## **Centre for the Study of Living Standards**

111 Sparks Street, Suite 500 Ottawa, Ontario K1P 5B5 613-233-8891, fax 613-233-8250 csls@csls.ca

## New Estimates of Manufacturing Productivity Growth for Canada and the United States

Andrew Sharpe Executive Director Centre for the Study of Living Standards

Prepared for the meeting on the Research Advisory Committee on the CSLS project on the Canada-U.S. Manufacturing Productivity Gap, March 25, 1999, Chateau Laurier, Ottawa, Ontario. Revised April 28, 1999.

# New Estimates of Productivity for Manufacturing in Canada and the United States

In recent months, the issue of productivity has risen to the top of the federal government's economic policy agenda. The motivation for this development has been the perception that Canada's aggregate productivity performance has been dismal in the 1990s, particularly relative to the United States. This perception is indeed true when productivity is measued on a per worker or person employed basis. Total economy GDP per worker advanced at a 1.1 per cent average annual rate in the United States over the 1989-98 period compared to 0.8 per cent in Canada (see Table 1).

However, when productivity is measured on the more appropriate hours worked basis, Canada actually outperformed the United States (1.2 per cent versus 1.1 per cent). This difference between aggregate measures of labour productivity is due to the 0.4 per cent average annual decline in the average weekly hours in Canada in the 1990s (from 35.1 in 1989 to 34.0 in 1998), compared to no trend in hours in the United States (Tables 2, A1).

Total factor or multifactor productivity measures the increase in output per unit of the combined inputs of labour and capital, where the two inputs are weighted by their shares of national income. For the total economy, Canada also outperformed the United States in the 1990s on this productivity measure because of our slower capital stock growth (Table 2). In other words, we have made more efficient use of our capital stock than the Americans. Statistics Canada has recently released productivity estimates that show that multifactor productivity in Canada's business sector also outperformed that of the United States in the 1990s.

It is in manufacturing where the official data do show a significant divergence in productivity growth rates between Canada and the United States in the 1990s. BLS data show that output per hour advanced more than 1 percentage point faster per year in the U.S. over the 1989-97 period. Consequently, the productivity debate has focussed on the manufacturing sector, especially since structural reforms affecting manufacturing (e.g. replacement of the Manufacturing Sales Tax by the GST, reduction in trade barriers through the FTA and NAFTA, deregulation, etc.) have lead to expectations that Canada's manufacturing productivity growth should exceed that of the United States.

The objective of this note is to contribute to the manufacturing productivity debate by presenting new detailed estimates for labour, capital, and total factor productivity for two-digit SIC manufacturing industries in Canada and the United States for the 1980s and 1990s. The estimates have been developed by the Centre for the Study of Living Standards (CSLS) from official estimates of real output, labour input, and capital stock data produced by Statistics Canada and the U.S. Department of Commerce.

#### Official data on general trends in manufacturing

Since 1981, according to BLS data, output per hour in manufacturing has advanced an

average 0.9 percentage points faster in the United States than in Canada- 3.1 per cent versus 2.2 per cent (Table 3). According to a recent benchmark estimate (de Jong, Gjalt 1996<sup>1</sup>), the level of output per hour in Canadian manufacturing in the 1987 was 79.4 per cent of the U.S. level. Combining this level and the relative productivity growth rates produces a fall in Canada's productivity relative for manufacturing from 83.9 per cent in 1981 to 73.7 per cent in 1997, a precipitous decline (Table 4).

In both the 1980s and the 1990s, Canada's output per hour growth in manufacturing has lagged that in the U.S. In the peak-to-peak 1981-89 period, output per hour increased at a 2.3 per cent rate in Canada versus 3.2 per cent in the U.S. From the 1989 peak to 1997, (not a business cycle peak, but the most recent year for which data are currently available), output per hour in Canadian manufacturing advanced at a 2.2 per cent average annual rate, compared to 2.9 per cent in the U.S.

The pace of output growth, and the relationship between output and productivity growth changed markedly in Canada between the 1980s and the 1990s, more so than in the U.S. In the 1980s, output growth advanced at a 3.0 per cent average annual rate (not much below the 3.2 per cent registered in the U.S.) and both productivity growth and labour input growth contributed to output, with growth rates of 2.3 per cent and 0.7 per cent respectively. But in the 1990s output has increased at only a 1.7 per cent average annual rate (compared to 2.7 per cent in the U.S.), with all the gains coming from productivity growth (2.2 per cent per year) and total hours falling at a 0.4 per cent annual rate. The key development in the 1990s in Canadian manufacturing was not any significant deterioration of productivity growth, but the almost halving of output growth.

#### Manufacturing Productivity Trends based on CSLS Data Base

The Centre for the Study of Living Standards (CSLS) has constructed a productivity data base based on Statistics Canada and U.S. Department of Commerce data that allows analysis of Canadian and U.S. labour, capital, and total factor productivity trends on an industry basis. The complete data base is posted on the CSLS website (<u>www.csls.ca</u>) under projects. For the total manufacturing sector the output per hour growth rates were almost identical with the BLS series for the 1981-97 period (Table 5). However, this is not quite the case when the 1990s and 1980s are examined separately.

According to the CSLS series, growth in output per hour was only 0.5 percentages points less than in U.S. manufacturing in the 1990s, compared to 0.7 points in the BLS series. Moreover, growth in output per hour in Canadian manufacturing accelerated by 0.3 points in Canada in the 1990s relative to the 1980s, compared to a fall of 0.5 points for U.S. manufacturing. Consequently, this data series puts Canada's manufacturing productivity performance is a somewhat better light than the BLS series.

A detailed analysis of US manufacturing in the 1990s reveals that productivity growth is largely concentrated in two industries- industrial machinery and equipment and electronic and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> de Jong, Gjalt (1996) "Canada's Post-war Manufacturing Performance: A Comparison with the United States," Research Memorandum GD-32, Groningen Growth and Development Centre, University of Groningen, December.

other electronic equipment. When these two industries are removed, US manufacturing productivity growth evaporates, falling from 2.9 per cent to 0.2 per cent per year (Table 5). In contrast, in Canada, removal of these two industries from the data has little effect on manufacturing productivity.

In the United States, output per hour in industrial machinery and equipment rose at a 7.9 per cent annual rate in the 1990s and electronic and other electric equipment at 13.9 per cent. These two sectors accounted for an astonishing 102.9 per cent of all the output (expressed in 1992 dollars) increase in U.S. manufacturing in the 1990s, with their share of total manufacturing output nearly doubling from 18.5 per cent to 34.8 per cent between 1989 and 1997 (Table 6). Indeed, real output in the rest of manufacturing fell in absolute terms in the 1990s.

In terms of the 19 two-digit SIC manufacturing industries, Canada enjoyed faster output per hour increases or smaller declines in growth in the 1990s in 11 industries (wood industries, furniture and fixture industries, primary metal industries, transportation equipment industries, food and kindred products, tobacco product industries, textile industries, paper and allied products industries, chemical and allied products industries, refined petroleum and coal products industries, and rubber and plastic industries). The United States outperformed Canada in only 8 sectors (non-metalic mineral products industries, fabricated metal products industries, machinery industries, electrical and electronic products industries, other manufacturing industries, clothing industries, printing and publishing industries, and leather and leather products industries).

An analysis of capital productivity trends in Canadian and U.S. manufacturing (Table 7) reveals that for the total manufacturing sector, Canada outperform the United States in the 1990s, with output per unit of net capital stock rising at a 2.3 per cent annual rate in this country compared to 0.6 per cent in the United States. This trend reflects the fact that the constant dollar net capital stock (geometric depreciation) in manufacturing in Canada fell at an average annual rate of 0.5 per cent over the 1989-97 period, compared to a 1.8 per cent average annual rate of increase in the United States.

Canada's superior performance was broadly based, occurring in 15 out of 19 industries. When the industrial machinery and equipment and electronic and other electric equipment sectors are excluded, capital productivity plummets in the United States (-2.3 per cent per year), but is relatively unchanged in Canada.

Caution should be exercised in the interpretation of capital productivity trends (and hence total factor productivity trends) between Canada and the United States because of use of different methodologies in the construction of the time series (e.g. different service lives, depreciation functions and deflators). Statistics Canada is currently developing capital stock estimates for Canada based on U.S. definitions, and these new series may produce results which differ significantly from capital productivity trends reported above.

It should also be noted here that the capital stock series used here is the official Statistics Canada constant 1992 dollar capital stock series for manufacturing (CANSIM D993721) based on fixed 1992 weights. Statistics Canada uses a chain-weighted (Fisher) series for calculation of its multifactor productivity series for manufacturing and this series shows a different trend in the capital, rising at 1.0 per cent per year over the 1989-97 period (see Appendix A8 for comparison of CSLS and Statistics Canada manufacturing productivity estimates).

Total factor productivity is the weighted average of labour and capital productivity growth where the weights are the income shares of labour and capital. Table 8 shows that total factor productivity growth advanced at a 2.3 per cent pace in Canada in the 1990s, compared to 2.1 per cent in the United States. Again, Canada's superior performance was broadly based, with 13 out of 19 industries surpassing U.S. growth rates. When the industrial machinery and equipment and electronic and other electric equipment sectors are excluded, total factor productivity falls in the United States (-0.7 per cent per year), but is relatively unchanged in Canada.

#### Implications of the New Data

Three important points arise from these new data. First, in contrast to Canada's inferior labour productivity performance, capital and total factor productivity growth in Canadian manufacturing exceeded that of the United States in the 1990s. This suggests it may be premature to conclude that Canada's overall productivity performance in manufacturing was worse than that experienced in the United States.

Second, the superior U.S. labour productivity performance is based on the massive output gains in the industrial machinery and equipment and electronic and other electric equipment sectors and evaporates when these sectors are excluded. This suggests one should be suspicious of the output estimates for the industrial machinery and equipment and electronic and other electric equipment sectors in the United States. Further investigation of this issue needs to be done.

Third, given the uncertainty associated with the comparable measurement of manufacturing productivity in Canada and the United States, it may be misleading to focus on the causes of faster U.S. productivity growth and a growing Canada-U.S. productivity gap, as such may not be the case. But we do know with a fair degree of certainty based on earlier benchmark level estimates that the level of manufacturing productivity in Canada continues to be below that in the United States, so a focus on the factors behind such a gap (even if it is not growing) remains justified.

#### Table 1

## Total Economy Labour Productivity Growth in Canada and the United States (average annual rate of change)

	Output per worker		Output per 1	hour	
	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	
1981-89	1.33	1.11	0.99	1.38	
1989-98	0.84	1.13	1.23	1.10	
1981-98	1.07	1.12	1.11	1.23	

Source: Centre for the Study of Living Standards based on Statistics Canada and Bureau of Economic Analysis data

#### Table 2

## Total Economy Output, Labour Input, and Capital Stock Trends in Canada and the United States (average annual rate of change)

	Output		Employment		Ave. Hours		Total Hours		Capita	al Stock
	Can.	U.S.	Can.	U.S.	Can.	U.S.	Can.	U.S.	Can.	U.S.
1981-89	3.10	3.18	1.74	2.04	0.34	-0.29	2.09	1.77	1.81	2.84
1989-98	1.86	2.47	1.01	1.33	-0.38	0.03	0.63	1.35	1.26	2.34*
1981-98	2.44	2.80	1.35	1.66	-0.04	-0.12	1.31	1.55	1.52	2.59*

Source: Statistics Canada and U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis

\*End year is 1997, not 1998.

#### Table 3

# Output, Output Per Hour, and Labour Input in Manufacturing in Canada and the United States

	Real O	Real Output		Output per hour		Total hours		Employment		Output per employed person	
	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	
1981-89 1989-97 1981-97	3.0 1.7 2.3	3.2 2.7 3.0	2.3 2.2 2.2	3.2 2.9 3.1	0.7 -0.4 0.1	0.0 -0.2 -0.1	0.4 -0.5 -0.1	-0.5 -0.5 -0.5	2.6 2.2 2.4	3.7 3.2 3.4	

(average annual rates of change)

Source: International Comparisons of Manufacturing Productivity and Unit Labour Costs, Updated Trends for 1997, News, Bureau of Labor Statistics, U.S. Department of Labor, March, 1999.

	Output per	Real GDP per
	Hour	
	In	employed
	Manufacturing	person
1977	89.9	81.4
1978	90.6	81.4
1979	89.3	81.1
1980	86.0	80.6
1981	83.9	80.3
1982	79.5	81.4
1983	80.6	81.3
1984	84.1	81.9
1985	84.1	82.0
1986	83.1	81.6
1987	79.4	82.5
1988	76.5	82.6
1989	78.3	81.8
1990	80.1	81.1
1991	79.5	81.2
1992	82.2	80.5
1993	83.2	80.5
1994	80.3	81.0
1995	77.6	81.1

74.8

73.7

### Table 4: Relative Productivity Levels Canada/US, %

(US = 100 in all years)

1996

1997

*Source*: manufacturing-Based on an estimate of 79.4 for the 1987 benchmark year by Gjalt de Jong "Canada's Post-war Manufacturing Performance: A Comparison with the United States," Research Memorandum GD-32, Groningen Growth and Development Centre, University of Groningen, December 1996, and growth rates from *International Comparisons of Manufacturing Productivity and Unit Labour Costs, trends for 1997*, News, Bureau of Labour Statistics, U.S. Department of Labour, March 1999.

80.2

80.3

http://www.bls.gov/news.release/prod4.t01.htm; total economy - Bureau of Labor Statistics (1998) "Comparative Real Gross Domestic Product Per Capita and per Employed Person, Fourteen Countries, 1960-1996," (<u>ftp.bls.gov/pub/special.requests/ForeignLabor/flsgdp.txt</u>); updated for 1997 up CSLS.

### Table 5: VALUE ADDED PER PERSON HOUR Estimates of GDP per hour, by Industry

	% Average compound growth rates					
	1981	-89	1989	9-97	1981	-97
	Canada	US	Canada	US	Canada	US
All industries	0.80	1.38	1.27	0.84	1.03	1.11
Total manufacturing industries	2.06	3.40	2.35	2.90	2.20	3.15
Wood industries	3.89	3.73	-1.46	-2.88	1.18	0.37
Furniture and fixture industries	0.26	0.51	4.89	2.03	2.55	1.26
Non-metallic mineral products industries	3.34	3.29	-1.37	1.84	0.95	2.56
Primary metal industries	3.56	-0.32	4.50	2.99	4.03	1.32
Fabricated metal products industries	2.57	2.73	0.93	2.01	1.75	2.37
Machinery industries	5.00	8.72	1.63	7.88	3.30	8.30
Electrical and electronic products industries	4.54	n/a	4.28	13.91	4.41	n/a
Transportation equipment industries	2.76	2.49	2.29	-0.70	2.52	0.88
Other manufacturing industries	-0.06	5.83	-0.32	0.27	-0.19	3.01
Food and kindred	0.22	2.82	2.23	-0.09	1.22	1.35
Tobacco products industries	n/a	-5.42	12.42	-0.17	n/a	-2.83
Textile industries	3.04	3.31	7.08	3.95	5.04	3.63
Clothing industries	-0.83	3.91	1.32	3.83	0.24	3.87
Paper and allied products industries	0.08	2.77	4.27	1.44	2.15	2.10
Printing, publishing and allied industries	-2.01	-0.35	-2.61	-1.80	-2.31	-1.08
Chemical and chemical products industries	3.42	4.53	3.44	3.23	3.43	3.88
Refined petroleum and coal products	0.63	8.66	7.44	1.60	3.98	5.07
industries						
Rubber and plastic industries	1.67	4.12	4.45	4.03	3.05	4.07
Leather and allied products industries	2.84	4.21	-0.26	4.11	1.28	4.16
Manufacturing - Machinery and Electric industries	1.84	2.95	2.21	0.20	2.02	1.56
Manufacturing (BLS data)	2.3	3.2	2.2	3.3	2.2	3.2

Source: CSLS productivity data base

#### Table 6

#### Manufacturing Output by Sector in Canada and the United States, 1989-97

	Outp	put by Ind	Percentage Change		(	Output S	Shares (%)			
	Canada	u (mill\$)	U.S. (	bill\$)	1989	9-97	Can	nada	U.	S.
	1989	1997	1989	1997	Canada	U.S.	1989	1997	1989	1997
Total manufacturing industries	106,612	123,155	1106.0	1369.9	15.5	23.9	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
Wood industries	5 673	5 797	38 7	33.1	2.2	-14 5	5 32	4 71	3 50	2 42
Furniture and fixture industries	2 188	2 579	16.9	197	17.9	16.6	2.52	2.09	1 53	$1 \Delta \Delta$
Non-metallic mineral products industries	2,100 3 473	2,377 2 947	25.6	29.3	-15.1	14.5	3.26	2.07	2 31	2 14
Primary metal industries	5 487	6 180	29.0 39.4	48.0	12.6	21.8	5.20	5.02	3 56	3 50
Fabricated metal products industries	8,260	9,005	75.2	93.0	9.0	23.7	7.75	7.31	6.80	6.79
Machinery industries	5,553	6,869	112.1	215.2	23.7	92.0	5.21	5.58	10.14	15.71
Electrical and electronic products industries	7,147	9,779	92.7	261.2	36.8	181.8	6.70	7.94	8.38	19.07
Transportation equipment industries	15,901	21,443	136.7	121.9	34.9	-10.8	14.91	17.41	12.36	8.90
Other manufacturing industries	3,175	3,619	78.7	59.4	14.0	-24.5	2.98	2.94	7.12	4.34
Food and kindred	14,955	17,352	102.7	106.7	16.0	3.9	14.03	14.09	9.29	7.79
Tobacco products industries	1,242	1,048	27.2	21.3	-15.6	-21.7	1.16	0.85	2.46	1.55
Textile industries	2,586	2,845	21.9	25.7	10.0	17.4	2.43	2.31	1.98	1.88
Clothing industries	3,154	2,846	27.2	28.2	-9.8	3.7	2.96	2.31	2.46	2.06
Paper and allied products industries	6,028	6,605	43.8	48.9	9.6	11.6	5.65	5.36	3.96	3.57
Printing, publishing and allied industries	8,827	6,996	87.9	76.7	-20.7	-12.7	8.28	5.68	7.95	5.60
Chemical and chemical products industries	8,617	10,281	111.4	141.2	19.3	26.8	8.08	8.35	10.07	10.31
Refined petroleum and coal products industries	961	1,191	33.4	32.4	23.9	-3.0	0.90	0.97	3.02	2.37
Rubber and plastic industries	3,771	5,402	34.5	53.7	43.3	55.7	3.54	4.39	3.12	3.92
Leather and allied products industries	586	371	4.9	4.3	-36.7	-12.2	0.55	0.30	0.44	0.31
Manufacturing - Machinery and Electric industries	93,912	106,507	901	894	13.4	-0.9	88.09	86.48	81.48	65.22

Source: Gross Domestic Product by Industry, CANSIM matrix 4677, Statistics Canada, 1999; Bureau of Economic Analysis, 1999, http://www.bea.doc.gov/bea/an/1198gpo/maintext.htm

#### Table 7: VALUE ADDED PER UNIT OF CAPITAL STOCK (\$1000's of 1992 constant dollar GDP per \$1000's of 1992 constant dollars of year-end net capital stock)

	%	5 Avera	ge comp	ound gro	wth rates	
	1981	-89	1989	9-97	1981	-97
	Canada	US	Canada	US	Canada	US
All industries	1.07	0.33	0.54	-0.04	0.81	0.14
Total manufacturing industries	0.95	0.11	2.32	0.61	1.63	0.36
Wood industries	4.91	2.40	-2.01	-4.30	1.39	-1.01
Furniture and fixture industries	-1.11	-0.91	0.42	-0.34	-0.35	-0.62
Non-metallic mineral products industries	4.72	-0.80	1.76	-0.44	3.23	-0.62
Primary metal industries	1.87	-7.25	3.23	0.17	2.55	-3.61
Fabricated metal products industries	0.99	-1.33	1.34	0.36	1.17	-0.49
Machinery industries	1.47	4.37	-0.94	6.80	0.25	5.58
Electrical and electronic products industries	2.16	n/a	6.27	12.12	4.19	n/a
Transportation equipment industries	0.78	0.82	1.54	-3.46	1.16	-1.35
Other manufacturing industries	-4.49	2.06	-0.24	-1.66	-2.39	0.18
Food and kindred	-1.37	-0.59	2.41	-1.79	0.50	-1.19
Tobacco products industries	-1.43	-11.66	-5.53	-5.15	-3.50	-8.46
Textile industries	1.35	-1.61	0.98	-0.43	1.16	-1.02
Clothing industries	-0.13	-0.87	-3.11	-1.79	-1.63	-1.33
Paper and allied products industries	-5.16	-0.04	1.84	-0.79	-1.73	-0.42
Printing, publishing and allied industries	-2.49	-0.71	-5.16	-3.34	-3.84	-2.04
Chemical and chemical products industries	8.63	1.18	3.55	0.87	6.06	1.03
Refined petroleum and coal products	3.22	1.59	9.44	-2.64	6.28	-0.54
industries						
Rubber and plastic industries	0.70	3.36	3.82	3.24	2.25	3.30
Leather and allied products industries	-1.24	-5.47	-2.73	-3.76	-1.99	-4.62
Manufacturing - Machinery and Electric industries	0.93	-1.56	2.09	-2.25	1.51	-1.90

Source: CSLS Productivity data base

## Table 8: Total Factor Productivity Indices (Using number of hours)

	%	6 Avera	ge comp	ound gro	wth rates	5
	1981	-89	1989	9-97	1981	-97
	Canada	US	Canada	US	Canada	US
All industries	0.90	0.95	0.98	0.46	0.94	0.71
Total manufacturing industries	1.70	2.42	2.34	2.12	2.02	2.27
Wood industries	4.11	3.23	-1.58	-3.45	1.23	-0.16
Furniture and fixture industries	-0.09	0.26	3.51	1.56	1.69	0.91
Non-metallic mineral products industries	3.76	2.44	-0.54	1.27	1.59	1.85
Primary metal industries	3.33	-1.39	4.31	2.40	3.82	0.49
Fabricated metal products industries	2.07	1.71	1.07	1.53	1.57	1.62
Machinery industries	3.69	7.95	0.53	7.65	2.10	7.80
Electrical and electronic products industries	4.06	n/a	4.68	13.26	4.37	n/a
Transportation equipment industries	2.18	2.31	2.05	-1.05	2.12	0.61
Other manufacturing industries	-0.92	4.36	-0.31	-0.58	-0.62	1.86
Food and kindred	-0.53	1.37	2.32	-0.90	0.88	0.23
Tobacco products industries	N/a	-10.48	-1.99	-4.52	n/a	-7.55
Textile industries	2.59	2.03	5.03	2.48	3.80	2.26
Clothing industries	-0.65	2.92	0.06	2.23	-0.30	2.58
Paper and allied products industries	-0.43	1.86	3.96	0.62	1.74	1.24
Printing, publishing and allied industries	-2.14	-0.46	-3.37	-2.32	-2.76	-1.40
Chemical and chemical products industries	6.26	2.95	3.50	1.98	4.87	2.46
Refined petroleum and coal products	1.61	4.59	8.12	-1.26	4.81	1.62
industries						
Rubber and plastic industries	1.29	3.96	4.19	3.85	2.73	3.90
Leather and allied products industries	2.02	1.14	-0.87	0.34	0.56	0.74
Manufacturing - Machinery and Electric	1.54	1.60	2.17	-0.67	1.85	0.46
industries						

Source: CSLS Productivity data base



Chart 1: Relative Productivity Levels (Canada/US)

	Total Economy								Man	ufacturi	ng					
Year	GDP at	Workers	Average	Total	Geom.	GDP per	GDP per	GDP	GDP at	Workers	Average	Total	Geom.	GDP per	GDP per	GDP
	market pr.,	, thous.	hours	hours per	End-Year	worker, \$	hour, \$	per unit	factor	, thous.	hours	hours	End-	worker,	hour, \$	per
	million		per	week,	Net CS,			of CS, \$	cost,		per	per	Year Net	\$		unit of
	1992 \$		week	thous.	mil 1992\$				million		week	week,	CS, mil			CS, \$
									1992 \$			thous.	1992\$			
	А	В	C/B	С	D	A/B*1000	(A*1000)	A/D	Е	F	G/F	G	Н	E/F*1000	(E*1000)	E/H
							/(C*52)								/(G*52)	
1976	470,291	9,776	35.0	342,550	374,823	48,106	26.40	1.255	75,917	1,983	35.9	71,155	48,660	38,282	20.52	1.560
1977	486,562	9,978	35.0	349,327	385,574	48,763	26.79	1.262	78,421	1,951	36.3	70,737	49,525	40,193	21.32	1.583
1978	506,413	10,320	35.4	364,943	395,504	49,070	26.69	1.280	82,774	2,020	36.7	74,148	49,512	40,969	21.47	1.672
1979	527,703	10,761	35.3	380,363	409,863	49,040	26.68	1.288	86,109	2,145	36.6	78,485	50,171	40,144	21.10	1.716
1980	535,007	11,082	34.7	385,007	429,104	48,276	26.72	1.247	82,165	2,187	36.1	78,895	52,935	37,565	20.03	1.552
1981	551,305	11,398	34.2	389,810	454,193	48,369	27.20	1.214	84,136	2,204	35.5	78,224	57,967	38,183	20.68	1.451
1982	535,113	11,035	34.0	375,681	466,469	48,492	27.39	1.147	74,743	2,010	35.7	71,785	59,567	37,191	20.02	1.255
1983	549,843	11,106	34.1	378,609	470,641	49,510	27.93	1.168	78,638	1,961	36.3	71,117	57,589	40,107	21.26	1.366
1984	581,038	11,402	34.1	389,267	474,712	50,958	28.70	1.224	89,152	2,046	36.2	74,086	55,384	43,582	23.14	1.610
1985	612,416	11,742	34.3	402,921	481,757	52,156	29.23	1.271	93,799	2,063	36.5	75,203	55,609	45,469	23.99	1.687
1986	628,575	12,095	34.3	414,669	486,441	51,972	29.15	1.292	94,829	2,098	36.4	76,348	57,604	45,202	23.89	1.646
1987	654,360	12,422	34.1	424,171	493,605	52,676	29.67	1.326	99,215	2,127	36.3	77,125	59,615	46,648	24.74	1.664
1988	686,176	12,819	34.7	444,806	508,187	53,529	29.67	1.350	105,126	2,214	37.3	82,595	63,046	47,480	24.48	1.667
1989	703,577	13,086	35.1	459,807	524,377	53,765	29.43	1.342	106,612	2,236	37.7	84,182	68,125	47,684	24.35	1.565
1990	705,464	13,165	34.6	455,550	536,879	53,586	29.78	1.314	102,570	2,104	36.9	77,737	71,044	48,750	25.37	1.444
1991	692,247	12,916	33.9	438,199	545,813	53,596	30.38	1.268	94,999	1,956	36.4	71,214	71,550	48,566	25.65	1.328
1992	698,544	12,842	33.4	428,648	548,252	54,395	31.34	1.274	96,181	1,878	36.1	67,743	68,460	51,223	27.30	1.405
1993	714,583	13,015	33.8	440,449	548,452	54,906	31.20	1.303	101,101	1,893	37.2	70,509	65,006	53,405	27.57	1.555
1994	748,350	13,292	34.3	455,746	554,689	56,302	31.58	1.349	108,859	1,949	37.5	73,092	63,783	55,851	28.64	1.707
1995	767,913	13,506	34.1	460,024	559,789	56,859	32.10	1.372	114,281	2,060	37.2	76,631	63,873	55,465	28.68	1.789
1996	777,167	13,676	34.3	468,732	566,059	56,827	31.88	1.373	115,658	2,084	37.4	77,891	64,588	55,511	28.56	1.791
1997	806,737	13,941	34.3	477,767	577,097	57,869	32.47	1.398	123,155	2,153	37.5	80,772	65,492	57,191	29.32	1.880
1998	830,828	14,326	34.0	486,536	586,791	57,994	32.84	1.416	128,018	2,246	37.1	83,333	65,859	56,996	29.54	1.944
						Av	erage ann	ual rates o	of growth							
81-89	3.10	1.74	0.34	2.09	1.81	1.33	0.99	1.26	3.00	0.18	0.74	0.92	2.04	2.82	2.06	0.95
89-98	1.86	1.01	-0.38	0.63	1.26	0.84	1.23	0.60	2.05	0.05	-0.16	-0.11	-0.38	2.00	2.17	2.44
81-98	2.44	1.35	-0.04	1.31	1.52	1.07	1.11	0.91	2.50	0.11	0.26	0.37	0.75	2.38	2.12	1.73
89-97	1.72	0.79	-0.31	0.48	1.20	0.92	1.24	0.51	1.82	-0.47	-0.05	-0.52	-0.49	2.30	2.35	2.32
81-97	2.41	1.27	0.01	1.28	1.51	1.13	1.11	0.89	2.41	-0.14	0.34	0.20	0.77	2.56	2.20	1.63

#### Table A1: Productivity in the Total Economy and Manufacturing, Canada

Sources: Columns A, E - Statistics Canada, GDP Data, CANSIM series D15721, I53036, 1999; Columns B, C - Statistics Canada Labour Force Historical Review, 71F0004XCB, 1999; columns F, G - Statistics Canada, unpublished Labour Force Survey Data, 1999; columns D, H - Statistics Canada, Capital Stock Data, CANSIM Series D993325, D993721, 1999.

	Total Economy							Manufacturing								
Year	GDP at	Workers,	Averag	Total hours	Geom. End-	GDP per	GDP per	GDP per	GDP at	Workers,	Average	Total	Geom. End-	GDP per	GDP per	GDP
	market pr.,	thous.	e hours	per week,	Year Net CS,	worker, \$	hour, \$	unit of	factor cost,	thous.	hours	hours per	Year Net	worker, \$	hour, \$	per unit
	million 1992		per	thous.	mil 1992\$			CS, \$	million		per	week,	CS, mil			of CS,
	\$		week						1992 \$		week	thous.	1992\$			\$
	А	В	С	D=B*C	Е	A/B*1000	(A*1000) /(D*52)	A/E	F	G	Н	I=G*H	J	F/G*1000	(F*1000) /(I*52)	F/J
1976	n/a	87 427	36.1	3 158 300	6 4 3 5 8 9 8	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	19.082	40.1	765 506	604 977	n/a	n/a	n/a
1977	4 273 573	90 444	36.0	3 254 477	7 065 608	47 251	25 25	0.605	796 538	19,002	40.1	798 475	653 859	40 227	19.18	1 218
1978	4 502 994	94 816	35.8	3 395 993	7,005,000	47,251	25.25	0.005	836 549	20,670	40.5	835 585	709 296	40,227 40,472	19.10	1.210
1979	4,502,554	98.050	35.0	3 496 300	8 645 542	AT 227	25.50	0.575	864 841	20,070	40.4	851 244	783 293	40,472	19.23	1.177
1980	4,630,031	98 408	35.7	3 471 342	9 547 080	46 896	25.47	0.330	822 674	21,104 20.437	39.7	810 838	868 292	40,025	19.54	0.947
1981	4,014,007	99,400	35.3	3 502 086	10 219 23/	40,000	25.57	0.462	858 601	20,437	30.0	810/39	928 261	40,254	20.37	0.947
1982	4,720,070	97 827	3/ 8	3,406,010	10,219,234	47,550	25.72	0.402	810 101	18 9/19	39.0	739 011	964 666	$^{+2,227}_{12,752}$	20.57	0.923
1983	4,020,203	98 599	35.0	3,450,010	10,390,712	/8 719	26.02	0.430	856 726	18 560	40.1	744 565	981 632	46 160	21.00	0.040
1984	5 140 115	103 196	35.0	3,430,143	10,713,700	49,719	20.76	0.448	948 217	19,500	40.1	793 569	996 818	48,100	22.13	0.075
1985	5 323 514	105,170	34.9	3 696 837	11 214 830	50 281	27.69	0.100 0.475	976 446	19 384	40.5	785 375	1 026 905	50 374	22.90	0.951
1986	5 487 743	107 804	34.9	3 748 884	11,214,000	50,201	28.15	0.475 0.475	967 675	19,068	40.5	776 227	1,020,903	50,574	23.91	0.907
1987	5 649 474	110 817	34.8	3 854 585	11,942,540	50,980	28.19	0.473	1 041 675	19,000	41.0	784 034	1,000,007	54 495	25.57	0.947
1988	5 865 220	113 981	34.6	3 946 592	12,396,580	51 458	28.58	0.473	1 111 013	19 483	41.0	798 478	1 148 144	57 025	26.76	0.968
1989	6.061.982	116 725	34.5	4 029 931	12,390,300	51,130	28.93	0.173 0.474	1 105 992	19 521	40.9	799,060	1 185 448	56 657	26.70	0.933
1990	6 136 291	117 639	34.4	4 051 683	13 090 289	52 162	20.23	0.171	1 089 974	19 141	40.8	780 474	1 229 839	56 944	26.86	0.886
1991	6 079 404	116 712	34.3	3 997 386	13,050,205	52,089	29.15	0.462	1,050,216	18 533	40.7	753 675	1 243 749	56 667	26.80	0.844
1992	6 244 445	117 204	34.4	4 028 888	13 484 088	53 278	29.81	0.463	1 063 628	18,555	41.1	747 005	1 263 491	58 509	27.38	0.842
1993	6 389 566	119 247	34.5	4 115 015	13 928 552	53 583	29.86	0.459	1 100 823	18,175	41.5	753 657	1 293 765	60 568	28.09	0.851
1994	6.610.744	122.258	34.6	4.234.202	14.464.191	54.072	30.02	0.457	1,193,167	18,428	41.9	772.747	1.332.854	64.748	29.69	0.895
1995	6.761.735	125.146	34.4	4.309.194	14.753.499	54.031	30.18	0.458	1.271.556	18,591	41.6	773.541	1.363.872	68.396	31.61	0.932
1996	6.994.777	127.567	34.4	4.392.557	15.065.479	54.832	30.62	0.464	1.293.847	18.575	41.6	771.946	1.380.938	69.655	32.23	0.937
1997	7.269.782	130.567	34.6	4.519.794	15.386.760	55.679	30.93	0.472	1.369.889	18,758	42.0	787.367	1.398.304	73.030	33.46	0.980
1998	7,551,900	131,463	34.6	4,548,620	n/a	57,445	31.93	n/a	1,426,054	18,719	41.8	781,518	n/a	76,182	35.09	n/a
	, ,	,		, ,		,				,		,		,		
						Avera	ige annual	rates of g	growth							
81-89	3.18	2.04	-0.27	1.77	2.84	1.11	1.38	0.33	3.22	-0.51	0.33	-0.18	3.10	3.74	3.40	0.11
89-98	2.47	1.33	0.02	1.35	n/a	1.13	1.10	n/a	2.86	-0.47	0.22	-0.25	n/a	3.34	3.12	n/a
81-98	2.80	1.66	-0.11	1.55	n/a	1.12	1.23	n/a	3.03	-0.49	0.27	-0.21	n/a	3.53	3.25	n/a
89-97	2.30	1.41	0.03	1.44	2.34	0.87	0.84	-0.04	2.71	-0.50	0.31	-0.18	2.09	3.22	2.90	0.61

#### Table A2: Productivity in the Total Economy and Manufacturing, US

1.61

2.59

0.99

2.74

1.73

-0.12

81-97

Sources: Columns A, B, F, G - BEA (http://www.bea.doc.gov/bea/uguide.htm#\_1\_14); columns E, J - BEA http://www.bea.doc.gov/bea/dn2/wealth.exe); Columns C, H - BLS (http://www.bls.gov/cesb1b6.htm) Estimates for the US GDP at factor cost for manufacturing for 1998 are based on 1997 data and 1997-98 4.1% annual growth rate estimates for output - BLS (http://www.bls.gov/news.release/prod2.t03.htm).

0.14

1.11

2.96

-0.50

0.32

-0.18

2.59

3.48

3.15

0.36

### Productivity Performance in Canada and the United States

	Levels (% of U.S. level)			Growth Ra (average annua	ates al rate of change)	
		Total	Economy			
	1981	1989	1997	1981-89	1989-1997	
Canada	80.3	81.8	80.3	1.5	0.8	
United States	100	100	100	1.2	1.0	
		М	anufacturi	ng		
Canada	83.9	78.3	73.7	2.3	2.2	
United States	100	100	100	3.2	2.9	

Note: Data for the total economy refer to output per worker, for manufacturing output per hour.

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics (1998a and 1998b)

## **Output Per Hour Growth in Manufacturing in Industrial Countries**

	1981-89	1989-97	1981-97
Canada	2.3	2.2	2.2
U.S.	3.2	2.9	3.1
Japan	3.9	3.5	3.7
France	3.7	3.3	3.5
U.K.	5.3	2.7	4.0
Italy	4.0	3.5	3.7
Germany	2.3	3.2	2.8
G-7 average	3.5	3.0	3.3
Belgium	4.3	2.4	3.3
Denmark	1.0	NA	NA
Netherlands	3.9	3.7	3.8
Norway	2.7	1.1	1.9
Sweden	3.1	4.5	3.8

(average annual rate of change)

Source: International Comparisons of Manufacturing Productivity and Unit Labour Costs, Updated Trends for 1997, News, Bureau of Labor Statistics, U.S. Department of Labor, March, 1999.

Note: NA indicates data are not available.

# Trends in Compensation, Unit Labour Costs in Manufacturing in Canada and the United States

	Hourly labour compensation Domestic currency		Hourly labour compensation U.S. dollars		ULC in domestic currency		ULC in U.S. dollars		Exchange Rate
									Rate
	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	Canada	U.S.	Canada
1981-89	5.6	4.5	5.8	4.5	3.2	1.2	3.4	1.2	0.2
1989-97	3.5	3.6	1.5	3.6	1.3	0.7	-0.6	0.7	-1.9
1981-97	4.6	4.0	3.6	4.0	2.3	0.9	1.4	0.9	-0.9

(average annual rate of change)

Source: International Comparisons of Manufacturing Productivity and Unit Labour Costs, Updated Trends for 1997, News, Bureau of Labor Statistics, U.S. Department of Labor, March, 1999.

### Table A6: VALUE ADDED PER WORKER Estimates of GDP per employed worker, by Industry

	% Average compound growth rates					
	1981-89		1989-97		1981-97	
	Canada	US	Canada	US	Canada	US
All industries	1.14	1.11	0.95	0.87	1.05	0.99
Total manufacturing industries	2.82	3.74	2.30	3.22	2.56	3.48
Wood industries	5.33	4.16	-1.55	-2.59	1.83	0.73
Furniture and fixture industries	1.05	0.83	4.83	2.26	2.92	1.54
Non-metallic mineral products industries	4.37	3.81	-1.67	2.09	1.30	2.95
Primary metal industries	4.50	0.42	4.56	3.56	4.53	1.97
Fabricated metal products industries	3.34	3.10	1.01	2.33	2.17	2.72
Machinery industries	5.82	9.16	1.86	8.25	3.82	8.71
Electrical and electronic products industries	5.40	n/a	4.26	14.31	4.83	n/a
Transportation equipment industries	3.44	2.97	2.43	-0.10	2.93	1.43
Other manufacturing industries	0.63	5.98	-0.72	0.57	-0.05	3.24
Food and kindred	0.88	3.12	2.22	0.11	1.55	1.60
Tobacco products industries	n/a	-5.51	13.00	-0.06	n/a	-2.82
Textile industries	3.79	3.67	7.24	4.12	5.50	3.89
Clothing industries	0.17	4.30	0.98	3.96	0.57	4.13
Paper and allied products industries	0.79	2.98	3.92	1.57	2.35	2.27
Printing, publishing and allied industries	-1.48	-0.16	-3.02	-1.60	-2.26	-0.88
Chemical and chemical products industries	3.94	4.79	3.35	3.49	3.64	4.14
Refined petroleum and coal products	0.95	8.99	7.87	1.26	4.35	5.05
industries						
Rubber and plastic industries	2.23	4.41	4.44	4.18	3.33	4.29
Leather and allied products industries	3.02	4.56	0.08	4.29	1.54	4.43
Manufacturing - Machinery and Electric	2.59	1.67	2.14	0.50	2.36	1.09
industries						
Manufacturing (BLS data)	2.6	3.7	2.2	3.5	2.4	3.6

Source: CSLS Productivity data base

	% Average compound growth rates					
	1981-89		1989-97		1981-97	
	Canada	US	Canada	US	Canada	US
All industries	1.11	0.79	0.79	0.48	0.95	0.64
Total manufacturing industries	2.22	2.68	2.31	2.32	2.26	2.50
0						
Wood industries	5.25	3.51	-1.65	-3.28	1.74	0.06
Furniture and fixture industries	0.50	0.53	3.47	1.74	1.98	1.13
Non-metallic mineral products industries	4.47	2.87	-0.77	1.45	1.82	2.15
Primary metal industries	4.15	-0.75	4.36	2.83	4.25	1.03
Fabricated metal products industries	2.60	2.00	1.12	1.75	1.86	1.88
Machinery industries	4.23	8.32	0.65	7.95	2.43	8.14
Electrical and electronic products industries	4.76	n/a	4.67	13.51	4.71	n/a
Transportation equipment industries	2.68	2.74	2.15	-0.54	2.41	1.09
Other manufacturing industries	-0.35	4.46	-0.62	-0.42	-0.48	1.99
Food and kindred	-0.17	1.55	2.31	-0.80	1.06	0.37
Tobacco products industries	n/a	-10.51	-1.94	-4.51	n/a	-7.56
Textile industries	3.15	2.31	5.13	2.58	4.14	2.45
Clothing industries	0.10	3.24	-0.18	2.32	-0.04	2.78
Paper and allied products industries	0.23	2.01	3.66	0.70	1.93	1.35
Printing, publishing and allied industries	-1.75	-0.34	-3.66	-2.19	-2.71	-1.27
Chemical and chemical products industries	6.48	3.09	3.45	2.10	4.95	2.59
Refined petroleum and coal products	1.80	4.75	8.41	-1.36	5.05	1.65
industries						
Rubber and plastic industries	1.63	4.19	4.19	3.97	2.90	4.08
Leather and allied products industries	2.17	1.41	-0.62	0.41	0.77	0.91
Manufacturing - Machinery and Electric industries	2.05	0.68	2.12	-0.49	2.09	0.09

### Table A7: Total Factor Productivity Indices (Using number of workers employed)

Source: CSLS Productivity Data base

## Comparison of CSLS and Statistics Canada Productivity Estimates for Manufacturing (average annual rate of change)

	1981-8	39	1989-9	7
	CSLS	Statistics Canada	CSLS	Statistics Canada
Real value added	3.0	3.1	1.8	1.5
Hours	0.9	0.4	-0.5	-0.4
Capital Input	2.0	2.2	-0.5	1.0
Multifactor Productivity	1.7	2.2	2.3	1.4

NOTE: Statistics Canada estimates of real value added and capital stock are based on the chainweighted Fisher indices while CSLS estimates are based on fixed-weighted Laspeyres indices from the National Accounts of Statistics Canada. The Labour Force Survey is the source of hours estimates for both series. CSLS data are unadjusted for labour quality changes while Statistics Canada estimates are adjusted for labour quality changes on the basis of relative wage trends. It should be noted that Statistics Canada uses the fixed-weighted Laspeyres series for output in its labour productivity series (CANSIM I600001).

Source: Statistics Canada: CANSIM I720372-I720375 multifactor productivity data base, March 21, 1999. CSLS: CSLS productivity data base based on Statistics Canada data.