Adding the Social To an Economic Calculus:

Comparing and Contrasting PNP Equations

National Metropolis Conference 2011
Sheraton Vancouver Wall Centre
March 23-26

Alexandra Dobrowolsky
adobrowolsky@smu.ca
Department of Political Science
Saint Mary's University

Objectives

1) *to engage with recent debates on neoliberalization*
2) *to propose a more finely-tuned approach to, & analysis of, neoliberalism by drawing on:*
   - *i) studies of scale;*
   - *ii) theories of governmentality*
3) *to strike more of a balance between structure & agency re: devolution of immigration policy in Canada*

Structure of Paper

- **Part I:** *debates around neoliberalization; premises & points of connection re: scalar & governmentality studies*
- **Part II:** *"Meso" scale: PNPs & NSNP*
- **Part III:** *"Micro" scale: rationales & realities of NS nominees (via 17 semi-structured, qualitative interviews)*
- **Part IV:** *Concluding Comments*

Governmentality *furthers the analysis by…*

- Deciphering the strategic & complex political roles & repercussions of the individual, the self, the personal
- Focusing on political subjects as "enterprising selves"; language of entrepreneurial individual, entrepreneurialism
- Contributing more complex understandings of power & choice; problematizing agency

NSNP *Primary Objectives*

- i) increase economic benefits for NS
- ii) process & admit candidates expeditiously as possible
- iii) attract & retain more immigrants
- iv) provide mentorship to give immigrants exposure & experience with NS businesses

Multiple problems re: NSNP economic stream…

- **Government nominee targets not met**
- **Nominees ill-matched with companies**
- **Not all those who started mentorships completed their 6 month assignments**
- **Some who participated did not plan to stay in NS**
- **Many local businesses did not adhere to guidelines for mentor companies**
- ***Cornwallis Financial Corporation* debacle (legal proceedings; partisanship issues)**

Neoliberal convergence, *yes, but….*

- **NSNP** = ***meso scale renditions of macro trends in terms of explicit marketization***

- ***At the same time, however….***

  NSNP= complications & contestation…

Challenges, Contradictions, & Conflict

- **Local businesses exposed & stymied**
- **Mobilization by nominees**
- **Gov't pressure: *bad optics of scandal*; *good, (i.e., compelling & convincing) arguments of nominees= economic redress***
- **Provincial response neither unified nor uniform**
- **Conflict between "partners" leads to legal proceedings, "divorce" & pay outs re: Cornwallis & provincial gov't**

Part III: "*Micro" Scale Considerations: Economic Stream Candidates' Choices, Opportunities & Constraints*

- **Principal applicants= "ideal migrants"**
  - = financially privileged; possess human capital
  - = disproportionately male; "independent"
  - = strategically weighing costs & benefits
- **Prime neoliberal subjects, individual entrepreneurs, seizing & shaping opportunities**
  - re: market
  - re: "fast tracking" immigration
  - re: accessing "easier" "less complicated" procedures

So, *on one hand…*

- these are the quintessential “ideal” migrants who possess sought-after capital & capitalistic knowhow
- *they epitomize the entrepreneurial, neoliberal individual making strategic, personal calculations in terms of the market, business investment, employment & self betterment etc.*

BUT, *on the other hand…*

- when rationales & realities probed further, nominees ***resist*** being both the “objects’ & “subjects” of neoliberalization
- their migration strategies & outcomes invariably encompassed ***more than*** *individualistic* & *economistic* logics
- ***more complicated*** choices, calculations & commitments involved…

Multi-faceted Strategic Choices

- **“My decision was long-term strategic, in management you call it strategic decision. My purposes are (pause) educational purpose and economical…And of course, the third one is social because I’m going to make a good life-style for my family, and we are going to upgrade ourselves in education…we are going to contribute and collaborate our experience and education to Nova Scotian society”** *(interviewee 12: 15).*

Nominees' choices, calculations & commitments

In order of priority…

- **Safety & security for families**
- **Education; English language**
- **Social & Political considerations, including gender equality**
- **Social & Economic considerations**

Nominees make the commitment despite harsh socio-economic & political realities *re: de-skilling, class & gender mobility, "reverse" remittances*; their choices made in light of long term calculations for their families

Safety & Security

- **“this place is a good place to live-crime is less and everything is calm, and people are friendly”** (interviewee 11: 235)
- **“we were trying to avoid the problems of big cities. We were trying to stay away from big cities and we didn’t want to face similar kinds of problems in Toronto- similar but perhaps on a different scale than we had back home”** (interviewee 13: 190)
- **“when I go into the street, I am very safety because my country when you go…outside, you must wear a scarf, in the summer! For woman it is very difficult, it is very hard but if you don’t wear a scarf out, you most go to jail. Here, I am free. Free, free”** (interviewee 3: 220)

Education & Families

- “Before we never hear about Halifax, Nova Scotia…but the agent person gave us the information and we like this because Halifax is, people is, liked education. Education is very important for my family also…And Halifax is a small city but there are lot of universities, colleges, we chose very important for education” *(interviewee 1: 330)*

Social & Political concerns

- **“Like all Iranian men, I wanted to be where my family was happy and satisfied. You could call the reason for immigration more social than financial or anything else, because we already knew that we wouldn’t be able to make money here, but back there we could easily make a lot of money, but we were living in a society where there was little security, there was always fear for instability, of war, of revolution, and we were not in a stable society, and that is why we decided to immigrate.”** *(interviewee 13: 12)*

Social networks: *local & transnational*

- **"It is a mistake to rely only on adverts that come through the internet or just the blurbs as it were. We were going by what the people actually told us, people who lived in Canada, people who were traveling back & forth, acquaintances, relations, by word-of-mouth...that means that we didn't only necessarily receive positive information about Canada, we were aware that people came here and they got divorced, they were separated, they became depressed, they were not able to remain, & they returned- so… we knew there were a lot of different things going on, and it's different for everybody"** ***(interviewee 13: 310)***

Less than optimal outcomes

- **“I’ve got 30 years experience in oil and gas project management, and according to my strategic decision I have decided to come here, and to contribute and to collaborate my experience and education to Nova Scotia…And it’s not fair that I am unemployed, and I have no income, and I have spent all of my savings, and (pause) I am in a bad situation now.”** *(interviewee 12: 110)*

Conclusions

- **“I think that each nominee they have to balance because in their country they have position, they have high salary, they won’t be how to find a job [here in Nova Scotia just] because they have a good job in their [home] country…the people should be prepared”** ***(interviewee 16: 415).***

Conclusions con't

- ***Scalar analysis*** reveals that the road to neoliberalization not only a bumpy one, but there are disruptions, diversions & cul-de-sacs along the way
- Drawing on insights from ***governmentality*** we see nominees as **neither "objects" nor "subjects" of rule** in processes of neoliberalization
- Indeed, we see contradictory behaviours of "usual suspects" i.e., political officials & economic agents & **resistive discourses & practices of nominees**
- =more textured experiences of structure & agency