integrated measures. The Agency has initiated further assessments to determine if security at the road crossings between Canada and the United States can be reinforced. This assessment will be done in concert with the RCMP as the responsibility for roads between the ports rests within its jurisdiction".

It's a slow start, but a start nonetheless. But there is still no word on addressing the procedural issues, such as an adequate system to ensure cars referred to secondary lines don't leave without a thorough secondary inspection. As we quoted Mr. Jolicoeur saying on page 40, "the only way to improve from year to year is to be more transparent about results".

We agree. CBSA should start by publishing official figures for border runners, and then act accordingly to reduce these numbers.

NEW RECOMMENDATIONS

- B4. The Committee recommends that Canada Border Services Agency complete its review and analysis of border running measures, and start to implement these measures at the ten ports with the highest number of border running incidents by Dec. 31, 2008.
- B5. That all land crossings have effective measures in place to prevent border running by Dec. 31, 2010.

Problem 13:

Backing Up Infrastructure at Key Border Crossings

Some border crossings are obviously more important to Canada and the United States than others. These important land crossings carry the heaviest volumes of people, goods and traffic - including well over 6 million trucks, 5 million containers, 61 million cars, and 3 million buses per year. Disruptions in service would result in significant damage to the economic health of both countries – especially to Canada.

Bridges and tunnels connecting Canada to the United States are strategic assets, vital to the national security and economic well-being of our two nations. The most important of these are the bridge and tunnel connecting Windsor to Detroit. Backup crossings are needed to reduce the reliance on potential failure points. They would provide an alternative in the event of a key crossing going down. 83

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that only those proposals for new crossing infrastructure at Windsor-Detroit which provide separate and secure infrastructure redundancy be considered. (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

According to Transport Canada's July 7, 2006 response:

"The Canada-United States-Ontario-Michigan border transportation partnership (the Partnership) through the Detroit River International Crossing (DRIC) study is identifying a location for a new river crossing, plazas for

⁸² US Bureau of Transportation Statistics, "Border Crossing Data US-Canada 1994-2003", Available at http://www.bts.gov/programs/international/border_crossing_entry_data/us_canada/index.html

⁸³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.45-46.

⁸⁴ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.47, Recommendation # 20

border inspections and connecting roads leading from Highway 401 in Canada to the Interstate Highway system in the United States. The study process was developed in order to satisfy the requirements of environmental laws in both countries.

On November 14, 2005 the Bi-National Partnership⁸⁵ for the development of a new crossing at the Windsor-Detroit Gateway announced that the Bi-National environmental assessment (EA) study teams would now concentrate future study of a new border crossing and inspection plazas to the industrial area of West Windsor. With the announcement, some of the crossing alternatives identified by the Partnership EA study team in June 2005, were eliminated (which among other criteria) did not provide separate and secure infrastructure. These proposals included the Detroit River Tunnel Partnership's two-lane truckway proposal determined to be inadequate to serve the region's long-term capacity needs and the Ambassador Bridge Twinning Proposal determined to not be practical based on the community impacts of the proposed plaza and access road in Canada.

On March 30, 2006 TC received an updated submission for the Ambassador Bridge Company for the Ambassador Enhancement Project. Under its obligations to the Canadian Environmental Assessment Act and the Navigable Waters Protection Act, TC will examine and respond to the proposal. TC remains committed to the Bi-National process and fulfilling its legislative and regulatory responsibilities."⁸⁶

⁸⁵ The Canada-United States-Ontario-Michigan border transportation partnership (the Partnership) through the Detroit River International Crossing (DRIC) study is identifying a location for a new river crossing, plazas for border inspections and connecting roads leading from Highway 401 in Canada to the Interstate Highway system in the United States. The study process was developed in order to satisfy the requirements of environmental laws in both countries.

⁸⁶ Transport Canada, "Response to Committee's Recommendations," (July 7, 2006), p.10.

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

The government's main consideration is clearly to increase capacity. Providing a nearby backup in the case of a bridge or tunnel being incapacitated by man-made or natural disaster does not appear to be a major consideration.

It is a major consideration for the Committee, so we were heartened to see that the proposed options of increasing capacity by widening the Windsor-Detroit tunnel or twinning the Ambassador Bridge were rejected. Good.

The Committee has been critical of the 2013 deadline – we felt that something so critical to the economies of both Canada and the United States could have been expedited.

However, the process was not expedited, so there is little point in flogging a dead horse. The Government should at least pull out all the stops to ensure that the 2013 deadline is met. A new bridge will bring sighs of relief and loud applause from the always-boisterous chambers of the Senate.

Problem 14:

Reverse Inspection Could Save Damage to Crossings

The key land border crossings between Canada and the United States – those bridges and tunnels that carry the majority of people and goods back and forth – are unnecessarily vulnerable. That is partially because trucks and people cross them every day *before* they are inspected.

The danger of this system is that an uninspected vehicle could stop in the middle of a tunnel or bridge and explode a bomb, disabling a crossing vital to the well-being of Canadians.

Reverse inspections, a process under which people and goods would be subject to examination prior to departure from their country of origin, would lessen this vulnerability.

Land pre-clearance and reverse inspections are not identical. When the term land pre-clearance is used, only one country might be operating on foreign soil. Reverse inspections implies a reciprocity – both countries are pre-clearing at all given crossings.⁸⁷ Reverse inspection is two-way pre-clearance.

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommended that the government move, with U.S. cooperation, to expand pre-clearance into continent-wide reverse inspection at all bridge and tunnel crossings. (Recommended in June 2005)
- The Committee recommended that the federal government develop and publicize an implementation plan for pre- clearance, with clearly understood timeframes.⁸⁹ (Recommended in June 2005)

⁸⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.40.

⁸⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43, Recommendation # 18

⁸⁹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43, Recommendation # 17

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) replied on August 30, 2006 as follows:

"On December 17, 2004, Canada and the U.S. announced that they would be piloting land pre-clearance at two locations. One pilot will be located at Peace Bridge, where U.S. border inspection operations will be moved from Buffalo, New York to Fort Erie, Ontario; Canadian inspection operations will be moved to the U.S. side of the border at the Thousand Islands Bridge.

Pre-clearance involves relocating the border operations of one country to another. It has been applied successfully in the air context for decades with U.S. border officers preclearing passengers (but not air cargo) destined to the U.S. at certain Canadian airports.

The formal negotiations on a Canada-U.S. Agreement on pre-clearance were put on hold with the dissolution of Parliament. Canadian negotiators have received a renewed mandate and negotiations have now resumed with a view to being successfully concluded by this fall.

Canadian and U.S. officials are working to finalize a land pre-clearance agreement at the earliest date and legislation will likely be required.

Reverse inspection involves the application of land preclearance twice, with the result being that, at the same crossing, U.S. border operations would be located in Canada and Canadian border operations are located in the U.S.

Canada has maintained that it is willing to consider reverse inspection at certain crossings where this makes sense. However, it would not be recommended for the Peace Bridge, the Thousand Islands Bridge or the Ambassador

Bridge unless the current geographical constraints at these crossings are addressed.

Reverse inspection would require the same instruments as for simple land pre-clearance, i.e., a government-to government agreement and legislative changes."⁹⁰

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Geographic Contraints: An Excuse to Do Nothing

What both countries need is a simple land swap at all bridges and tunnels connecting Canada and the United States, so that Canada owns snippets of the U.S. and the United States owns little snippets of Canada. This is not a new idea – foreign embassies, for instance, are foreign territory located inside our borders. The amount of land swapped should be roughly equal at each crossing. Secured highways would have to be constructed when the swapped land is not adjacent to the crossing.

Reverse inspection makes sense, but it is being held up because neither the Government of Canada or the Government of the United States is keen having armed persons from another country searching people on their own territory. Land swaps would put these search points under the jurisdiction of the neighbouring country.

NEW RECOMMENDATION

B6. The Committee recommends that the Government of Canada begin negotiations with the United States to effect land swaps/transfers of sovereignty to permit customs and immigration pre-clearance before a vehicle or an individual gains access to an international bridge or in an international tunnel.

⁹⁰ Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada, "Response from PSEPC/Portfolio on Reports from SCONSAD," (August 30, 2006),), p.6-7.

Problem 15:

No Plans for Reverse Inspection at New Windsor-Detroit Crossing

Problem 13 refers to the government's plan to build a new bridge in the Windsor-Detroit area. If there is one location at which reverse inspection should be introduced, it should be this one.

First, the structure will be new - it is far easier to incorporate reverse-inspection facilities at a new crossing than it is to re-fit an old crossing. Secondly, the Ontario-Michigan crossings are the most vital to the economic health of Canada.

Canadian and U.S. inspectors should switch sides of the border so they have an opportunity to protect their countries before potential wrongdoers arrive, and before any cargo that might do damage to a land border crossing enters that crossing. Best to apprehend a truck whose occupants want to blow up a bridge before that truck gets on the bridge.⁹¹

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that any new crossing constructed at Windsor-Detroit include facilities for reverse inspection. (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

According to Transport Canada's July 7, 2006 response:

"The Canada-United States-Ontario-Michigan border transportation partnership (the Partnership) is willing to consider reverse inspections if the appropriate agreement(s) can be reached between the Governments of

⁹¹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.46.

⁹² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.47, Recommendation # 21

Canada and the United States and if it can be implemented within the time frame of DRIC project. On this basis the Partnership is developing a business case for customs/inspection facilities that will allow for full plaza sites in both Canada and the United States." 93

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Alain Jolicoeur, the President of the Canada Border Service Agency told the Committee that reverse inspections are the preferred option for conducting inspections at border crossings.⁹⁴

This should be a no-brainer. The government should attach a priority to getting the agreement done and implemented within the time frame of the Detroit River International Crossing (DRIC) project. Furthermore, the Detroit-Windsor tunnel and the Ambassador Bridge are too critical to the economies of Canada and the United States to allow terrorists any advantage if they are targeted. For that reason both of these crossings should be retrofitted for reverse inspections.

⁹³ Transport Canada, "Response to Committee's Recommendations," (July 7, 2006), p10.

⁹⁴ Mr. Jolicoeur told the Committee that "if we have a treaty with the U.S. and get our legislation for pre-clearance, de facto we get the tools for doing reverse [inspection]...That is by far the preferred option coming from customs and border protection; and in some places, it would be the best recipe. Proceedings of the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, "Issue 27 – Evidence - Alain Jolicoeur, President, Canada Border Services Agency," (October 31, 2005)

NEW RECOMMENDATIONS

- B7. The Committee recommends that any new border crossing between Canada and the United States feature reverse inspection facilities, so that each country can check out vehicles entering its territory before those vehicles enter the crossing.
- B8. The Committee recommends that both the Detroit-Windsor tunnel and the Ambassador Bridge be retrofitted with reverse inspection facilities, so that each country can inspect vehicles entering its territory before those vehicles enter the crossing.
- B9. The Committee recommends that there be a corresponding transfer of sovereignty at the inspection plaza and a controlled access roadway leading to the new bridge.

Problem 16:

Windsor-Detroit Border Crossing a "Public Order Emergency"

The importance of the Windsor-Detroit crossings to Canada as a whole is so great, and the impact of a permanent disruption to these crossings so severe, that the Committee believes that the current situation constitutes a "public order emergency" to the security of Canada. That being the case, the federal government has both the mandate and obligation, in the interests of national security, to remedy the situation as quickly as possible by creating an additional separate crossing. It should do so by introducing legislation granting the Minister of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness the authority to expedite construction of key border infrastructure.⁹⁵

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that the federal government, in the interests of national security, introduce legislation that would grant the Governor-in-Council – upon the recommendation of the Minister of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness – the authority to expedite border infrastructure construction. (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

In its July 7, 2006 response to the Committee, Transport Canada wrote:

"The DRIC environmental assessment (EA) project complies with the existing legislative requirements in both countries— the Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA), the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act (OEAA) and the U.S. National Environmental Policy Act

⁹⁵ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.60.

⁹⁶ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.61,, Recommendation # 23

(NEPA). New federal legislation would not expedite the EA process. This project would still be required to comply with the OEAA and NEPA, which requires an extensive EA comparing a number of alternatives. In Canada, the planning process provided by the OEAA provides a solid framework to analyze and consult on the range of options that are available for choosing the location for a new border crossing. (sic)

The DRIC planning and environmental assessment study is being done in three years. This is record time for an EA of this size and complexity. The timeframe is necessary to ensure a systematic and thorough evaluation of reasonable and prudent alternatives including consultation with all affected stakeholders and proper documentation to help ensure speedy environmental approval as required by the legislation in both countries.

In March 2006, the Partnership announced the specific options for the new bridge, customs plazas and connecting access roads. Overall the environmental assessment is on schedule and progressing well.

The aggressive study schedule for the EA process is ontrack for submission of final reports planned for by the end of 2007, so that the Partnership may proceed to design and construction. The Partnership continues to seek opportunities to accelerate this schedule if it can be done so without jeopardizing the ability to gain environmental approvals.

In addition, the International Bridges and Tunnels Act (Bill C-3) will create one standard for all bridges and tunnels crossings. Included in this Act is a provision where the Governor in Council, based on the recommendation of the Minister of Transport, would have the authority to make regulations respecting the security and safety of

Government Response continued...

international bridges and tunnels. More specifically, it would ask of person who own or operate international bridges or tunnels:

- develop and implement security plans;
- specify what must be included in the security plan, and;
- require any information related to security and safety.

The Act received Second Reading in the House of Commons and was referred to Committee on May 1, 2006." ⁹⁷ (sic)

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

Introduce legislation which grants the Governor-in-Council the authority to expedite border infrastructure construction.

Our request was reasonable. Nothing was done. Build the bridge as soon as possible. [See Problem 13 – "there is little point in flogging a dead horse."]

63

⁹⁷ Transport Canada, "Minister of Transport: Response to Committee's Recommendations," (July 7, 2006) pp..10-11

Problem 17:

Need for Greater Public Awareness of Benefits of Safer Canada-U.S. Border Crossings

The crossings at Windsor-Detroit represent a critical continental linkage. Like the natural gas pipelines connecting western Canada to the energy markets of the Pacific United States, or the electricity transmission towers connecting northern Quebec to the northeastern United States, the linkages at Windsor-Detroit are vital to the economic prosperity of central Canada and the mid-western United States.⁹⁸

It is in Canada's interest – and America's overall interests as well to clearly understand the consequences of foot-dragging on reinforcing Canada-U.S. border crossings at Windsor-Detroit.⁹⁹

COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

• The Committee recommended that the federal government move in 2005 to fund an awareness campaign that will outline to Canadians and Americans the security and economic benefits that would result from reinforcing Canada-U.S. border crossings quickly and the potential cost of not doing so. (Recommended in June 2005)

GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

Responding to the Committee in July 2006, the Privy Council Office (PCO) replied:

"The Canadian government makes significant efforts to ensure that our border processes are capable of screening out threats to Canadians, while at the same time permitting

⁹⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.48.

⁹⁹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.56.

¹⁰⁰ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), Recommendation # 22

Government Response continued...

the streamlined movement of low risk people and goods to support trade growth and continued investment in Canada. This includes raising awareness both domestically and with our U.S. partners.

The Canada-U.S. Advocacy and Mission Liaison Division of Foreign Affairs Canada as well as the Advocacy Secretariat established in the Canadian Embassy in Washington are dedicated to promoting Government of Canada interests and policies in the United States. An important part of these duties is raising awareness of the importance of the border to the security and economy of both countries.

Activities occur at all levels:

- A group of senior Canadian officials (Commissioner of the RCMP: Director of CSIS; President of CBSA; Deputy Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) attended Capitol Hill meetings on June 15, 2006. These officials met with members of the House of Representatives and the Senate to provide specific information on Canada's security contributions as follow up to the alleged terrorist-related activities' arrests in Toronto and Kingston.
- Canada's Embassy in Washington hosted a reception for Congressional Friends of Canada caucus, a newly-formed bi-partisan group of elected representatives on June 21, 2006.
- Canadian officials collaborate with the Business for Economic Security, Trade, and Tourism (BESTT) coalition, a grassroots group made up of firms on both sides of the border that are concerned about the potential impact of the Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative (WHTI). The Embassy helped to facilitate BESTT's lobbying visit to Washington,

Government Response continued...

DC, in February 2006, where border security and the free movement of legitimate trade and travel were discussed.

- Canadian missions responsible for Canada-U.S. border regions (Anchorage, Seattle, Denver, Minneapolis, Detroit, Buffalo, and Boston) will be conducting a series of cross-border community events over the summer of 2006 to strengthen relationships with border stakeholders and share key messages on border security.
- Opinion-editorials are regularly prepared for U.S. newspapers designed to rebut claims that Canadian border security is weak, particularly in response to the myth that the 9/11 hijackers entered the United States through Canada.
- The Canadian Ambassador and Consuls-General regularly speak at chambers of commerce meetings, community forums, and academic conferences about Canada's commitment to security and facilitation at our borders.

Domestically, the Canada Border Services Agency has implemented a website (www.cbsa-asfc@gc.ca) to inform the Canadian public on the WHTI initiatives and the documentation requirements to enter the United States today and on December 31, 2006 and on December 31, 2007."

¹⁰¹ Privy Council Office, "Response of the Privy Council Office," (July 2006) p.4-5.

CHALLENGE TO GOVERNMENT

The Committee supports any attempt of the Government to promote Canada's interests with regards to border security. However, politicians don't listen to rational arguments – they listen to constitutents who will be annoyed with them if something doesn't get done.

On our trips to the United States, Committee members heard the same refrain from numerous politicians: we don't hear anything from our constituents about the issues you are pushing; we only hear about them from you. (They were polite enough not to add "and you don't count because you don't vote here," but we got the message).

If Canadian authorities are going to convince politicians to take steps to safeguard the economic relationship between Canada and the United States, they are going to have to go to U.S. citizens whose jobs depend on that relationship and convince them that measures must be taken to safeguard it.

People in striped pants talking to people in striped pants isn't good enough. Radio ads? TV ads? Comic books? Blogs? How about a Superbowl ad? We don't care. Just do what needs to be done. This relationship is crucial to the economic wellbeing of every Canadian. Spend some money promoting it – to the right people.

NEW RECOMMENDATION

B10. The Committee recommends that a comprehensive, multi-year mass media program be commissioned by the Government of Canada to better educate Canadian and American residents along the border of the importance of a secure and commerce-friendly border to the economy of both our countries.

APPENDIX I Order of Reference

Extract from the *Journals of the Senate*, Thursday, April 27, 2006:

It was moved by the Honourable Senator Kenny, seconded by the Honourable Senator Moore:

That the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence be authorized to examine and report on the national security policy of Canada. In particular, the Committee shall be authorized to examine:

- (a) the capability of the Department of National Defence to defend and protect the interests, people and territory of Canada and its ability to respond to and prevent a national emergency or attack, and the capability of the Department of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness to carry out its mandate;
- (b) the working relationships between the various agencies involved in intelligence gathering, and how they collect, coordinate, analyze and disseminate information and how these functions might be enhanced;
- (c) the mechanisms to review the performance and activities of the various agencies involved in intelligence gathering; and
 - (d) the security of our borders and critical infrastructure.

That the papers and evidence received and taken during the Thirty-seventh and Thirty-eighth Parliaments be referred to the Committee; and

That the Committee report to the Senate no later than March 31, 2007 and that the Committee retain all powers necessary to publicize the findings of the Committee until May 31, 2007.

After debate,

The question being put on the motion, it was adopted.

Paul C. Bélisle *Clerk of the Senate*

APPENDIX II Index of Recommendations Canadian Security Guidebook 2005

Problem 1: The Need for a Culture Shift on Our Borders

• The Committee recommended that the government restructure the personal exemption limits to allow CBSA to better focus on security. The restructuring should include harmonization with U.S. levels by 2007 and incremental bilateral increases to \$2000 per visit by 2010. (June 2005) ... PAGE 3

Problem 2: Poor Threat Identification at Borders

• The Committee recommended that by 30 June 2003 the Canada Border Service Agency offer substantive evidence that [it has] addressed the Auditor General's recommendations to improve training to help airport personnel identify persons "likely to engage in criminal activities or endanger the safety of Canadians."

The CBSA should also demonstrate that [it has] moved to gain access to police databanks that would assist in such identification, and provide their employees with the training and technology required to take advantage of these databanks. (Recommended in January 2003) ... PAGE 7

• The Committee recommended that CBSA upgrade the quality and fuse the data that is available to officers on the primary and secondary inspection lines.¹⁰⁴ (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 7

¹⁰² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, Borderline Insecure, (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005) p.14,, Recommendation # 1

¹⁰³ Standing Committee on National Security and Defence, *The Myth of Security at Canada's Airports*, (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, January 2003) p.25,, Recommendation #I. 2

¹⁰⁴ June 2005 - Borderline Insecure, (page 40). Recommendation # 16

Problem 3: Lack of Reliable Documentation

- The Committee recommended that by 2007, the government require documentation of all people entering Canada (including Canadians) that is:
 - a) Tamper-proof
 - b) Machine-readable
 - c) Biometrically enhanced
 - d) Known to have been issued on the basis of reliable documentation ¹⁰⁵ (Recommended in June 2005) ... **PAGE 14**

Problem 4: Inadequate Staffing Levels

• The Committee recommended that the number of personnel employed by the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) be sufficient to provide security commensurate with increased security threat associated with the increased traffic and threat at Canada-U.S. land border crossings in recent years. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 19

Problem 5: Undertrained Part-Time Customs Staff

- The Committee recommended that all personnel on the primary inspection line be trained to the highest standard, without exceptions for short-term staff. (Recommended in February 2002) ... PAGE 24
- The Committee recommended that CBSA deploy only inspectors fully-trained to the level of indeterminate employees to perform primary duties on inspection lines. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 24

¹⁰⁵ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43, Recommendation # 19

¹⁰⁶ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.21, Recommendation # 5

¹⁰⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Canadian Security and Military Preparedness*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, February 2002), p.121, Recommendation #15.A

¹⁰⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.4, Recommendation # 4

• The Committee recommended that CBSA investigate the possibility of pairing students with full-time inspectors at land border crossings so that students could earn both summer wages and credits toward community college diplomas associated with policing and security. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 24

Problem 6: The Need for Proper Training for All Border Guards on Duty

- The Committee recommended that the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) expand its training programs in line with its newly focused mission on security as opposed to tax collection. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 29
- The Committee recommended that CBSA improve its training programs for border agency personnel, with a special focus on components that increase skill sets for questioning techniques and cultural sensitivity. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 29

Problem 7: Unsafe Border Posts

- The Committee recommended that the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) ensure that no customs officers work alone at posts. (Recommended in February 2002) ... PAGE 33
- The Committee recommended that CBSA ensure that at least half of all shifts at land border crossings be staffed by at least two persons by Dec. 31, 2006; and that all shifts at all land border crossings be staffed by at least two persons by Dec. 31, 2007. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 33

¹⁰⁹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.25, Recommendation # 8

¹¹⁰ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.27, Recommendation #9

Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.27, Recommendation #10

¹¹² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Canadian Security and Military Preparedness* (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, February 2002), p.121, Recommendation #15. B

¹¹³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p. 22, Recommendation # 6

• The Committee recommended that the CBSA significantly increase its capacity to move extra personnel to posts during surge/emergency conditions, and that it document such an increase in capacity by Dec. 31, 2006. 114 (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 34

Problem 8: Unconnected Border Posts

• The Committee recommended that CBSA connect all 62 unconnected border posts with real-time access to the customs mainframe by January 1st, 2006. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 36

Problem 9: Culture of Secrecy: Who Do You Trust?

- The Committee recommended that the government implement a system of periodic effectiveness testing that assesses the effectiveness of each of the components of Canada's national security programs at our borders. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 38
- The Committee recommended that the government release the results of periodic effectiveness testing of border security programs, after a delay sufficient to remedy problems. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 38

Problem 10: Lack of a Credible System for Reporting Critical Incidents

• The Committee recommended that the Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) make mandatory the timely reporting and cataloguing of critical incidents faced by personnel.¹¹⁸ (Recommended in June 2005)

... PAGE 42

¹¹⁴ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.22). Recommendation # 7

¹¹⁵ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.40, Recommendation # 15

Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.18, Recommendation #2

¹¹⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.18, Recommendation #3

¹¹⁸ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation #11

• The Committee recommended that the CBSA include a tally of those incidents in the Agency's annual report to Parliament. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 42

Problem 11: Unarmed Border Officers

- The Committee recommended that the federal government arm border officers if it is not prepared to station and maintain a Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) presence at all border crossings. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 46
- The Committee recommended that if the government does go ahead with arming border officers, it create a firearm qualification and recertification program that meets or exceeds the Firearms Course Training Standards of the RCMP. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 46

Problem 12: Border Runners

No previous recommendations. See Appendix III for new recommendations.

Problem 13: Backing Up Infrastructure at Key Border Crossings

• The Committee recommended that only those proposals for new crossing infrastructure at Windsor-Detroit which provide separate and secure infrastructure redundancy be considered. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 52

Problem 14: Reverse Inspection Could Save Damage to Crossings

• The Committee recommended that the government move, with U.S. cooperation, to expand pre-clearance into continent-wide reverse inspection

¹¹⁹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation #12

¹²⁰ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation # 13

¹²¹ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.35, Recommendation # 14

¹²² Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.47, Recommendation # 20

at all bridge and tunnel crossings. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 55

• The Committee recommended that the federal government develop and publicize an implementation plan for pre-clearance, with clearly understood timeframes. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 55

<u>Problem 15: No Plans for Reverse Inspection at New Windsor-Detroit Crossing</u>

• The Committee recommended that any new crossing constructed at Windsor-Detroit include facilities for reverse inspection. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 58

Problem 16: Windsor-Detroit Border Crossing a "Public Order Emergency"

• The Committee recommended that the federal government, in the interests of national security, introduce legislation that would grant the Governor-in-Council – upon the recommendation of the Minister of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness – the authority to expedite border infrastructure construction. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 61

Problem 17: Need for Greater Public Awareness of Benefits of Safer Canada- U.S. Border Crossings

• The Committee recommended that the federal government move in 2005 to fund an awareness campaign that will outline to Canadians and Americans the security and economic benefits that would result from reinforcing Canada-U.S. border crossings quickly and the potential cost of not doing so. (Recommended in June 2005) ... PAGE 64

¹²³ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43, Recommendation # 18

¹²⁴ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.43, Recommendation # 17

¹²⁵ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.47, Recommendation # 21

¹²⁶ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), p.61,, Recommendation # 23

¹²⁷ Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence, *Borderline Insecure*. (Ottawa: Senate of Canada, June 2005), Recommendation # 22

APPENDIX III Index of New Recommendations

Problem 1: The Need for a Culture Shift on Our Borders

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 2: Poor Threat Identification at Borders

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 3: Lack of Reliable Documentation

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 4: Inadequate Staffing Levels

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 5: Undertrained Part-Time Customs Staff

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 6: The Need for Proper Training for All Border Guards on Duty

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 7: Unsafe Border Posts

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 8: Unconnected Border Posts

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 9: Culture of Secrecy: Who Do You Trust?

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 10: Lack of a Credible System for Reporting Critical Incidents

B1. The Committee recommends that for the purposes of its public reporting, the Canada Border Services Agency define what constitutes a critical incident and also define the maximum timeline for these incidents to be brought to the attention of senior management. ... PAGE 44

Problem 11: Unarmed Border Officers

- B2. The Committee recommends that until the Canadian Border Services Agency has completed the process of arming border guards, it should either place RCMP officers at all border crossings or hire off-duty police officers to provide protection for border officers and to assist in the apprehension of suspected criminals. ... PAGE 48
- B3. The Committee recommends that the Government of Canada ensure that once a border post has trained and armed border officers present, Canada Border Services Agency officers no longer have the right to unilaterally abandon these posts. ... PAGE 48

Problem 12: Border Runners

- B4. The Committee recommends that Canada Border Services Agency complete its review and analysis of border running measures, and start to implement these measures at the ten ports with the highest number of border running incidents by Dec. 31, 2008. ... PAGE 51
- B5. That all land crossings have effective measures in place to prevent border running by Dec. 31, 2010. ... PAGE 51

Problem 13: Backing Up Infrastructure at Key Border Crossings

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

Problem 14: Reverse Inspection Could Save Damage to Crossings

B6. The Committee recommends that the Government of Canada begin negotiations with the United States to effect land swaps/transfers of sovereignty to permit customs and immigration pre-clearance before a vehicle or an individual gains access to an international bridge or in an international tunnel. ... PAGE 57

Problem 15: No Plans for Reverse Inspection at New Windsor-Detroit Crossing

- B7. The Committee recommends that any new border crossing between Canada and the United States feature reverse inspection facilities, so that each country can check out vehicles entering its territory before those vehicles enter the crossing. ... PAGE 60
- B8. The Committee recommends that both the Detroit-Windsor tunnel and the Ambassador Bridge be retrofitted with reverse inspection facilities, so that each country can inspect vehicles entering its territory before those vehicles enter the crossing. ... PAGE 60
- B9. The Committee recommends that there be a corresponding transfer of sovereignty at the inspection plaza and a controlled access roadway leading to the new bridge. ... PAGE 60

Problem 16: Windsor-Detroit Border Crossing a "Public Order Emergency"

No new recommendations – old recommendations still stand. Please see Appendix II

<u>Problem 17: Need for Greater Public Awareness of Benefits of Safer Canada-U.S. Border Crossings</u>

B10. The Committee recommends that a comprehensive, multi-year mass media program be commissioned by the Government of Canada to better educate

Canadian and American residents along the border of the importance of a secure and commerce-friendly border to the economy of both our countries. ... PAGE 67

APPENDIX IV Glossary of Terms

Advance Passenger Information/Passenger Name Record Program (API-PNR)

The Advance Passenger Information/Passenger Name Record program, established by Citizenship and Immigration Canada, identifies and intercepts persons posing security risks as early and as far away from our borders as possible. The program provides CIC with information on air passengers and crew before they arrive in Canada. The goal of the API/PNR program is to intercept those who may pose a concern, such as: known terrorists; human smugglers; and other criminals.¹²⁸

Advance Commercial Information (ACI)

The ACI program provides CBSA officers with electronic pre-arrival cargo information so that they are equipped with the right information at the right time to identify health, safety and security threats related to commercial goods before the goods arrive in Canada. The ACI program applies to marine and air cargo and conveyance, and will soon be require advance transmission of cargo and conveyance information for highway and rail shipments. 129

Ambassador Bridge Enhancement Project

Detroit International Bridge Company (DIBC) is proposing to construct a 6-lane cable stayed bridge over the Detroit River, just west of the existing Ambassador Bridge. The new bridge will connect directly into the existing plazas in both Detroit and Windsor. The new structure will be 102.5 feet wide and 6,200 feet long, with approximately 2,200 feet traversing the Detroit River. Once the new structure is completed, the existing Ambassador Bridge will be taken out of service in order to evaluate and make repairs deemed necessary and economically feasible. 130

¹²⁸ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "The Advance Passenger Information / Passenger Name Record Program (API/PNR)," (January 2004), Available at http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/visit/api.html, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹²⁹ Canada Border Services Agency, "Advance Commercial Information," (January 2007), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/import/advance/menu-e.html#a1, Accessed March 19, 2007

Ambassador Bridge Enhancement Project, "Public Workshop Notice," (2007), Available at http://www.ambassadorbridge.com/workshop.pdf, Accessed March 19, 2007

Canadian Police Information Center (CPIC)

The Canadian Police Information Centre (CPIC) is a computerized information system to provide all Canadian law enforcement agencies with information on crimes and criminals, and is operated by the RCMP.¹³¹

Detroit River International Crossing (DRIC) / Bi-National Partnership

The Bi-National Environmental Assessment Partnership is a joint initiative between the Governments of Canada, the United States, Ontario and Michigan to implement a 30-year transportation strategy addressing the various challenges at the Windsor-Detroit Gateway, including free and secure trade, security, environmental concerns and community impacts. The Bi-National Partnership is a six-stage integrated planning and environmental process that is currently in its second stage (to be completed in 2007).

Integrated Border Query (IBQ)

The Integrated Border Query Tool (IBQ) is a computerized tool that allows CBSA employees working on border crossings to query multiple databases and computer systems at the same time, including the Canadian Police Information Centre.

Integrated Primary Inspection line (IPIL)

The Integrated Primary Inspection Line (IPIL) system is an automated support tool that provides customs officers with an immediate system response which identifies whether the traveller is on a customs or immigration lookout or has previous customs infractions. ¹³²

Integrated query tool (IQT)

Started in 2005, the Integrated Query Tool (IQT) is the information sharing tool for federal public safety agencies such as the RCMP, Canada Border Services Agency and Canada Firearms Centre. ¹³³

International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO)

The International Civil Aviation Organization is the specialized agency of the United Nations whose mandate is to ensure the safe, efficient and orderly evolution of international civil aviation. ICAO has its headquarters in Montreal, Canada, and

Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "Canadian Police Information Centre (CPIC)," (February 2007), Available at http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca//factsheets/fact_cpic_e.htm, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹³² Canada Border Services Agency, "Integrated Primary Inspection Line System" (January 2002), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/media/facts-faits/034-eng.html, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹³³ Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "National Integrated Interagency Information (N-III) System," (January 2007), Available at http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/niii/index_e.htm, Accessed March 19, 2007

represents over 180 Contracting States. ICAO provides the forum whereby requirements and procedures in need of standardization may be introduced, studied and resolved. 134

National Integrated Interagency Information System (N-III) project

The National Integrated Interagency Information (N-III) System supports government departmental cooperation and information sharing. It is comprised of the Police Information Protocol (another query tool capable of electronically accessing data in police records), for Canadian police services and the Integrated Query Tool for federal public safety agencies. ¹³⁵

National Risk Assessment Centre (NRAC)

Established January 2004 by the CBSA, the National Risk Assessment Centre is a focal point and interface between intelligence agencies at the international, national, and local levels to protect Canadians against current and emerging threats. It operates on a 24/7 basis. 136

National Routing System (NRS)

The National Routing System (NRS) is a secure electronic communications environment permitting provinces, territories and federal departments to exchange vital event information. It allows provincial and territorial vital event registrars to validate birth information that is essential to authenticate identity and to notify federal departments of deaths in order to manage changes to program entitlements in a timely manner. ¹³⁷

Nexus Air, Nexus Marine and Partners in Protection programs

NEXUS is a joint customs and immigration program for frequent travellers that both the Canadian and American governments have implemented. The NEXUS program is designed to simplify border crossings for pre-approved, low-risk travelers. NEXUS is active for selected air, land and marine points of entry: 11 land locations and Vancouver Airport. 138

¹³⁵ Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "National Integrated Interagency Information (N-III) System," (January 2007), Available at http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/niii/index_e.htm, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹³⁴ International Civil Aviation Organization, "The International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO)," (August 11, 2004), Available at http://www.icao.int/cgi/goto_m.pl?icao/en/anb/mais/index.html, Accessed on March 19, 2007

¹³⁶ Canada Border Services Agency, "National Risk Assessment Centre," (January 2005), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/media/facts-faits/039-eng.html, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹³⁷ John Menic and Mel Turner, "National Routing System for Vital Events," (June 2006), Available at http://www.unece.org/stats/documents/ece/ces/sem.54/3.e.pdf, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹³⁸ Canada Border Services Agency, "NEXUS", (February 2007), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/travel/nexus/menu-e.html, Accessed March 19, 2007

Partners in Protection (PIP)

The Partners in Protection program is a Canada Border Services Agency initiative with private industry. Under the PIP program, participating private industries sign an agreement with the CBSA. Working together, the CBSA and the partner company develop a joint plan of action, conduct security assessments, participate in awareness sessions and consult on a regular basis. The CBSA also reviews the partner's security measures and provides guidance, advice or suggestions to address any potential gaps. ¹³⁹

Port-of-Entry Recruit Training (POERT)

Port of Entry Recruit Training Program (POERT) pilot sessions provide CBSA recruits with a cross-program training environment, integrating aspects of border services functions related to food, plant and animal inspection, immigration and customs. POERT began at the CBSA Learning Center in Rigaud, QC in mid-2005-2006. 140

Primary Automated Lookout System (PALS)

The Primary Automated Lookout System is a critical risk management system used by CBSA officers and is deployed along the land border all across the country. It is used to verify the license plates of vehicles entering Canada. The license plate information is then cross-referenced against enforcement databases.¹⁴¹

Radio frequency identification (RFID)

Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) is a subset of a group of technologies, often referred to as automatic identification, that are used to help machines identify objects, and which include bar codes and smart cards. RFID refers to the subset of automatic identification that uses radio waves to automatically identify bulk or individual items. 142

Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs)

Standard operating procedures are used in a variety of different contexts, from everyday use (often ironically), to industry and the military. Generally, a Standard Operating Procedure is a set of instructions having the force of a directive,

¹³⁹ Canada Border Services Agency, "Partners in Protection," (January 2007), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/media/facts-faits/048-eng.html, Accessed March 20, 2007

¹⁴⁰ http://www.tbs-sct.gc.ca/dpr-rmr/0506/BSA-ASF/bsa-asf02 e.asp

Treasury Board of Canada, "2007-2008 Part I - The Government Expenditure Plan," (February 28, 2007)

Available at http://www.tbs-sct.gc.ca/est-pre/20072008/me-bd/part1/me-029_e.asp?printable=True, Accessed March 2007

Office of the Privacy Commissioner of Canada, "RFID Technology," (February 23, 2006), Available at http://www.privcom.gc.ca/fs-fi/02_05_d_28_e.asp, Accessed on March 19, 2007

covering those features of operations that lend themselves to a definite or standardized procedure without loss of effectiveness. 143

Security and Prosperity Partnership (SPP)

The Security and Prosperity Partnership of North America (SPP) was launched in March of 2005 as a trilateral effort to increase security and enhance prosperity among the United States, Canada and Mexico through greater cooperation and information sharing.¹⁴⁴

Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative (WHTI)

The Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative (WHTI) is a U.S. law that will require all travellers, including Canadians, to carry a valid passport or other appropriate secure document when travelling to the United States from within the western hemisphere. The WHTI will be implemented in two phases: the first phase affects travel to the United States by air only. Since January 23, 2007, Canadians require a valid passport; or a NEXUS card (used at a NEXUS kiosk at designated airports). The second phase will include travel to the United States by all modes of travel, including land and sea and will be implemented on June 1, 2009. ¹⁴⁵

¹⁴³ Wikipedia, "Standard Operating Procedure," (March 9, 2007), Available at http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Standard_Operating_Procedures, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹⁴⁴ Security and Prosperity Partnership of North America, Available at http://www.spp.gov/, Accessed March 19, 2007

¹⁴⁵ Canada Border Services Agency, "Travel Documents for Crossing the Border," (March 8, 2007), Available at http://www.cbsa-asfc.gc.ca/agency/whti-ivho/what-quoi-e.html, Accessed March 19, 2007

APPENDIX V Who the Committee Heard From

Abbas, Mr. Leo Mayor Town of Happy Valley Goose Bay February 3, 2005

Adams, Mr. John Commissioner Canadian Coast Guard May 5, 2003

Addy, Major General (ret'd) Clive National Past Chairman, Federation of Military and United Services Institutes of Canada October 15, 2001

Alarie, Master Corporal Bernadette Canadian Forces Dental Services School CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Allan, Major Murray Deputy Commanding Officer Royal Regina Rifles January 27, 2003

Allen, Mr. Jon Director General, North America Bureau Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade

Anderson, Colonel N.J. National Defence May 2, 2005

Arcand, Chief Warrant Officer Gilles 5th Combat Engineer Regiment CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

January 28, 2002, March 17, 2003

Atkins, Chief Superintendent Ian Criminal Operations Officer, H Division, RCMP January 22-24, 2002, September 22-23, 2003 **Adams,** Superintendent Bill Federal Services Directorate RCMP June 9, 2003

Adams, Corporal Terrance CFB Borden Technical Services CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Addy, Major General (ret'd) Clive Conference of Defence Associations (Ottawa) June 27, 2005

Alexander, Dr. Jane Deputy Director U.S. Defence Advanced Research Projects Agency (DARPA) February 4, 2002

Allard, The Honorable Wayne
Ranking Member (Republican – Virginia), U.S.
Senate Armed Services Committee
February 5, 2002

Amos, Chief Warrant Officer Bruce 423 Maritime Helicopter Squadron, 12 Wing Shearwater January 22-24, 2002

Andrash, Mr. P. (Duke) Sergeant 481, Vancouver Police Department November 18-22, 2001

Armstrong, Tim Assistant Chief, Special Operations Vancouver Fire & Rescue Services January 29, 2007

Atkinson, Ms. Joan Assistant Deputy Minister, Policy and Program Development Department of Citizenship and Immigration January 28, 2002

Audcent, Mr. Mark

Law Clerk and Parliamentary Counsel

Senate of Canada December 2, 2002

Axworthy. Dr. Thomas

Chairman, Centre for Study of Democracy Queen's University

September 29, 2003

Baird, Master Corporal Keith

Bravo Squadron **CFB Kingston** May 7-9, 2002

Baker, Lieutenant-Colonel Roy

Wing Logistics and Engineering Officer

CFB Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Balnis. Richard

Senior Research Officer

Canadian Union of Public Employees

November 18, 2002

Barbagallo. Lieutenant Jason

The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Barr, Colonel David E.

Commander, Canadian Special Operations Forces Command

(CANSOFCOM) National Defence November 20, 2006

Barrette. Mr. Jean

Director, Security Operations, Safety and Security Group

Transport Canada

November 27, 2002 / December 2, 2002 / October 2, 2006

Basrur, Dr. Sheela

Medical Officer of Health

City of Toronto

October 30, 2003

Bastien. Commander Yves

Formation Administration Officer

Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Avis, Captain Peter

Director of Maritime Policy, Operations and Readiness

Department of National Defence

April 7, 2003

Badger. Captain Chris J.

Vice President, Operations, Vancouver Port Authority

November 18-22, 2001

Baker, Mr. Mike

Vice-President, Corporate Management

Canadian Air Transport Security Authority

November 25, 2002

Baker, Phillip

Director General, Afghanistan, India, Nepal, Sri Lanka Div.

Canadian International Development Agency

May 29, 2006

Baltabaev, M.P., Mr. Tashpolot

Kyrgyz Republic

May 12, 2003

Bariteau, Lieutenant-Colonel François

Commanding Officer, Canadian Forces

Leadership and Recruit School

National Defence

June 1, 2005

Barrett, Major Roger R.

Operational Officer, 2 RCR

CFB Gagetown

January 22-24, 2002

Bartley, Mr. Alan

Director General, Policy Planning and Readiness, Office of Emergency

Infrastructure Protection Critical

Preparedness

July 19, 2001

Bastien, Major-General Richard

Deputy Commander of Air

Assistant Chief of the Air Staff

Department of National Defence

December 3, 2001

Baum, Major Nigel

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

APPENDIX V

Who the Committee Heard From

Bax, Ms. Janet

Director General, Programs

Office of Critical Infrastructure Protection and Emergency

Preparedness

October 20, 2003

Beaton, Chief of Police Jack

City of Calgary

February 1, 2007

Beattie, Lieutenant-Colonel Mark

Senior Staff Officer, Canadian Forces Support Training Group,

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Beers, Master Corporal Robert

Canadian Forces School of Electrical and Mechanical

Engineering CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Begley, Inspector J.J. (Jim) Federal Policing Service

RCMP

November 18-22, 2001

Bell, Lieutenant-Commander John

Commander, HMCS Queen

National Defence

March 9, 2005

Belzile, Lieutenant-General (ret'd) Charles

Chairman

Conference of Defence Associations

October 15, 2001

Bernier, Warrant Officer Michel

5th Military Police Platoon

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Berthiaume, Lieutenant-Colonel Philip (Res)

Essex and Kent Scottish Regiment

December 1, 2004

Bildfell, Mr. Brian

Director, Ambulance Services

City of Windsor

February 27, 2003

Beare, Brigadier-General Stuart A. Commander, Land Forces

Western Area

National Defence

March 7, 2005

Beattie, Captain Davie

Canadian Parachute Centre Adjutant

CFB Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Beazley, Chief Frank

Halifax Regional Police

Halifax Regional Municipality

September 23, 2003

Begin, Mr. Robert

Regional Director, Quebec

Office of Critical Infrastructure Protection and Emergency

Preparedness

October 27, 2003

Belcourt, Chief Warrant Officer Mario

12th Canadian Armoured Regiment

5th Canadian Mechanized Brigade CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Bell, Mr. Peter

Intelligence Analyst

Organized Crime Agency of B.C.

November 18-22, 2001

Bercuson, Dr. David J.

Director, Centre for Military and Strategic Studies

University of Calgary

April 19, 2004 and March 8, 2005

Berry, Major David

Canadian Parachute Centre Training Officer Commander

CFB Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Berthiaume, Mr. Tim

Deputy Fire Chief

City of Windsor

February 10, 2003

Bilodeau, Mr. Ronald

Associate Secretary to the Cabinet, Deputy Minister to the

Deputy Prime Minister and Security and Intelligence

Coordinator, Privy Council Office

February 24, 2003

Bishop Jr., The Honorable Sanford D.

(Democrat – Georgia)

U.S. House Select Committee on Intelligence

February 5, 2002

Black, Mr. Bob

Director, Office of Emergency Preparedness

City of Edmonton

January 28, 2003 / January 30, 2007

Blackmore, Mr. David

Director of Building and Property, Emergency Operations

Centre Manager City of St. John's

March 31, 2003

Blair, Master Warrant Officer Gérald

Canadian Forces School of Communications and Electronics

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Blanchette, Lieutenant-Colonel Michael

Commander, Canadian Parachute School

CFB Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Blight, Master Corporal

8 Air Maintenance Squadron

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Bloodworth, Ms Margaret

Deputy Minister

Public Safety and Emergency

Preparedness Canada

February 15, 2005

Bolton, Lieutenant Colonel Bruce D

Commanding Officer

The Black Watch, Royal Highland Regiment of Canada

November 5-6, 2001

Bonnell, Mr. R.J. (Ray)

Superintendent, Officer in Charge, Protective Services

Branch, RCMP

December 2, 2002

Bouchard, Major-General J.J.C

Commander, 1 Canadian Air Division

National Defence

March 10, 2005

Bissonnette, Captain J.R.A.

Commander, 5th Military Police Platoon

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Black, Lieutenant Colonel Dean C.

Commanding Officer, 403 Squadron

CFB Gagetown

January 22-24, 2002

Blair, Colonel Alan

12 Wing Commander

National Defence

May 5, 2005

Blanchard, Master Corporal Piette

Canadian Forces Dental Services School

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Bland, Professor Douglas

Chair of Defence Management Program, School of Policy

Studies

Queen's University

October 29, 2001 / May 27, 2002 / June 27, 2005

Blondin, Colonel Yvan

Wing Commander, 3 Wing Bagotville

National Defence

June 1, 2005

Boisjoli, Lieutenant-Commmander André

Commanding Officer, HMCS Glace Bay, Maritime Forces

Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Bon, Mr. Daniel

Director General, Policy Planning, Assistant Deputy Minister,

Policy

Department of National Defence

July 18, 2001

Boswell, Lieutenant-Colonel Brad

Acting Director of Army Doctrine

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Boucher, Mr. Mark

National Secretary Treasurer

Canadian Merchant Service Guild

February 2, 2005

APPENDIX V

Who the Committee Heard From

Boulden, Ms Jane

Canada Research Chair in International Relations and Security

Studies

Royal Military College of Canada

November 29, 2004

Boutilier, Dr. James A.

Special Advisor (Policy), Maritime Forces, Pacific Headquarters

Department of National Defence

June 9, 2003

Boyer, Colonel Alain

Commander 15 Wing Moose Jaw

National Defence

March 9, 2005

Brandt, Mr. Brion

Director, Security Policy

Transport Canada

May 5, 2003 / February 12, 2007

Brochet, Inspector Pierre, Chief of Operation,

Planning Section, Montreal Police Service, City of

Montreal

September 26, 2003

Brooks, Captain Melissa

CFB Petawawa

June 25-27, 2002

Brown, Rick

Executive Director, Emergency Management Alberta

Government of Alberta

January 30, 2007

Buck, Vice-Admiral Ron

Chief of the Maritime Staff Department of National Defence

December 3, 2001, August 14, 2002, April 7, 2003

Buenacruz, Corporal

Wing Administration

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Bujold, Mr. Guy

Assistant Deputy Minister

Infrastructure Canada

February 7, 2005

Bourgeois, Mr. Terry

District Chief, Rural District 3, Communications, Fire and

Emergency Service, Halifax Regional Municipality

September 23, 2003

Bowes, Lieutenant-Colonel Steve

Armour School

C.F.B. Gagetown

National Defence

January 31, 2005

Bramah, Mr. Brian

Regional Director

Transport Canada

November 18-22, 2001

Bradley, Corporal John

Imagery Technician

17 Wing Imaging and Associate Air Force Historian, 17 Wing

Winnipeg

November 18-22, 2001

Brodeur, Vice-Admiral (Ret'd) Nigel

As an individual

March 1, 2005

Brown, Major Chris

424 Squadron

CFB Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Bryan, Mr. Robert

Emergency Planning Coordinator

City of Vancouver

January 30, 2003

Buck, Vice-Admiral Ron

Vice Chief of the Defence Staff

National Defence

December 6, 2004

Bugslag, Mr. Bob

Executive Director, Provincial Emergency

Program

Government of British Columbia

March 1, 2005

Bullock, Ms. Margaret

Manager, Security Awareness, Policy and

Regulatory Corporate Security, Air Canada

November 18-22, 2001

Burke, Captain (N) Greg Chief of Staff, Maritime Forces Atlantic Department of National Defence January 22-24, 2002

Burr, Ms Kristine Assistant Deputy Minister, Policy Transport Canada February 7, 2005

Burrell, Fire Chief (William) Bruce Director of Disaster Services City of Calgary February 1, 2007

Cabana, Chief Superintendent Mike Royal Canadian Mounted Police Federal and International Operations, Director General Border Integrity October 30, 2006

Cameron, Colonel Scott
Director of Medical Policy on the staff of the Director
General Health Services (DGHS)
Department of National Defence
December 10, 2001

Campbell, Anthony Vice-President, Canadian Association for Security and Intelligence Studies June 3, 2002

Campbell, Master Corporal Steve 426 Training Squadron, 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Caouette, Sergeant Denis, Operational Planning Section, Montreal Police Service, City of Montreal September 26, 2003

Caron, Corporal Denis National Support Arrangements Coordinator, Coast and Airport Watch National Coordinator, Organized Crime Branch, RCMP April 7, 2003

Carroll, Lieutenant-Commander Derek HMCS Tecumseh National Defence March 8, 2005 **Burke,** Mr. Sean Research Associate, National Security Studies, Council on Foreign Relations

February 4, 2002

Burrell, Mr. Bruce Assistant Deputy Chief Director, Halifax Regional Fire Service Halifax Regional Municipality September 23, 2003

Butler, Mr. John Regional Director, Newfoundland and Labrador Canadian Coast Guard February 2, 2005

Calder, Mr. Kenneth Assistant Deputy Minister, Policy Department of National Defence November 26, 2001, August 14, 2002, April 26, 2004, October 25, 2004

Cameron, Captain Keith CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Campbell, Lieutenant-General Lloyd Commander of Air Command and Chief of the Air Staff Department of National Defence December 3, 2001

Camsell, Lieutenant-Colonel J.F. 36th Service Battalion February 2, 2005

Capstick, Colonel Mike Director, Land Personnel Strategy Patricia's Canadian Light Infantry March 10, 2005

Caron, Lieutenant-General Marc Chief of Land Staff National Defence February 7, 2005

Castillo, Corporal Marvin CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

APPENDIX V

Who the Committee Heard From

Castonguay, Staff Sergeant Charles

Unit Commander, RCMP November 5-6, 2001

Cessford, Lieutenant-Colonel Michael

Acting Commader, Canadian Forces Joint Operations Group, CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Charette, Mr. Serge National President

Customs Excise Union Douanes Accise

January 22-24, 2002

Chartrant, Lieutenant-Commander Yves Acting Commanding Officer, HMCS Huron

Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Christie, Mr. Ryerson

Researcher, Centre for International and Security Studies York University

March 21, 2005

Clapham, Superintendent, Ward D.

Officer in Charge

RCMP

November 18-22, 2001

Clarke, Master Corporal James

Gulf Squadron CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Coble, The Honorable Howard

Ranking Member (Republican, North Carolina)

U.S. House Judiciary Committee

February 7, 2002

Collenette, P.C., M.P., The Honourable David Michael

Minister of Transport December 2, 2002 Cellucci, H.E. Paul

Ambassador

Embassy of the United States of America to Canada

August 15, 2002

Chapin, Mr. Paul

Director General, International Security Bureau,

Department of Foreign Affairs and International

Trade

February 23, 2004

Chartier, Honorary Lieutenant-Colonel Victor G., OMM,

CD.

The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Chow, Lieutenant Commander Robert

Commanding Officer, HMCS Unicorn (Saskatoon)

January 27, 2003

Cirincione, Mr. Joseph

Senior Director, Non Proliferation Project, The

Carnegie Foundation February 5, 2002

Clark, Captain Robert

CO BW No.2497 Cadet Corps Head Librarian, Law Library

McGill University

November 5-6, 2002

Clarke, Mr. Shawn

Acting Regional Director, Prince Edward Island, Office of Critical Infrastructure Protection and

Office of Chilear Illiastructure Protection and

Emergency Preparedness

October 27, 2003

Cohen, Mr. Andrew

Associate Professor, School of

Journalism and Communications

Carleton University March 21, 2005

Connolly, Mr. Mark

Director General, Contraband and Intelligence

Services Directorate, Customs Branch Canada Customs and Revenue Agency February 10, 2003, September 22, 2003

Connolly, Mr. Mark

Head, Customs Contraband, Intelligence and Investigations

Canada Border Services Agency

February 23, 2004

Cooper, First Officer Russ

Toronto Representative, Security Committee Air Canada Pilots Association

November 4, 2002

Cormier, Master Seaman Michael

Canadian Forces Military Police Academy

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Côté, Mr. Bertin

Deputy Head of Mission

Canadian Embassy (Washington)

February 4-7, 2002

Côté, Brigadier-General Gaston

Commander, Land Forces Quebec Area

National Defence June 1, 2005

Coulter, Mr. Keith

Chief, Communications Security Establishment

February 24, 2003

Crabbe, Lieutenant-General (Ret'd) Ray

Royal Military Institute of Manitoba (RMIM)

March 10, 2005

Crober, Mr. Paul

Regional Director for B.C. and Yukon,

Emergency Mgmt. and National Security Sector, Public Safety

and Emergency Preparedness Canada

March 1, 2005

Crosman, Colonel John

Assistant Chief of Staff Plans, Maritime Forces Pacific

Headquarters

National Defence

January 29, 2007

Croxall, Corporal Kevin

CFB Borden Administration Services, CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Conyers, Jr., The Honorable John

Ranking Member Democrat-Michigan, U.S. House

Judiciary Committee

February 7, 2002

Corcoran, Mr. James

Former Deputy Director, Operations

Canadian Security and Intelligence Service

October 1, 2001

Cormier, Captain Michael P.

Deputy Harbour Master

Vancouver Port Authority

November 18-22, 2001

Côté, Master Corporal Claude

Bravo Squadron

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Côté, Mr. Yvan

Investigator, Organized Crime Task Force, Montreal

Urban Community Police Department

November 5-6, 2001

Couture, Lieutenant-General Christian

Assistant Deputy Minister (Human Resources-Military)

Department of National Defence

December 10, 2001

Creamer, Mr. Dennis

Vice-President, Finance and Administration

Halifax Port Authority

January 22-24, 2002

Crosbie, Mr. William

Director General, North America Bureau

Foreign Affairs Canada

April 11, 2005

Crouch, Dr. Jack Dyer

Assistant Secretary of Defence, International

Security Policy

Office of the U.S. Secretary of Defence

February 6, 2002

Cushman, Dr. Robert

Chief Medical Officer of Health, City of Ottawa

February 3, 2003

APPENDIX V

Who the Committee Heard From

D'Avignon, Mr. Michel

Director General, National Security, Policing and Security Branch, Solicitor General Canada July 19, 2001

Daigle, MSC, CD, MGen. Pierre Special Advisor to the Chief of Defence Staff Department of National Defence March 17, 2003 / February 23, 2004

Daniels, Private Jason CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Davies, Ms. Krysta M. Intelligence Analyst Specialist KPMG Investigation and Security Inc. October 01, 2001

DeCastro, Second Lieutenant. Rod The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Deemert, Mr. Rob Cabin Security, International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers August 15, 2002

Dempsey, Mr. Lawrence National Secretary Treasurer Canadian Merchant Service Guild September 22, 2003, February 2, 2005

De Riggi, Mr. Angelo Intelligence Officer Organized Crime Task Force - RCMP November 5-6, 2001

Desrosiers, Chief Warrant Officer Christian 5th Canadian Light Artillery Regiment September 24, 2003

deVries, Nicolaas C.W.O. (Ret'd) Military Bands January 31, 2005 D'Cunha, Dr. Colin

Commissioner of Public Health, Chief Medical Officer of Health, Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care, Ontario
October 30, 2003

Dallaire, Gabriel Gulf Squadron, CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Davidson, Rear-Admiral Glenn V. Commander, Maritime Forces Atlantic Department of National Defence September 22, 2003

Dawe, Mr. Dick Manager, Personnel Support Programmes, Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

DeCuir, Brigadier-General Mike Deputy Regional Commander Canadian NORAD Region Headquarters November 18-22, 2001

Deering, Richard Chief of Police Royal Newfoundland Constabulary February 3, 2005

Dempster, Major-General Doug Director General, Strategic Planning National Defence April 11, 2005

Deschamps, Col. André Director, Continental Operations Department of National Defence May 6, 2002

Devlin, Mr. W.A. (Bill)
Manager, Hub Development, Vancouver
International Airport
Air Canada
November 18-22, 2001

Dewar, Captain (N) (Ret'd) John Member, Maritime Affairs Navy League of Canada May 12, 2003, June 2, 2003

Dewitt, Mr. David

Director, Centre for International and Security Studies York University December 2, 2004

Dietrich, Chief Warrant Officer Dan Chief Warrant Officer One Canadian Air Division November 18-22, 2001

Ditchfield, Mr. Peter Deputy Chief Officer Organized Crime Agency of B.C. November 18-22, 2001

Doherty, Lieutenant-Colonel Brian Commanding Officer, 14 Service Battalion National Defence February 1, 2007

Douglas, Lieutenant-Colonel Brian Artillery School C.F.B. Gagetown National Defence January 31, 2005

Downton, Master Corporal Doug 426 Training Squadron 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Droz, Superintendent Pierre Criminal Operations RCMP November 5-6, 2001

Dufour, Major Rénald Commander, 58th Air Defence Battery CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Duguay, Mr. Yves Senior Director Corporate Security Risk Management Air Canada November 18-22, 2001

Dumais, Lieutenant-General Marc J. Commander, Canada Command National Defence October 2, 2006 **Dickenson,** Mr. Lawrence T.

Assistant Secretary to the Cabinet, Security and Intelligence
Privy Council Office
October 29, 2001 / February 24, 2003

Dion, Corporal Yves Canadian Forces Fire Academy CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Doge, Ms. Trish Director, Risk and Emergency Management, City of Vancouver January 30, 2003 / January 29, 2007

Dongworth, Steve Deputy Chief of Emergency Management (Fire Department) City of Calgary February 1, 2007

Dowler, Chief Petty Officer First Class George Maritime Forces Atlantic January 22-24, 2002

Doyle, Lieutenant Colonel Bert Commanding Officer, 402 Squadron 17 Wing Winnipeg November 18-22, 2001

Duchesneau, Mr. Jacques President and Chief Executive Officer Canadian Air Transport Security Authority November 25, 2002 / October 30, 2006

Dufresne, Corporal Canadian Forces Postal Unit 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Dumais, Lieutenant-General Marc J. Deputy Chief of the Defence Staff National Defence June 27, 2005

Duncan, Mr. Mark Vice-President, Operations Canadian Air Transport Security Authority November 25, 2002 / October 30, 2006

APPENDIX V

Who the Committee Heard From

Dunn, Major General Michael Vice Director, Strategic Plans and Policy The Pentagon

February 6, 2002

Earnshaw, Commander Paul F.

Commanding Officer TRINITY, Joint Ocean Surveillance Information Centre National Defence September 22, 2003

Egener, Mark

Managing Director, Emergency Management Alberta Government of Alberta January 30, 2007

Elliott, Mr. William

Assistant Deputy Minister, Safety and Security Group Transport Canada November 27, 2002, December 2, 2002, May 5, 2003

Ellis, Captain Cameron CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Ellis, Ms. Karen

Assistant Deputy Minister (Infrastructure and Environment), National Defence June 6, 2005

Erkebaev, M.P., The Honourable Abdygany Speaker of the Legislative Assembly Kyrgyz Republic May 12, 2003

Evraire, Lieutenant-General (Ret'd) Richard J. Conference of Defence Associations April 19, 2004

Fagan, Mr. John

Director of Intelligence and Contraband, Atlantic Region Canada Customs and Revenue Agency January 22-24, 2002

Falconer, Captain Vic

Formation Drug Education Coordinator, Formation Health Services (Pacific) Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001 **Durocher,** Captain Pascal Deputy Commanding Officer, 2EW Squadron, CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Edmonds, Captain (N) David Chief of Staff Personnel & Training, Naval Reserve Department of National Defence September 25, 2003

Elcock, Mr. Ward Director

Canadian Security Intelligence Service August 14, 2002, February 17, 2003

Elliott, QC, William J.S. Associate Deputy Minister Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada June 19, 2006

Ellis, Colonel Jim 2nd in Command, Operation Peregrine National Defence March 1, 2005

Enger, Inspector T.G. (Tonia) Operations Officer RCMP November 18-22, 2001

Evans, Ms. Daniela Chief, Customs Border Services Canada Customs and Revenue Agency November 18-22, 2001

Fadden, Mr. Richard

Deputy Clerk, Counsel and Security Intelligence Coordinator Privy Council Office October 29, 2001, January 29, 2002, August 14, 2002

Fagan, Mr. Wayne Regional Vice-President Union of Canadian Transportation Employees (UCTE) February 2, 2005

Falkenrath, Mr. Richard Senior Director U.S. Office of Homeland Security February 7, 2002

Fantino, Chief Julian Toronto Police Service May 6, 2002

Farr, Mr. Bruce

Chief and General Manager, Toronto Emergency Medical Services City of Toronto October 30, 2003

Fergusson, Mr. James

Centre for Defence and Security Studies Department of Political Studies University of Manitoba March 10, 2005

Ferris, Mr. John

Faculty of Social Sciences, International Relations Program University of Calgary March 8, 2005

Fisher, Second Lieutenant Greg The Black Watch

November 5-6, 2002

Flack, Mr. Graham

Director of Operations, Borders Task Force Privy Council Office March 17, 2003, February 23, 2004

Fleshman, Larry

General Manager, Customer Service Toronto, Air Canada June 24, 2002

Fonberg, Mr. Robert

Deputy Secretary to the cabinet, Operations Privy Council Office March 17, 2003

Forcier, Vice-Admiral J.C.J.Y. Commander, Canada Command National Defence May 8, 2006

Fortin, Jean-Pierre 1st National Vice-President Customs Excise Union Douanes Accise (CEUDA) December 4, 2006 Farmer, Mr. Rick

Area Manager, Ontario East Port of Entries Citizenship and Immigration Canada May 7-9, 2002

Ferguson, Mr. Brian

Assistant Deputy Minister, Veterans Services Veterans Affairs Canada January 22-24, 2002

Fernie. Iain

Regional Security Operations Manager Air Canada June 24, 2002

Fields, Fire Chief Dave Fire Department City of Windsor February 27, 2003

Fisher, Captain Kent J8

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Flagel, Mr. Brian

Director, Airport Operations Canada Customs and Revenue Agency November 18-22, 2001

Flynn, Commander Steven

U.S. Coast Guard and Senior Fellow National Security Studies, Council on Foreign Relations February 4, 2002

Forcier, Rear-Admiral J.Y. Commander, MARPAC National Defence February 28, 2005

Forgie, Mr. John

Enforcement Supervisor, Vancouver Citizenship and Immigration Canada November 18-22, 2001

Fortin, Lieutenant-Colonel Mario Acting Commanding Officer, 426 Squadron CFB Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Who the Committee Heard From

Foster, Lieutenant-Colonel Rob

Acting Commanding Officer, 8 Air Maintenance Squadron CFB Trenton
June 25-27, 2002

Fox, James

Acting Assistant Deputy Minister, Bilateral Relations Foreign Affairs Canada May 29, 2006

Francis, Warrant Officer Charles

Bravo Squadron CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Frappier, Lieutenant-Colonel Jean

Commander, 12th Canadian Armoured Regiment, 5th Canadian Mechanized Brigade, CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Fraser, Ms. Sheila

Auditor General of Canada December 10, 2001, December 6, 2004

Frerichs, Private Travis

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Froeschner, Major Chris

Acting Commanding Officer, 429 Squadron CFB Trenton
June 25-27, 2002

Gagné, Major M.K.

Officer Commanding Administration Company, 2nd Battalion Princess National Defence March 10, 2005

Gagnon, Mr. Jean-Guy, Deputy Director, Investigations Department, Montreal Police Service, City of Montreal September 26, 2003

Garnett, Vice-Admiral (Ret'd) Gary L. National Vice-President for Maritime Affairs Navy League of Canada May 12, 2003 **Fox,** Mr. John Member

Union of Canadian Transportation Employees (UCTE) February 2, 2005

Fox, James

Assistant Deputy Minister, Bilateral Relations Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada December 11, 2006

Frappier, Mr. Gerry

Director General, Security and Emergency Preparedness and Chair of Interdepartmental Marine Security Working Group, Transport Canada April 7, 2003, June 2, 2003, February 25, 2004

Fraser, Rear-Admiral Jamie D.

Commander Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Frederick, Corporal

8 Air Maintenance Squadron 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Fries, Mr. Rudy

Emergency Management Coordinator, London-Middlesex Community City of London March 31, 2003

Gadula, Mr. Charles

Director General, Fleet Directorate, Marine Services, Department of Fisheries and Oceans Canada April 7, 2003

Gagnon, Major Alain

Commanding Officer, Canadian Forces Recruiting Centre, Montreal June 25-27, 2002

Gardner, Major Craig Mechanized Brigade Group CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Garnon, Lieutenant-Commander Daniel Comptroller, National Defence September 25, 2003

Gauthier, Corporal

2 Air Movement Squadron 8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Gauvin, Major Bart

Directorate of Army Training 5

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Giasson, Mr. Daniel

Director of Operations, Security and Intelligence

Privy Council Office

January 8, 2002 / January 29, 2002

Giffin-Boudreau, Ms. Diane

Acting Director General, Atlantic Region, Department

of Citizenship and Immigration Canada

September 22, 2003

Gilbert, Gary D.

Senior Vice President – Americas

Hutchison Port Holdings

November 6, 2006

Gilkes, Lieutenant-Colonel B.R.

Kings Own Calgary Regiment

National Defence

March 8, 2005 / February 1, 2007

Gimblett, Mr. Richard

Research Fellow

Centre for Foreign Policy Studies

Dalhousie University

February 21, 2005

Girouard, Rear-Admiral Roger, OMM, CD

Commander, Maritime Forces Pacific (MARPAC)

National Defence

January 29, 2007

Glencross, Captain, Reverend Bruce

Regimental Padre Minister

The Black Watch

November 5-6, 2002

Goatbe, Mr. Greg

Director General, Program Strategy Directorate

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

January 28, 2002

Gauthier, Lieutenant-General J.C.M.

Commander, Canadian Expeditionary Forces Command

National Defence

May 8, 2006 / May 29, 2006

Gauvin, Commodore Jacques J.

Acting Assistant Chief of the Maritime Staff

Department of National Defence

December 3, 2001

Gibbons, The Honorable Jim

Member (Republican – Nevada)

U.S. House Select Committee on Intelligence

February 6, 2002

Gilbert, Chief Warrant Officer Daniel

Department of National Defence

December 3, 2001

Gilbert, Staff Superintendent Emory

Operational Support Services, Toronto Police

Services, City of Toronto

October 30, 2003

Gilmour, Wendy

Director, Peacekeeping and Operations Group, Stabilization

and Reconstruction Task Force

Foreign Affairs Canada

May 29, 2006

Girouard, Commodore Roger

Commander, CANFLTPAC

National Defence

February 28, 2005

Giroux, Master Corporal

Canadian Parachute Centre

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Gludo, Colonel J.D.

Commander, 41 Canadian Brigade Group of Canada,

National Defence

March 8, 2005

Goetz, Captain J.J.

Mechanized Brigade Group

CFB Petawawa

June 25-27, 2002

Who the Committee Heard From

Goodall, Superintendent Bob

Bureau Commander, Field and Traffic Support Bureau Ontario Provincial Police

October 30, 2003

Gotell, Chief Warrant Officer Peter

Operations 12 Wing Shearwater January 22-24, 2002

Graham, Master Corporal 8 Air Maintenance Squadron 8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Granatstein, Dr. Jack

Chair, Council for Defence and Security in the 21st Century May 27, 2002, April 28, 2004

Grant, Captain Timothy J.

Commander, 1 Canadian Mechanized Brigade Group National Defence March 7, 2005

Green, Major Bill

Commanding Officer, Saskatchewan Dragoons (Moose Jaw) January 27, 2002

Gregory, Leading Seaman

Wing Administration Human Resources Department 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Guevremont, Benoît

Gulf Squadron **CFB Kingston** May 7-9, 2002

Gutteridge, Mr. Barry

Commissioner, Department of Works and Emergency Services City of Toronto October 30, 2003

Haché, Colonel Mike

Director, Western Hemisphere Policy National Defence April 11, 2005

Goss. The Honorable Porter Chair (Republican - Florida) U.S. House Select Committee on Intelligence February 6, 2002

Goupil, Inspector Pierre

Direction de la protection du territoire, Unité d'urgence, région ouest, Sûreté du Québec November 5-6, 2001

Graham, Erin

Manager Safety, Capital District Health Halifax Regional Municipality September 23, 2003

Grandy, Mr. Brian

Acting Regional Director, Atlantic Region Canada Customs and Revenue Agency January 22-24, 2002

Gray, P.C., Right Honourable Herb

Chair and Commissioner, Canadian Section, International Joint Commission March 29, 2004

Grégoire, Mr. Marc

Assistant Deputy Minister, Safety and Security Group Transport Canada February 25, 2004 / October 2, 2006 / February 12, 2007

Grue, Superintendent Tom **Edmonton Police Services** City of Edmonton January 28, 2003

Guindon, Captain (N) Paul Submarine Division Maritime Forces Atlantic January 22-24, 2002

Gupta, Lieutenant-Colonel Ranjeet K.

Canadian Forces School of Military Engineering, C.F.B. Gagetown National Defence January 31, 2005

Haeck, Lieutenant Colonel Ken F. Commandant of Artillery School IFT CFB Gagetown January 22-24, 2002

Hall, Major Steve

Deputy Commandant, Canadian Forces School Communications and Electronics

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Hammond, Major Lee

Artillery CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Hapgood, Warrant Officer John

Canadian Parachute Centre 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Harrison, Captain (N) R.P. (Richard)

Assistant Chief of Staff, Operations, Maritime Forces Pacific

November 18-22, 2001

Harvey, Lieutenant-Commander Max

Commander H.M.C.S. Cabot February 2, 2005

Hatton, Commander Gary

Commanding Officer, HMCS Montreal Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Hazelton, LCol Spike C.M.

Commandant of Armour School C2 SIM, CFB Gagetown

January 22-24, 2002

Heath, Captain (N) Jim

Assistant Chief of Staff Operations (J3), Maritime

Forces Pacific Headquarters

National Defence

January 29, 2007

Heinbecker, Paul

Former Ambassador to the U.N.

As an individual

February 21, 2005

Heisler, Mr. Ron

Canada Immigration Centre, Halifax

Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada

September 22, 2003

Hamel, MWO Claude

Regimental Sergeant-Major Designate

The Black Watch

November 5-6, 2002

Hansen, Superintendent Ken

Director of Federal Enforcement

RCMP

of

April 7, 2003, June 9, 2003

Harlick, Mr. James

Assistant Deputy Minister, Office of Critical Emergency

Infrastructure Protection and

Preparedness, National Defence

July 19, 2001, October 20 & 27, 2003

Hart, Corporal

Wing Administration Human Resources Department, 8 Wing

Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Haslett, Lieutenant Adam

Logistics Officer & Course Commander, The Black Watch

November 5-6, 2002

Havdon, Mr. Peter T.

Senior Research Fellow, Center for Foreign Policy

Studies

Dalhousie University

April 28, 2003, February 1, 2005

Hearn, Brigadier-General T.M.

Director General, Military Human Resources Policy

and Planning

Department of National Defence

December 10, 2001

Hébert, Barbara

Regional Director, Customs, Canada Customs and

Revenue Agency

June 24, 2002

Heimann, Dr. Alan

Medical Officer of Health

City of Windsor

February 27, 2003

Henault, General Raymond R.

Chief of the Defence Staff

National Defence

December 3, 2001

Who the Committee Heard From

Hendel, Commodore (Ret'd) Hans Consultant, Canadian Forces Staff College April 28, 2003

Henneberry, Lieutenant-Commander, HMCS Nanaimo Maritime Air Force Command Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Henschel, Superintendent Peter Federal Services Directorate RCMP June 9, 2003

Hickey, Mr. John MHA, Lake Melville House of Assembly of Newfoundland and Labrador February 3, 2005

Hildebrand, Sergeant F.D. (Fred) "H" Division, Criminal Operations Branch, RCMP September 22, 2003

Hill, Mr. Dave Chair, Capital Region Emergency Preparedness Partnership City of Edmonton January 28, 2003

Hillmer, Dr. Norman Professor of History and International Affairs. Carleton University November 1, 2004

Hines, Colonel Glynne Director, Air Information Management, Chief of the Air Staff National Defence July 18, 2001

Hooper, Jack
Deputy Director (Operations)
Canadian Security Intelligence Service
May 29, 2006
Hornbarger, Mr. Chris
Director
U.S. Office of Homeland Security
February 7, 2002

Henderson, Major Georgie Deputy A3 CFB Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Henry, Dr. Bonnie Associate Medical Officer of Health City of Toronto October 30, 2003

Herbert, Mr. Ron Director General, National Operations Division Veterans Affairs Canada January 22-24, 2002

Hickey, Captain (N) Larry
Assistant Chief of Staff Plans and Operations
(Maritime Forces Atlantic)
National Defence
June 16, 2003

Hildebrandt, Captain Gerhard Canadian Parachute Centre 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Hillier, General Rick Chief of the Defence Staff National Defence May 30, 2005 / June 21, 2006

Hincke, Colonel Joe Commanding Officer 12 Wing Shearwater January 22-24, 2002

Holman, Major-General (Ret'd) Fraser Canadian Forces College Toronto June 27, 2005

Horn, Lieutenant-Colonel Bernd CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Hounsell, Master Corporal Scott Candian Forces School of Electronical and Mechanical Engineering, CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Howard, Brigadier-General A.J.

Director General Operations, Strategic Joint Staff National Defence

October 16, 2006 / November 20, 2006

Huebert, Dr. Rob

Professor, Dept. of Political Science University of Calgary March 8, 2005

Hunter, The Honorable Duncan

Ranking Member, Subcommittee on Military Procurement (Republican – California) U.S. House Armed Services Committee February 6, 2002

Hynes, Major A.G.

Air Reserve Coordinator (East) 1 Canadian Air Division Headquarters Feburary 1, 2005

Idzenga, Major Ray

Commanding Officer, Gulf Squadron CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Inkster, Mr. Norman

President, KPMG Investigation and Security Inc. Former Commissioner, RCMP October 1, 2001

Irwin, Brigadier-General S.M.

Chief Executive Officer of the Canadian Forces Housing Agency National Defence June 6, 2005

Jackson, Major David

J3

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Janelle, Private Pascal

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Jean, Mr. Daniel

Assistant Deputy Minister, Policy and Program Development, Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada
March 17, 2003

Howe, Corporal Kerry

CFB Borden Technical Services

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Hunt, Mr. Baxter

Embassy of the United States of America to Canada August 15, 2002

Hupe, Master Corporal Bryan

426 Training Squadron 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Iatonna, Mr. Mario

Municipal Engineer City of Windsor

December 1, 2004

Inglis, Brian

General Manager/Task Force Leader Vancouver Fire & Rescue Services January 29, 2007

Innis, Captain Quentin

Instructor, Canadian Parachute Centre 8 Wing Trenton
June 25-27, 2002

Issacs, Sergeant Tony

Search and Rescue Technician Maritime Forces Atlantic January 22-24, 2002

Jackson, Ms. Gaynor

Manager, Military Family Support Centre, Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Jarvis, Vice-Admiral Greg

Assistant Deputy Minister (Human Resources Military) February 21, 2005

Jeffery, Lieutenant General M.K.

Chief of the Land Staff
Department of National Defence

December 3, 2001 / August 14, 2002

Who the Committee Heard From

Jeffery, Lieutenant General (ret'd) Mike

June 27, 2005

Jestin, Colonel Ryan

Commander, C.F.B. Gagetown 3 Area Support Group

National Defence

January 31, 2005

Johns, Fred

General Manager, Logistics and Processing Strategies

Canada Post

August 15, 2002

Johnson, Captain Wayne

J7, CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Johnston, Chief Cal

Chief of Police

City of Regina

January 27, 2003

Jolicoeur, Mr. Alain

President, Department of Public Safety and Emergency

Preparedness Canada

Canada Border Services Agency

February 23, 2004, April 11, 2005

Joncas, Chief Petty Officer First Class Serge

Maritime Command Chief Petty Officer

National Defence

December 3, 2001

Jurkowski, Brigadier-General (ret'd) David

Former Chief of Staff, Joint Operations

Department of National Defence

October 1, 2001

Kasurak, Mr. Peter

Principal

Office of the Auditor General of Canada

December 10, 2001, December 6, 2004

Keane, Mr. John

Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Western

Hemisphere Affairs

U.S. Department of State

February 6, 2002

Jenkins, Wilma

Director, Immigration Services

Citizenship and Immigration Canada

June 24, 2002

Job, Mr. Brian

Chair, Institute of International Relations

University of British Columbia

March 1, 2005

Johnson, Captain Don

President

Air Canada Pilots Association

November 4, 2002

Johnston, Rear-Admiral (Ret'd) Bruce

As an individual

April 28, 2003

Johnston, Mr. Kimber

Director General, Stragetic Policy

Public Safety and Emergency

Preparedness Canada

February 15, 2005

Jolicoeur, Alain

President

Canada Border Services Agency

June 19, 2006

Judd, Jim

Director

Canadian Security Intelligence Service

June 19, 2006

Kalincak, Captain Karl

Adjutant, 33 Field Engineer Squadron

National Defence

February 1, 2007

Kavanagh, Paul

Regional Director, Security and Emergency Planning

Transport Canada

June 24, 2002

Keating, Dr. Tom

Professor, Department of Political Science

University of Alberta

March 7, 2005

Kee, Mr. Graham Chief Security Officer Vancouver Port Authority November 18-22, 2001

Kelly, Chief Warrant Officer Michael The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Kennedy, Mr. Paul E Senior Assistant Deputy Solicitor General, Policy Branch, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada February 15, 2005

Kerr, Captain Andrew CD The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Khokhar, Mr. Jamal Minister-Counsellor (Congressional Affairs) Canadian Embassy (Washington) February 4, 2002

King, Lieutenant-Colonel Colin Commanding Officer, Royal Regina Rifles (Regina) January 27, 2003

King, Vice-Admiral (Ret'd) Jim Vice-President, Atlantic CFN Consultants May 5, 2005

Kloster, Mr. Deryl Emergency Response Department City of Edmonton January 28, 2003

Koch, Major Pat J5, CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Knapp, Corporal Raymond CFB Borden Technical Services June 25-27, 2002 **Kelly**, Mr. James C. As an individual May 26, 2003

Kelly, Lieutenant Colonel W.J.

Force Planning and Program Coordination, Vice Chief of the Defence Staff, National Defence July 18, 2001

Kennedy, Mr. Paul Senior Assistant Deputy Solicitor General, Solicitor General of Canada January 28, 2002, February 24, 2003

Keyes, Mr. Bob Senior Vice-President, International Canadian Chamber of Commerce December 1, 2004

Kiloh, Inspector D.W. (Doug) Major Case Manager, RCMP November 18-22, 2001

King, Vice-Admiral (Ret'd) James As an individual May 12, 2003

Kinney, Laureen Director General, Marine Security Transport Canada February 12, 2007

Kobolak, Mr. Tom Senior Program Officer, Contraband and Intelligence Canada Customs and Revenue Agency April 7, 2003

Koop, Mr. Rudy Research Adviser, Canadian Section International Joint Commission March 29, 2004

Kneale, Mr. John Executive Coordinator, Task Force on Enhanced Representation in the U.S Foreign Affairs Canada April 11, 2005

Who the Committee Heard From

Krause, Lieutenant Colonel Wayne 423 Maritime Helicopter Squadron 12 Wing Shearwater January 22-24, 2002

Kubeck, Commander Kimberley

Naval Control of Shipping Intelligence, Department of National Defence

September 25, 2003

Kurzynski, Major Perry

Search and Rescue Operations Centre Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Lachance, Mr. Sylvain A/Director General, Fleet Canadian Coast Guard February 17, 2003

Lacroix, Colonel Jocelyn P.P.J.

Commander, 5th Canadian Mechanized Brigade Group, CFB

Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Laflamme, Mr. Art Senior Representative

Air Line Pilots Association, International

August 14, 2002

Lafrenière, Major Luc

Commander, Headquarters and Signal Squadron

CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Lait, Commander K.B.

Commander, Directorate of Quality of Life,

DQOL 3 - Accommodation Policy Team Leader, National

Defence June 6, 2005

Lamb, John

Deputy Chief, Fire Rescue

City of Edmonton

January 30, 2007

Landry, LCol (Ret'd) Rémi

International Security Study and Research Group

University of Montreal

June 2, 2005

Krueger, Master Corporal 8 Air Maintenance Squadron

8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Kummel, Colonel Steff J.

Wing Commander, 17 Wing Winnipeg

National Defence March 10, 2005

Kwasnicki, Corporal Anita

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Lacroix, Chief Warrant Officer Greg Army Regimental Sergeant Major

National Defence February 26, 2007

Lacroix, Colonel Roch

Chief of Staff, Land Force Atlantic Area

National Defence May 6, 2005

LaFrance, Mr. Albert

Director, Northern New Brunswick District Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

January 22-24, 2002

Laing, Captain (Navy) Kevin

Director, Maritime Strategy, Chief of Maritime Staff,

National Defence July 18, 2001

Lalonde, Major John

Air Reserve Coordinator (Western Area)

National Defence March 8, 2005

Landry, Chief Warrant Officer André 1st Battalion, 22nd Royal Regiment

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Landry, Inspector Sam

Officer in Charge, Toronto Airport Detachment

RCMP

June 24, 2002

Langelier, Mr. André

Director, Emergency and Protective Services, City of Gatineau

February 3, 2003

Laroche, Colonel J.R.M.G.

National Defence May 2, 2005

Last, Colonel David

Registrar

Royal Military College of Canada

November 29, 2004

LeBoldus, Mr. Mick

Chief Representative at the NATO Flight Training

Centre

Bombardier Aerospace

March 9, 2005

Lefebvre, Denis

Assistant Commissioner, Customs Branch Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 6, 2004, February 10, 2003

Legault, Mr. Albert

Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)

February 21, 2005

Lenton, Assistant Commissioner W.A. (Bill)

RCMP

January 28, 2002, June 9, 2003

LePine, Mr. Peter

Inspector, Halifax Detachment

RCMP

September 23, 2003

Leslie, Lieutenant-General Andrew

Chief of the Land Staff

National Defence

February 26, 2007

Lessard, Brigadier-General J.G.M.

Commander, Land Forces Central Area

December 2, 2004

Laprade, CWO Daniel

Headquarters and Signal Squadron

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Larrabee, Mr. Bryan

Emergency Social Services Coordinator, Board of

Parks and Recreation, City of Vancouver

January 30, 2003

Leblanc, Ms. Annie

Acting Director, Technology and Lawful Access

Division, Solicitor General of Canada

July 19, 2001

Lefebvre, Mr. Denis

Executive Vice-President

Canada Border Services Agency

February 7, 2005

Lefebvre, Mr. Paul

President, Local Lodge 2323

International Association of Machinists and Aerospace

Workers

August 15, 2002

Leighton, Lieutenant-Commander John

J1

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Leonard, Lieutenant-Colonel S.P.

Royal Newfoundland Regiment

(1st Battalion)

February 2, 2005

Lerhe, Commodore E.J. (Eric)

Commander, Canadian Fleet Pacific

Maritime Forces Pacific

November 18-22, 2001

Leslie, Major-General Andrew

National Defence

November 29, 2004

Lester, Mr. Michael

Executive Director, Emergency Measures

Organization

Nova Scotia Public Safety Anti-Terrorism Senior

Officials Committee

September 23, 2003

Who the Committee Heard From

Levy, Mr. Bruce

Director, U.S. Transboundary Division Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade January 28, 2002

Lilienthal, Lieutenant-Colonel Mark Senior Staff Officer

Canadian Forces Support Training Group CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Loeppky, Deputy Commissioner Garry

Operations RCMP

October 22, 2001 / December 2, 2002

Loschiuk, Ms Wendy

Principal

Office of the Auditor General of Canada

December 6, 2004

Lucas, Lieutenant-General Steve

Chief of the Air Staff National Defence February 26, 2007

Luciak, Mr. Ken

Director, Emergency Medical Services City of Regina January 27, 2003

Lupien, Chief Petty Officer First Class R.M.

Canadian Forces Chief Warrant Officer Department of National Defence

December 3, 2001

Macaleese, Lieutenant-Colonel Jim

Commander 9 Wing (Gander) February 2, 2005

Macdonald, Lieutenant-General (Ret'd) George

CFN Consultants Ottawa

June 27, 2005

MacKay, The Honourable Peter Minister of Foreign Affairs

May 29, 2006

Lichtenwald, Chief Jack

Regina Fire Department

City of Regina

January 27, 2003

Lloyd, Captain (N) Ron

Director General, Maritime Force Development

National Defence

February 26, 2007

Logan, Major Mike

Deputy Administration Officer, Canadian Forces Support

Training Group

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Lucas, Brigadier-General Dwayne

Director General - Aerospace Equipment Program

Management

National Defence

June 27, 2005

Lucas, Major General Steve

Commander One Canadian Air Division, Canadian

NORAD Region Headquarters

November 18-22, 2001

Luloff, Ms. Janet

A/Director, Regulatory Affairs, Safety and Security

Group, Transport Canada

November 27, 2002, December 2, 2002

Lyrette, Private Steve

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Macdonald, Lieutenant-General George

Vice Chief of the Defence Staff

Department of National Defence

January 28, 2002, May 6, 2002, August 14, 2002,

February 23, 2004

Mack, Rear Admiral Ian

Defence Attaché

Canadian Embassy (Washington)

February 4, 2002

MacKay, Major Tom

The Black Watch

November 5-6, 2002

MacKenzie, Major-General (Ret'd) Lewis As an individual

May 3, 2004, December 6, 2004

MacLaughlan, Superintendent C.D. (Craig), Officer in Charge, Support Services ``H" Division, RCMP

September 22, 2003

MacLean, Vice-Admiral Bruce Chief of Maritime Staff

National Defence February 14, 2005

Macnamara, Mr. W. Donald

Senior Fellow Queen's University November 29, 2004

MacQuarrie, Captain Don

J6

CFB Kingtson May 7-9, 2002

Magee, Mr. Andee

Dog Master

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 7-9, 2002

Maillet, Acting School Chief Warrant Officer Joseph

Canadian Forces School of Communications and Electronics,

CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Maisonneuve, Major-General J.O. Michel

Assistant Deputy Chief of Defence Staff

October 22, 2001

Malec, Mr. George

Assistant Harbour master

Halifax Port Authority

January 22-24, 2002

Mandel, His Worship Mayor Stephen

City of Edmonton

January 30, 2007

Manning, Corporal Rob

CFB Borden Technical Services

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

MacIsaac, Captain (N) Roger Base Commander, CFB Halifax

National Defence May 6, 2005

MacLaughlan, Mr. Craig

Executive Director, Emergency

Measures Organization Province of Nova Scotia

May 6, 2005

MacLeod, Colonel Barry W.

Commander 3 Area Support Group

CFB Gagetown

January 22-24, 2002

Macnamara, Brigadier-General (ret'd) W. Don,

President, Conference of Defence Associations

Institute

May 3, 2004

Maddison, Vice Admiral.Greg

Deputy Chief of the Defence Staff

National Defence

May 5, 2002, February 14, 2005

Maher, Lieutenant Earl

4 ESR

CFB Gagetown

January 21-24, 2002

Maines, Warren

Director, Customer Service

Air Canada

June 4, 2002

Malboeuf, Corporal Barry

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Mallory, Mr. Dan

Chief of Operations for Port of Lansdowne

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 7-9, 2002

Mandel, Mr. Stephen

Deputy Mayor and Councillor

City of Edmonton

January 28, 2003

Manson, General (Ret'd) Paul D.

Conference of Defence Associations (Ottawa)

June 27, 2005

Who the Committee Heard From

Manuel, Mr. Barry

Coordinator, Emergency Measures

Halifax

May 6, 2005 / September 23, 2003

Marsh, Howie

Conference of Defence Associations (Ottawa)

June 27, 2005

Martin. Mr. Ronald

Emergency Planning Coordinator

City of Vancouver

January 30, 2003, March 1, 2005

Mason, Mr. Dwight

Joint Chief of Staff, U.S. Chair, Permanent Joint Board

on Defence The Pentagon February 6, 2002

Massicotte, Ms Olga

Regional Director General/Atlantic

Veterans Affairs Canada

January 22-24, 2002

Matte, Colonel Perry

14 Wing Commander

National Defence

May 5, 2005

Mattiussi, Mr. Ron

Director of Planning and Corporate Services

City of Kelowna

March 1, 2005

McAdam, Lieutenant-Colonel Pat

Tactics School, C.F.B. Gagetown

National Defence

January 31, 2005

McCuaig, Mr. Bruce

Assistant Deputy Minister

Policy, Planning and Standards Division

Ontario Ministry of Transportation

December 1, 2004

McGarr, Kevin

Canadian Air Transport Security Authority

Vice-President and Chief Technology Officer

October 30, 2006

Marcewicz, Lieutenant-Colonel

Base Commander, CFB Edmonton

National Defence March 7, 2005

Organization, City of

Martin, Ms Barbara

Director, Defence and Security Relations

Division, Foreign Affairs Canada

April 11, 2005

Mason, Lieutenant-Colonel Dave

Commanding Officer, 12 Air Maintenance Squadron, 12

Wing Shearwater

January 22-24, 2002

Mason, Ms. Nancy

Director, Office of Canadian Affairs, Bureau of

Western Hemisphere Affairs

U.S. Department of State

February 06, 2002

Matheson, Corporal

2 Air Movement Squadron

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Mattie, Chief Warrant Officer Fred

12 Air Maintenance Squadron

12 Wing Shearwater

January 22-24, 2002

Maude, Master Corporal Kelly

436 Transport Squadron

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

McCoy, Chief Warrant Officer Daniel

Support Unit, 430th Helicopters Squadron

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

McDonald, Corporal Marcus

Canadian Forces Medical Services School

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

McIlhenny, Mr. Bill

Director for Canada and Mexico

U.S. National Security Council

February 7, 2002

McInenly, Mr. Peter

Vice-President, Business Alignment

Canada Post August 15, 2002

McKerrell, Mr. Neil

Chief, Emergency Management Ont.
Ontario Ministry of Community Safety
Correctional Services

October 30, 2003

McKinnon, Lieutenant-Colonel DB

P.E.I. Regiment February 1, 2005

McLean, Corporal

Wing Operations

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

McLellan, Mr. George

Chief Administrative Officer Halifax Regional Municipality

September 23, 2003

McManus, Lieutenant-Colonel J.J. (John),

Commanding Officer, 443 (MH) Squadron,

Maritime Air Force Command Pacific

November 18-22, 2001

McNeil, Commodore Daniel

Vice Chief of the Defence Staff Department of

National Defence

July 18, 2001

McRae, Robert

Director General, International Security Bureau Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada

December 11, 2006

Mean, Master Corporal Jorge

Canadian Forces School of Aerospace Technology and

Engineering

June 25-27, 2002

Melançon, Lieutenant-Colonel René

Infantry School

C.F.B. Gagetown

National Defence

January 31, 2005

McKeage, Mr. Michael

Director of Operations, Emergency Medical Care

Halifax Regional Municipality

September 23, 2003

McKinnon, Chief David P.

Chief of Police

Halifax Regional Police Force

January 22-24, 2002

McLaughlin, Michael J.

Canadian Air Transport Security Authority

Vice-President and Chief Financial Officer

October 30, 2006

McLellan, The Honourable Anne, P.C. M.P.

Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Public

Safety and Emergency Preparedness

February 15, 2005 & April 11, 2005

McLeod, Mr. Dave

Lead Station Attendant

International Association of Machinists and Aerospace

Workers

August 15, 2002

McNeil, Rear-Admiral Dan

Commander, Maritime Forces Atlantic

National Defence

May 6, 2005

McNeil, Commodore Daniel

Director, Force Planning and Program Coordination,

Vice Chief of the Defence Staff

Department of National Defence

July 18, 2001

McRoberts, Mr. Hugh

Assistant Auditor General

Office of the Auditor General of Canada

December 6, 2004

Meisner, Mr. Tim

Director, Policy and Legislation, Marine Programs

Directorate

Canadian Coast Guard

February 17, 2003, April 7, 2003

Melis, Ms. Caroline

Director, Program Development.

Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada

March 17, 2003

Who the Committee Heard From

Mercer, Mr. Wayne

Acting First Vice-President, Nova Scotia District Branch, (CEUDA)

January 22-24, 2002

Michaud, Mr. Jean-Yves, Deputy Director, Administrative Support Directorate, City of Montreal

September 26, 2003

Miller, Lieutenant-Colonel

Commander,

10th Field Artillery Regiment, RCA

National Defence

March 9, 2005

Milner, Dr. Marc

Director, Military and Strategic Studies Program

University of New Brunswick

January 31, 2005

Mitchell, Mr. Barry

Director, Nova Scotia District

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

January 22-24, 2002

Mogan, Mr. Darragh

Director General, Program and Service Policy

Division, Veterans Services

Veterans Affairs Canada

January 22-24, 2002

Morency, André

Regional Director General, Ontario Region, Transport

Canada

June 24, 2002

Morton, Dr. Desmond

Professor

University of McGill

November 15, 2004

Mulder, Mr. Nick

President, Mulder Management Associates

June 9, 2003

Munger, Chief Warrant Officer JER

Office of Land Force Command

Department of National Defence

December 03, 2001

Merpaw, Ms. Diane

Acting Deputy Director, Policy Development and

Coordination

Citizenship and Immigration Canada

April 7, 2003

Middlemiss, Professor Danford W.

Department of Political Science

Dalhousie University

May 12, 2003, May 5, 2005

Miller, Mr. Frank

Senior Director, President's Adviser on Military

Matters

U.S. National Security Council

February 7, 2002

Minto, Mr. Shahid

Assistant Auditor General

Office of the Auditor General of Canada

December 10, 2001

Mitchell, Brigadier General Greg

Commander

Land Forces Atlantic Area

January 22-24, 2002

Moran, Ron

National President

Customs Excise Union Douanes Accise (CEUDA)

December 4, 2006

Morris, Ms. Linda

Director, Public Affairs

Vancouver Port Authority

November 18-22, 2001

Moutillet, Lieutenant-Commander Mireille

Senior Staff Officer Policy

National Defence

September 25, 2003

Mundy, Lieutenant-Commander Phil

Executive Officer

H.M.C.S. Queen Charlotte

February 1, 2005

Munroe, Ms. Cathy

Regional Director of Cutsoms for Northern Ontario

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 7-9, 2002

Murphy, Captain (N) R.D. (Dan) Deputy Commander, Canadian Fleet Pacific Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Murray, Major James Commandant, Canadian Forces Fire Academy CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Mushanski, Lieutenant Commander Linda Commanding Officer HMCS *Queen* (Regina) January 27, 2003

Nelligan, Mr. John Patrick Senior Partner, Law Firm of Nelligan O'Brien Payne LLP, Ottawa December 2, 2002

Neville, Lieutenant-Colonel Shirley
Wing Administration Officer, Acting Wing
Commander, 17 Wing
17 Wing Winnipeg
November 18-22, 2001

Newton, Captain John F. Senior Staff Officer, Operations Maritime Forces Atlantic January 22-24, 2002

Nikolic, Mr. Darko District Director, St.Lawrence District Canada Customs and Revenue Agency May 7-9, 2002

Nordick, Brigadier-General Glenn
Deputy Commander, Land Force Doctrine and Training
Systems, CFB Kingston
May 7-9, 2002

Normoyle, Ms. Debra Director General, Enforcement Branch Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada

Nossal, Dr. Kim Richard Professor and Head, Political Studies Department Queen's University November 29, 2004 Murray, Ms. Anne C. Vice President, Community and Environmental Affairs, Vancouver International Airport Authority

November 18-22, 2001

Murray, Admiral (Ret'd) Larry Deputy Minister Veterans Affairs Canada January 22-24, 2002

Narayan, Mr. Francis Detector Dog Service Canada Customs and Revenue Agency November 18-22, 2001

Neumann, Ms. Susanne M. Compliance Verification Officer Customs – Compliance Mgt. Division Canada Customs and Revenue Agency November 18-22, 2001

Newberry, Mr. Robert J. Principal Director, Territorial Security The Pentagon February 06, 2002

Niedtner, Inspector Al Vancouver Police, Emergency Operations and Planning Sector City of Vancouver January 30, 2003

Noël, Chief Warrant Officer Donald 5th Field Ambulance CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Norman, Mr. Mark
President of Daimler-Chrysler and Chair of the Infrastructure
Committee
Canadian Automotive Partnership Council
December 1, 2004

Normoyle, Ms. Debra Head, Immigration Enforcement Canada Border Services Agency February 23, 2004

Nymark, Ms. Christine Associate Assistant Deputy Minister Transport Canada January 28, 2002

April 7, 2003

Who the Committee Heard From

O'Bright, Mr. Gary

Director General, Operations

Office of Critical Infrastructure Protection and

Emergency Preparedness

July 19, 2001, October 20, 2003

O'Hanlon, Mr. Michael

Senior Fellow, Foreign Policy Studies

The Brookings Institution

February 5, 2002

Olchowiecki, Private Chrissian

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Orr, Major Ken

Senior Staff Officer, Attraction Canadian Forces Recruiting

Group

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Ouellet, Chief Warrant Officer J.S.M.

5th Canadian Mechanized Brigade Group

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Ouellette, Lieutenant-Colonel Bernard

Commander, 2nd Battalion, 22nd Royal Regiment,

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Parks, Lieutenant-Commander Mike

Directorate of Army Training 5-4

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Pasel, Mr. William

Emergency Measures Coordinator, Hamilton Emergency Services Department, City of Hamilton

March 31, 2003

Paulson, Captain (N) Gary

Commanding Officer of HMCS Algonquin

Maritime Forces Pacific

November 18-22, 2001

O'Donnell, Mr. Patrick

President

Canadian Defence Industries Association

November 22, 2004

O'Shea, Mr. Kevin

Director, U.S. General Relations Division,

Department of Foreign Affairs and International

Trade

January 28, 2002

Oliver, Superintendent Joe

Royal Canadian Mounted Police

Director, Customs & Excise

October 2, 2006

Ortiz, The Honorable Solomon P.

Ranking Member, Subcommittee on Military

Readiness (Democrat - Texas)

U.S. House Armed Services Committee

February 06, 2002

Ouellet, Major Michel

Acting Commanding Officer, 5th Canadian Service

Battalion

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Parker, Major Geoff

Infantry

CFB Petawawa

June 25-27, 2002

Parriag, Ms Amanda

Centre for Research and Information on

Canada

December 6, 2004

Pataracchia, Lieutenant (N) John

Representing Commanding Officer, Canadian Forces

Recruiting Centre, Halifax

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Payne, Captain (N) Richard

Commanding Officer, Fleet Mantenance Facility

Cape Scott

Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Pearson, Lieutenant Colonel Michael Commandant of Infantry School SAT CFB Gagetown January 22-24, 2002

Pelletier, France

Legislative and Regulatory Affairs, Airline Division Canadian Union of Public Employees November 25, 2002

Pennie, Lieutenant-General Ken Chief of Air Staff National Defence February 7, 2005

Pentland, Mr. Charles Political Studies, Centre for International Relations, Queen's University November 29, 2004

Peters, Colonel William
Director, Land Strategic Planning, Chief of the Land
Staff
National Defence
July 18, 2001

Pettigrew, Master Corporal Robert Canadian Forces School of Administration and Logistics, CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Pichette, Mr. Pierre Paul, Deputy Director, Operational Management Department, Montreal Police Service, City of Montreal September 26, 2003

Pigeon, Mr. Jacques
Senior General Counsel and Head, Department of
Justice, Legal Services
Transport Canada
December 2, 2002

Pile, Commodore Ty Commander, Canadian Fleet Atlantic National Defence May 6, 2005

Pilgrim, Superintendent J. Wayne
Officer in Charge, National Security Investigations
Branch, Criminal Intelligence Directorate, RCMP
July 19, 2001

Pellerin, Colonel (Ret'd) Alain Executive Director Conference of Defence Associations October 15, 2001, April 19, 2004 / June 27, 2005

Penner, Lieutenant-Colonel Doug Commanding Officer, North Saskatchewan Regiment (Saskatoon) January 27, 2003

Pennie, Lieutenant-General (Ret'd) Ken June 27, 2005

Pentney, Mr. Bill Assistant Deputy Attorney General Department of Justice Canada February 15, 2005

Petras, Major-General H.M. Chief, Reserves and Cadets National Defence June 6, 2005

Pharand, M. Pierre Director, Airport Security Montréal Airports November 5-6, 2001

Pichette, Mr. Pierre-Paul Assistant Director, Montreal Urban Community Police Department November 5-6, 2001

Pigeon, Mr. Jean François Acting Director, Security Montréal Airports November 5-6, 2001

Pile, Captain (N) T.H.W. (Tyron) Commander, Maritime Operations Group Four, Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Pinsent, Major John Canadian Parachute Centre, 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Who the Committee Heard From

Pilon, Mr. Marc

Senior Policy Analyst, Security Policy Division, National Security Directorate
Office of the Solicitor General

February 24, 2003

June 25-27, 2002

Plante, Master Corporal 8 Air Maintenance Squadron 8 Wing Trenton

Polson, Captain (N) Gary Commanding Officer HMCS Algonquin Maritime Forces Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Poulin, Corporal Mario

Canadian Forces Military Police Academy CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Préfontaine, Colonel Marc

Comd 34 Brigade Group Executive

The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Proulx, Asst. Commissioner Richard Criminal Intelligence Directorate RCMP

KCMIP

October 22, 2001

Puxley, Ms Evelyn

Director, International Crime and Terrorism

Division, Foreign Affairs Canada

April 11, 2005

Quinlan, Grant Security Inspector Transport Canada June 24, 2002

Randall, Dr. Stephen J.

Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences University of Calgary

March 8, 2005

Rathwell, Mr. Jacques

Manager, Emergency and Protective Services, City of

Gatineau

February 3, 2003

Pitman, Mr. B.R. (Brian)

Sergeant, Waterfront Joint Forces Operation,

Vancouver

Royal Canadian. Mounted Police

November 18-22, 2001

Poirier, Mr. Paul

Director, Intelligence and Contraband Division

Northern Ontario Region

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 7-9, 2002

Potvin, Corporal

8 Air Maintenance Squadron

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Preece, Captain (N) Christian Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Primeau, M. Pierre

Investigator

Organized Crime Task Force – RCMP

November 5-6, 2001

Purdy, Ms. Margaret

Associate Deputy Minister Department of National Defence

August 14, 2002

Ouick, Mr. Dave

Co-ordinator, Emergency Planning

City of Regina

January 27, 2003

Raimkulov, M.P., Mr. Asan

Kyrgyz Republic

May 12, 2003

Rapanos, Mr. Steve

Chief, Emergency Medical Services

City of Edmonton

January 28, 2003

Read, Mr. John A.

Director General, Transport Dangerous Goods,

Transport Canada

February 25, 2004

Reaume, Mr. Al, Assistant Chief of Fire and Rescue Services, Fire Department, City of Windsor February 27, 2003

Reeve, Jason

Cabinet and Parliamentary Affairs Liaison, Afghanistan Task Force Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada December 11, 2006

Reid, Chief Warrant Officer Clifford Canadian Forces Fire Academy CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Reid, Warrant Officer Jim Air Defence Missile CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Richard, CWO Stéphane 5th Canadian Service Battalion CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Richter, Dr. Andrew

Assistant Professor, International Relations and Strategic Studies
University of Windsor
December 1, 2004

Rivest, Master Corporal Dan

Canadian Forces School of Aerospace Technology and Engineering, CFB Borden
June 25-27, 2002

Robertson, Vice-Admiral Drew Chief of the Maritime Staff National Defence February 26, 2007

Robinson, Second Lieutenant. Chase The Black Watch November 5-6, 2001

Romses, Brigadier-General R.R. Commander Land Forces Atlantic Area National Defence January 31, 2005 **Reed,** The Honorable Jack

Chair (Democrat – Rhode Island), U.S. Senate Armed Services Committee February 5, 2002

Regehr, Mr. Ernie Executive Director Project Ploughshares March 21, 2005

Reid, Lieutenant Colonel Gord Commandant, Canadian Forces Air Navigation School (CFANS) 17 Wing Winnipeg November 18-22, 2001

Renahan, Captain Chris

Armour CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Richmond, Mr. Craig Vice President, Airport Operations Vancouver International Airport November 18-22, 2001

Riffou, Lieutenant-Colonel François Commander, 1st Battalion, 22nd Royal Regiment, CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Robertson, Rear-Admiral Drew W.

Director General, International Security Policy
Department of National Defence
February 23, 2004, April 11, 2005

Robertson, Mr. John Chief Building Inspector City of Vancouver January 30, 2003

Rochette, Colonel J.G.C.Y. Director General Compensation and Benefits National Defence June 6, 2005

Rose, Mr. Frank International Security Policy The Pentagon February 6, 2002

Who the Committee Heard From

Ross, Major-General H. Cameron

Director General, International Security Policy, National Defence

January 28, 2002

Ross, Dr. Douglas

Professor, Faculty of Political Science

Simon Fraser University

March 1, 2005

Rossell, Inspector Dave

Inspector in charge of Operations-Support Services, Windsor Police Services City of Windsor

February 27, 2003

Rousseau, Colonel Christian

Commanding Officer, 5th Area Support Group

National Defence

June 1, 2005

Rumsfeld, The Honorable Donald

U.S. Secretary of Defense

February 6, 2002

Russell, Mr. Robert A., Assistant Commissioner,

Atlantic Region, Canada Customs and Revenue

Agency

September 22, 2003

Rutherford, Lieutenant-Colonel Paul

Commander, 73 Communication Group

National Defence

March 9, 2005

Samson, Chief Warrant Officer Camil

2nd Battalion, 22nd Royal Regiment

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Sampson, Tom

Chief of Emergency Medical Services

City of Calgary

February 1, 2007

Saunders, Corporal Cora

16 Wing

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Ross, Mr. Dan

Assistant Deputy Minister (Information Management),

National Defence

February 14, 2005

Ross, Master Warrant Officer Marc-André, 58th Air

Defence Battery

CFB Valcartier

September 24, 2003

Rostis, Mr. Adam

Federal/Provincial/Municipal Liaison Officer

Province of Nova Scotia

May 6, 2005

Rudner, Dr. Martin

Director, Centre for Security and Defence Studies,

Carleton University

June 3, 2004 / December 13, 2004

Rurak, Ms. Angela

Customs Inspector

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 7-9, 2002

Rutherford, Master Corporal Denis

Canadian Forces Fire Academy

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Salesses, Lieutenant Colonel Bob

Logistics Directorate for Homeland Security, The

Pentagon

February 6, 2002

Samson, Brigadier-General P.M.

Director General, Intelligence

National Defence

October 22, 2001

Sanderson, Mr. Chuck

Executive Director, Emergency Measures Organization,

Province of Manitoba

March 10, 2005

Saunders, Captain Kimberly

Disaster Assistance Response Team

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Savard, Lieutenant-Colonel Danielle Commander, 5th Field Ambulance CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Scoffield, Mr. Bruce Director, Refugees Branch Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada March 17, 2003

Scott, Captain John Canadian Parachute Centre 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Shadwick, Mr. Martin

Research Associate, Centre for International and Security Studies, York University
December 2, 2004

Sharapov, M.P., Mr. Zakir Kyrgyz Republic May 12, 2003

Sheridan, Norman Director, Customs Passenger Programs Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

June 24, 2002

Simmons, Mr. Robert
Deputy Director, Office of European Security and
Political Affairs
U.S. Department of State

February 6, 2002

Sinclair, Ms. Jill Acting Assistant Deputy Minister, Global Security Policy, Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade

January 28, 2002 / August 14, 2002

Skelton, The Honorable Ike Ranking Member (Democrat Missouri), U.S. House Armed Services Committee February 6, 2002

Skidmore, Colonel Mark Commander, 2 Canadian Mechanized Brigade Group, CFB Petawawa June 25-27, 2002

Schmick, Major Grant Commanding Officer, Canadian Forces Recruiting Centre, CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Scott, Dr. Jeff Provincial Medical Officer of Health Halifax Regional Municipality September 23, 2003

Sensenbrenner, Jr., The Honorable F. James, Chair (Republican – Wisconsin U.S. House Judiciary Committee February 07, 2002

Shapardanov, Mr. Chris Counsellor, Political Canadian Embassy (Washington) February 04, 2002

Sheehy, Captain Matt Chairman, Security Committee Air Canada Pilots Association November 4, 2002

Sigouin, Mr. Michel
Regional Director, Alberta, Office of Critical
Infrastructure Protection and Emergency
Preparedness
October 27, 2003

Sinclair, Ms. Jill
Director General, International Security Bureau,
Department of Foreign Affairs and International
Trade
March 17, 2003

Sirois, Lieutenant-Colonel Sylvain Commander, 5th Combat Engineer Regiment, CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Skidd, Officer Cadet. Alden The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Slater, Ms. Scenery C. District Program Officer Metro Vancouver District Canada Customs and Revenue Agency November 18-22, 2001

Who the Committee Heard From

Smith, Corporal Canadian Postal Unit 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Smith, Commodore Andy

Director General, Maritime Personnel and Readiness National Defence

February 26, 2007

Smith, Mr. Bill Chief Superintendent Royal Canadian Mounted Police February 3, 2005

Smith, Master Corporal Terry 436 Transport Squadron 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Sokolsky, Dr. Joel

Dean of Arts and Professor of Political Science, Royal Military College of Canada

November 22, 2004

Spraggett, Ernest

Director, Commercial Operations Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

June 24, 2002

Stairs, Dr. Denis

Professor, Department of Political Science

Dalhousie University

May 5, 2005

Stark, Lieutenant-Commander Gary

Commanding Officer, HMCS Whitehorse, Maritime

Forces Pacific

November 18-22, 2001

Stevens, Pipe-Major Cameron

The Black Watch November 5-6, 2002

Stewart, Warrant Officer Barton

Canadian Forces School of Communications and Electronics,

CFB Kingtson May 7-9, 2002 Smith, Captain (N) Andy

Commanding Officer, Fleet Maintenance

Facility, National Defence

May 6, 2005

Smith, Mr. Bob

Deputy Chief, Vancouver Fire and Rescue Services,

City of Vancouver January 30, 2003

Smith, Mr. Doug Engineering Department

City of Vancouver January 30, 2003

Snow, Master Corporal Joanne

Canadian Forces School of Administration and Logistics,

CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Souccar, Assistant Commissioner Raf

Royal Canadian Mounted Police Federal and International Operations

October 2 and 30, 2006

Stacey, Corporal Derrick

CFB Borden Administration Services

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Starck, Mr. Richard

Senior Counsel, Quebec Regional Office,

Department of Justice November 5-6, 2001

St-Cyr, Lieutenant-Colonel Pierre

Commander, Support Unit, 430th Helicopters

Squadron, CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Stevens, Daniel

Emergency Management Coordinator, Risk & Emergency

Management City of Vancouver January 29, 2007

Stewart, Mr. James

Civilian Human Resources Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Stewart, Chief William

Fire Chief and General Manager, Toronto Fire Services, City of Toronto October 30, 2003

St. John, Mr. Peter

Professor (retired), International Relations, University of Manitoba November 25, 2002

Stone, Master Corporal Canadian Parachute Centre 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Stump, The Honorable Bob Chair (Republican – Arizona) U.S. House Armed Services Committee February 6, 2002

Sully, Mr. Ron Assistant Deputy Minister, Programs and Divestiture, Transport Canada February 7, 2005

Sweeney, Steve Superintendent Vancouver Police Department January 29, 2007

Taillon, Mr. Paul Director, Review and Military Liaison Office of the Communications Security Establishment Commissioner June 2, 2005

Tarrant, Lieutenant-Colonel Tom Deputy Director of Army Training CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Taylor, The Honorable Gene Subcommittee on Military Procurement U.S. House Armed Services Committee February 6, 2002

Taylor, The Honourable Trevor Minister of Fisheries and Aquaculture and Minister Responsible for Labrador Government of Newfoundland and Labrador February 3, 2005 Stiff, Mr. Bob General Manager, Corporate Security Canada Post August 15, 2002

St. John, Dr. Ron Executive Director, Centre for Emergency Preparedness and Response Health Canada February 10, 2003

St-Pierre, M. Jacquelin Commanding Officer, Post 5, Montreal Urban Community Police Department November 5-6, 2001

Sullivan, Colonel C.S. Wing Commander, 4 Wing Cold Lake National Defence March 7, 2005

Summers, Rear-Admiral (Ret'd) Ken Naval Officers Association of Vancouver Island February 28, 2005 / June 27, 2005

Szczerbaniwicz, LCol Gary Commanding Officer, 407 Squadron Maritime Air Force Command Pacific November 18-22, 2001

Tait, Mr. Glen Chief, Saint John Fire Department, City of Saint John March 31, 2003

Tatersall, Lieutenant-Commander John Directorate of Army Training 3 CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Taylor, Mr. Robert
Inspector
Vancouver Police Department
November 18-22, 2001
Theilmann, Mr. Mike
Acting Director, Counter-Terrorism Division,
Solicitor General Canada
July 19, 2001

Who the Committee Heard From

Thibault, Master Corporal Christian

Gulf Squadron CFB Kingston May 7-9, 2002

Thomas, Mr. John F.

Partner

BMB Consulting June 9, 2003

Tracy, Ms Maureen

Acting Head, Customs Contraband, Intelligence and Investigations, Enforcement Branch, Canada Border Services Agency

February 7, 2005

Tremblay, Colonel Alain

Commander, Canadian Forces Recruiting Group, CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Tremblay, Colonel J.G.E.

Director, Current Operations, Strategic Joint Staff National Defence October 16, 2006

Trim, Corporal

8 Air Maintenance Squadron, 8 Wing Trenton June 25-27, 2002

Tse, Hau Sing

Vice-President, Asia Branch Canadian International Development Agency May 29, 2006

Ur, Corporal Melanie 16 Wing, CFB Borden June 25-27, 2002

Verner, The Honourable Josée Minister of International Cooperation May 29, 2006

Wainwright, Lieutenant-Colonel J.E. Commander, 16/17 Field Ambulance National Defence March 9, 2005

Ward, Master Corporal Danny

Canadian Forces School of Aerospace Technology and Engineering, CFB Borden
June 25-27, 2002

Thomas, Vice-Admiral (Ret'd) Charles

As an individual March 1, 2005

Thompson, Ms Susan

Former Mayor of the City of Winnipeg As an individual March 10, 2005

Tracy, Ms. Maureen

Director, Policy and Operations Division Canada Customs and Revenue Agency April 7, 2003

Tremblay, Lieutenant-Colonel Eric

Commander, 5th Canadian Light Artillery Regiment, CFB Valcartier September 24, 2003

Tremblay, Captain (N) Viateur Deputy Commander, Naval Reserve Department of National Defence September 25, 2003

Trottier, Lieutenant-Colonel Ron (Res)

Windsor Regiment December 1, 2004

Tulenko, Mr. Timothy

Political-Military Officer, Canadian Affairs, U.S. Department of State February 6, 2002

Verga, Mr. Peter F.

Special Assistant for Homeland Security, The Pentagon February 6, 2002

Villiger, Lieutenant-Colonel F.L.

Calgary Highlanders National Defence March 8, 2005

Wamback, Lieutenant-Commander A. Commanding Officer, HMCS Windsor Maritime Forces Atlantic January 22-24, 2002

Ward, Officer Cadet. Declan

Student McGill University November 5-6, 2002

Ward, Colonel Mike J.

Commander Combat Training Centre

CFB Gagetown

January 22-24, 2002

Wareham, Corporal

8 Air Maintenance Squadron

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Warner, The Honorable John

Ranking Member, U.S. Senate Armed Services

Committee

February 5, 2002

Watt, Major John

Commanding Officer, Bravo Squadron

CFB Kingtson

May 7-9, 2002

Weighill, Mr. Clive

Deputy Chief of Police

City of Regina

January 27, 2003

Wells, Corporal Corwin

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Westwood, Commodore Roger

Director General - Maritime Equipment Program Management

National Defence

June 27, 2005

Whitburn, Lieutenant Colonel Tom

Squadron 435

17 Wing Winnipeg

November 18-22, 2001

Wicks, Major Brian

Commander, 103 Search and Rescue Squadron

(Gander)

February 2, 2005

Williams, Captain (N) Kelly

Former Commanding Officer, HMCS Winnipeg,

National Defence

September 22, 2003

Ward, Master Corporal

Wing Operations

8 Wing Trenton

June 25-27, 2002

Wark, Professor Wesley K.

Associate Professor in the Deptartment of History,

Trinity College, University of Toronto

October 1, 2001 / May 5, 2003 / June 27, 2005

Warren, Mr. Earle

Director General, Major Projects Design and Development

Directorate, Customs Branch

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

February 10, 2003

Watts, Chief Warrant Officer Ernest

3 Area Support Group

CFB Gagetown

January 22-24, 2002

Weldon, The Honorable Curt

Chair, Subcommittee on Military Procurement

(Republican – Pennsylvania)

U.S. House Armed Services Committee

February 6, 2002

Werny, Colonel W.S.

Commanding Officer, Aerospace Engineering

Test Establishment

National Defence

March 7, 2005

Whalen, Private Clayton

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

White, Lieutenant (N) Troy

J2

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Williams, Mr. Alan

Assistant Deputy Minister (Material)

National Defence

November 1, 2004 / October 16, 2006

Williams, Col. Richard

Director, Western Hemisphere Policy Department of National Defence

May 6, 2002, March 17, 2003

Who the Committee Heard From

Wilmink, Mr. Chuck

Consultant

November 4, 2004

Wing, Mr. Michael

National President, Union of Canadian Transportation

Employees

September 22, 2003

Winn, Mr. Conrad

President and CEO

COMPASS

December 2, 2004

Woodburn, Commander William

Submarine Division

Maritime Forces Atlantic

January 22-24, 2002

Wriedt, Colonel Art

Commander, 41 Canadian Brigade Group

National Defence

February 1, 2007

Wright, Robert

Commissioner

Canada Customs and Revenue Agency

May 6, 2002

Wynnyk, Colonel P.F.

Area Support Unit Commander

National Defence

March 7, 2005

Young, Brigadier-General G.A. (Res)

Deputy Commander, Land Forces Central

Area

December 2, 2004

Young, Major Marc

J4

CFB Kingston

May 7-9, 2002

Wilson, Mr. Larry

Regional Director, Maritimes

Canadian Coast Guard

September 22, 2003

Wingert, Colonel Douglas

Director Land Equipment Program Staff

National Defence

June 27, 2005

Wolsey, Chief Randy

Fire Rescue Services, Emergency Response

Department

City of Edmonton

January 28, 2003

Woods, Corporal Connor

Canadian Forces Medical Services School

CFB Borden

June 25-27, 2002

Wright, Mr. James R.

Assistant Deputy Minister, Global and Security

Policy, Department of Foreign Affairs and

International Trade

February 23, 2004

Wright, Mr. James R.

Assistant Deputy Minister, Global and Security

Policy, Privy Council Office

February 23, 2004

Yanow, Rear-Admiral (Ret'd) Robert

As an individual

March 1, 2005

Young, Dr. James

Assistant Deputy Minister, Public Safety and Commissioner of Public Security, Ontario Ministry

of Community Safety and Correctional Services

October 30, 2003

Zaccardelli, Commissioner Giuliano

Royal Canada Mounted Police

May 8, 2006 / May 29, 2006

APPENDIX VI Biographies of Committee Members



The Honourable NORMAN K. ATKINS, Senator

Norman K. Atkins was appointed to the Senate of Canada on June 29, 1986. Senator Atkins currently sits as an independent Progressive Conservative member, and is on the National Security and Defence Committee and the Veterans Affairs Subcommittee. Senator Atkins is a former President of Camp Associates Advertising Limited, a well-known Toronto-based agency, Senator Atkins has also played an active role within the industry, serving, for instance, as a Director of the Institute of Canadian Advertising in the early 1980's. Senator Atkins has been very

active within the Progressive Conservative Party – at both the national and the provincial levels. Namely, Senator Atkins was National Campaign Chair in the federal elections of 1984 and 1988 and has held senior organizational responsibility in a number of Provincial election campaigns and he has served as an advisor to both the Rt. Hon. Brian Mulroney and the Rt. Hon. Robert L. Stanfield, as well as the Hon. William G. Davis Premier of Ontario.



The Honourable TOMMY BANKS, Senator

Tommy Banks is known to many Canadians as an accomplished and versatile musician and entertainer. He is a recipient of the Juno Award, the Gemini Award and the Grand Prix du Disque. From 1968 to 1983 he was the host of The Tommy Banks Show on television. He has provided musical direction for the ceremonies of the Commonwealth Games, the World University Games, Expo '86, the XV Olympic Winter Games, various command performances and has performed as guest conductor of symphony orchestras throughout Canada, the United States, and in Europe. Tommy Banks was called to the Senate of Canada on

7 April 2000. On 9 May 2001, Senator Tommy Banks was appointed Vice-Chair of the Prime Minister's Caucus Task Force on Urban issues. He is currently a member of the Committee on National Security and Defence, Chair of the Committee on Energy, the Environment and Natural Resources, and chair of the Alberta Liberal Caucus in the Parliament of Canada.



The Honourable JOSEPH A. DAY, Senator

Appointed to the Senate by the Rt. Honourable Jean Chrétien, Appointed to the Senate by the Rt. Honourable Jean Chrétien, Senator Joseph Day represents the province of New Brunswick and the Senatorial Division of Saint John-Kennebecasis. He has served in the Senate of Canada since October 4, 2001.

He is currently a Member of the following Senate Committees: National Security and Defence; the Subcommittee on Veterans Affairs, National Finance and

Internal Economy Budgets and Administration. Areas of interest and specialization include: science and technology, defence, international trade and human rights issues, and heritage and literacy. He is a member of many Interparliamentary associations including the Canada-China Legislative Association and the Interparliamentary Union. He is also the Chair of the Canada-Mongolia Friendship Group.

A well-known New Brunswick lawyer and engineer, Senator Day has had a successful career as a private practice attorney.



The Honourable COLIN KENNY, Senator

Sworn in on June 29th, 1984 representing the Province of Ontario. His early political career began in 1968 as the Executive Director of the Liberal Party in Ontario. From 1970 until 1979 he worked in the Prime Minister's Office as Special Assistant, Director of Operations, Policy Advisor and Assistant Principal Secretary to the Prime Minister, the Right Honourable Pierre Trudeau. During his parliamentary career, Senator Kenny has served on numerous committees. They include the Special Committee on Terrorism and Security (1986-88) and (1989-91), the Special Joint Committee on Canada's Defence Policy (1994), the Standing Committee on

Banking Trade and Commerce, the Standing Committee on National Finance, and the Standing Committee on Internal Economy, Budgets and Administration.



The Honourable WILFRED P. MOORE, Q.C., Senator

Senator Moore was appointed to the Senate on September 26th, 1996 by the Right Honourable Jean Chrétien and represents the Province of Nova Scotia (Stanhope St./South Shore). The Senator graduated from Saint Mary's University with a Bachelor of Commerce degree in 1964, and with a Law degree in 1968 from Dalhousie University. He was appointed a Queen's Counsel in 1983. He is a member of the Nova Scotia Barrister's Society, having practiced law in Halifax for 31 years (1968-1999). The Senator was a Halifax Alderman from 1974 to 1980 and served as

Deputy Mayor from 1977 to 1978. He was Chairman of the Halifax Metro Centre, having been a member of its building committee, and he chaired the Social Assistance Appeal Board for Halifax and Dartmouth. For 10 years, from 1994-2004, he was a member of the Board of Governors of Saint Mary's University, including the Advisory Committee to the President. He is a former member of the 615 Bluenose Air Cadet Squadron, and the R.C.A.F. Reserves.



The Honourable ROD A.A. ZIMMER, Senator

Rod Zimmer is one of Winnipeg's most recognized community leaders. He was President of the Royal Winnipeg Ballet from 1989 to 1991 and as a Member of the Board of Directors for the Winnipeg Blue Bombers Football Club from 1981 to 1993. In 1973 Rod Zimmer became Special Assistant to the Hon. James Richardson, Minister of National Defense, in Ottawa and served in that position until 1979. From 1979 to 1983, he was Vice-President of Corporate Communications for CanWest Capital Corporation. and was the Director of Project Management for the Canadian Sports Pool Corporation in Ottawa in 1984. From 1985

to 1993, he was the Director of Marketing and Communications for the Manitoba Lotteries Foundation. Since 1993, he has been the President of The Gatehouse Corporation. From 1995 to 1998, he served as Vice President of Festivals for the Pan American Games Society.

Throughout his career, he has co-chaired and coordinated appeals for various charitable groups, arts and sport organizations and universities, including, B'nai Brith, Hebrew University, Manitoba Métis Federation, First-Nations, Universities of Winnipeg and Manitoba, Winnipeg Chinese Cultural Centre, Hellenic Society, East Indian Culture Centers, Saskatchewan Association of Rehabilitation Centres, Para and Special

Olympics, and recently Gold Medal Plates (Manitoba)/ 2010 Winter Olympics (Vancouver).

Recently, Rod Zimmer was asked to be the Senate Caucus Liaison for the Young Liberals of Canada. A role that will allow him to mentor youth from across the country through his position as a Senator, an illustration that merely reflects his countless years of dedication to youth within the Liberal Party.

APPENDIX VII Biographies of the Committee Secretariat



Major-General (Ret'd) G. Keith McDonald, Senior Military Advisor

MGen McDonald grew up in Edmonton, attended College Militaire Royal in St. Jean and Royal Military College in Kingston (RMC), graduating in 1966 and being awarded his pilot wings in 1967.

MGen McDonald operationally flew the Tutor, T-33, CF5, CF104 and CF18 aircraft accumulating over 4000 hours of pilot in command throughout his 37-year career in the Air

Force, Canadian Forces.

He held staff positions at the Royal Military College, in Baden Soellingen Germany, at National Defence Headquarters in Ottawa and at the North American Aerospace Command in Colorado Springs. Command positions include CF18 Squadron Commander, Base and Wing Commander in Baden Soellingen, Germany.

Major General McDonald ended his military career as the Director of Combat Operations at Headquarters North American Aerospace Defence Command at Colorado Springs, USA.

After leaving the military in 1998, General McDonald served a period of "conflict of interest" prior to joining BMCI Consulting as a Principal Consultant in the Aerospace and Defence Division. He left BMCI in 2002 to set up his own consulting company, KM Aerospace Consulting.

Major General McDonald has a degree in Political and Economic Science (Honours Courses) from the Royal Military College. He has completed Canadian Forces staff school, the Royal Air Force (England) Staff College, the National Security studies course, Post Graduate Courses in Business at Queens University, Electronic Warfare Courses at the University of California Los Angeles, the Law of Armed Conflict at San Remo, Italy, and numerous project management courses.

General McDonald is married to the former Catherine Grunder of Kincardine, Ontario, and they have two grown daughters, Jocelyn and Amy.



Barry A. Denofsky, National Security Advisor

Barry Denofsky recently retired after having completed 35 years with the Canadian Security Intelligence Service (CSIS) and the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP). Mr. Denofsky joined the RCMP in January 1969 and worked as a peace officer in Saskatchewan, Alberta, and Quebec. In 1972, he was transferred to the RCMP Security Service where he was involved in a variety of national security investigations. With the creation of CSIS in 1984, Mr. Denofsky

maintained his interest and involvement in matters of national security with the new Service.

Mr. Denofsky held a variety of operational and senior management positions with CSIS which have included the following: Chief, Counter Intelligence, Quebec Region, Deputy Director General Operations, Ottawa Region, Deputy Director General Counter Terrorism, Headquarters, Ottawa, and Director General Counter Intelligence, Headquarters, Ottawa. On retirement from CSIS, Mr. Denofsky was the Director General, Research, Analysis and Production, Headquarters, Ottawa. In that capacity, he was responsible for the production and provision to government of all source analytical products concerning threats to the security of Canada

Mr. Denofsky also represented CSIS for many years at meetings of the NATO Special Committee in Brussels, Belgium. The Special Committee is an organization of security and intelligence services representing all member nations of NATO. In 2002, Mr. Denofsky was the Chair of the NATO Special Committee Working Group.

Mr. Denofsky is a graduate of the University of Toronto, and holds a graduate Diploma in Public Administration from Carleton University in Ottawa. He is a member of the Council of Advisors, the Canadian Centre of Intelligence and Security Studies, (CSIS), Carleton University. He is married and has two children.



Steven James, Analyst

Steven James joined the Parliamentary Information and Research Service of the Library of Parliament in July 2005. He serves as a Research Officer for the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence.

Mr. James received his Bachelor of Arts (Psychology and Sociology) from the University of Alberta and a Masters in Military and Strategic Studies from the Center for Military and Strategic Studies at the University of Calgary.

Mr. James' recent studies have focused on Canada's counter-terrorism framework, specifically, federal, provincial and municipal responses to and prevention of terrorist-related incidents.

Previous to joining the Committee, Mr. James served as a Police Officer for the both the Ontario Provincial Police (1994 - 1998) and the Toronto Police Service (1998 - 2001).



Melissa Radford, Analyst

Melissa Radford joined the Parliamentary Information and Research Service of the Library of Parliament in November 2006 and serves as analyst for the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence.

Miss Radford graduated from the Royal Military College of Canada with an MA in Defence Management and Policy in May 2006. She also holds a BSc in International Relations from the London School of Economics.

During her last semester at RMC, just prior to joining the Committee, Miss Radford worked at the United Nations Secretariat in the Department of Peacekeeping Operations.

Jason Yung, Research Assistant

Jason Yung joined the Parliamentary Research and Information Service of the Library of Parliament in January 2007. Jason currently serves as a Research Assistant to the Senate Standing Committee on National Security and Defense.

Jason earned his Honours Bachelor of Arts from the University of Toronto in 2005 in Economics and Political Science. Jason has since completed internships with organizations including the International Crisis Group, Human Rights Watch and the Atlantic Council of Canada. Most recently, Jason served as a policy analyst for the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade.

Jason's primary research interests are focused on Islamism, Middle East politics, and the evolving role of China in the Middle East.

Jodi Turner, Committee Clerk

Jodi Turner joined the Committees Branch of the Senate in January 2005. She serves as the Co-clerk for the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence.

Ms. Turner received a *cum laude* Double Honours Bachelor of Arts (French and Political Studies) and a *cum laude* Masters in Public Administration (specialization in Canadian Politics), from the University of Manitoba.

Previous to joining the Committee, she served as Chief of Staff to the Speaker of the Senate from 2002 - 2005; and was Vice-President of Research for Western Opinion Research in Winnipeg, Manitoba from 2000 - 2002.